

NUNAVUT WILDLIFE MANAGEMENT BOARD

PUBLIC HEARING TO CONSIDER THE ESTABLISHMENT
OF A REGIONAL TOTAL ALLOWABLE HARVEST FOR THE
BATHURST CARIBOU HERD

June 14, 2016

Pages 1 TO 277

HELD AT THE COMMUNITY HALL

CAMBRIDGE BAY, NUNAVUT

VOLUME 1

BOARD MEMBERS

Daniel Shewchuk	Acting Chair
Simeonie Keenainak	Member
Charlie Inuarak	Member
Caleb Sangoya	Member
David Igutsaq	Member
David Kritterdlik	Member

NUNAVUT WILDLIFE MANAGEMENT BOARD

Jason Akearok	Executive Director
Eric Kan	Director of Administration
Peter Kydd	Director of Wildlife Management
Erin Keenan	Terrestrial Wildlife Management Biologist
Eric Idlaut	Communications Coordinator
Sheila Oolayou	IQ Coordinator
Michael d'Eça	Legal Counsel
Evie Amagoalik	Interpreter
Leetia Janes	Interpreter
Henry Ohokannoak	Interpreter
Joe Otokiak	Interpreter
Adele Jones	Stenographer

GOVERNMENT OF NUNAVUT

Drikus Gissing	Director of Wildlife
Lisa Marie Leclerc	Kitikmeot Regional Biologist
Mathieu Dumond	Wildlife Manager

GOVERNMENT OF NORTHWEST TERRITORIES

Lynda Yonge	Director of Wildlife
Jan Adamczewski	Wildlife Biologist, Ungulates

NUNAVUT TUNNGAVIK INCORPORATED

Paul Irngaut	Director of Wildlife & Environment
Bert Dean	Assistant Director of Wildlife & Environment

KITIKMEOT REGIONAL WILDLIFE BOARD

Simon Qingnaqtuq	Chair
Ema Qaqqutaq	Regional Coordinator
Eva Ayalik	

KUGLUKTUK HTO

Kevin Klengenberg	Secretary-Treasurer
Larry Adjun	Chair
Gustin Adjun	Vice-Chair
Peter Taktogon	Director
Jorgen Bolt	Director

BATHURST HTO

Peter Kapolak	Chair
Mary Kaniak	Elder
Joseph Tikhak	Elder

BAY CHIMO HTO

Connie Kapolak	Chair
Sam Kapolak	Director

CAMBRIDGE BAY HTO

Bobby Greenley	Chair
George Angohiatok	Vice-Chair

KITIKMEOT INUIT ASSOCIATION

Attima Hadlari	Vice-President Wildlife & Environment
Paul Emingak	Executive Director
Geoff Clark	Director of Land, Environment & Resources
John Donihee	Legal counsel

NORTH SLAVE MÉTIS ALLIANCE

Shin Shiga	Regulatory Analyst
------------	--------------------

WEK'ÈEZHÌI RENEWABLE RESOURCES BOARD

Jonas Lafferty	Board Member
Jody Pellissey	Executive Director

ADVENTURE NORTHWEST LIMITED

Boyd Warner	President
-------------	-----------

PUBLIC

Jimmy Haniliak	Cambridge Bay Elder
James Panioyak	Cambridge Bay Elder
Sam Angohiatok	Elder

I N D E X

	PAGE
Opening and Prayer	6
NWMB Legal Counsel - Hearing Rules	12
GOVERNMENT OF NUNAVUT SUBMISSION	22
Nunavut Wildlife Management Board Questions and Comments	30
Nunavut Wildlife Management Board Staff Questions and Comments	31
Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife Board Questions and Comments	35
Kugluktuk HTO Questions and Comments	36
Bathurst Inlet HTO Questions and Comments	47
Bay Chimo HTO Questions and Comments	49
Cambridge Bay HTO Questions and Comments	49
Elders Questions and Comments	53
Nunavut Tunngavik Incorporated Questions and Comments	65
Kitikmeot Inuit Association Questions and Comments	74
North Slave Métis Alliance Questions and Comments	121
Adventure Northwest Limited Questions and Comments	125
Public Questions and Comments	136
GOVERNMENT OF NORTHWEST TERRITORIES SUBMISSION	140
Nunavut Wildlife Management Board Questions and Comments	170

Nunavut Wildlife Management Board Staff Questions and Comments	194
Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife Board Questions and and Comments	197
Bay Chimo HTO Questions and Comments	217
Cambridge Bay HTO Questions and Comments	220
Elders Questions and Comments	226
Nunavut Tunngavik Incorporated Questions and Comments	232
Kitikmeot Inuit Association Questions and Comments	240
Public Questions and Comments	267
KITIKMEOT REGIONAL WILDLIFE BOARD SUBMISSION	273
Stenographer's Certificate	277

1 (Proceeding commenced at 9:00 a.m.)

2 OPENING AND PRAYER

3 THE CHAIR: Good morning, everyone. Welcome
4 to Cambridge Bay, and I'm very happy that everybody made it
5 in safe and sound because that's not always easy at this
6 time of year, so it's nice so see everybody here.

7 My name is Dan Shewchuk. I'm Acting Chair of
8 the Nunavut Wildlife Management Board at present.

9 And in the process here, first of all, I would
10 like to call the meeting to order and have Simeonie say a
11 prayer. Thank you.

12 (PRAYER)

13 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much Simeonie.

14 I think we'll start off with introductions of
15 everyone. So I would ask we go around the table and you
16 state your name and the organization you're representing,
17 and we'll start -- we'll start right there, right in the
18 corner.

19 MR. P. KAPOLAK: Good morning, everyone. My name
20 is Peter Kapolak representing Bay Chimo and organization.

21 MS. M. KANIAK: Morning. My name is Mary Kaniak.
22 I'm traditional from the land, and I'm here to listen to
23 the delegates, their meetings.

24 MR. GREENLEY: Bobby Greenley, Cambridge Bay HTO
25 Chair.

1 MR. G. ANGOHIATOK: Good morning, my name is George
2 Angohiatok, Cambridge Bay HTO Vice-Chair.

3 MR. IRNGAUT: My name is Paul Irngaut, Director
4 of Wildlife and Environment, NTI.

5 MR. DEAN: My name Bert Dean, Assistant
6 Director of Wildlife and Environment, based in
7 Rankin Inlet.

8 MR. HADLARI: Good morning, Mr. Chair. My name
9 is Attima Hadlari, President For Wildlife and Environment,
10 KIA, and as well as trading off with Lance Instructor
11 (phonetic) from KIA, just for your information.

12 MR. CLARK: Good morning, Geoff Clark,
13 Director of Land, Environment, and Resources for Kitikmeot
14 Inuit Association.

15 MR. DONIHEE: My name is John Donihee. I'm
16 legal counsel to the Kitikmeot Inuit Association.

17 MR. SHIGA: Good morning. My name is
18 Shin Shiga, Regulatory Analyst for North Slave Métis
19 Alliance.

20 MR. LAFFERTY: Jonas Lafferty. I'm the
21 Wek'èezhii Renewable Resources Board.

22 MS. PELLISSEY: Jody Pellissey, Executive Director
23 for the Wek'èezhii Renewable Resources Board.

24 MR. WARNER: Boyd Warner, representing
25 Adventure Northwest.

1 MR. KEENAINAK: Good morning. Simeonie Keenainak
2 from Pangnirtung and a Board Member for Nunavut Wildlife
3 Management Board, appointed by Government of Nunavut.

4 MR. IGUTSAQ: Good morning. David Igutsaq. I'm
5 a Board Member for Nunavut Wildlife Management Board. I
6 was appointed by Kitikmeot Inuit Association.

7 MR. SANGOYA: My name is Caleb Sangoya. I feel
8 very welcome here in Ikaluktutiak. I'm from Pond Inlet and
9 was appointed by the Qikiqtalluk Inuit Association. I'm a
10 Board Member for GN.

11 MR. SHEWCHUK: Again, I'm the Acting Chair for
12 Nunavut Wildlife Management Board, appointed by Department
13 of Environment.

14 MR. AKEAROK: Jason Akearok. I'm Executive
15 Director of the Nunavut Wildlife Management Board.

16 MR. KRITTERDLIK: From Whale Cove, David
17 Kritterdlik. I was appointed by the federal government to
18 Nunavut Wildlife Management Board.

19 MR. INUARAK: I'm Charlie Inuarak from Pond
20 Inlet. I'm a Board Member for Nunavut Wildlife Management
21 Board. I was appointed by NTI.

22 MR. D'EÇA: My name is Michael d'Eça. I'm a
23 legal advisor for Nunavut Wildlife Management Board. I
24 live in Ottawa.

25 MR. KYDD: Good morning, everybody. I'm

1 Peter Kydd, the Director of Wildlife Management with the
2 Nunavut Wildlife Management Board.

3 MS. KEENAN: Good morning. I'm Erin Keenan,
4 the Terrestrial Biologist with the Nunavut Wildlife
5 Management Board.

6 MR. GISSING: Good morning. Drikus Gissing,
7 Director For Wildlife Management for Department of
8 Environment for the GN.

9 MS. LECLERC: Good morning. Lisa Leclerc,
10 Biologist for the Kitikmeot Regional Board, Government of
11 Nunavut, Department of Environment.

12 MS. OOLAYOU: Good morning. My name is Sheila
13 Oolayou. I'm the Inuit Qaujimagatuqangit Coordinator.

14 MR. IDLAUT: I'm Eric Idlaut, Communications
15 Coordinator.

16 MS. YONGE: Lynda Yonge. I'm Director of
17 Wildlife for the Government of North West Territories.

18 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Jan Adamczewski, Wildlife Director
19 for Government of Northwest Territories in Yellowknife.

20 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: Simon Qingnaqtuq from Kitikmeot
21 Wildlife Board, Chairperson.

22 MR. QAQQUTAQ: Ema Qaqqutaq. I'm the Regional
23 Coordinator for KRWB.

24 MR. KLENGENBERG: Kevin Klengenberg, Secretary
25 Treasurer from the Kugluktuk Hunters and Trappers

1 Association.

2 MR. G. ADJUN: Good morning. Gustin Adjun,
3 Vice-Chair from Kugluktuk.

4 MR. L. ADJUN: Larry Adjun, Chairman, Kugluktuk
5 HTO.

6 MR. TAKTOGON: Peter Taktogon, Kugluktuk HTO
7 Director.

8 MR. BOLT: Jorgen Bolt, Director, Kugluktuk
9 HTO.

10 MR. S. KAPOLAK: Sam Kapolak, Director, Bathurst
11 HTO.

12 MR. KAN: Eric Kan, and I'm the director for
13 administration, also the coordinator for this public
14 hearing, so if there's anything you need, just come and
15 talk to me, and I'll help you out.

16 And I also would like to take the opportunity to
17 introduce the translators for this public hearing. You
18 will be able to use three languages, English, Inuktitut,
19 and Inuinnaqtun. For those Inuinnaqtun speakers you would
20 have to let me know so that if you want to have Inuinnaqtun
21 translation we will have to give you a special piece of the
22 transmitter because we're using two different systems. So
23 let me know if you prefer to have Inuinnaqtun translation.

24 So for the translators, for the English and
25 Inuktitut translators, we have Leetia Janes at the very far

1 corner. Beside her working as her colleague is Evie
2 Amagoalik. For the Inuinnaqtun translators we have Joe
3 Otokiak as well as Henry Ohokannoak.

4 And, also, because of the proceeding, we will
5 also have it recorded using an stenographer, and we have
6 the stenographer, Adele Jones, sitting in the back. So the
7 proceedings is all going to be recorded so we have a record
8 of what you have said both in audio as well as in English
9 writing.

10 Okay. Thank you.

11 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much, Eric.

12 And thank you all for that, and welcome to all
13 the observers that are in the building, too.

14 The next item on the agenda is some of the
15 housekeeping rules that we have. First of all, we would
16 like you to turn off all your cell phones so they're not
17 interrupting the proceedings as we go on.

18 The bathrooms are located at the entrance of the
19 hall here, both men's and women's bathrooms.

20 I believe that every organization that you're
21 representing has a hearing binder in front of them that you
22 can refer to, and, also, if you do wish to have a digital
23 copy to put in your computer, we have those available, too,
24 if you would like one.

25 We would ask that when you're making your

1 presentations or asking questions that you state your name
2 before you do that, and don't speak too fast for the
3 interpreters so they can translate what we're hearing.

4 We will have coffee breaks scheduled at 10 and
5 3:00. They will be for 15 minutes or so, but there will be
6 coffee and snacks available.

7 At this point in time, before we start the
8 hearing I'm going to have our legal advisor go through some
9 of the rules of the hearing and the expectations of
10 everybody here and some of the background leading up to the
11 hearing.

12 Michael, the floor is yours.

13 LEGAL COUNSEL - HEARING RULES

14 MR. D'EÇA: Qujannamiik, itsivautaaq.

15 This will take about ten minutes or so just to
16 walk you through some important prehearing items.

17 As the Chairman mentioned, the Board has asked
18 me to briefly address four preliminary issues before the
19 first of the parties delivers its oral submissions, and
20 they are: First of all, to walk you through the hearing
21 rules that are most relevant to today and tomorrow;
22 secondly, to briefly go over some of the prehearing
23 decisions that were made by the Nunavut Wildlife Management
24 Board; third, I think it would be helpful to talk a little
25 bit about the role of the Nunavut Wildlife Management Board

1 Members at this hearing; and, finally, I'll briefly discuss
2 some time management issues.

3 So turning to the rules -- and they're found, I
4 think, at tab 2 of your binder if you want to follow along.
5 And I want, first of all, to talk about the purpose of this
6 hearing.

7 As everybody knows, the Government of Nunavut
8 has filed a proposal for decision, and that proposal is for
9 the Nunavut Wildlife Management Board to establish a total
10 allowable harvest of 30 male caribou for the Bathurst herd,
11 but that proposal isn't actually the purpose of the
12 hearing.

13 As you can see at the very opening of the rules
14 it says that the purpose of this Nunavut Wildlife
15 Management Board public hearing is to publicly consider the
16 harvest management of Bathurst caribou, so our purpose is
17 wider than the proposal which is for the TAH of 30 caribou.
18 We're looking at consideration of what ought to be the
19 harvest management of Bathurst caribou.

20 There's 18 hearing rules. I'm not going to walk
21 you through all of them. What I'm going to do is turn to
22 the last 10 or 11 of them which are more specifically
23 focused on the two days of this oral hearing.

24 So on page 2 we go to Rule 6. This is, you
25 know, a public board, a public hearing. We want to be open

1 and transparent, so the Board shall ensure that all
2 materials filed with it or produced by it are made publicly
3 available, subject to relevant confidentiality or privacy
4 concerns.

5 Rule 7 -- and Eric Kan just went through this --
6 but the Board is going to provide simultaneous English,
7 Inuktitut, and Inuinnaqtun translation at the hearing to
8 the extent reasonably possible.

9 The Rule 8. A quorum of Nunavut Wildlife
10 Management Board Members shall be present at the hearing,
11 and that is what we have. For our Board, we need a minimum
12 of five members to be present.

13 Jumping ahead to Rule 11. All parties and other
14 participants at the hearing are required to treat one
15 another and the Nunavut Wildlife Management Board with
16 respect. And it is important for everyone to recognize and
17 to remind themselves that every delegate around the table
18 has come in good faith to share their views about the best
19 harvest management for Bathurst caribou. All of us deserve
20 to be treated with respect and to treat our fellow
21 delegates and the Nunavut Wildlife Management Board Members
22 with that respect. Of course, it's good and it's necessary
23 to be passionate about what you believe in; however, it is
24 unacceptable and against the rules of this hearing to be
25 disrespectful, and I ask everyone to keep that in mind over

1 the next two days.

2 Rule 12. The Nunavut Wildlife Management Board
3 shall provide a reasonable opportunity for oral
4 presentations from each of the parties at the hearing, and
5 that would be by the choice of official, expert, or
6 counsel.

7 Rule 13. Any member of the Nunavut Wildlife
8 Management Board, the NWMB's Director of Wildlife
9 Management, or the NWMB's legal counsel may ask relevant
10 questions of any party at the hearing.

11 And also, under Rule 14, any party may ask
12 relevant questions of any other party at the hearing.

13 Rule 15. The Nunavut Wildlife Management Board
14 shall provide members of the public in attendance at the
15 hearing a reasonable opportunity to make statements and to
16 ask questions of the parties and the Nunavut Wildlife
17 Management Board.

18 Rule 16. Every person at the hearing wishing to
19 speak or ask a question shall raise his or her hand and
20 shall only speak once the Nunavut Wildlife Management Board
21 Chairperson has recognized him or her. And I know
22 Chairperson Dan and Executive Director Jason will have
23 their hands full, but they will be trying to note who has
24 put their hands up, what order it will be, and so on and so
25 forth. So we'll try to make that run as smoothly as we

1 can.

2 Rule 17. The Board Chairperson does reserve the
3 right to place reasonable time limits on presentations,
4 statements, and questions. It's a matter of efficiency
5 and, you know, running a fairly large hearing within a
6 confined period of time, so that is an important rule.

7 And, finally, again, as Eric mentioned to you,
8 we do have an audio recording of the hearing available --
9 or we will have it upon request -- and we do have our court
10 reporter here, the highly competent Adele, so we hope to
11 also have transcripts of the entire oral hearing at some
12 point shortly after the hearing is completed.

13 So I'm going to move on to prehearing decisions
14 made by the Nunavut Wildlife Management Board. During the
15 last month or so, the Board made a number of prehearing
16 decisions, not all of which have been popular with all of
17 the parties, and the Board does not want those decisions to
18 be a distraction over the next couple of days. Our
19 collective work here over the next two days is too
20 important and the time available to us is too precious.

21 So we thought it would be helpful if I set out
22 for you some of the decisions that were made and the
23 reasons why they were made, and I've chosen three of the
24 main decisions made by the Board to very briefly talk to
25 you about, one concerning the location of the hearing here

1 in Cambridge Bay, the second concerning the proposed
2 adjournment of the hearing and, thirdly, concerning the
3 adequacy of the Government of Nunavut's consultations.

4 So turning, first of all, to the location. The
5 Nunavut Wildlife Management Board clearly has decided to
6 hold the hearings in Cambridge Bay, and the reasons
7 provided, which were provided in writing to the parties,
8 were straightforward and practical.

9 First, the Nunavut Wildlife Management Board is
10 of the view that there is an urgent conservation concern
11 with the Bathurst herd. Time was and still is of the
12 essence, and the hearings had to proceed at this time in
13 mid-June. Second, there was, at the time that this
14 decision was made, a significant risk that Kugluktuk would
15 not have the necessary commercial rental accommodation
16 available in June. And, thirdly, the parties needed at
17 that time to be certain where the hearings would take place
18 and be able to finalize their travel and accommodation
19 arrangements, so the Board made the decision it made.

20 With respect to the other two, the decisions to
21 not adjourn the hearings until late September as was
22 requested by the some of the parties, and to not conclude
23 without proper investigation that the Government of
24 Nunavut's consultation was inadequate, the reasons for that
25 were the following: First -- and I'm repeating myself --

1 that there was that urgent conservation concern to deal
2 with the Bathurst herd, and so time was of the essence in
3 holding the hearings; and, second, the Nunavut Wildlife
4 Management Board is bound by the legal rules of procedural
5 fairness, and they require the Nunavut Wildlife Management
6 Board to invite and carefully consider submissions from all
7 affected parties, including the Government of Nunavut if it
8 wishes to provide submissions on the point, concerning the
9 adequacy of the Government of Nunavut's consultations.
10 Only then can the Board reach an informed conclusion.

11 So it is one of the hearing issues, and we'll
12 see where it takes us. So I won't say any more about that,
13 and I think that is really all that the Nunavut Wildlife
14 Management Board intends to say about those decisions for
15 this hearing.

16 I'm coming close to the end of my presentation
17 here, but I did want to talk about two other things.

18 First of all, the role of the Nunavut Wildlife
19 Management Board Members at the hearing. The Nunavut
20 Wildlife Management Board Members will eventually be making
21 decisions that will go to the minister under the terms of
22 the Land Claims Agreement, but it is important to recognize
23 that the Nunavut Wildlife Management Board Members will not
24 be making any decisions regarding Bathurst caribou during
25 these next two days. Eventually, they will do so. We

1 expect that that will actually take place in September,
2 which is the next time that they meet face to face.

3 For these members, the hearing is all about
4 maintaining an open mind, listening carefully to your
5 evidence and your arguments, asking questions, where
6 necessary, to ensure that they understand that evidence and
7 those arguments.

8 And my advice to each of the parties is probably
9 pretty obvious, but you want to be as clear as possible
10 about what your position is and, where you can, try to
11 provide evidence -- the more convincing the better -- and
12 reasons that support your position. Everything you say,
13 everything you have written is part of the hearing record
14 and will be taken into account. If it's relevant, it will
15 be taken into account. The Board -- part of its job is,
16 when all is said and done, to determine, well, what do we
17 find most reliable? What do we find most persuasive in
18 reaching a decision?

19 And, finally, Mr. Chair, a few words about time
20 management over the next two days of this hearing.

21 If you look at tab 1, you'll see the agenda is
22 jam-packed with parties delivering oral submissions and
23 asking and answering questions, and it will be a challenge
24 meeting the agenda timelines. In fact, I'll say it right
25 out. The timelines provided are not achievable, at least

1 for the first part of day one.

2 The first two parties are the Government of
3 Nunavut and the Government of Northwest Territories, and we
4 are expecting lots of questions and answers, which will
5 slow us down in terms of the agenda timelines; however, if
6 we are all, together, efficient and aware of the time, the
7 Nunavut Wildlife Management Board plans to make up ground
8 and to wrap up the hearing in time by 5:30 p.m. tomorrow
9 afternoon.

10 And I think it's important in this context to
11 remind all of the parties that, if you have filed written
12 submissions -- and a number of you have -- they are already
13 a part of the hearing record. They will be carefully
14 considered when it comes time for decision-making. So do
15 keep in mind and rest assured that the Nunavut Wildlife
16 Management Board is not only relying upon your oral
17 submissions; you've done a lot of the work already, for
18 those of you who have prepared and provided written
19 submissions.

20 Because of timing considerations, we ask all
21 parties to limit your questions to those that are most
22 important and most relevant. There are a lot of us here,
23 and so we have to keep that in mind; and, also, if another
24 party has already asked your question, perhaps there's no
25 need to ask it again. Everyone, or practically everyone,

1 will have questions, and we want to ensure, to the extent
2 possible, that everyone has that chance to ask their
3 questions and receive the resulting answers.

4 And, finally, please keep in mind that you only
5 have one opportunity to directly ask questions of each
6 party.

7 So by way of example, the Government of Nunavut
8 will soon be making its oral submissions, and each party
9 will have an opportunity to ask a limited number of
10 questions. After that, we move on to the next party, which
11 in this case would be the Government of the North West
12 Territories, and so on, as we go around the table.

13 So recognize that, you know, when a particular
14 party that you want to ask questions to has finished their
15 presentation, that's your opportunity to ask your
16 questions. Later on, we'll move to other parties, and you
17 can't go back and say, well, I want to ask them something
18 further.

19 So that's it for my introduction, Mr. Chair. If
20 there is time and if there are any questions, I'm certainly
21 happy to respond to them. Taima.

22 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much, Michael.

23 Is there any questions from anybody around the
24 table about the process? Okay. There isn't. Thank you
25 very much.

1 With that, I'll turn it over to the first
2 presentation, Government of Nunavut. Go ahead, Lisa.

3 GOVERNMENT OF NUNAVUT SUBMISSION

4 MS. LECLERC: Mr. Chair, thank you.

5 Time has come today to actually present to the
6 public the GN recommendation to establish the total
7 allowable harvest for the Bathurst caribou. For
8 transparency and consistency, I would like to mention in
9 precise that the presentation that the GN's going to
10 publicly make available to the Board today was actually
11 presented to the different HTO in January.

12 So here I would like to precise the Government
13 of Nunavut DoE mandate. Under the Land Claim Agreement,
14 the Government of Nunavut Department of Environment
15 Wildlife Management has a legislated mandate for the
16 management of terrestrial wildlife species in Nunavut,
17 which also include caribou. And this responsibility is an
18 ongoing responsibility that involve the co-management
19 partner in Nunavut.

20 In order to do that, our first goal is to
21 archive a balanced approach for the wildlife management
22 that use both science and a traditional knowledge approach.
23 Our objective are then to provide updated information from
24 various source. It could be science or traditional
25 knowledge.

1 We also have further objective to develop
2 management plan with co-management partner, provide support
3 and resource for co-management partner and harvester and,
4 of course, (unintelligible) and regulatory compliance
5 through education and enforcement.

6 As you know, the Kitikmeot Region is really rich
7 in caribou as a numerous number of subpopulation in caribou
8 are found. As you can see in this picture, the
9 subpopulation not only found in Nunavut, but also across
10 many other jurisdiction, such as the Yukon Territory,
11 Alberta, Saskatchewan, and Manitoba. Each of these herd
12 have been defined by the female specificity to a particular
13 calving location, and this approach is not only used in
14 Nunavut but also apply all across North America.

15 This calving location and, therefore, the range
16 map have been widely accepted, and this information has
17 been gather through collar program over more than a 20-year
18 period. All this range was review many time by HTO, RWO
19 through development of different management plan meeting
20 and so on.

21 Of course, without further delay, I will have to
22 talk about the herd of interest today, and this is the
23 Bathurst herd. As you can see in that upper right corner,
24 the Bathurst herd is represented by the red colour. The
25 winter range of this herd expands to Northwest Territories,

1 and when the herd was this big, will also historically
2 winter in Saskatchewan. As the winter recess and the
3 spring take place, the herd progress make its way to their
4 calving ground, and at this time their movement stop to
5 give birth.

6 The picture below go back to the start of the
7 wintering of this herd in 1986. Since 1996 (verbatim), the
8 Bathurst calving ground have remained in the same location
9 where, each year, the collared female are eating at the
10 same location, representing a very high site fidelity for
11 over more than 20 years. At that time, the population
12 estimate were well above 300,000 caribou.

13 From 2006 to 2009, the most rapid decline occur.
14 This also affect to contract the range -- the herd range,
15 but also was the start to a very long discussion between
16 (unintelligible) group co-management partner, harvester,
17 and government. The 2009 estimate was 32,000, and at that
18 time the harvest rate was 4 to 6,000 caribou, which raised
19 a lot of concern due to the high harvesting rate.

20 So, on a yearly and monthly basis as new
21 information became available, the Department of Environment
22 reported a survey result to HTOs in KWB that was affected
23 by this herd, but also, as a public servant, we have our
24 due diligence to also communicate report those result with
25 the public, sometime going -- also reaching out to the high

1 school student on how the herd around the neighbourhood are
2 doing.

3 There is ongoing management plan and incentive,
4 ongoing public consultation, but also, in 2007, there were
5 West Kitikmeot caribou workshop that's been in place. This
6 workshop, held in Kugluktuk, provided an opportunity for
7 the participant to share their knowledge of the caribou
8 herd, as well as proposing several action. This report has
9 been online and widely review since 2007.

10 So, since 2014, an increase in participation in
11 consultation is imminent from what you can read on this
12 slides. And this was trigger by the 2014 reconnaissance
13 survey of the Bathurst herd as the reconnaissance survey
14 show that the herd was in serious decline.

15 So on September 9th, 2014, we sit down with the
16 HTO Kugluktuk to raise concern, position, and potential
17 recommendation. But there were also need to consult with
18 the public and inform them of the change in situation of
19 the herd. Since September 22, that's what was done. We
20 actually sit down with the community and the HTO.

21 To be fair, with the co-management partner, on
22 October 1st, we actually reach out of Bay Chimo and
23 Bathurst to make them aware of the new statutes and to make
24 them part of that new conversation.

25 In October 2000 -- October 9, there were the

1 first technical meeting where GN and NTI was participating.
2 The result of that meeting, a new population estimate was
3 brought into attention at the KRWB meeting couple days
4 later, a week later. And we fully wanted to engage all the
5 HTO to participate to the second technical meeting, and
6 that's what we did. The second technical meeting, the GN
7 and NTI participated, along with the HTOs.

8 From all this discussion, the GN took
9 (unintelligible) position to establish a TAH, 100 for
10 Bathurst and no incentive for predation control. On
11 January 30, Bathurst and Bay Chimo HTO was first consulted
12 on the GN recommendation. A total allowable harvest of 100
13 was clearly mentioned to them. In addition, on
14 February 2nd, the Kugluktuk HTO was also consulted. It was
15 the same TAH at that time, 100.

16 As you can see, at the end of that consultation
17 report, Mr. Chair, we could find a letter from the
18 Kugluktuk HTO. There were in need to actually have the
19 best information available to really discuss a TAH, and,
20 therefore, they wanted to hear about the result of the 2015
21 survey.

22 Of course, June came, and the survey was done.
23 They wanted active participation of the HTO delegate to the
24 survey: NTI, two GN biologists, wildlife technician, and
25 even the conservation officer.

1 In October 2015, the KRWB with all the HTOs
2 again consulted on a new population result, bringing the
3 expert to the table GNWT complete on that population
4 survey. So at that meeting, there were actually mention
5 that the consultation was not enough, and this was echoed
6 by the Kugluktuk HTO of concern expressed if we're going to
7 effort of consulting for the Baffin Island caribou issue,
8 but there were maybe a lack of initiative from the GN to
9 show that same consultation for the Kitikmeot report --
10 Kitikmeot Region.

11 So in January 2016, Mr. Chair -- and I really
12 want to point out that caribou harvest consultation, which
13 I think the title of the report and the meeting represent
14 well the goal of that two-days meeting.

15 When you look at the list of participant, you
16 will see that a full quorum for Bay Chimo HTO, Bathurst
17 HTO, Kugluktuk HTO, Cambridge Bay HTO, representative from
18 NTI, GN, GNWT was present at that meeting; but most
19 importantly, a delegate Elder of each community, to make
20 sure that the traditional knowledge and their vision on
21 this caribou management each year will be heard and
22 considered.

23 During that meeting, which was face to face,
24 transparent with all the delegate co-management partner
25 present, the revise in explanation -- the whole GN position

1 was clearly explained, and it was revised, and a new TAH
2 recommendation was explained based on, now, the new
3 information available.

4 As you can see also in the agenda, a full day
5 was set for caribou management action by the HTO,
6 community-based initiative, and possible solution to
7 implement harvest protection was at the agenda. The HTO in
8 this meeting was actually well aware that the GN will
9 submit the proposed recommendation for a TAH of 30 male
10 caribou to Bathurst herd to Nunavut Wildlife Management
11 Board for their March submission to the Board.

12 So what's the new population information that we
13 have? Well, the 2015 population estimate was 19,700
14 caribou, which was down from 35 caribou (verbatim) in 2015,
15 the last population census. This is a 37 percent
16 reduction. What is a little bit more alarming is, in 2009,
17 there were 16 (verbatim) breeding cow in the calving
18 ground, and in 2015, the new population survey counted only
19 8,000. This is a 50 percent decline in breeding female.

20 This was ongoing. From 2013 to 2015, the
21 calf-cow ratio is below normal. I could explain "below
22 normal." It's under what is needed for the herd to
23 recover, and this was not only in 2015 but for a couple
24 year. And, of course, we have low productivities since
25 2011.

1 From the 1986 survey, we're facing a 96 percent
2 lost. The GN position is that we now have the evidence
3 that we have a serious conservation concern, and we need to
4 address that, that decline. There's also a need to protect
5 Inuit harvest right, not only for now, but also for the
6 future generation.

7 Since 2010, we had had a 1 percent harvest on
8 the Bathurst herd with the GN incentive of 300 caribou and
9 the overall harvest on the GN side of 70.

10 Since 2014, there is a moratorium on the
11 Northwest Territories side with 15 tag located for the
12 summary purposes. So since 2014, before the survey, we
13 were looking at a harvest around 85, but the herd was still
14 declining.

15 Based on this information, we can see that the
16 Bathurst herd is very vulnerable. Not only the number
17 decline, but their population demographic show that the
18 herd cannot produce the number of caribou that they need.
19 To consider there is also environment factor -- forest
20 fire, climates change, development -- that all point to the
21 same direction.

22 So at this declining rate, biologically, the
23 herd cannot sustain any harvest. It would just push down
24 farther the declining of that herd; however, on NLCA there
25 is recognition for key economic importance to this herd for

1 Bay Chimo and the outpost camp, the cultural maintenance of
2 their skill practice; and, therefore, the GN was
3 recommended a harvest, negligible harvest of 0.15 percent,
4 which would represent 30 caribou. And that will be male
5 caribou.

6 We want to make sure that the herd -- we want to
7 jump start the herd. We're actually aware of the sex ratio
8 of this herd, and targeting the male could actually help
9 the female to produce more calf and have those calf be
10 recruited the following winter.

11 I will actually leave the floor to the question
12 period. Thank you.

13 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much, Lisa, for
14 your presentation.

15 So at this point in time I'll open up questions
16 to the Board, the Board Members. Any questions? Charlie,
17 go ahead.

18 NUNAVUT WILDLIFE MANAGEMENT BOARD QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

19 MR. INUARAK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

20 According to your written presentation, I know
21 they're well informed, but I do have a question. You are
22 saying that the Bathurst herd are declining. Although
23 there's written documents on this herd declining, how much
24 study or survey have you done? Do you do it every year?
25 Do you do the survey every year, or how much information of

1 surveys do you base this information on? Thank you.

2 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Charlie.

3 Lisa.

4 MS. LECLERC: Mr. Chairman, I'm going to try and
5 answer that question, and I'm going to leave Nunavut
6 Wildlife Management Board to maybe precise or add to what
7 I'm going to be saying.

8 When the herd is declining, there's an increase
9 in monitoring, so there were, like, population survey in
10 2012, but also reconnaissance survey done along the way.

11 So in 2014, we have a reconnaissance survey;
12 2015, a population survey; and, again last June, there were
13 another reconnaissance survey done to see if the trend of
14 the Bathurst herd has increased and stable or decreasing.
15 So the effort was of surveying increases.

16 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lisa.

17 And I suppose people should consider that the
18 research question with NWT being the lead in the research,
19 maybe we'll wait until after they make their presentation
20 next to address some of those questions.

21 Any other Board Member questions? If not,
22 staff? Peter?

23 NUNAVUT WILDLIFE MANAGEMENT BOARD STAFF QUESTIONS AND
24 COMMENTS

25 MR. KYDD: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

1 Thank you, Lisa, for the presentation. Just
2 following up with Charlie's question and to provide a
3 little clarity, can you explain what a reconnaissance
4 survey is versus an overall population survey? Thank you.

5 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Peter.

6 Lisa.

7 MS. LECLERC: Mr. Chair.

8 So a reconnaissance survey is actually to
9 monitor trend on the calving ground. So there's a 10
10 kilometre transect that flew that is consistent from year
11 to year reconnaissance survey.

12 When we talk about a population estimate, we
13 want to know a very precise number; therefore, we flew the
14 reconnaissance survey first to know the aggregation of
15 caribou, but then, after, we go back with a photo plane
16 survey to actually take picture of the high-density caribou
17 area, and those picture are analyzed, and each caribou in
18 that picture are counted one by one. We are looking for
19 precise estimate, and the transect line at that time could
20 be as close as two to five kilometres apart.

21 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lisa.

22 Peter, good? Okay. Legal, Michael.

23 MR. D'EÇA: Qujannamiik, itsivautaaq.

24 Lisa, I just want to turn to the January 2016
25 consultation, and even before that, let's say that whole

1 period 2014 to 2016 which you covered in your presentation.
2 During those two years, was there any discussion of the
3 development of a management plan or of a community-based
4 initiative? And, more specifically, what I'm asking is,
5 did either of the Inuit harvester organizations or the
6 government start or suggest such a discussion?

7 And I do note, and I think you noted in your
8 presentation, that, you know, day two of that January
9 meeting has on the agenda, you know, "Caribou management
10 actions, (HTOs), additional and supportive community-based
11 actions from the co-management partners," and it goes on to
12 talk about implementing harvest restrictions, HTOs' bylaws
13 enforcement, implementing solutions, a group discussion.

14 So if there were any of those kinds of
15 discussions, can you confirm that and maybe summarize, to a
16 certain extent, what took place during those parts of that
17 January 2016 meeting, but at any time during the two years?
18 Taima.

19 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Michael.

20 Lisa.

21 MS. LECLERC: Mr. Chair.

22 That discussion actually start to taking place
23 in 2012. There were a long-term process management plan
24 where all the community harvesting the Bathurst herd gather
25 in Yellowknife.

1 In addition, in 2016, there were Bathurst
2 caribou herd cooperative and advisory committee that was
3 formed with a draft of reference review at that meeting.
4 Thank you.

5 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lisa.
6 Michael.

7 MR. D'ÉÇA: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
8 Just a supplementary. So you said it started in
9 2012, and then the advisory committee was formed. Has the
10 advisory committee presented any recommendations? What
11 state is this management planning process at, at this time?
12 Taima.

13 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Michael.
14 Lisa.

15 MS. LECLERC: This management process is at the
16 initial state. There -- no recommendation at that point
17 from that group.

18 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lisa.
19 Okay. We're going to move on, and Kugluktuk, I
20 know you had your hand up for questions. We're going to
21 get to you very quickly. Soon. Okay? We have a list,
22 kind of, we're going to follow here.

23 So the next up for questions is GNWT.

24 MS. YONGE: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

25 Thank you, Lisa, for the presentation. We have

1 no questions.

2 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much.

3 The next up for question is Kitikmeot Regional
4 Wildlife Board. Any questions? Go ahead, Simon.

5 KITIKMEOT REGIONAL WILDLIFE BOARD QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

6 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

7 Thank you for the presentation, Lisa. On your
8 January 2016 consultation with the Kitikmeot Regional
9 Wildlife Board and the HTOs that are affected on the herd,
10 correct me if I'm wrong, but I need a clarification that
11 total allowable harvest was discussed. To my knowledge, we
12 discussed about caribou, but to my information, to my
13 knowledge, total allowable harvest wasn't fully discussed.
14 Thank you.

15 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Simon.

16 Lisa.

17 MS. LECLERC: Mr. Chair.

18 So the principle of conservation was discussed,
19 as well as what's happening when a herd faces serious
20 decline. The role of the HTO in such process was informed.
21 Like, the Nunavut management process was informed to the
22 HTO, and the proposal to establish a herd-specific TAH of
23 30 was brought to the table at that meeting, which...

24 So at this meeting we went through the same
25 slides. Thank you.

1 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lisa.

2 Simon? Any other questions from the regional
3 wildlife board? If not? We'll move on to Kugluktuk.

4 Do you have questions, Kugluktuk HTO?

5 KUGLUKTUK HTO QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

6 MR. KLENGENBERG: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Kevin
7 Klengenberg.

8 Does the GN have its own separate data from the
9 GNWT on these caribou herds that relate to the TAH? Thank
10 you.

11 THE CHAIR: Thank you.

12 Lisa.

13 MS. LECLERC: The survey work is done in
14 partnership, but GNWT is the data owner of those survey.
15 If there is a need to access those data, I'm sure that the
16 data sharing agreement could be taking place.

17 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lisa.

18 Any other questions, Kugluktuk?

19 MR. BOLT: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Jorgen from
20 Kugluktuk HTO.

21 I just want to ask, I see that your population
22 estimate here from 2006 to 2009, you could see from 1996 or
23 from 1990 to 1996 where it's been pretty stable, relatively
24 stable herd, and then all of a sudden from 1996 to 2003
25 there's a gap there, and then it just drops.

1 Just like to know, when these mines were
2 opened -- I know I've guided on those lakes before even
3 these mines were opened, Lac De Gras, Courageous Lake. And
4 I know these routes, these migration routes, these mines
5 put them right smack dab in the middle of their migration
6 route. And these migration routes, I've seen them where --
7 the traditional migration route, I've seen them, I've
8 walked on them. And how much effect does these mines have
9 on these traditional routes? Because I've seen them.

10 Now they're going to be opening up another mine,
11 and I know that's going right through their migration
12 route. I know it's to conserve calving grounds and
13 wintering grounds, but in between, there's a lot of rivers
14 and lakes and all these I don't know what you would say,
15 but now they're having to reroute their migration route,
16 and these calves that are going -- I know their routes.
17 There's a minimal amount of assuming area that they cross.
18 We call them nalluq, traditional, where caribou cross. How
19 much effect have these mines have on these migration
20 routes? Have you looked into that?

21 Because I know -- like I said, I hunted on those
22 lakes long before those mines were there, and I used to see
23 caribou go through there all the time every year until
24 those mines started coming. And I even worked as a
25 wildlife technician at the mines, and I would do weekly

1 caribou surveys, and I can see that year after year the
2 caribou seemed to be moving another way.

3 Are they finding a different migration route?
4 Is it more hazardous? Because they know this is the safest
5 route to get to their winter calving ground. That's why
6 they use those nalluq.

7 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

8 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much, Jorgen.

9 Lisa? Thank you. Mathieu.

10 MR. DUMOND: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

11 And, sorry, I came to sit based on your staff
12 recommendation. I didn't want to impose, but I may have
13 some further information, as I was in that position before.

14 Just to mention on the land use aspect, it is
15 considered, and it's not left aside; however, it's a
16 different process with different co-management partners
17 involved. The Kugluktuk HTO, along with the Burnside HTO,
18 are involved in the Bathurst caribou range plan. It's a
19 working group trying to work to see how land use on that
20 range can be sustainable and not affect caribou. So the
21 government is involved in that.

22 However, at the end, the Government of Nunavut
23 has no or very little jurisdiction over land use itself.
24 It's other organization taking those decisions. But it's
25 considered, and we're working on the land use aspect, as

1 well, and trying to see how it impacts and how we can
2 reduce or mitigate those impacts. Thank you.

3 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mathieu.

4 Any other questions from Kugluktuk? Kevin, go
5 ahead.

6 MR. KLENGENBERG: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

7 Why was it only males you have to harvest?

8 Thank you.

9 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Kevin.

10 Lisa.

11 MS. LECLERC: The justification to have a bull
12 harvest only was the fact that the female are actually --
13 the breeding female are declining. The survival of
14 breeding female are low. The female production are
15 declining, and the cow-calf ratio are also going downwards.
16 To try to increase the herd as soon as possible, if we
17 could not take the female, then we could maybe potentially
18 increase the female survival and also the chance for calf
19 to be born, and that calf number could increase, which
20 having a higher number of calf might affect the
21 recruitment. That's a little bit irrational for a bull
22 harvest.

23 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lisa.

24 MR. KLENGENBERG: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

25 Another one. The neighbouring herd, I believe,

1 was Ahiak. There's some questions on that one. Some of
2 the Bathurst herd can mix up with the other herd? Thank
3 you.

4 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Kevin.

5 Lisa.

6 MS. LECLERC: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

7 Based on collar information, there's a very low
8 percentage of female that go from one calving to the other,
9 so the herd is very consistent at the same calving area,
10 site fidelity. This year we flew from Bluenose Lake to
11 past Adelaide Peninsula. We didn't find any high
12 concentration of caribou.

13 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lisa. Mathieu, you
14 want to add?

15 MR. DUMOND: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

16 And I forgot the first time. I'm Mathieu
17 Dumond. I'm the Regional Manager for the Kitikmeot for the
18 Government of Nunavut Department of Environment.

19 And I just wanted to add -- and I'm sure the
20 GNWT presentation will show more of that -- but basically
21 since 2005-2006, the -- when we realized that several herds
22 had -- were showing signs of decline, an effort, especially
23 by the GNWT, was made to monitor those herds on a yearly
24 basis and pretty much across the whole mainland in Nunavut.
25 And Nunavut government did some of the herds as well. And

1 there was a common effort to survey pretty much all the
2 barren ground caribou on the mainland, nearly every year,
3 at least, to have reconnaissance survey to see the
4 distribution of those caribou and the general trend of
5 those caribou from year to year.

6 So it's just to explain that, with that amount
7 of coverage over the whole mainland nearly each year, there
8 hasn't been observation of mass movement or mass shift of
9 caribou from one area to the other; and at this time, the
10 trends across pretty much all northern Canada for all
11 caribou is towards a decline. So there's really no
12 evidence that some caribou would have shifted to another
13 area and thrive (verbatim) in that area while they are
14 declining somewhere else. Thank you.

15 THE CHAIR: Thank you for that addition,
16 Mathieu. Okay. We'll move on, then, to -- oh, go ahead,
17 Kugluktuk. You got more. Sorry.

18 MR. L. ADJUN: We got a whole bunch.

19 THE CHAIR: Okay.

20 MR. L. ADJUN: Getting back to this page
21 regarding the caribou population, do you have any
22 historical data? Because I know from using traditional
23 knowledge, from 1960s, we had a low in the spike of the
24 caribou population, along with the muskox population, as
25 presented to KIA and Kugluktuk HTO by Susan Coutts who does

1 the muskox population studies.

2 She showed a trend, in the early '60s, of the
3 low of the caribou population at its lowest point, and it
4 was a trend also with the muskox, and then it came back up
5 in the '80s. And then I see -- like, stated it from here,
6 but how much traditional knowledge are you really imposing
7 on your information? Because I don't see any information
8 regarding the spikes of traditional knowledge. As we know
9 from Inuit side, caribou populations, any population does
10 have a rise and spike or rise and fall with their
11 populations.

12 I was just wondering if you have any traditional
13 knowledge studies imposed or gathered in your information.
14 As I said, I got some good information from Susan Coutts,
15 who is a muskox biologist, and she showed me a trend, along
16 with muskox and the caribou from the low end from the '60s
17 to '80s and now down back to its low end again.

18 I'm just wondering if you have any historical
19 data like that from traditional knowledge. Do you have any
20 information used from a traditional knowledge study from
21 KIA?

22 I think that will be it for now.

23 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry.

24 Lisa, Mathieu, go ahead.

25 MR. DUMOND: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

1 Mathieu Dumond, Department of Environment.

2 Just, I think there's no question or no deny on
3 the cycle of caribou going from low to high to low. That's
4 the natural cycle, and that's well documented through
5 traditional knowledge, I mean, and there's no question
6 about that.

7 I think what we're facing right now is, is that
8 the situation and the human population and the land use and
9 the harvesting activities and possibilities have changed
10 over time, and we're facing a decision where, you know,
11 it's a natural cycle, so let's let it be. But we're doing
12 things that may affect that cycle and the length of
13 recovery that will affect future generation and the ability
14 to harvest caribou in the future, potentially. So it is
15 with that in mind that actions are proposed.

16 It's not to say that it's not natural or that
17 there's no natural cycles or anything. There's no question
18 about that up and down of caribou population. I think it's
19 just that our action today will determine probably how long
20 we gonna be with very little or no caribou. Thank you.

21 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Matthew.

22 Larry.

23 MR. L. ADJUN: On another point in regard to
24 predation of culling, I know the GNWT or the GN is
25 following GNWT's footsteps, because we all know the GN

1 doesn't have that much money to do any studies for funds.

2 Another part of that, in regards to wolf culls
3 and grizzly bear culls -- I stated this already last month
4 for the Sabina hearings -- is the GN going to put any money
5 or funding in the future for incentives that the GNWT has
6 for wolves or grizzly bears?

7 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry.

8 Drikus?

9 MR. GISSING: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

10 Drikus Gissing from the Department of
11 Environment.

12 At this time, no, we have no intention of
13 initiating any wolf cull or grizzly cull or incentive
14 programs. The issue has been discussed within the
15 department, and there's a lot of examples in other places
16 in the country where these initiatives do not work. They
17 actually result in more wolves than actually addressing the
18 issue, unless you put in a lot of money and a lot of time
19 and lot of effort in culling these wolves from helicopters.
20 But, you know, the effort there is significant, and at this
21 stage we are not considering that.

22 I'm not saying that we won't consider it in
23 future. It all depend on requests from communities to
24 government and what pressure is put on government. It
25 might happen, but at this time we are not considering that,

1 no.

2 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Drikus.

3 Larry, any more questions?

4 Okay. At this time I think in the interest for
5 all of us we're going to take a 15-minute coffee break. Be
6 back in 15.

7 (ADJOURNMENT)

8 THE CHAIR: Okay. If I can ask everybody to
9 get settled again. Okay. We'll continue on. We'll
10 continue on with Kugluktuk HTO. Is there any further
11 questions.

12 MR. TAKTOGON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

13 The consultations, the numbers for that Bathurst
14 herd, why was it from 300 right down to 100, now it's 30?

15 THE CHAIR: Could you please state that
16 question again? Thank you.

17 MR. TAKTOGON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

18 The numbers when we're down now, just wondering
19 about from 300 and now it goes down to 100. And so it's
20 really, without consulting the communities, why was the
21 numbers put down?

22 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much.

23 Lisa.

24 MS. LECLERC: Mr. Chair.

25 We consulted the community on the declining of

1 the Bathurst herd in September 22, 2014, and we actually
2 take a step further and went to the school to have a poster
3 done with the high school student informing them on the
4 decline of the herd around their community. Thank you.

5 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lisa.

6 Does that answer your question? Go ahead,
7 Larry.

8 MR. L. ADJUN: Larry Adjun, Chairman of Kugluktuk
9 HTO.

10 Are your numbers derived from GNWT? Because I
11 don't know if you guys are getting your own numbers for the
12 population estimate for the harvester to have because I
13 believe, at one point, as one of my directors pointed, it
14 was at 300, now down to one. Who sets the quota numbers?
15 Is it GNWT or GN for the Bathurst caribou?

16 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry.
17 Lisa.

18 MS. LECLERC: Mr. Chair.

19 The population number is consistent across the
20 two generation restriction, but for the harvesting rate,
21 it's proposal by the GN.

22 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lisa.
23 Larry.

24 MR. L. ADJUN: No, further questions.

25 THE CHAIR: Any further questions from

1 Kugluktuk? If not, we'll move on to the next entity.

2 Bathurst Inlet HTO, any questions?

3 BATHURST INLET HTO QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

4 MR. BOLT: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

5 Thank you, Lisa, for your presentation. I have
6 a couple of questions. My first question is on your
7 surveys. I believe that your surveys are mostly
8 concentrated on the calving grounds. I'm just wondering if
9 you've done any surveys outside the calving ground. If so,
10 how much has been done? Thanks.

11 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much.

12 Lisa.

13 MS. LECLERC: Mr. Chair.

14 Without getting into further detail, I'm going
15 to leave the GNWT to really show the map in their
16 presentation of the overall area that was surveyed in 2015,
17 but not only the core calving area survey but also an area
18 around it is taken into consideration. Thank you.

19 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lisa.

20 Jorgen.

21 MR. BOLT: Okay. Thank you. I'll wait for
22 that.

23 And my second question is on your population
24 estimates there from 35,000 to 19,000. That's a pretty big
25 number of declining caribou. I mean, with that big number,

1 I'm sure that people would see evidence of dead caribou
2 somewhere sometime with all the traffic, Ski-Doos,
3 airplanes, exploration, and stuff like that.

4 I'm just wondering. In your surveys have you
5 seen or heard of anything like that? Because I'm sure if
6 there's that many dead caribou there's going to be bears
7 feeding, animals feeding, foxes feeding. But to my
8 knowledge, nobody seen evidence of dead caribou that
9 puts -- I'm just wondering. If nobody seen that, then
10 maybe the animals are just moving away somewhere. Thank
11 you.

12 THE CHAIR: Thank you for that question.

13 Lisa.

14 MS. LECLERC: Mr. Chair.

15 I think that we share the same understanding
16 that there are not that much caribou that, you know, we've
17 seen or been reported just dead on the tundra. So it's not
18 a matter of dead caribou. It's actually caribou not being
19 born. Thank you.

20 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lisa.

21 Jorgen.

22 MR. BOLT: Thank you. No further questions.

23 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thank you very much. And I
24 think maybe we'll get more answers to that once GNWT does
25 their presentation, too.

1 Next on the list is Bay Chimo HTO. Any
2 questions?

3 BAY CHIMO HTO QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

4 MR. P. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

5 Peter Kapolak from HTO.

6 Do you have any concrete evidence why the
7 caribou are declining so rapidly, scientifically? Thank
8 you.

9 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Peter.

10 Lisa, go ahead.

11 MS. LECLERC: Lisa here, research biologist.

12 We don't have the exact cause of the decline
13 because, when a caribou population plum (verbatim), it's a
14 cumulative effect. There is environmental factor and human
15 factor to take into consideration. Thank you.

16 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lisa.

17 Peter?

18 MR. P. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

19 The other question was asked by Kugluktuk, so no
20 further questions. Thank you.

21 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much.

22 Move on to the next questioner is Cambridge Bay
23 HTO.

24 CAMBRIDGE BAY HTO QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

25 MR. GREENLEY: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Bobby

1 Greenley, Chairperson of the HTO.

2 I have a couple questions. The first one is,
3 you had mentioned in I think it was 2012 that you had
4 started an advisory committee during the decline of the
5 herd. Who consists of this committee? Who creates this
6 committee, advisory committee? Thank you.

7 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Bobby.

8 Lisa.

9 MS. LECLERC: Mr. Chair.

10 So in 2012, there was a versional (phonetic)
11 gathering to have incentive to create such a group, and in
12 2016, in the end of January when the term of the reference
13 draft was review, delegate from HTO, Bay Chimo, Bathurst,
14 KRWB was at that meeting, as well as aboriginal group from
15 Northwest Territories.

16 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lisa.

17 Bobby.

18 MR. GREENLEY: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

19 Second question. During your survey, when you
20 do your survey, do you also keep track of the predator
21 numbers? Do you log those in a book and see if they're
22 increasing over the years on each survey? We all know
23 there's grizzly bears, wolves increasing. Thank you.

24 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Bobby.

25 Lisa.

1 MS. LECLERC: Thank you.

2 Bobby, to answer your question, I need to --
3 like, when we do a survey, muskox, grizzly, fox, and wolf
4 are recorded as a sighting observation; however, those
5 observation is not a population or wolf population or
6 grizzly population indicator.

7 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lisa.

8 Bobby, anything else?

9 MR. GREENLEY: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

10 Last question from me. How many caribou were
11 originally collared, and how many are left that are
12 currently moving, I guess you'd say? Thank you.

13 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Bobby.

14 Lisa.

15 MS. LECLERC: Lisa here.

16 For the exact number, I would have to defer that
17 answer to GNWT.

18 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lisa.

19 Again, there's information that will probably
20 come forward there.

21 Any more from Cambridge Bay HTO? Go ahead.

22 MR. G. ANGOHIATOK: Yes. George Angohiatok from HTO.

23 One of the things I always hear about when we do
24 have a concern with any of the animals in the north, -- or
25 any place, for that matter -- is in my basis, the least

1 amount of impact on the caribou herd is the humans, and
2 that is always, you know, the concentration of trying to
3 work on. You know, we have to look at the other impacts.

4 And the reason I'm saying is that I've observed
5 over my lifetime on the Bathurst caribou herd that one pack
6 of wolves would follow for eight hours, and their numbers
7 was about 30 animals, and in that one day we counted about
8 six animals that this one pack consumed.

9 Now, one pack consumed six animals in a short
10 period time every day over the years, you know, is a larger
11 number than the human population impact is on the herd.
12 And I think I mentioned this in our January meeting that
13 something has to be done. You know, it's not only the
14 humans that are bringing the numbers down.

15 I'm speaking from, you know, my personal
16 experience over the years as to what other things impact
17 these animals, and the largest impact, to me, is the
18 predators, and nothing is being done to look at these or to
19 bring the numbers down.

20 So that has to be included also when we're doing
21 this discussion, is not only concentrate on the human
22 impact on the herds, but also the predators which do have a
23 larger -- probably two, three times. you know, we can't
24 say. What I'm talking about is one pack of wolves.

25 Now, how many packs are in that area is unknown

1 by our biologists and by hunters, but we have a good idea
2 that, you know, numbers are far greater now than before.
3 So there has to be something done other than the human side
4 of the impacts. Thank you.

5 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jorgen.

6 Again, I think maybe we'll find out more of that
7 information after GNWT's presentation. But, Lisa, if you'd
8 like to comment at all.

9 MS. LECLERC: No comment.

10 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thank you. Any other
11 questions from Cambridge Bay?

12 Okay. We'll move on next to the Elders from the
13 four HTOs that are here. If there's any questions that
14 Elders would like, questions from Kugluktuk, Bathurst,
15 Bay Chimo, or Cambridge Bay.

16 Larry, go ahead.

17 ELDERS QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

18 MR. L. ADJUN: Just for clarity's sake, we're
19 only given five people to come here from Kugluktuk, and out
20 of that we have two knowledgeable hunters and Elders from
21 our board. That will be Mr. Taktogon and Mr. Jorgen Bolt.
22 We did not consider having the Elder coming here. So I'd
23 like to state for the record we only have five delegates
24 from Kugluktuk to attend this meeting here in Cambridge, so
25 Peter and Jorgen Bolt will be our IQ representatives.

1 THE CHAIR: Thank you for that information,
2 Larry. Any questions from your delegation, from Elders?
3 Go ahead.

4 MR. S. ANGOHIATOK: I know what you're talking about,
5 the herd that you're talking about. But us with
6 knowledge -- I cannot go out hunting anymore -- I believe
7 that we look for them. Even though they're far away, we go
8 far away to look for the caribou. And nowadays you don't
9 see the ones that we know. I know that the wolves also
10 hunt caribou. There's lots of wolves during the winter,
11 and that is a difficulty for the caribou.

12 (No translation) you heard the interpreters that
13 are Inuk -- because they sometimes drown in the water while
14 they're crossing. We know that they work to help us. I
15 thank you for coming before us because I have knowledge
16 since I was a young person. That's what I wanted to say
17 because I have knowledge of the caribou. Thank you for
18 coming before us.

19 We look for them, but at times we have
20 difficulty finding the caribou. I believe that. Thank you
21 very much. We have to work together, because there are
22 ways we can work together. Thank you.

23 But right now I believe we're talking about,
24 today, the declining of Bathurst herd because caribou are
25 our main diet. In the fall time there used to be a big

1 herd coming through. So nowadays it's -- the caribou are
2 declining. It's kind of hard to say because I don't -- I
3 hardly ever go out hunting anymore because I'm getting on
4 in my years.

5 So my knowledge is that it's not always easy
6 when you're hunting for caribou, try to locate where the
7 caribou are, because many years ago we used to have to go
8 long ways, long distance to go caribou hunting.

9 So there's -- because I know the biologists are
10 here, they're the ones that do the hunting. Because
11 nowadays there are a lot of people that's going out
12 hunting.

13 And even though when they try to cross to the
14 mainland is when they go through the ice and drown. So we
15 have to have some way we can -- we have to do something
16 about the declining of the caribou.

17 And I would like to -- I really appreciate for
18 you people to come here to listen to us, and I do have a
19 traditional knowledge of caribou from way back, so that's
20 how it is today. Because I know there's a number of people
21 living here that know the traditional knowledge, and they
22 may have a knowledge of declining caribou around this
23 table.

24 So we went through hardships many years ago, so
25 we cannot forget those because that's right. Now it's

1 known that hunters are hunting any caribou more easily
2 without having any hardship. And I would like to thank
3 each and every one of you putting your heads together and
4 think this over.

5 Thank you all.

6 THE CHAIR: Thank you.

7 Any other Elders? Go ahead.

8 MR. HANILIAK: That is the case now. I still
9 remember in 1960, because there was hardly any caribou
10 around this island here, but we used to hunt these Peary
11 Caribou when they came around once in a while. We call
12 this pawet (phonetic) caribou, our caribou here. Because
13 we hardly had any caribou back in the '60s, but when we
14 were moving on through the years, the caribou started
15 coming around, and there was plentiful in the later years
16 as well.

17 So even the barren ground caribou started coming
18 up here, so -- the caribou herd, because are they bigger?
19 Because Peary caribou are much smaller than barren ground
20 caribou and probably from the island caribou as well, so I
21 was just adding on to what Sam was saying here. Because we
22 had to go long ways to go caribou hunting. It was never
23 easy back then because we have to go long ways.

24 The predators have increased from way back. We
25 are now told by governments, from the employees, that

1 caribou are declining. We're aware that, yes, maybe they
2 will return. At some point they will return. We don't
3 know. That's our food, the caribou.

4 He's an Elder. He understands how you need to
5 listen to. I'm getting to that point of being an Elder.

6 I understand because I travelled with this Elder
7 as a young man years ago. We hunted caribou, and it was
8 hard to find at times. Years ago there was not much
9 caribou around. It seemed they'd increase, maybe nowadays
10 are using different routes. Even on the mainland, they
11 travel to the mainland in the fall. In the spring they
12 return to Victoria Island. It seems the numbers are
13 depleting. Maybe others are using different routes. Maybe
14 that's the case of us thinking that they're depleting.

15 Yes, we're worried about this, but you need to
16 think of us, too. We're going to get to the point where
17 we're going to need caribou, but they're not going to be
18 around. We understand very well, this Elder and I.
19 Because that's their only main country food also, you need
20 to think at some point maybe they might not be around. In
21 Nunavut and the NWT people are telling us that caribou are
22 depleting in numbers. Here in Cambridge Bay that seems to
23 be the case also.

24 But you need to adhere to what we're saying.
25 Our caribou need to be looked after. Environment is the

1 way it is. That's nature. This Elder has often told me
2 we're going to reach that point of going through tough
3 times sometime in the future.

4 Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

5 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much for that
6 information.

7 Peter.

8 MR. TAKTOGON: I'm always against shooting
9 bulls. I know in the past the bulls are the main breeders.

10 And another thing, too, grizzly bears and wolf
11 populations is really, really going north. Now they're
12 reaching Cambridge Bay, the grizzly bears and everything.

13 Like the Elders here in the past, people used to
14 live out on the land. They control the predators and
15 whatever on the land. Like, the caribou, they used to
16 equalize them. They were only shooting bulls all the time.
17 That's how it was done in the past.

18 Now peoples are living in the communities.
19 Nobody's hunting, nobody's trapping, nobody's controlling
20 the predators anymore. That's the reason why the
21 predators' population is going right up and our caribou is
22 going right down.

23 Another problem, too, the Government of
24 Northwest Territories, in the past, they were controlling
25 grizzly -- muskox population. Peoples were not allowed to

1 shoot muskox, and the muskox is reaching right down to
2 Sahtu or whatever. In Kugluktuk region the population is
3 right up, and it's going way south now. It's getting out
4 of hand. Maybe it might be affecting the caribou.

5 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

6 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much. Peter. I'm
7 not sure if there was a question in there, but it's very,
8 very good information.

9 Is there any other Elders that would like to
10 speak to the Board? Go ahead.

11 MR. TAKTOGON: Many years ago the family, many
12 families have to hunt for their family and for their kids,
13 and there was a plentiful amount of animals way back then.
14 In my younger days I still remember those.

15 And springtime when the wolves are making pups,
16 and there's hardly any wolves, predators, back then. Right
17 now it's really hard to control the wolf population because
18 they're getting more and more.

19 So back in NWT days, government used to control
20 the population of wolves, but nowadays it's not being
21 properly controlled, so that's why we notice the declining
22 of the caribou herd, Bathurst herd. And way, way back when
23 I was in my younger days there used to be big herds coming
24 through when they're migrating either way, springtime
25 migrating up north and in the fall time migrating south.

1 And even though the hunters are not getting as
2 much caribou like they did in the past, but I guess the
3 ones that are the ones to blame are the wolves, and those
4 predators are the ones to really blame, because nowadays
5 even the hunters are not getting that many caribou anymore,
6 and still our caribou population is going down. Because I
7 still remember from my parents' day we used to live out on
8 the land, and they used to hunt wolves. They hunted both
9 caribou and wolves back then.

10 That's about all I have to say for now. I may
11 have something else to say a bit later. Thank you,
12 Mr. Chair.

13 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much for your
14 information, Peter.

15 Lisa.

16 MS. LECLERC: Can you repeat the question,
17 please?

18 THE CHAIR: Yes, Peter, can you repeat the
19 question, please.

20 MR. TAKTOGON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

21 (No translation) representative absolutely
22 sought the advice of the HTOs, or did it actually just
23 engage in information session?

24 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Peter.

25 Lisa.

1 MS. LECLERC: The DoE felt that the HTO was
2 consulted on the GN DoE TAH proposal for the Bathurst herd
3 management recommendation on the Bathurst herd.

4 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lisa.

5 Go ahead, sir.

6 MR. ANGOHIATOK: I was going to say that, regarding
7 the wolves and grizzly bear population, it seems to be --
8 those wildlife seem to be more of a concern to governments.
9 The hunters need to be assisted more, it seems. Why is our
10 Nunavut government not assisting us? Those are my
11 comments. Thank you.

12 THE CHAIR: Mathieu, go ahead.

13 MR. DUMOND: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Mathieu
14 Dumond, Government of Nunavut.

15 Well, the predator issue has always been on the
16 table and just brought by the communities and discussed,
17 and I think the difficult thing is to communicate
18 efficiently to each other on what it implies and what it
19 means.

20 And at this time, the Government of Nunavut or
21 the Nunavut Wildlife Management Board has set no limitation
22 on Inuit harvest of predators, so there's no limitation on
23 the number of animals that can be taken, in terms of
24 predators. And like Drikus explained, it is extremely
25 difficult and unlikely to result in significant positive

1 results on the long term to establish any type of organized
2 control of predators. It has been tried in other
3 jurisdiction, and, in general, it does not work, or require
4 some resources that are beyond what we can expect to have.

5 Like, we're talking -- to be efficient with
6 predator control, we're talking very invasive harvest and
7 culling of predators to have somewhat an effect. So this
8 is what makes it difficult to move forward with what the
9 communities have said, and we have heard it, and I think
10 the fact that at this time there's no limitation on
11 predators with acknowledging that some species would maybe
12 necessitate some level of protection to be sustainable in
13 the ecosystem, there's still no limitation on predator
14 harvest, and just that is an opportunity to have
15 community-based programs to address this issue.

16 And just to mention that the Government does
17 have some programs to assist harvesters in a more general
18 way, maybe not geared towards predator harvest
19 specifically, but we do have some programs that assist
20 harvesters in different ways that can be accessed through
21 our department and that are linked to harvesting
22 activities. Thank you.

23 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mathieu.

24 Is there any other questions from our Elder
25 representation? Jorgen?

1 MR. BOLT: Yeah, Jorgen Kugluktuk HTO.

2 Just a quick question to whoever may be up
3 there. I just want clarification on definition of
4 "consultation" or "information session." Can you define
5 "consultation" for me?

6 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jorgen.

7 MR. BOLT: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

8 THE CHAIR: Drikus.

9 MR. GISSING: The way we consult with the
10 communities is we go to communities, and we send staff to
11 communities to communicate the results of surveys. For
12 instance, in the issue of total allowable harvest, we go to
13 communities and present the best available information that
14 we've collected, scientific and traditional knowledge, and,
15 where possible, we try to accommodate the concerns and
16 requests from communities. Sometimes we can accommodate,
17 and sometimes we can't. And then we bring that forward,
18 back to the Nunavut Wildlife Management Board, who will
19 then make a decision and a recommendation to the minister.

20 So the consultation process, where possible, we
21 try to accommodate the concerns and input from the
22 communities. And it's at that same time we also collect
23 information from the communities, oral presentations by
24 Elders, for instance, as we're getting at this meeting
25 today. So this is a way of consultation, as well.

1 And the Board Members are listening and taking
2 your advice, as well. And we do the same in community
3 consultations, and there's been a lot of instances over the
4 years where we have changed our position and
5 recommendations to the Nunavut Wildlife Management Board
6 based on consultations with communities. I hope that
7 answers the question.

8 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Drikus.

9 Go ahead, sir.

10 MR. TIKHAK: Yeah, I just wanted to thank our
11 regional biologist for the hard work she has been doing
12 keeping us informed of, you know, what's happening with our
13 wildlife and, you know, keeping us up to date with the
14 numbers. Thank you.

15 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much.

16 Go ahead.

17 MR. HANILIAK: Thank you.

18 As you mentioned, thank you for you around the
19 table wanting to help. I want to assist also wherever I
20 can.

21 We often think of these things, we envision
22 things. We want our livelihood. At times it's tough.
23 Things you buy in the stores and places is very expensive.
24 Years ago we had money we could buy lots with very little
25 bit of money, but nowadays money doesn't go very far.

1 Thank you for trying to assist each other. If
2 you're not together, we've often thought of one vision or
3 we seem to think of one vision, see one vision. And thank
4 you for all your assistance in trying to help each other.
5 Thank you.

6 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much. Thank you
7 very much for being here, to all the Elders that presented,
8 and of course, you'll be here for the rest of the time that
9 we're here, too, helping us out.

10 Okay. We're going to move on to our next
11 questioners, which is Nunavut Tunngavik Incorporated.
12 Paul.

13 NUNAVUT TUNNGAVIK INCORPORATED QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

14 MR. IRNGAUT: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

15 I'd like to thank the Elders, first of all, for
16 their comments. I just want to say, I have a question. I
17 just have a comment and a question to the government.

18 The pictures that are behind us, the ones, the
19 Elders on the wall. They won't be there -- they're there
20 because they lived off the land, off the wildlife; and
21 their grandchildren, their children are around because of
22 them because they were able to survive, and some of them
23 only lived, ate caribou, consumed caribou meat. That is a
24 privilege.

25 I have a question to the GN. When you produced

1 the total allowable harvest, the first people that are
2 affected are the harvesters, and they are affected, and
3 they have to follow the total allowable harvest.

4 My question is, what about, have you considered
5 the effects that the total allowable harvest -- as you
6 said, are they affected, too, regarding polar bears,
7 caribou, whichever?

8 And how has the mining company affected the
9 harvesters? We heard that they have made roads where the
10 migration routes were, and also, even I don't know where
11 the calving grounds are, but we were told that they also
12 have routes on the calving grounds of the caribou. Have
13 you considered that? What have you done to that, first of
14 all? Thank you to GN.

15 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Paul.

16 Government of Nunavut, Mathieu.

17 MR. DUMOND: I think we're trying to look at
18 every aspect that can affect wildlife and, in this case,
19 caribou. Just as I mentioned earlier, regarding the land
20 use, there's other process, other organizations that are
21 involved in that, and trying to address cumulative effects
22 of everything that impact caribou is quite a task, but it
23 is on the table, and we are trying, through different
24 venues and with different organization, trying to address
25 that.

1 The bottom line is that there's only a few
2 things that we can act on as people, as managers. There's
3 only a few aspect that we can influence and modify and the
4 main ones being the land use and the harvest. Thank you.

5 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mathieu.

6 Paul.

7 MR. IRNGAUT: Thank you, Mathieu.

8 I have a question. My next question is, what
9 does the government do to protect -- I know that the land
10 use plan that you keep mentioning, but what have you done
11 to protect the calving grounds? What have you done? Have
12 you started working on that regarding protecting the
13 calving grounds?

14 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Paul.

15 Mathieu.

16 MR. DUMOND: Well, at this time, and again
17 without repeating myself too much, like, there's other
18 organizations that are in charge of the land use, mainly,
19 and the government has expressed their position regarding
20 calving ground. We are involved with every project, in
21 terms of review of impact assessment and trying to provide
22 recommendations to the Nunavut Impact Review Board, in
23 particular, on mitigation conditions or concerns regarding
24 some activities in some areas, some wildlife habitat,
25 including calving ground, and at this time, this is what we

1 can do.

2 Again, other organization have much more power
3 over what's happening on the land from, well, ultimately on
4 crown land if all government has the final say, and on
5 Inuit own land, the regional Inuit organization have the
6 power also to set conditions or decide what would be
7 happening on those lands. And I think those organization
8 have much more ability to address this issue than the
9 government at this time, but we're trying through the
10 process to at least raise our concern or the concern of our
11 partners. Thank you.

12 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mathieu.

13 Bert.

14 MR. DEAN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Bert
15 Dean with Nunavut Tunngavik.

16 Thanks, Lisa, for your presentation. I was able
17 to attend the meeting or the consultations in January,
18 along with a lot of the other delegates, and I realize a
19 lot of the concerns around consultation are what the impact
20 of this TAH is going to be on the communities.

21 And I know a number of years ago the government
22 had done a lot of work and community consultations on
23 developing a caribou strategy, and then it wasn't funded by
24 the government. As far as I know, there was no funding put
25 in place. There was a lot of expectations, a lot of

1 community consultations to talk about how are we going to
2 manage caribou? And I'm just wondering -- and not to put
3 you on the spot -- not specifically for you, Lisa, maybe
4 others can try and respond; but what is the status of that
5 strategy?

6 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Bert.

7 Government of Nunavut, Drikus.

8 MR. GISSING: The caribou strategy was done.

9 Just the implementation plan, we have not received funding
10 for the implementation part of that, but we have received
11 and we have been committing a lot more money in our
12 department towards caribou research. And so as you might
13 be aware or not aware, but basically we're doing a lot more
14 work on most of our caribou herds at the moment, especially
15 the ones that are in decline. So I think we are addressing
16 a lot of aspects of the caribou strategy already through
17 just our current research programs and plans.

18 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Drikus. Bert.

19 MR. DEAN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

20 And the reason I bring that up is the
21 communities have asked for, especially Bathurst and
22 Umingmaktok. Because they're the main harvesters of the
23 caribou at the moment, they're the ones that have been
24 relying on it for the last number of years, but they're
25 being asked to make a huge sacrifice and to reduce or stop

1 their harvest and to make some big changes.

2 And whether it's Kugluktuk's comments about
3 development and impacts from different things, or if it's
4 surveys and research and how are communities being
5 involved, my experience is we're really reactive. We're
6 trying our best. We're doing these meetings, we're flying
7 people in, we're putting them on the hot seat or, you know,
8 on the spot because I think everybody recognizes there are
9 some low numbers of caribou and different things are
10 happening with the caribou. But it's not the best way to
11 create co-management or a trusting relationship, especially
12 for implementation if we want people to follow whatever
13 limitations are going to be put into place.

14 And you'll hear more as the hearing goes on, but
15 there is a lot of history, not just with this herd but with
16 other herds, and I just hope that doesn't get lost.

17 There's been a lot of work done at the community
18 level, especially by the Kugluktuk HTO, and it just seems
19 all of that is forgotten because we have to put a TAH in,
20 and initially at one of the meetings we held with the
21 delegates from Bathurst Inlet and Umingmaktok, we talked
22 about a TAH of a hundred, and I think the current harvest
23 is 70, and then that radically changed down to 30 because
24 numbers were lower.

25 And this comes back to one of the earlier

1 questions. Why is this herd declining? Is it because of
2 the harvest? And if it's not because of the harvest, will
3 a small harvest have, like, a major detrimental effect, or
4 can a small harvest be tolerated?

5 And again, I'm bringing this up in context
6 because the question I have is, from NTI's perspective --
7 and we're working with all regions -- and there's a major
8 concern with caribou in the Baffin. That population is at
9 5,000, approximately, is what they're estimating, and
10 there's a TAH of 250. So why on a population of 17,000,
11 that's triple what's on Baffin Island, is the recommended
12 TAH 30? What's the difference that makes the TAH have to
13 be that much smaller for the Kitikmeot Region? Thank you.

14 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Bert.

15 Government of Nunavut? Drikus?

16 MR. GISSING: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

17 I'll try and answer the first part of the
18 question, and then I'm going to refer to my scientific
19 supporters here, Lisa and Mathieu, to respond to the
20 request, the question about why such a small TAH, and they
21 can try and explain that to you.

22 On your concern that we're not proactive and
23 very reactive, in a lot of cases it might seem like that,
24 but Lisa spent a lot of time this morning explaining the
25 consultation process that we've been in the region, the

1 activities of the regional staff working with the HTOs over
2 the years; the surveys that have taken place, the
3 involvement of communities, the consultations and meetings
4 that have taken place over a long period of time to bring
5 awareness of the decline of this herd. So this decline
6 where, we're sitting has been coming for a number of years,
7 and we've done a lot of consultation.

8 But as per the claim, and it's also our
9 government do not want to just impose harvest restrictions.
10 People we know that it's controversial, and we do it as a
11 last resort, and that is where we've come to now. This
12 population has declined significantly. You know, if you
13 look at historic numbers, this herd was in the hundreds of
14 thousands and has gone down to likely less than 20,000, and
15 that represents a conservation concern from our point of
16 view. And under the Claim we believe there is grounds to
17 start coming forward with recommendations to put
18 limitations on Inuit harvesting.

19 And it's not an easy decision. It's not
20 something we take very lightly, and we've been criticized
21 as a government, even from other jurisdictions who have
22 taken action, about why we as a Nunavut government haven't
23 taken action, and the reason for that was that we believed
24 at that time that we haven't done adequate consultation and
25 haven't looked at other options in working with HTOs.

1 But the continued decline is a concern, and the
2 only aspect of this decline that we as a government can
3 really manage is the human aspect, the harvesting and
4 things like development, as well as Mathieu mentioned early
5 on, we are very actively involved in the land-use planning
6 aspects and development and the NIRB processes. We have a
7 department and staff that is fully committed and working on
8 those aspects as well.

9 But we are now at the stage where this is almost
10 a crisis situation, and bringing quotas into place or total
11 allowable harvest into place might not immediately halt the
12 decline because the decline, there could be other factors
13 like vegetation, environmental factors causing the decline.
14 But at low numbers, harvesting could hamper recovery, and
15 that's the reason why we've come forward with harvest
16 restrictions and recommendations on this herd.

17 But as you know, on Baffin Island, Southampton
18 Island there are other herds where we've done it as well,
19 and the intention there is to help recovery once the
20 environment is ready to allow those herds to recover.

21 And again I'm going to hand this over to Lisa or
22 Mathieu to maybe try and explain this specific harvest
23 number that's being proposed.

24 MS. LECLERC: Mr. Chair, Lisa.

25 To add a little bit more information, the Land

1 Claim Agreement actually managed by a subpopulation, herd
2 specificity and, therefore, each herd have a whole
3 management concept that is based on population information,
4 demographic, and so on specific to that herd. So something
5 that maybe have apply in Baffin and Southampton Island
6 might be not a straightforward solution. Percentage of
7 harvest and so on might not straightforwardly be apply in
8 the context of the Bathurst herd.

9 And to raise that is because, since 2010, GNWT
10 did have restriction of 300 on their side of the boundary,
11 and Nunavut have a harvest around 70 and so on. So for
12 numerous amount of year we did have relatively a small
13 harvest, and the herds keeping declining, which kind of put
14 us to a position to further reduce or have limitation on
15 the herd.

16 THE CHAIR: Thank you.

17 NTI, anymore questions? Okay. Thank very much,
18 gentlemen.

19 We'll move over to Kitikmeot Inuit Association.
20 It's your floor.

21 KITIKMEOT INUIT ASSOCIATION QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

22 MR. CLARK: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

23 My name is Geoff Clark. I'm the Director of
24 Lands, Environment, and Resources for the Kitikmeot Inuit
25 Association. I'm based out of Kugluktuk.

1 We have three different people that would wish
2 to ask questions. Our vice-president would like to ask a
3 question. I have about six questions with possibly
4 follow-up. And then Mr. John Donihee has questions about
5 consultation and alternatives to a TAH.

6 In total, our questioning might take about 45
7 minutes or so, so I wanted to advise you of that, just in
8 terms of the schedule, and, of course, it depends on the
9 ensuing conversation. And I just wanted to be sure that
10 that's okay with you, Mr. Chair.

11 THE CHAIR: Okay. Go ahead.

12 MR. CLARK: Can I ask our vice-president to
13 come up first, please?

14 THE CHAIR: Yes, for sure, yeah. Go ahead,
15 Attima. The floor is yours.

16 MR. HADLARI: Thank you. Thank you, Mr.
17 Chairman. My name is Attima Hadlari. I have just one
18 question.

19 Based on information that I have been receiving
20 through, you know, my life, back in early, early '40s there
21 was plenty of the muskox and plenty of caribou in this
22 region, and then they died off later on late '40s. And
23 Inuit knows that it's a cycle. Now we're getting the
24 information over again that the muskox dying off from
25 lungworms. And caribou has that, too.

1 So long ago, when the climate changed to warmer,
2 the muskox tend to die off, and as well as caribou. So has
3 that been considered with the worms that they're dying off
4 from? Because the hunters -- it's not affecting the
5 population, but lungworms that muskox has -- and caribou
6 has that, too -- is based on information from the
7 scientists. So has that been considered? Thank you.

8 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Attima.

9 Lisa.

10 MS. LECLERC: Lisa here.

11 We actually have an ongoing monitoring program
12 with Susan Coutts that we're collaboratively working
13 together. We actually take the sample and give it to her
14 from caribou and muskox. That program was initiated in
15 2013 and was mainly focussed originally on Victoria Island
16 for muskox lungworm, which is one type that affect mostly
17 muskox, but there's another type that affect both muskox
18 and caribou.

19 That being said, the caribou herd that was
20 mostly investigated for the presence of the lungworm at
21 this point was the Dolphin Union. And recently, two
22 winters ago, we had opportunity to go around Bathurst Inlet
23 to start collecting fecal samples to address if the
24 lungworm has propagated on the mainland coast. We track
25 the lungworm propagation for muskox across the Victoria

1 Island, Mr. Chair; however, will be a need to more sample
2 on the muskox on the mainland to address that concern,
3 talking specifically here today for the Bathurst herd.
4 Thank you.

5 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lisa. Thank you.
6 Geoff, go ahead.

7 MR. CLARK: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

8 And thank you for the presentation by the
9 Government of Nunavut and for the many questions answered
10 so far about the caribou management and the TAH proposal.

11 The first question that I have is that near the
12 start of the GN presentation, spoke about a concern due to
13 high harvest rate of Bathurst caribou, and subsequently in
14 the conversation and discussion and I believe in the
15 presentation it was discussed about a harvest rate of
16 around 70. I think I heard 85, 100 animals. I presume
17 this is about harvest in Nunavut. I'm aware from the GNWT
18 that from a presentation they made at the Back River
19 hearing a few weeks ago that, between 2006 to 2009, about
20 4,000 to 6,000 caribou were harvested per year from the
21 Bathurst herd.

22 If the number's about a hundred Bathurst caribou
23 that are harvested in Nunavut per year, that's about
24 one-fortieth or one-sixtieth of the herd during that
25 period, and so I just wanted clarification from the

1 Government of Nunavut. Is the concern due to the high
2 harvest rate? Is that a concern within Nunavut, or is that
3 a concern for the herd overall, or is that a GNWT concern?

4 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Geoff.

5 Lisa or Drikus?

6 MR. DUMOND: I think in that case -- sorry.

7 Mathieu Dumond, Government of Nunavut.

8 In that case, that's a general concern for the
9 herd, and I mean, even if its jurisdiction have after that
10 their process to establish management regimes, it's still a
11 shared herd, and whatever happen on each side of the border
12 is important to consider, and that was, I think, at the
13 time a concern that the overall harvest was high. And at
14 the time, the Nunavut portion, like you mention, of the
15 harvest was minimum compared to the overall harvest. This
16 has changed now because we remain -- even with a low number
17 of harvested animal, we are now the main harvester of that
18 herd with the moratorium in NWT.

19 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mathieu. Geoff -- oh,
20 sorry, Drikus.

21 MR. GISSING: Maybe I could just add to that as
22 well is that there's currently no limitation on the number
23 of animals that can be taken from this herd.

24 To a large degree, the low harvesting in Nunavut
25 is due to accessibility, is my understanding, and so people

1 do not have access to it. But, basically, even residents
2 in Nunavut, every resident could go buy five tags and
3 harvest from that herd. So potentially the harvest in
4 Nunavut could be much higher. It's just accessibility, so
5 if that herd had come close to a community, harvest could
6 become a significant threat to this population as well, and
7 that's another added concern why there need to be some
8 limitation put in place.

9 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Drikus.

10 Geoff.

11 MR. CLARK: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

12 Thank you, Drikus. That actually leads into the
13 next question the KI has. Two times in the ten meetings
14 that were held where there were meeting minutes recorded,
15 it talked about this issue of the potential of residents
16 buying tags and, for example, 20 residents could
17 theoretically buy five tags and harvest a hundred Bathurst
18 caribou, and, actually, that was presented as to why a TAH
19 was required.

20 So we know from the Bathurst range that the
21 places they come most proximal to where residents possibly
22 could harvest predictably would be Contwoyto Lake or the
23 south end of Bathurst Inlet.

24 Could the GN provide information in the last ten
25 years of how many Bathurst caribou have been harvested by

1 residents? Because this is important to know because the
2 TAH, in some cases, seemed to be presented as that's the
3 reason why this needed to be imposed, just as Drikus talked
4 about, but, in fact, the TAH affects Inuit the most. It
5 limits their rights the most. So it's sort of a backwards
6 way to back into a TAH.

7 So what is the data? How many residents have
8 harvested Bathurst caribou in the last decade at Contwoyto
9 Lake and south end of Bathurst Inlet?

10 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Geoff.

11 Mathieu.

12 MR. DUMOND: To answer your question -- I don't
13 want to dismiss your question -- the number of resident,
14 per se, would be minimum. The most nonbeneficiary harvest
15 is through the sport hunts, but that's different.

16 But just maybe to steer away on focussing on
17 resident, that may be not be the right way to look at the
18 issue, like you mentioned, but just this past winter, the
19 Bathurst herd, at least part of it, wintered in proximity
20 of Kugluktuk. The harvest on that herd was much more than
21 usual because the herd suddenly was accessible, and this
22 was subsistence harvest.

23 So I think the point of Drikus is that, at this
24 stage, considering the status of the herd, there's a need
25 to have some guarantee that it cannot go over a certain

1 number, whether it's purely subsistence harvest or mix of
2 harvest with other users, that it cannot go beyond that
3 because we will run a high risk of maintaining that low
4 number of caribou for a longer time. And I think that's
5 the issue to focus on.

6 The number of resident, like you say, is
7 minimum. It could increase for whatever reason if suddenly
8 there were resident interested in going in those areas.
9 But at this time, it's minimum. But the concern is the
10 overall harvest as a whole. Thanks.

11 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mathieu.

12 Geoff.

13 MR. CLARK: Thank you, Mathieu. And thank
14 you, Mr. Chair.

15 So that does answer the question. In my
16 experience, the number's probably close to zero, in terms
17 of the number of residents that are harvesting the Bathurst
18 herd, and thanks for clarifying that, as well.

19 The next question is in regards to the TAH
20 coefficient has been used to calculate the proposed TAH
21 number. I have read in the information sessions that the
22 KRWB agreed to a one percent harvest rate for the Bathurst
23 herd when the population is in a phase of deep decline.

24 I guess there was a proposal, that never made it
25 to the Nunavut Wildlife Management Board, of a TAH of 100

1 Bathurst caribou, and the coefficient was used at a .3
2 percent harvest rate, and then the 30 TAH proposal most
3 recently is based on a harvest rate of .15 percent. So
4 it's not the 1 percent. So, for example, if it was
5 1 percent, it would be 197 animals if the population is
6 19,700. It almost appears, the way that it's constructed,
7 is that the harvest rate is determined and then the
8 coefficient is backwards integrated to say that should be
9 the harvest rate.

10 Can the GN please clarify, explain, how a .15
11 percent harvest rate is used for the current TAH
12 particularly when, as my colleague at NTI pointed out, that
13 on Baffin Island the coefficient for the harvest rate is 5
14 percent? You know, acknowledging that there's shared
15 harvest between the NWT and Nunavut, there's still a
16 disconnect in the math. Could I please get an explanation
17 for that.

18 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Geoff.

19 GN. Lisa.

20 MS. LECLERC: Mr. Chair.

21 Just for clarification, the 1 percent was -- it
22 was never been made for decision or anything like that. It
23 was what currently the harvest was taking place, and the
24 1 percent come with since 2010. There were never any
25 discussion about the 1 percent. It was what was the past

1 situation was.

2 When a herd from a historical peak plunged to a
3 very low, for the Porcupine herd, that low is, you know,
4 27, 13 percent, 23 percent. There's different herd, and
5 the peak is -- the low status change a little bit from one
6 herd to the other. And that's a percentage of decrease
7 from the original maximum historical peak. And I think
8 that right now it's clear that we reached a low because we
9 were left with 4 percent of that peak. Therefore, a very
10 limited harvest should take place. When we look at the
11 rule of thumb, when a herd reach that low, 1 percent or
12 less harvest is recommended, and that recommendation is
13 based through very different amount of herd in Nunavut.

14 Just for clarification, on the Baffin the GN
15 recommendation was way lower than what Nunavut Wildlife
16 Management Board recommendation was and was pretty much
17 matching the percentage that we're proposing right now.

18 The 0.5 percent is representing a decline from
19 the harvest percentage that was put in place -- not put in
20 place, but practice, 0.3 percent, and that echoed the 50
21 percent decline in breeding female or 37 percent of decline
22 of the herd.

23 I hope that answer your question. But on Baffin
24 caribou, the GN representation was lower than what NWMB
25 recommended.

1 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lisa.

2 Geoff.

3 MS. LECLERC: Thank you.

4 More specifically about the .15 percent harvest
5 rate, where did that number come from? The GN did state
6 that around 1 percent is the number that should be the
7 harvest rate. Can you please provide the logic model that
8 was used to justify the .15 percent, because that's how you
9 got to the number of 30. So, you know, that's critical.
10 Where is the other .85 percent, for example?

11 Just trying to understand the logic of the
12 proposal. Thank you.

13 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Geoff.

14 Lisa.

15 MS. LECLERC: The 30 total allowable harvest
16 proposed today, it's for economical purposes and cultural
17 and the perpetuation of the Inuit value on the land. There
18 have to be a -- the justification behind it, it have to be
19 a very negligible harvest to assure that. So 30 percent
20 was put forward, a harvest of 30 was put forward.

21 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lisa.

22 Geoff, just slow down a little bit for the
23 interpreters. Okay? Thank you.

24 MR. CLARK: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

25 Thank you, Lisa, for the clarification that it

1 was the number 30 that was more important than the
2 coefficient of harvest. So there really wasn't any science
3 to get that coefficient to get the number 30. It was a
4 recommendation that 30, for cultural and economic reasons,
5 should be the number, and the coefficient of 1.5 percent
6 wasn't selected on a basis of -- doesn't appear that
7 there's a logical reason why it's less than 1 percent, for
8 example, or why it's not 1 percent or why it's not a
9 portion of 1 percent shared with the GNWT.

10 The next question relates to genetics, and is it
11 possible to genetically separate the Beverly, Ahlak, and
12 Bathurst caribou herds? Are there differences that a
13 harvester or hunter would know if there's a Beverly caribou
14 or a Bathurst caribou or Ahlak caribou standing in front of
15 them?

16 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Geoffrey.

17 Lisa, Mathieu.

18 MR. DUMOND: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Mathieu
19 Dumond, Government of Nunavut.

20 Just to answer your latest question, there is a
21 recent publication starting to show some level of
22 structuring genetically, but it's very, very hard for
23 mainland caribou, barren ground mainland caribou to
24 differentiate at this stage with the tools available
25 genetically because the herds have been fairly large, and

1 it's a fairly recent recolonization of the area at the
2 genetic scale, and so the genetic differentiation between
3 herd is not high enough at this time to have a very clear
4 genetic differentiation.

5 However, we start to see some patterns at the
6 genetic level, and it's consistent with traditional
7 knowledge where harvesters have been able to differentiate
8 some of those herds from their appearance, their behaviour,
9 different aspect of the animals that enabled some hunters,
10 some experienced hunters to differentiate between those
11 herds. I know I talk to hunters that can differentiate
12 between the Beverly, the Bathurst, and the Bluenose herd
13 from physical characteristic and behaviour.

14 So I believe the genetic is just behind, in
15 terms of tools to establish it in a scientific way, but
16 traditional knowledge have been there for a long time that
17 can distinguish between those caribou. Thank you.

18 THE CHAIR: Thank, Mathieu.

19 Geoff.

20 MR. CLARK: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

21 I'll just wait for the lunch bell to go off.
22 It's probably a signal we're all getting hungry as well. I
23 have a couple more questions, Mr. Chair. What is your
24 preference in regards to the schedule?

25 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Geoff. If you don't

1 mind delaying your questions until after lunch, I think
2 we'll break for lunch, and we'll return here, make sure
3 everybody is here by 1:30, sitting down at 1:30. Thank
4 you.

5 (Proceedings ended at 12:15 p.m.)

6

7 (Proceedings to recommence at 1:30 p.m.)

8

9 (Proceedings recommenced at 1:29 p.m.)

10 THE CHAIR: Good afternoon, everybody. Thank
11 you for coming back on time. Hope everybody had a good
12 lunch.

13 So we're going to carry on in a minute, but I
14 just wanted to say, in the interests of time, I mean, we
15 are somewhat behind, but I think we'll make that up, but I
16 would like everybody to just keep in the back of your mind
17 that we may be meeting this evening yet, too, okay? So
18 we'll let you know that as time progresses.

19 So with that I would ask that KIA, if you would
20 continue, Geoff, your questioning.

21 MR. CLARK: Geoff Clark, Kitikmeot Inuit
22 Association. I hope everybody had a really good lunch and
23 we stay awake for the next couple of hours. It's a time
24 that we can doze, but we'll try and keep it lively.

25 So in relation to the genetics question where

1 the genetics between the Beverly, Ahiak, and Bathurst herds
2 are functionally indistinguishable, relating that to the
3 fact that the three herds overlap at the south end of
4 Bathurst Inlet and Contwoyto Lake, how could a TAH
5 management system be enforced that doesn't unfairly
6 penalize Inuit who are legitimately harvesting Ahiak and
7 Beverly caribou or Bathurst caribou? Thank you.

8 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Geoff.

9 Government of Nunavut, Mathieu.

10 MR. DUMOND: Thank you. Mathieu Dumond,
11 Government of Nunavut.

12 It will create some challenges. There's no
13 question about that. With the seasonal range, although
14 there's some overlap, there's still some possibility to
15 distinguish a little bit at least some core areas and with
16 the help of the collared animal, so it helps a little bit
17 defining which herd is where, but there will be some areas
18 where it will be difficult to tease out the different
19 herds, and those areas may be managed differently, and it
20 will be a challenge, that's for sure. But overall, a lot
21 of the harvest of those mainland herds happen a lot of the
22 time where the herds are fairly segregated into their
23 migration routes, riding areas (verbatim) or calving areas,
24 and so for most of the time in Nunavut the issue should be
25 minimum, but we'll have to address that in a way that is

1 fair, for sure.

2 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mathieu.

3 Geoff.

4 MR. CLARK: Thank you for the answer, Mathieu.

5 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

6 The GN said that since 2012 they've been working
 7 to develop an alternative to a TAH. KIA found out about
 8 the TAH proposal about a month before the submission
 9 deadline, and we spent one hour brainstorming with the
 10 Kugluktuk HTO chair for the Bluenose East herd about
 11 management alternatives and then about an hour with the
 12 Kugluktuk HTO board for the Bluenose East herd for
 13 management alternatives and then a three-hour meeting with
 14 the full board to develop a full plan for the Bluenose East
 15 herd, so a total of five hours in about three weeks to
 16 develop an alternative that will be presented tomorrow.
 17 And we're confident that something could be done for the
 18 Bathurst herd if sufficient time were allowed to work with
 19 all four HTOs.

20 Why, in the GN's understanding, has it been so
 21 difficult to develop an alternative to a TAH as a
 22 management tool in the consultations or meetings or
 23 whatever they were since 2012?

24 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Geoff.

25 Mathieu.

1 MR. DUMOND: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Mathieu
2 Dumond, Government of Nunavut.

3 Just a first thing, I think KIA was aware, a
4 little bit earlier than that, of the possibility of a TAH
5 proposal because one of your representative at other
6 meetings mentioned the issue earlier than that.

7 But in terms of alternative, one of the big
8 thing is that the land claim doesn't give that many tools,
9 doesn't provide that many tools in terms of managing the
10 harvest levels outside of TAH. There's a few other
11 possibilities.

12 Now, the emergency of the situation and the
13 significant decline in that herd grants -- I mean, requires
14 some efficient action to address the harvest side of
15 things, and this is what the GN has -- has suggested and
16 recommend to the Board to go with. I mean, we're here at
17 the public hearing where other alternative will be heard
18 from other parties, and that will be up to the Board to
19 decide what is viable and required for the herd
20 conservation. Thank you.

21 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mathieu.
22 Geoff.

23 MR. CLARK: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

24 A last question, before we go on to questions of
25 consultation and alternatives to a TAH, about wolf

1 management. In some of the meeting notes since 2014, it
2 was noted that there were ideas presented by HTO members
3 that there were efficient ways to manage wolves in their
4 experience using traditional knowledge. It included using
5 their knowledge of where wolf dens are, and traditional
6 practices when Inuit lived on the land was to kill the pups
7 in the den to prevent that generation of wolves from
8 growing up and relieving the pressure on the wolf pack to
9 harvest more meat for the wolf pack.

10 Also focussing on wolves that weren't the alpha
11 male and female to keep that dominant structure in place so
12 that there weren't more wolf packs created. There seemed
13 to be a lot of traditional knowledge available from Inuit
14 about how to manage wolf populations and combined with the
15 efficiency of Inuit as wolf hunters.

16 Was there a discussion in the meetings that you
17 had about designing a predator management system that would
18 be culturally relevant and use the skills of Inuit to
19 assist in co-management of the herds?

20 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Geoff.

21 Mathieu.

22 MR. DUMOND: Thank you.

23 The short answer is yes, there was lots of
24 discussion around predators, and we did at meetings have
25 discussion also on, okay, what would be feasible? And I

1 like to remind that at this time there's no limitation on
2 wolf and on wolf harvest, and no more seasons or harvest
3 limits on the numbers. Like you said, there are active and
4 experienced hunters that can do a wolf harvest; however, I
5 think that's a common agreement that there's less and less
6 of those experienced people able to actually efficiently
7 harvest wolves at the larger scale than just
8 opportunistically, and that's an issue of education and
9 traditional skills that are being lost. And I think
10 there's ways at the community level, considering the
11 flexibility of the regulation or about absence of
12 regulation really limiting wolf harvest. There's a lot of
13 opportunities at the community levels.

14 One thing that -- from my experience at the
15 meetings I was attending and where the topic was raised,
16 one thing that came as an obstacle of a little bit, okay,
17 what can we do at the scale that will make a difference, is
18 that I heard from people that they don't want to just kill
19 wolf and waste them. Like, they don't want to just kill
20 wolf and have carcasses laying around not skinned and just
21 left to rot. And I believe from my in-laws and from people
22 I know that that's a strong value that you don't kill those
23 animals just to leave them to rot if you don't have any use
24 for them.

25 So that was one of the obstacles that we saw as,

1 how can we implement a large scale where people efficiently
2 harvest those animals and take benefit of the pelts for
3 their economic revenues and to do it at a scale that is
4 large enough to make a difference for the caribou
5 populations to have less predation?

6 So that's an issue we discussed and that it's
7 still on the table, and it hasn't been resolved, but it's
8 not that easy.

9 It's not just saying you have to kill wolf, or
10 you have to -- we have to find the right way to do it in a
11 way that is not just a political thing. It has to have a
12 meaningful effect in terms of management, and that's the
13 challenge we are facing with that issue. Thank you.

14 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mathieu.

15 Geoff.

16 MR. CLARK: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

17 An observation is that in the Northwest
18 Territories the government has decided to support
19 incentives to harvest wolves. I'm not an expert in that
20 program, but I know that a hunter can get up to \$850 to
21 harvest wolves, and the GNWT seems to have a lot of
22 capacity and science and consideration of the issue, and so
23 I'm just wondering what the limitation is in Nunavut that
24 would prevent a consideration of such a program since there
25 seems to be a lot of mirroring between NWT and Nunavut in

1 terms of management of this herd.

2 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Geoff.

3 And just before you answer, I think you'll have
4 that opportunity to ask the NWT that question how they do
5 this when they make their presentation, today, but Mathieu,
6 if you would like to comment.

7 MR. DUMOND: Well, I was roughly, I mean,
8 basically saying that it will be good to hear from NWT how
9 they feel the program is efficient at addressing the issue
10 itself other than providing some extra revenue to the few
11 harvesters that are harvesting wolves. And it will be
12 good, also, maybe, to hear from other aboriginal groups
13 from NWT on the challenges that they had to implement those
14 kind of programs or any program that is geared towards
15 harvesting wolves, because I know there's also some issues
16 with spiritual values and certain practices, traditional
17 practices that makes it difficult to implement, sometimes,
18 so it will be good to hear from the other jurisdiction how
19 this work.

20 For the Nunavut side, I mean, unless we can see
21 that those type of program would have an efficient
22 management result, it may not be the best use of resources
23 at this time unless we can show that it will be efficient
24 to address the issue. Thank you.

25 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mathieu.

1 Geoff.

2 MR. CLARK: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

3 Those are my questions. My executive director
4 asked to make a comment, if that's okay.

5 THE CHAIR: Yeah, that's fine. Just please
6 state your name for the record.

7 MR. IRNGAUT: Paul Irngaut, I'm chairperson of
8 Kitikmeot Inuit Association. Legal counsel (no
9 translation) recent process questions, I believe.

10 Just in regards to consultations, as KIA, you
11 know, we discussed amongst ours internally and with
12 ourselves Board in terms of how the process, consultation
13 process affects our organization, as well as other
14 organizations as HTO and residents of our region. So for
15 that matter, I think, you know, it's important for, you
16 know, governments of the day -- GN, federal government,
17 including IPGs and, as well, Nunavut Wildlife Management
18 Board -- to consult with the regional Inuit associations on
19 issues that pertain to our beneficiaries that are concerned
20 about the environment, wildlife, and what not.

21 So having said that, I think it's important
22 that, you know, delegates need to hear our concerns in
23 terms of the consultation process in regards to any
24 hearings that is going to affect Inuit and beneficiaries as
25 a whole. So like I said, you know, we've asked our legal

1 counsel to ask those hard questions, in terms of the
2 consultation. You know, I can fully ask those questions,
3 but, however, I think it's important that I don't.
4 Otherwise, I get into trouble. But any case, I'll leave it
5 to John to ask those questions. Thank you.

6 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Paul. John, go ahead.

7 MR. DONIHUE: Thank you, very much,

8 Mr. Chairman.

9 And my thanks to our friends from GN for their
10 presentation and answers so far.

11 I want to explore two sort of interrelated
12 themes with you. The first one is the relationship between
13 co-management and consultation, and, in particular, I'm
14 going to ask you some questions about where in that
15 co-management relationship the demarcation point is when
16 you have to start to consult in a different way with Land
17 Claim beneficiaries whose rights to harvest are likely to
18 be affected by a decision that you're asking for from the
19 Nunavut Wildlife Management Board.

20 So I'm suggesting to you -- and I will ask you
21 some questions to try to explore this -- that there is a
22 spectrum, there is an ongoing relationship. And I note
23 that your slide number 7 from your presentation this
24 morning listed no fewer than ten meetings between September
25 2014 and January 2016 where it's very clear that GN did

1 everything it could to meet its obligations as a comanager.
2 But somewhere along the line there Government of Nunavut
3 decided that it would come to the Board and request a
4 formal TAH, and that has legal implications, and so we'll
5 explore that a little bit, too.

6 The second issue or theme that I want to explore
7 relates to section 5.3.3 of the Nunavut Land Claims
8 Agreement, and it's the one that talks about, essentially,
9 the authority of the Board and Government of Nunavut to
10 limit Inuit harvesting rights when there is a conservation
11 problem, but, of course, it indicates -- and I don't have
12 it turned up in front of me, but in general words, it
13 indicates that those limits should only go so far or to the
14 extent necessary for conservation.

15 And in that context I want to ask you about the
16 two aspects, I suppose, that emerge from a TAH request
17 because, first of all, of course, you have to convince the
18 Board that there's a conservation issue. I don't think
19 there's much debate about that in this case. I won't be
20 asking you those kinds of questions. There are some
21 questions about what the number, the actual number ought to
22 be for the Bathurst herd.

23 But the other side of a TAH is that, of course,
24 it is enforced or is enforceable using government
25 authorities, legal enforcement tools, I suppose. The

1 possibility, for example, of laying a charge and that kind
2 of thing. So I have some questions about that as well. So
3 that's the landscape. I won't take -- despite the long
4 introduction, Mr. Chairman, I won't take a really long time
5 with this.

6 So let's come back to co-management and
7 consultation. We've reviewed the reports that you filed
8 with the Board, and you have the two that, I guess, attract
9 my attention most are the report at tab 5 in the binder
10 that's the report on your January 14th-15th, 2016, meeting
11 and then you have at tab 7 in the binder a report that's
12 entitled "HTO Consultations on Caribou Issues in the
13 Kitikmeot Region," and that's a summary from February 2013
14 to February 2015.

15 And I think that the -- let's talk about tab 7
16 first, so the one that I just asked you about, the 2013 to
17 2015. It certainly gives good indication of GN being a
18 co-management partner with the HTOs and the Kitikmeot
19 Regional Wildlife Board. There's a couple of things about
20 the report I guess I'd just like to get clarified, and
21 Mr. Clark asked about this a little earlier, and I just
22 want to be sure about it. So when I look at the executive
23 summary of that report, third paragraph -- I'll just quote
24 it to you because you don't need to -- the quote says:
25 (as read.

1 "The HTOs would like their own management
2 initiatives be recognized --"

3 I'm reading it as it reads: (as read)

4 "-- thus they understand that more
5 restriction measures on the nonbeneficiary
6 are necessary to the preservation of the
7 species, and to do so, a total allowable
8 harvest has to be implemented."

9 Okay. That's in the executive summary. The same language
10 is found at the end of page 2 of the report. And when I
11 read that, what it's saying to me is that GN may have been
12 telling the HTOs that, in order to manage nonresident or
13 resident harvesting on a Bathurst caribou herd, that a TAH
14 had to be implemented. And I'm going to suggest to you
15 that that's simply incorrect. The GN can regulate
16 nonresident and resident harvesters any time it wants
17 through the Wildlife Act.

18 And so what concerns me is that throughout
19 these consultation processes that you undertook with the
20 HTOs and KRWB that you may have been misinforming them
21 about why an HTA was necessary, and I wonder if you would
22 just like to respond to that suggestion.

23 THE CHAIR: Thank you, John.

24 GN, Mathieu.

25 MR. DUMOND: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Mathieu

1 Dumond, Government of Nunavut.

2 I think you touched on a legal aspect that will
3 require some discussion between the relevant organizations
4 because there seems to be different interpretations and
5 conflicting interpretation over time from the same
6 organizations. So I think this is a matter that is -- that
7 is being looked into and should be looked into with the
8 appropriate organization to clarify that legal matter,
9 because at this time there's some difference of opinion
10 within the key organization that would implement that.

11 And so, yeah, I hope that answers that part of
12 your question. Thank you.

13 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mathieu.

14 John.

15 MR. DONIHÉE: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

16 Unfortunately, Mr. Dumond, it does not answer my
17 question. It seems to me that the relevant organization is
18 Department of Environment, Government of Nunavut, which is
19 responsible for wildlife management and which is
20 responsible for wildlife enforcement.

21 And I'm not asking you for a legal opinion. I'm
22 just asking you whether you know that the Government of
23 Nunavut has or not -- whether you know or not -- if the
24 Government of Nunavut has the authority to regulate
25 nonaboriginal harvesting without the requirement for a TAH.

1 THE CHAIR: Thank you, John.

2 Drikus.

3 MR. GISSING: This is an issue that we have
4 discussed between the NWMB and NTI, and the direction was
5 that we cannot unless it's gone through a Nunavut Wildlife
6 Management Board decision-making process, and recently
7 we've been informed that we cannot set limitations on
8 non-Inuit unless a total allowable harvest had been
9 established. And, again, as Mathieu has said, it's an
10 issue of ongoing discussion between the organizations
11 within Nunavut.

12 I don't know if the Board legal counsel is
13 willing to step in on this matter.

14 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Drikus.

15 Michael, would you like to add? Thank you.

16 MR. D'ÉÇA: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

17 Any restriction on harvesting within the Nunavut
18 Settlement Area must go through the NLCA Article 5
19 decision-making process, and that's reflected in the
20 Wildlife Act. The NWMB's authority includes authority to
21 restrict non-Inuit harvesting either in connection with
22 Inuit or solely for non-Inuit harvesting.

23 My understanding is that the Government of
24 Nunavut -- and correct me if I'm wrong, Drikus -- took the
25 position for some time that the NWMB or that the Government

1 of Nunavut had sole authority to establish, modify, remove
2 restrictions on nonbeneficiaries, but they have recently
3 had a change of mind on that, and now all parties are in
4 agreement that the NWMB's authority to establish, modify,
5 or remove harvesting limitations now include limitations,
6 total allowable harvests, levels of harvesting, those
7 grandfathered provisions under section 5.6.4. All of that
8 falls within the NWMB's authority which, of course, is
9 shared cojurisdictionally with the minister.

10 So we just finished a regular meeting in which
11 we were having a discussion with Drikus, and so I think
12 there's a bit of a mixup here -- I don't want to get into
13 the details because nobody, except possibly John, will
14 follow it -- had to do with sport hunting for a different
15 population. But I think I am reflecting a consensus view
16 with government, with NTI, and the NWMB that harvesting
17 restrictions require an NWMB decision, and that originates
18 in the terms of Article 5 of the Land Claims Agreement and
19 is reflected in the language of the Wildlife Act. So I
20 hope that assists everyone. Taima.

21 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Michael.

22 John.

23 MR. DONIHEE: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. It's
24 John Donihee.

25 I guess the point, at least from where we're

1 coming from for this proceeding, is that I didn't realize I
2 was wading into such deep waters there. But no issue with
3 respect to the -- from KIA with respect to the question of
4 whether NWMB might have to approve a restriction on
5 nonaboriginal harvesting.

6 But I guess what we're suggesting is it is
7 different to tell the HTOs that -- you know, for example,
8 the question that Geoff asked earlier, you know, 20
9 nonaboriginal harvesters with five tags each could have
10 used up way more than the existing quota, I guess, or the
11 proposed quota for Bathurst herd.

12 And so to me the difference is, if you tell the
13 HTOs the only way you can have protection for your rights
14 is we have to have a TAH to do that, I'm not sure that you
15 necessarily have to have a TAH on Inuit to do that. You
16 may have to have an NWMB decision to restrict nonaboriginal
17 harvesting, and that's entirely proper. No issue at our
18 table about that.

19 But where we have a problem in terms of this
20 report in the consultation -- I will leave it there -- is
21 simply this question of whether or not the HTOs were told,
22 hey, look, the only way to solve this problem with the
23 nonbeneficiary harvesting is for a TAH that at the same
24 time is going to have an impact on the exercise of your
25 rights. That's a different situation and, I think,

1 somewhat problematic. I'll leave it there.

2 Back to our friends, then, perhaps, at GN. I
3 just want -- you know, as we look through all of the
4 consultation documents which you filed, it's obvious that,
5 as I said earlier, you were good co-management partners;
6 but again, there does come a point where you tell Inuit
7 that you're going to go to the Board and you're going to
8 get a request, at least, a TAH from the Board and, of
9 course, that, to put it into layman's terms, you know, that
10 one bites from the standpoint of the way Inuit may be
11 affected by it.

12 My understanding of what would happen if the
13 Board agrees to your proposal and chooses a number for a
14 TAH but, nevertheless, recommends one to your minister, is
15 that the TAH would end up being reflected in regulation and
16 that you would issue tags or some indication that a
17 harvester selected for allocation of the right to harvest,
18 you know, can go out and kill a caribou.

19 They get a tag, they go and kill one, and that
20 when your officers or enforcement officials have to
21 determine whether or not somebody has a right, they're
22 going to look to a tag. Do you have a tag on that caribou
23 when you coming back to town? If not, you could have a
24 problem. That's certainly my experience in the NWT in
25 terms of how it works. Is that, in a very general way, how

1 it would work here in Nunavut as well.

2 THE CHAIR: Thank you, John.

3 Mathieu.

4 MR. DUMOND: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Mathieu
5 Dumond, Government of Nunavut.

6 The way the Land Claim works -- and I'm sure you
7 know as well as I know -- is that when a TAH is established
8 by the NWMB for a population, especially when that TAH is
9 below the basic need levels, the BNL, the tags are going to
10 the RWO and to the HTOs, and they are the one managing
11 those tags.

12 Now, in the case of a TAH where regulation is
13 updated to reflect that TAH on a species, that means
14 there's an enforceable legislation from our department's
15 perspective, and we can therefore enforce the requirement
16 for a tag and the harvest limit on that population or that
17 herd in that case.

18 But the HTO has control over the distribution of
19 those tags; and, after that, it's just our department
20 assist in that case in enforcing something that would be
21 otherwise very difficult to enforce. So you're right in
22 the general principle, but it's important to note that the
23 tags are under the responsibility and the control of the
24 HTO.

25 MR. GISSING: I might just want to add to that

1 that the tags is a mechanism of allocation. If you look
2 under the claim, it says once a TAH is established the
3 HTOs -- it's an allocation -- the HTO will allocate to
4 their members. So the tag is basically just a mechanism of
5 the allocation and a way of monitoring the allocation from
6 the HTO as a proof that they have allocation. They don't
7 necessarily have to have a tag, but the HTO is basically
8 managing that whole allocation.

9 THE CHAIR: Thank you, GN.

10 John.

11 MR. DONIHUE: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

12 And then just for certainty, I guess, in
13 relation to your response, someone with a Bathurst caribou
14 on their sled, an Inuk with a Bathurst caribou on his sled
15 and no tag could potentially be subject to some kind of
16 enforcement action from your department once this whole
17 piece plays out. Is that correct?

18 THE CHAIR: Thank you, John.

19 Mathieu.

20 MR. DUMOND: Well, I think it's not that simple
21 in the way that -- or that simple or it's not like that.
22 Like, because the HTO would be responsible for the
23 allocation, depending on the system of allocation they
24 implement to tell people what they can harvest or how they
25 can harvest them, it would then be a collaboration with the

1 HTO in terms of how we can enforce it in a meaningful way
2 to ensure that -- I mean, if we do put a limit on caribou
3 harvest, it is because there is a consensus that there is a
4 conservation issue.

5 If we let that limit be unregulated and
6 unchecked and potentially harvest going above that limit
7 without any consequences, it's not an efficient management
8 action. So, I mean, the HTO will decide how they want to
9 implement the allocation, and our department will assist to
10 enforce that allocation that the HTO decide. So it's not
11 as clear-cut as somebody doesn't have a tag on their
12 caribou that they have on their sled. It will be a matter
13 of working with the HTO on how they decide to allocate the
14 tags and monitor the harvest and how we can assist to
15 enforce it to ensure that there's no abuse against that
16 limit.

17 Thank you.

18 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mathieu.

19 John.

20 MR. DONIHEE: Thank you again, Mr. Chairman.

21 John Donihee.

22 Is it your understanding that a tag -- if you
23 allocate a tag per caribou, 30 tags, that a person who
24 harvests a caribou and who does not have a tag could
25 potentially be prosecuted for that? I'm not saying they

1 have to be. I understand that you work with the HTOs. Is
2 it your understanding that the system, once a TAH is in
3 place, is legally enforceable?

4 THE CHAIR: Thank you, John.
5 Mathieu.

6 MR. DUMOND: The short answer is yes, it is.
7 If it becomes an enforceable thing, it is enforceable, and,
8 yeah, so the short answer is yes.

9 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mathieu.
10 John.

11 MR. DONIHUE: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Thank
12 you, Mr. Dumond.

13 I wanted then to just talk a little more
14 generally about the time when it became clear to the HTOs
15 and KRWB that, in fact, GN was going forward with an
16 application to the Board to establish a TAH. And my review
17 of the documents that GN has filed indicates that you
18 talked on a number of occasions about the potential need
19 for a TAH and that, in 2015, you even talked about the
20 possibility of a TAH for the Bathurst herd of 100 caribou;
21 and then based on the presentation that's in the
22 materials -- and I think it's there on the slide dec, as
23 well -- in January of 2016, you made it clear not only that
24 you were going forward to the Board for real this time but
25 that the proposed TAH had been decreased from 100 to 30

1 caribou.

2 So is that when you had your formal
3 notification, your formal session with the HTOs and KRWB to
4 talk about the application that's in front of the Board
5 right now?

6 THE CHAIR: Thank you, John.

7 GN, Lisa.

8 MS. LECLERC: Yes. I mean, during the
9 January 14, '16, meeting, the GN took an internal position
10 to recommend to NWMB a TAH of 30 for Bathurst caribou, and
11 by the NLCA there is requirement for consultation, and at
12 that time all the HTO, RWO, and co-management partner was
13 consulted on the GN proposal to go to NWMB, and those
14 co-management partner was aware that the GN will submit
15 that to the Board on the March -- for the March meeting.
16 And potentially, depending on the NWMB way to process,
17 there will be public hearing on that recommendation. Thank
18 you.

19 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lisa.

20 John.

21 MR. DONIHÉE: Thank you, sir.

22 I'm going to turn now to the report that's in
23 the binder that deals with the January 2016 meeting, and I
24 just again want to read a quote to you. It's actually from
25 the executive summary, and it says the HTOs would like

1 their own management initiatives to be recognized, and then
2 it goes on to say, you know, thus they understand that more
3 restriction measures on the nonbeneficiary -- I'm sorry.
4 Got the wrong piece of paper in front of me. So you should
5 strike the quote for the purposes of the transcript, and
6 I'll read you the proper quote. It says: (as read)

7 "The HTOs have taken action for caribou
8 management already and would like their
9 initiatives be recognized. They understand
10 that more restriction measures on the
11 nonbeneficiary --"

12 Sorry, it is correct: (as read)

13 "-- more restriction measures on a
14 nonbeneficiary are necessary to the
15 preservation of the species and that to do so
16 require a TAH be implemented."

17 So that's the same issue, I guess -- I'm not going to
18 explore that again -- about the nonbeneficiary part. But I
19 guess what I want to ask you about is, KIA's understanding
20 is that, at the January meeting, that the HTOs were still
21 saying that they had taken measures of their own to manage
22 harvesting in their communities, that they felt that they
23 had the capacity to achieve results with those initiatives.
24 And you go on in your report to say that there was no
25 consensus achieved at the January meeting about whether or

1 not the TAH was necessary and what the level ought to be.

2 So is that -- I mean, again, I'm working off
3 your report, but is that a fair representation of where and
4 how that came out?

5 THE CHAIR: Thank you, John.

6 Lisa.

7 MS. LECLERC: Mr. Chairman.

8 I'm not going to comment on that statement in
9 the executive summary because I think that we explored that
10 answer previously.

11 It's correct. Even if we had a consultation and
12 the GN recommendation specific for the Bathurst of 30
13 caribou, the report is right in mentioning that there were
14 no consensus on TAH limit. Thank you.

15 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lisa.

16 John.

17 MR. DONIHÉE: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

18 So based on our exchange this afternoon, let me
19 ask you the question this way. When GN decides that it is
20 going forward in the March meeting to the Board to request
21 a TAH of 30 caribou for the Bathurst herd, that has legal
22 implications for Inuit harvesting restrictions, formal
23 harvesting restrictions, suppose in a rare case, the
24 downside potential for prosecution. Is this the only
25 meeting that you've had with HTOs to talk about the TAH of

1 30 caribou?

2 THE CHAIR: Thank you, John.

3 Government of Nunavut, Lisa.

4 MS. LECLERC: Lisa here.

5 I just want to clarify that the GN recommend to
6 the Board management action when the population decline or
7 get to a certain status or, actually, 4 percent of the
8 peak, so that's, yeah, we provide recommendation to the
9 NWM Board. Yes, that's correct. We only had one
10 consultation, TAH of 30, which was done over two days, so
11 very extensive meeting and face to face.

12 Just also need to mention that all the HTO was
13 aware a year before of the position or recommendation of
14 the GN to go forward with a TAH. So the GN position on
15 making harvest limitation goes from a year prior to the
16 revised TAH to NWMB Board.

17 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lisa.

18 John.

19 MR. DONIHEE: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

20 In 2015, as I read your evidence, the GN did
21 talk with the HTOs about the potential for a TAH
22 application to the Board, and the HTOs weren't supportive
23 and asked you to back off until after the 2015 surveys were
24 flown so that you would have better numbers, I suppose.

25 So, really, the TAH as proposed, the action

1 proposed in 2015 and the application made to the Board, at
2 least -- at the very least in respect of the number of
3 caribou involved -- they were different; right?

4 THE CHAIR: Thank you, John.

5 Lisa.

6 MS. LECLERC: Because TAH is based on the last
7 available population estimate, the January -- it was really
8 well mentioned to the HTO that the TAH was based on the
9 2012, which was the last complete population estimate which
10 was at that time around 30,000 animal. They were clearly
11 mention that a survey will come with new population
12 estimate, so they were very well aware of that.

13 In addition, yes, the Kugluktuk HTO, as you
14 mentioned, say that they wanted to have access to that
15 information before talking further about a TAH; but also
16 want to mention that Bay Chimo and Bathurst actually came
17 back with maybe they would like to have a TAH 150 at that
18 time. Thank you.

19 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lisa.

20 John.

21 MR. DONIHÉE: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

22 Your report on the January meetings, section
23 3.5, page 5, is entitled "Accommodation of Input Received,"
24 and KIA noted this in its adjournment application, but I do
25 want to comment back to it. I think it's important. And,

1 again, I'm just going to read you the first sentence in
2 here. It says: (as read)

3 "There's little accommodation to be made on
4 the TAH recommendations as they are based on
5 biological facts; however, there are
6 additional issues that were consistent
7 throughout the meeting on which there is room
8 for additional actions."

9 I want to suggest to you that there's sort of two aspects
10 to the way that a TAH works. The first one is, of course,
11 that you need to put the evidence in front of the Board to
12 convince it that there's a conservation concern and that
13 the appropriate response is a total allowable harvest. In
14 this case, your application asks the Board to set a
15 numerical TAH of 30 caribou. So that's the first part, I
16 guess, is picking a number, if you will.

17 The second part of a TAH I've explored with
18 you a moment ago, and that is that normally what government
19 does, if the Board agrees to set a numerical TAH, is that
20 government will amend the appropriate schedule in the
21 regulations to reflect the number, the TAH that the Board
22 approved, and then at that point, although you've indicated
23 you continue to work with the HTOs, the enforcement, if you
24 will, of that process is at least as much in the
25 Government's hands as it is in local hands.

1 Now, I guess I want to stop just there
2 before I ask you the ultimate part of the question. But
3 that's a fair representation, I think of our conversation
4 so far, isn't it?

5 THE CHAIR: Thank you, John.

6 Mathieu.

7 MR. DUMOND: I mean, I think you're going back
8 to what you want to say in the first place, and there's
9 still a little bit more to it than what you're trying to
10 picture. And the HTOs have power over the TAH tags that
11 are allocated to their HTOs. And the enforcement, yes, is
12 done by our department, but in coordination with the HTOs,
13 the allocation of tags is done either by the HTO, or the
14 HTO, as per their choice, delegates that responsibility to
15 our department. It happens for some muskox population in
16 some communities, for example.

17 But there's a collaboration on this because,
18 after the -- the recognition is that what alternative to
19 the legal enforcement would you suggest?

20 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mathieu.

21 John.

22 MR. DONIHÉE: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

23 Mr. Dumond, as it turns out, I ask the
24 questions. And let me ask you it this way. If there's no
25 difference between a TAH situation and no TAH situation --

1 in other words, if it's all done on the basis of
2 collaboration and can be done on the basis of collaboration
3 between your department and Inuit harvesters -- why do you
4 need a TAH?

5 THE CHAIR: Thank you, John.

6 Mathieu.

7 MR. DUMOND: I'm not sure the discussion goes
8 anywhere in there, but we feel that at this time this is --
9 especially considering the urgency of the situation, we
10 feel that it's probably the best options to have an
11 allocation as the HTO with the assistance of our department
12 for the enforcement. Thank you.

13 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mathieu.

14 John.

15 MR. DONIHÉE: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I have
16 two questions left.

17 I'm just wondering, looking at section 5.7.3 of
18 the Land Claim and the authorities that are granted to HTOs
19 under 5.7.3 to regulate harvesting practices, including
20 non-quota limitations, allocation, and enforcement,
21 assignment to nonmembers, etcetera -- I'm sure you've read
22 it, you're familiar.

23 My question really is, wouldn't you agree that
24 GN could achieve the same goals by working closely with the
25 HTOs to establish a framework based around section 5.7.3

1 without the requirement for a TAH at all?

2 THE CHAIR: Thank you, John.

3 GN, Mathieu.

4 MR. DUMOND: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

5 Just to mention that this has been tried, and in
6 some other communities, actually the community asks for a
7 TAH to be able to regulate that harvest. So we have also
8 examples where the community themselves ask for assistance,
9 and through this tool that is available through the Land
10 Claim to be able to manage their population. And, again,
11 at this time -- and we do work in collaboration with the
12 HTOs, and at this time we feel that would be the best
13 options, the best option. And some other population
14 conservation issues that were first addressed tried to be
15 addressed through a community-based harvest management, the
16 community asked for the government to step in because it
17 was more viable that way and more possible to implement the
18 restrictions that way.

19 HTOs have difficulties to implement bylaws and
20 enforce bylaws, and that's a reality at this time.
21 Hopefully in the future it can change to allow more
22 community-based enforcement and management, for sure.
23 Thank you.

24 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mathieu.

25 John, go ahead.

1 MR. DONIHÉE: Last one.

2 THE CHAIR: Go ahead.

3 MR. DONIHÉE: Thank you, sir.

4 The last question really is just about the 100
5 versus 30. I won't belabour it, but I wonder if you could
6 tell me, you know, from a statistical standpoint whether
7 you even have the capacity to tell the difference, you
8 know, in terms of what impact the 100 versus 30 is going to
9 have on that herd from a biological standpoint. My
10 understanding is that the confidence intervals in these
11 surveys are quite high, and I really wonder, you know,
12 whether, in fact, the move from 100 to 30 for the proposed
13 TAH isn't what a good friend of mine would call a
14 distinction between a difference.

15 THE CHAIR: Thank you, John.

16 Lisa.

17 MS. LECLERC: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

18 I want to reply at the table that the first
19 position was based on the 2012 survey population estimate.

20 The 2015 estimate show a rapid decline in that
21 population, and biologically, all the demographic indicator
22 point toward a moratorium. The herd cannot sustain any
23 harvest. It's still going to decline. That's the point
24 that we reach.

25 Biologically, the TAH is zero. However, we

1 recognize that the Inuit have -- the harvest represent an
2 economic venture, and cultural, and that's why we're really
3 allowing a minimum negligible harvest on that herd based on
4 the 2015 population estimate, and that's just the TAH of
5 30, which the negligible harvest is 0.15 percent of the
6 herd.

7 I hope that answer your question.

8 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lisa.

9 Final question, Mr. Donihee.

10 MR. DONIHEE: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I told a
11 fib. I have a follow-up, if I may.

12 I didn't ask you about the two different
13 surveys. I do understand you've got newer, maybe better
14 information now. I guess what I was asking -- and I
15 understand, as well, that even with a zero harvest that the
16 biology of the situation -- we'll hear more of it, I'm
17 sure, from our friends from GNWT -- but even with a zero
18 harvest, the prediction is the herd is going to continue to
19 go down.

20 I guess my question really was trying to get at:
21 If that's the situation, you know, are you able from a
22 biological standpoint to say that 70 more bulls is going to
23 be, you know, the tipping point for the herd? You know, do
24 your statistics actually allow you to make that
25 determination, or not?

1 THE CHAIR: Thank you, John.

2 Lisa.

3 MS. LECLERC: Mr. Chair.

4 I don't want to put my colleague in the hot
5 seat, but I want to -- maybe they're going to be able to
6 talk more about it because they did, with the very good
7 research that they did, come up with harvest modelization.
8 So I think I'm going to leave them the ability to present
9 their harvest model.

10 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thank you. That will be a
11 question for NWT once they get to the chair.

12 MR. DONIHÉE: Thank you very much for your
13 patience, Mr. Chairman. Those are all my questions.

14 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much. KIA, any
15 other questions? Attima.

16 MR. HADLARI: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Attima
17 Hadlari.

18 Just the comment that, if a total allowable
19 harvest is the effect, were affected by just number of 30
20 with a population that's higher than Baffin and the total
21 allowable harvest in Baffin is much higher, so I don't see
22 where that fairness comes in. So that's my last statement.
23 Thank you.

24 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Attima.

25 Lisa, would you like to respond?

1 MS. LECLERC: Mr. Chairman.

2 Once again, I want to mention that each herd in
3 Nunavut is -- the management of harvest is based by the
4 herd.

5 Just to give you a little bit broader example,
6 since we're exploring what's happening in different other
7 herd, barren ground caribou herd, I just want to point out
8 that the harvest management plan for Porcupine caribou was
9 finalized in 2010. The red zone, which represented 33
10 percent of the peak number, the threshold is 6, that's
11 45,000 animal; and at that time, at 45,000 animal the
12 harvest is close.

13 Thank you.

14 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lisa.

15 KIA, then, you're done your questioning for now.
16 Thank you very much.

17 We'll move on to the next questioners, and that
18 is the North Slave Métis Alliance. Go ahead, sir.

19 NORTH SLAVE MÉTIS ALLIANCE QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

20 MR. SHIGA: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Shin Shiga,
21 North Slave Métis Alliance.

22 I have two pretty basic questions. How is the
23 current harvest level monitored or estimated?

24 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Shin -- I believe it is
25 Shin. Thank you.

1 GN, Mathieu.

2 MR. DUMOND: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

3 At this time for the Bathurst herd it's not
4 completely accurate. We're missing some of the
5 information, but it makes it easy that most of the harvest
6 is actually through an outfitter that has provided us with
7 a report of his harvest, and so we have actually quite
8 accurate number of that part of the harvest, and then you
9 would add a little bit of subsistence harvest, which is a
10 little bit harder to monitor at this time.

11 But recently for example, Kugluktuk accessed the
12 Bathurst herd a little bit, and we did monitor, as much as
13 we could, the harvest by going on site and also in the
14 community interviewing people to try to have the most
15 accurate sense of what was the subsistence harvest at that
16 time.

17 But in general, the core of the harvest on the
18 Bathurst herd from the Nunavut side, especially nowadays
19 that a lot of the outpost camp around Contwoyto Lake are
20 not used fully anymore, the core of the harvest come from
21 the outfitting business, and it's pretty easy to monitor.
22 Thank you.

23 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mathieu.

24 Shin.

25 MR. SHIGA: Thank you, Mathieu. Shin Shiga,

1 North Slave Métis Alliance.

2 So is it GN's responsibility to monitor the
3 harvest, or is it HTOs'?

4 THE CHAIR: Thank you.

5 Mathieu.

6 MR. DUMOND: Well, at this time, it's either a
7 joint or nobody's responsibility the way -- the only legal
8 obligation that I could think of, of caribou at this time,
9 especially for herds that are -- don't have a TAH but could
10 have one, is to have a sense of the BNL; and under the Land
11 Claim, that's under NWMB jurisdiction.

12 But in terms of the total harvest monitoring, it
13 feels it falls on the GN to monitor it, but I think it's a
14 shared responsibility because it's an important set of data
15 that is crucial for management to either defend the harvest
16 level or to be aware that it may be an issue. But, yeah.
17 So I know it's not a clear-cut answer, but that's the best
18 I can do at this time, I think.

19 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mathieu.

20 MR. SHIGA: Thank you, Mathieu.

21 Shin Shiga, Slave Métis Alliance.

22 So once the TAH is set, is the responsibility
23 going to be more clear?

24 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Shin.

25 Mathieu.

1 MR. DUMOND: Yeah, as a TAH is established,
2 then it would be a -- well, the HTO would be responsible to
3 monitor the allocation, and the GN could assist in ensuring
4 that that allocation is appropriate, based on the
5 legislation, but the HTO would be -- it's the same with
6 other species that have TAH where technically the HTOs is
7 responsible to monitor the allocation for that species,
8 and, in practice, they do so with the assistance of the GN,
9 and we collaborate on that to try to have accurate record
10 of harvest for TAH species together.

11 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mathieu.
12 Shin.

13 MR. SHIGA: Thank you. Shin Shiga, Slave
14 Métis Alliance. Just last question.

15 So roughly speaking, what sort of range of
16 harvest are we talking about if there is some? because I
17 don't think I saw a range of numbers in terms of estimated
18 harvest. I think there was just one number, 100 or 70.
19 What's a realistic sort of range we're talking about?

20 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Shin.
21 Mathieu.

22 MR. DUMOND: So as I mentioned, we don't have
23 the exact number. We have a base of 70 or less from the
24 outfitting business, and on top of that there's a little
25 bit of subsistence harvesting happening. It may vary

1 depending on the years.

2 Based on previous discussions with Bathurst
3 Inlet, Burnside HTO, and other people active in that area
4 in the past ten years it's probably been between 100, 200,
5 maybe 300, at the most, but it's probably somewhere between
6 100 and 200, the actual harvest. And I would encourage Sam
7 or Boyd or other people that are currently active in that
8 area, if that range is somewhat accurate, but I believe
9 from our previous discussion that that's what it is most of
10 the years issues, like, in general. Thank you.

11 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mathieu.

12 Shin.

13 MR. SHIGA: Thank you. That's all my
14 questions.

15 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much.

16 Okay. We'll move on to our next questioner, and
17 that is Adventures Northwest. Boyd, the floor is yours.

18 ADVENTURE NORTHWEST LIMITED QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

19 MR. WARNER: Than you, Mr. Chair.

20 Boyd Warren, Ventures Northwest. Appreciate all
21 the time and the information, and I know we're going slow
22 so I'll try and summarize my points. I've got four
23 questions I'd like to discuss.

24 The first one is talking about the Bathurst
25 range. You mentioned in your opening proposals or

1 presentation that the Bathurst range -- up to 1986 the
2 Bathurst range is 350,000 square kilometres, and up to 1996
3 any caribou on the mainland from basically Great Bear Lake
4 to Chantry Inlet calving would have been considered
5 Bathurst caribou. To my knowledge, the creation of the
6 Bluenose East and the Ahiak herds came after 1996 when
7 satellite collars came into play and people were able to
8 see year round where caribou moved.

9 My point I'm trying to make is that during that
10 time, and to most people in this room, any caribou on the
11 mainland in that 350,000 square kilometres would have been
12 considered a Bathurst caribou, and now the Bathurst range
13 is reduced to perhaps about one-third of that, but there's
14 still a lot of animals out there. And from even the most
15 conservative estimates that I could pull off the GNWT
16 website and others, in that 350,000 square kilometres
17 there's not just 19,000 caribou, there's 200,000 caribou.
18 And I know we're calling them Bathurst East (verbatim) and
19 Ahiak and now even the fact that the Beverly caribou are
20 perhaps occupying what used to be Bathurst caribou calving
21 grounds.

22 So as a group, I think we need to be concerned
23 about total caribou on the mainland. If, for management
24 reasons, it's good to classify Bluenose East and Bathurst
25 and Ahiak, I could understand that, but I don't believe --

1 and, please, if I say something wrong here, if I'm wrong in
2 that, there's 200,000 at least caribou in 350,000 square
3 kilometres range that used to be Bathurst or still is
4 called Bathurst, but those other herds are there -- please
5 correct.

6 So the other question that leads to for me --
7 and I've lived in the north quite a while, been around
8 Bathurst Inlet, as most of you know, since 1970, and have a
9 lot of flight hours in the area, some actually with then
10 GNWT biologist doing caribou survey. But was there ever
11 any consultation that the GN is aware of when the Bluenose
12 East and the Ahiak caribou were created?

13 To my knowledge, there was no HTO consultation,
14 there was no Nunavut consultation at all, and I've done,
15 probably some of you know, some writing on this that I find
16 it incredibly confusing and then misleading because we
17 think there's only 19,000 caribou, but there's 200,000
18 caribou, at least, on the mainland.

19 So I guess the question directly to the GN would
20 be, was there any involvement? Was the GN involved in the
21 creation of the Bluenose East and the Ahiak caribou herd?
22 And, if so, was there any consultation with the local HTOs
23 and regional organizations? Thank you.

24 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Boyd.

25 GN, Mathieu.

1 MR. DUMOND: Some of the delineation you're
2 referring to happen prior the establishment of Nunavut in
3 '99; however, after '99, there's been more work done in
4 collaboration with other jurisdictions in terms of
5 collarings and monitoring. And I think the key thing is
6 that our information get better in refining the structure
7 of the herds, and it's hard to compare an idea from the
8 '60s, in terms of assessing the distribution on a snapshot
9 on a few flights around and on-the-ground accounts to what
10 the tools we have now to delineate those herds. So there's
11 a difference there.

12 And at the end of the day, what if, even
13 hypothetically, over hundreds and hundreds of years all
14 those caribou eventually mix, that Qaminaruaq caribou
15 eventually end up in the Bluenose range after hundreds of
16 generation, the bottom line is that we have to manage
17 wildlife and the population structure we can establish at
18 the time scale that will benefit people. And, of course,
19 we could probably continue to harvest the Bathurst -- or
20 what we call the Bathurst, anyway, if we disagree on
21 that -- and then how long it is going to take for that area
22 to recover and for people to be able to harvest caribou
23 again. So that's a matter of scale, of time scale, too, in
24 terms of management and how we want to leave the landscape
25 for future generation.

1 I think we can argue over and over on the
2 delineation and all that. There's quite a few evidence
3 nowadays to support the delineation of the herds -- they
4 are defined in the presentation -- but at the end of the
5 day, that discussion won't really help present and
6 future -- and especially future harvesters.

7 So I'll leave it at that. But something to
8 think about, anyway.

9 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mathieu. Lisa, you
10 wanted to add something?

11 MS. LECLERC: Mr. Chair.

12 I just want to point out that the Bathurst herd
13 have been surveyed on the calving ground (unintelligible)
14 for a very numerous amount of year, and there's multiple
15 report that have tracked and reported the amount of caribou
16 survey in that location since then.

17 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lisa.

18 Boyd.

19 MR. WARNER: Okay. I thank you for your
20 answer. I'll just make a statement, and maybe you can just
21 say yes or no, if that's possible.

22 In the area that you define as the Bathurst
23 herd, the 350,000 square kilometre area that's referred to
24 in your submission, is it accurate to say that right now
25 there's close to or around 200,000 caribou using that

1 range, regardless of what we call them as herds? I
2 understand the importance that you have placed on that for
3 management tool, but is that a fair statement that there's
4 at least 200,000 caribou, give or take, in that 350,000
5 square kilometres?

6 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Boyd.

7 GN, Mathieu.

8 MR. DUMOND: I'm not even sure we can say yes
9 to that number at this time. It would be difficult to say
10 yes because the other herds have been surveyed at the same
11 time, meaning that there's no room for a big chunk of
12 caribou to hide somewhere with the amount of surveys that
13 were undertaken for now a decade since the early signs of
14 decline of those herds. And I wouldn't be comfortable
15 saying yes to your 200 within that range because we know
16 that most herds that would overlap at sometime in that
17 range that are not defined as the Bathurst as per now, as
18 per this presentation. All of them have shown sign of
19 decline, as well, so I cannot say yes. Sorry.

20 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mathieu.

21 Boyd.

22 MR. WARNER: Thank you for that.

23 And just so the others know, the reason I came
24 up with that number is based off of information that's
25 available on the internet that accounts for the estimates

1 for the Bluenose East, the Bathurst, and then the Ahiak,
2 and Beverly that are using the east side of Bathurst, so
3 just so people know where I came from.

4 The second question I have is a bit of a
5 statement question. In the Nunavut Wildlife Act, Nunavut
6 Wildlife Act, it defines the Bathurst caribou herd, and I
7 plotted it on a map, and it all comes up on the east side
8 of Bathurst Inlet, an area very commonly known to probably
9 everybody here as the Bathurst caribou calving grounds.
10 And the fact that it's recognized in the Nunavut Wildlife
11 Act, how can we consider a total allowable harvest of
12 caribou on the Bathurst herd if we don't count those
13 animals that are recognized in the Nunavut Wildlife Act
14 calving area?

15 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Boyd.

16 Government of Nunavut, Mathieu.

17 MR. DUMOND: Hard to answer this one except
18 that some information may be outdated in an Act that has
19 quite a few years now, and I think it would need an update
20 on this aspect, and, I mean, you touch a point that this is
21 discrepancy of the calving ground that is a historic
22 calving ground and the current calving ground of that herd.

23 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mathieu.

24 Boyd.

25 MR. WARNER: Thank you, Mathieu.

1 And just to supplement to that, if we are going
2 to change the definitions of calving grounds, I would
3 presume that that would involve a lot of community and HTO
4 consultations, and the fact is, to my knowledge, there's
5 been no discussions at any level about the change and,
6 historically, there's a lot of maps that show the Bathurst
7 caribou move back and forth across the inlet, and going
8 back to all the surveys, and that they've often used both
9 sides. But I guess that's a point that I have is that may
10 be a legal technicality maybe for your legal department
11 about how we could do that without actually using those
12 animals that are in the calving grounds.

13 And the next question, I guess, is just
14 revolving around the predators. We've heard a lot from the
15 traditional knowledge side and Elders on predators, and I
16 agree with them 100 percent that predators are on a big
17 increase.

18 We've operated a lodge in Bathurst Inlet since
19 1969, and we have an observation book, and we record
20 sightings of caribou, grizzlies, wolves, everything, for
21 our guests and as our guides are out. And in the early
22 days you'll be lucky to see three bears a year in Bathurst
23 Inlet, and in the hours that I've flown as a commercial
24 pilot, same thing, whereas nowadays we're seeing up to 13
25 bears a day. It's actually becoming one of the greatest

1 attractions for our guests in an eco tourism sense is the
2 amount of bears. But I think it's having a huge impact on
3 our animals on the mainland.

4 And I'd like to lead into that a little bit with
5 the outfitting that we do on Contwoyto Lake in conjunction
6 with the two HTOs, Umingmaktok and Burnside, that our
7 hunters while they're there often harvest predators. And
8 we've heard how wolves impact caribou herds, and we've also
9 heard how fewer and fewer people are on the land and not
10 able to taking wolves. But, historically, our hunters
11 while they're hunting caribou -- and we also run a straight
12 wolf hunt north of Yellowknife -- it's often just in
13 Management Unit R in the NWT side, but still Bathurst
14 caribou range -- we often take at least ten wolves a year.

15 I've written this before that by harvesting ten
16 wolves in September when there's no chance for pack -- I
17 mean, there's no chance to reproduce those wolves for the
18 winter, that we actually save more caribou than we harvest.
19 So if we take ten wolves, and they're going to 25 to 30
20 caribou in their year before they can give birth again, I'm
21 not saying it as a justification, but I would like to
22 present it as a fact to the Board to consider that if you
23 remove -- because by going to a total allowable harvest of
24 30 animals would basically wipe out the outfitting
25 opportunities for the HTOs and then us -- that you'd

1 actually hurt the caribou, because there's going to be more
2 dead caribou at the end of the year because of the impact
3 we have positively on the wolf -- and maybe not positive
4 for the wolves, but positively for the caribou.

5 I don't know if you want to comment on that
6 before I continue or you want to make any statement, but
7 before I just ramble on, do you see that as a positive, the
8 fact that we're harvesting wolves on Contwoyto Lake and my
9 statement about saving caribou for that winter is correct?

10 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Boyd.

11 Mathieu.

12 MR. DUMOND: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

13 No, I -- yeah, it's great, I mean, and it's good
14 that you can get an economic activity that potentially is
15 one drop in the jar of getting it full of addressing some
16 of the predators issue. No, I mean, I can only say yeah,
17 it's good.

18 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mathieu.

19 Boyd.

20 MR. WARNER: Okay. I think I'm just going to
21 wrap up, in the interests of time. I know there's a lot of
22 other presentations.

23 I would just like to make one last comment that,
24 when trying to regulate harvest, total allowable harvest,
25 especially of bulls only, that there's no radio collars, to

1 my knowledge, legally on bulls or allowed on bulls, so we
2 have no information on where bulls rut or winter. The
3 information we're basing off of range management areas are
4 off of cows. So even though it was mentioned the Bathurst
5 herd was close to Kugluktuk this year, but that would be
6 cows and caribou (verbatim). Is that correct that there
7 are no caribou collared?

8 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Boyd.

9 Lisa.

10 MS. LECLERC: Lisa Marie, regional biologist.

11 I would like my colleague in GN to a specific
12 number, but for recent year now bull have been collared as
13 well as female.

14 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much, Lisa.

15 You'll have questions of NWT once their
16 presentation --

17 MR. WARNER: Okay. Thank you.

18 And, Lisa, just to clarify, is that for the
19 Bathurst herd as well?

20 THE CHAIR: Okay. Boyd.

21 MR. WARNER: Thank you. I'll wrap up, Mr.
22 Chair.

23 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much.

24 We'll move on to our next questioners. That's
25 the Wek'èezhìi Renewable Resource Board, if there's any

1 questions at all.

2 MS. PELLISSEY: Thank you, Mr. Chair. This is
3 Jody Pellissey, Executive Director of the Wek'èezhìi
4 Renewable Resources Board. We are here in the capacity as
5 a witness only. We're not an intervener, and, therefore,
6 we won't be asking questions as per our understanding of
7 the rules garnered for witnesses. So thank you.

8 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much. Welcome
9 here.

10 Our last questioners would be the general public
11 that's sitting in the back of the room. Is there any
12 questions at all from anybody of the general public to the
13 Government of Nunavut?

14 Thank you very much. Sit down and state your
15 name for the record, and you can go on with your question.

16 PUBLIC QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

17 MR. PANIOYAK: Yeah, good afternoon. I'll be
18 speaking my Inuinnaqtun language. Is that it? That's it
19 now?

20 The caribou issue has been a discussion item for
21 years. This delegation from the Bathurst area and the
22 Bay Chimo area have talked of this issue many times when we
23 got together. Today it's good to hear the comments being
24 made. They're true and are felt by the presenters in
25 dealing with the caribou issue.

1 I have been the Ikaluktutiak HTO chairman for
2 three terms as well as sat on the Kitikmeot Wildlife Board
3 for three terms as well. So for those years that I've sat
4 on the boards, in terms of trying to manage or assist in
5 managing the wildlife if there are concerns from our
6 beneficiaries. So during those years I have not, to my
7 knowledge, anyway, heard any community concerns in terms of
8 the communities requesting the assistance from the Nunavut
9 Government in terms of managing the caribou herds.

10 So I would like to ask the Nunavut government as
11 to when exactly did the communities ask for assistance in
12 terms of a management model with the Bathurst caribou herd,
13 and, if so, which community is the Nunavut government
14 referring to?

15 Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

16 THE CHAIR: Thank you, James.

17 Mathieu.

18 MR. DUMOND: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

19 The reference to those example were in
20 particular with some communities that had to deal with TAH
21 on caribou as well, and so that would be communities on
22 Baffin Island and Southampton Island. And so it's not
23 examples from the region here, but there's other
24 communities in other regions that have run into that
25 problem of having a hard time to manage the harvest by

1 themselves without the establishment of a TAH and the
2 assistance of the department for the implementation.

3 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mathieu.

4 James.

5 MR. PANIOYAK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

6 So, in reality, what the Nunavut government has
7 recommended to the Nunavut Wildlife Board is that there
8 needs to be a total allowable harvest for the Bathurst
9 caribou herd without consulting the Kitikmeot HTOs. Am I
10 correct?

11 Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

12 THE CHAIR: Thank you, James.

13 Mathieu.

14 MR. DUMOND: I think there's a misunderstanding
15 here. I was just referring to some examples elsewhere;
16 however, we discussed it before on the level of
17 consultation that the Government did regarding this issue,
18 and there was consultation done on this issue in the
19 Kitikmeot. I was just referring to other examples where
20 other communities had to deal with harvest restrictions on
21 caribou and had asked to work with the government to
22 implement the restrictions.

23 I hope that clarifies the matter. Thanks.

24 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mathieu.

25 James.

1 MR. PANIOYAK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

2 Just to get away from that line of questioning,
3 in terms of your total allowable harvest that you
4 recommended to the Nunavut Wildlife Management Board for
5 the numbers -- for example, like, what we heard earlier,
6 there was a number being thrown around from 100 tags to 30
7 tags -- should that be a reality, though? How is it that
8 30 tags or 30 animals be enough to sustain both the sports
9 hunts and the sustainability for the Inuit who do go back
10 to their homeland to harvest for their families? How is it
11 that the number of 30 animals be able to sustain both
12 sports hunts and traditional harvest activity?

13 Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

14 THE CHAIR: Thank you, James.

15 Mathieu.

16 MR. DUMOND: I think the short answer is that
17 we're not claiming it does. That's the sad thing of
18 getting to a point in conservation issues that you have to
19 set limits is that usually those limits cannot accommodate
20 for everything as it was without limit. That's the sad
21 part of being in that situation.

22 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mathieu.

23 James, taima.

24 Okay. I think, then, it's coffee time. We're
25 going to break for coffee, and then when we break, come

1 back from coffee, we will have GNWT up for presentation.

2 Thank you.

3 (ADJOURNMENT)

4 THE CHAIR: Thank you everybody. Welcome
5 back.

6 Okay. We're going to carry on, and I'll give
7 the floor to the Government of Northwest Territories to
8 make their presentation.

9 The floor is yours. Go ahead.

10 GOVERNMENT OF NORTHWEST TERRITORIES SUBMISSION

11 MS. YONGE: Good afternoon Mr. Chair, Board
12 Members and staff, Elders, community members, and all
13 participants in this meeting. My name is Lynda Yonge, and
14 I'm the Director of Wildlife in the Department of
15 Environment and Natural Resources for the Government of
16 Northwest Territories, and I'm situated in Yellowknife.
17 With me at the table today is Jan Adamczewski. He's our
18 caribou biologist, also with the Wildlife Division in
19 Yellowknife.

20 We would first like to thank the community of
21 Cambridge Bay and the Nunavut Wildlife Management Board for
22 this opportunity to participate in the hearing and present
23 our information on the Bathurst caribou heard.

24 We fully recognize that we are visitors here,
25 and we're appearing today to share our information about

1 what we have seen happening with the Bathurst herd and the
2 management actions that are being taken in the Northwest
3 Territories. It will be up to the Nunavut Wildlife
4 Management Board and authorities in Nunavut to decide how
5 Bathurst caribou should be managed in Nunavut, but we're
6 here today because the Bathurst herd ranges across the
7 border between Nunavut and the Northwest Territories. It
8 has fallen to very low numbers, and it's still declining,
9 and there is a need for a consistent approach to management
10 of this transboundary herd.

11 This herd has been very important to the
12 aboriginal people in the Northwest Territories for
13 countless generations. Representatives of some of the
14 Aboriginal communities that rely on this herd are also here
15 at this hearing or have submitted submissions to the Board.
16 The herd's very low numbers have meant that hearings have
17 occurred in the NWT and management actions have been taken
18 on the NWT side, including closure of all harvest.

19 In our presentation, we will provide an overview
20 of the herd status and management in the NWT and for
21 management of this herd.

22 Thank you, Mr. Chair. I mention will now turn
23 it over to Jan Adamczewski to begin our presentation.

24 THE CHAIR: Thank you. Jan.

25 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Thank you, Lynda. And it says in

1 my speaking notes "Good morning," but I guess we'll change
2 that to "Good afternoon."

3 My name is Jan Adamczewski, and I am a biologist
4 with the Government of Northwest Territories in
5 Yellowknife. I have been working on Bathurst caribou and a
6 number of other herds for about nine years.

7 Our presentation today has two main sections.
8 Part A is on the Bathurst herd status, and I mention will
9 be presenting that information; and part B is on proposed
10 management, and for that I mention will turn the mic over
11 to Lynda again.

12 This map shows the annual ranges and calving
13 grounds of the migratory barren ground caribou herds that
14 occur entirely or partially in the Northwest Territories.

15 The annual ranges are based on accumulated
16 satellite radio collar locations from female caribou over
17 time. The first satellite collars were placed on migratory
18 caribou herds in the Northwest Territories in 1995-1996, so
19 about 20 years ago, and they are part of ongoing monitoring
20 of all migratory caribou herds across North America.

21 For each herd, the calving grounds are the
22 darker areas found at the north end of each annual range.
23 Each herd has a distinct calving ground that defines the
24 herd.

25 The Bathurst herd's range is the big green

1 triangle in the middle with the calving grounds found west
2 of Bathurst Inlet since 1996. The Bathurst range takes in
3 about 350,000 square kilometres if you use all the collar
4 information since 1996. As you likely know, the calving
5 grounds and part of the summer range in Nunavut. Most of
6 the remaining part of the range is in the Northwest
7 Territories, and, occasionally, Bathurst caribou have been
8 found a little bit further south into Saskatchewan.

9 Since the 1960s, migratory tundra barren ground
10 caribou herds across North America have been named and
11 managed based on the distinct calving grounds that female
12 caribou return to every year in June.

13 Since satellite collars have been placed on
14 migratory caribou herds in the Northwest Territories since
15 the mid-'90s, ENR -- Environment, Natural Resources, my
16 department -- has kept track of collared cows where at
17 least two consecutive June locations during calving were
18 recorded. We have generally found that collared cows
19 return to the same calving ground in consecutive years 96
20 to 98 percent of the time. The other 2 to 4 percent of
21 cases show a low rate of switches between neighbouring
22 herds.

23 This has been the case for the Bathurst herd as
24 well. 96 to 98 percent of the time cows that calved on the
25 Bathurst calving ground have returned there the next year,

1 and a very small number of times cows have switched to the
2 Bluenose East and Beverly and Ahiak calving ground on
3 either side. This has been the pattern for 20 years since
4 the first collars were placed on Bathurst caribou in 1996.

5 There is the same low rate of switches in
6 reverse from the Bluenose East and Beverly and Ahiak
7 calving ground to the Bathurst calving grounds. Thus,
8 overall, there has been very little net movement between
9 neighbouring herds. The same approach is used in defining
10 migratory tundra caribou herds in Alaska and in
11 Quebec-Labrador where named herds also have distinct
12 calving grounds.

13 In 2008, the Alberta Research Council carried
14 out an independent review of the Government of Northwest
15 Territories barren ground caribou program. In their report
16 of 2009, the Alberta Research Council endorsed the
17 herd-based management used by the Government of Northwest
18 Territories and noted that this was standard practice
19 across North America.

20 It is also worth mentioning that some migratory
21 tundra caribou herds may be ancient. Russell and
22 co-authors in 1993 wrote about the Porcupine herd. We are
23 relatively certain that the herd has acted as an entity for
24 several thousand years.

25 Bergerud and co-authors in 2008 wrote about the

1 George River herd, which is Quebec and Labrador: "We
2 believe that the George River herd has traditionally
3 summered northeast of Indian House Lake for the past 4,000
4 to 7,500 years." Although we don't know how long the
5 Bathurst herd has been on the landscape, it is deserving of
6 our respect, and conservation requires us to do our best to
7 keep this population on the landscape for future
8 generations.

9 Aboriginal people have known that barren ground
10 caribou go through big changes in numbers over time, and
11 this has been the case for a long time. In the case of the
12 Bathurst herd, traditional knowledge of Tlicho Elders has
13 shown that the Bathurst herd reached high numbers in the
14 1940s and in the 1980s with low numbers between the peaks.

15 Although caribou herds like the Bathurst have
16 recovered from low numbers before, it is not guaranteed
17 that they will recover this time. Studies of other caribou
18 herds have shown they may reach low numbers and then stay
19 at low numbers for many years.

20 This graph shows the estimated herd size of the
21 Fortymile herd in Alaska between 1950 and 1990. This herd
22 was once estimated at a much larger size of at least
23 300,000 and possibly as much as 500,000 in the 1920s.

24 It then dropped to much lower numbers of 40 to
25 60,000 in the 1950s and 1960s and may have gone as low as

1 7,000 in the early 1970s. Since then, it has recovered to
2 a little over 50,000 in 2014, and it is unclear whether it
3 will ever again reach the hundreds of thousands that it
4 numbered a hundred years ago.

5 This herd's history shows that long-term changes
6 in caribou numbers are not always predictable and that
7 herds may sometimes remain at low numbers for many years.

8 We would like to take a look next at global
9 trends in numbers of caribou herds.

10 This map shows the northern part of our planet,
11 and all the numbered areas are ranges of caribou and
12 reindeer herds. The map includes migratory tundra herds
13 like the Bathurst, but also Peary caribou on the arctic
14 islands, boreal woodland caribou in Canada, and at the top
15 of the map are Russia and northern Europe and the reindeer
16 ranges that they have.

17 The red caribou and reindeer populations are
18 declining ones, the green ones are increasing, and the gray
19 ones are populations where status was unknown or unclear.
20 Unfortunately, there's a lot of red on this map and very
21 little green.

22 The overall status of the world's caribou and
23 wild reindeer populations is a major concern in the
24 countries where they occur and in the communities that
25 depend on them. This map was published in a paper in 2009,

1 but, unfortunately, the situation in 2015 doesn't look much
2 better.

3 I'll move on now to the information we have on
4 the Bathurst herd size and recent trend as of 2015.

5 You'll have to forgive me. Some of this repeats
6 a little bit of what Lisa presented earlier today, but
7 we've done most of the monitoring, so we have a little more
8 detail to provide.

9 This map shows the intensive survey area covered
10 on the Bathurst herd's calving grounds in June 2015. The
11 map also includes the survey area for the Bluenose East
12 herd to the west. The surveys of the two calving grounds
13 were done at the same time.

14 Although the GNWT was the lead on the surveys,
15 we would like to recognize the extensive participation of
16 biologists and observers from Nunavut in these surveys.
17 This included Lisa Marie who is here today, Myles Lamont,
18 Mathieu Dumond, also Mitch Campbell from Arviat, David Lee
19 with Nunavut Tunngavik, and a number of observers from
20 Kugluktuk. So we thank all those people for all the help
21 and support they provided in the survey.

22 Each of the squares shows a ten-kilometre
23 segment along a survey flight line. The blank squares show
24 segments where no caribou were seen. All areas with
25 collared Bathurst caribou were flown along with thousands

1 of kilometres of lines where no caribou were seen.

2 The gray squares show segments with a low
3 caribou density which is less than one caribou per square
4 kilometres. The blue squares show caribou densities of one
5 to ten caribou per square kilometre, and the red squares
6 show densities of more than ten caribou per square
7 kilometre.

8 The yellow dots are locations of 31 Bathurst
9 collared cows on June 5th, 2015, all of them within the
10 core survey area.

11 The black dots are collared bull locations which
12 are basically to the south of the calving distribution down
13 to the Contwoyto Lake area. And there was a question
14 earlier about collars on Bathurst bulls, so we've had up to
15 20 Bathurst bulls collared since early 2015.

16 The tight concentration of the core calving
17 distribution show that nearly all the cows and a large part
18 of the herd was concentrated in an area of about 30 by 40
19 kilometres. This core area was almost entirely within the
20 photo block where 85 percent of the adult caribou estimated
21 in the survey area were found. The coverage of the photo
22 block was about 55 percent. Thus, we are confident that
23 the survey reliably captured a high percentage of the
24 herd's breeding cows, which is the primary focus of the
25 survey.

1 We also note that the tight aggregation on the
2 Bathurst calving ground continues a pattern seen since
3 2009, but the concentrated cluster has become smaller and
4 smaller from the 2009, 2012, and 2015 surveys. This may be
5 evidence that the herd's reduced numbers of cows are still
6 congregating to maintain the advantages of calving in large
7 groups.

8 So you've seen one of these graphs before in
9 Lisa's presentation, and I'll go over the numbers again.
10 These graphs show the estimated size of the Bathurst herd
11 from 1986 to 2015 in blue on the right, and the estimated
12 numbers of breeding cows on the calving ground in red on
13 the left. The same calving photo survey methods have been
14 used for this herd since 1986 with refinements over the
15 years to increase the precision of the surveys.

16 In 1986, the herd estimate was about 470,000.
17 In 2015, the herd estimate was about 20,000. This is a
18 decline of 96 percent. The most rapid decline in the herd
19 occurred from 2006 to 2009 when the herd went from more
20 than 100,000 to about 32,000 in three years.

21 From 2009 to 2012, the herd appeared to be
22 approximately stable, but from 2012 to 2015, the decline in
23 the numbers of breeding females was statistically
24 significant, and the numbers dropped by almost half from
25 just under 16,000 to a little more than 8,000. Overall

1 herd size declined from about 35,000 to about 20,000 over
2 the same three-year time period.

3 The extent of the decline in the Bathurst herd
4 has been very large, but it is not the only herd that has
5 declined on this scale. In Quebec and Labrador, the George
6 River herd was at very low numbers in the 1950s, increased
7 to about 800,000 in the late 1980s and has since declined
8 to less than 14,000 in 2014. I mention was recently in
9 contact with one of the biologists who works with that
10 herd, and they're now estimating it as probably at about
11 10,000 or less.

12 This graph provides a little further detail on
13 the estimates in recent years of the Bathurst adult cows,
14 three survey years, 2009, 2012, 2015. The total estimated
15 cows in the survey area are the bars including blue and
16 red. The blue bars are the estimated number of breeding
17 cows, the red bars are the nonbreeding cows.

18 Both the total number of cows and particularly
19 the number and proportion of breeding cows has declined
20 from 2012 to 2015. The number of breeding cows as a
21 proportion of the total number of cows provides a measure
22 of the previous winter's pregnancy rate. If there are many
23 nonbreeding cows in June on the calving ground, then the
24 pregnancy rate the previous winter was low.

25 The survey results from 2015 are particularly

1 worrisome because about 40 percent of the cows were
2 nonbreeders. This would suggest that the pregnancy rate
3 the previous winter was only about 60 percent, and that is
4 well below the 80 percent we would usually expect to see in
5 a healthy herd.

6 On the right are the estimated numbers of
7 breeding females in the Bathurst herd 2009, 2012, and 2015,
8 and again, we have about a 50 percent decline in the last
9 three years.

10 For reference, the number of breeding cows
11 estimated in 1986 is also shown, and at that time there
12 were more than 200,000 breeding cows estimated in the herd.

13 In addition to tracking the number of breeding
14 cows and overall herd size, biologists monitor indicators
15 called vital rates which help us understand the herd's
16 trend and whether it is likely to increase or decrease in
17 the future. Lisa Marie talked about this a little bit
18 earlier, so again, pardon me if I repeat some of this
19 information.

20 Three of these vital rates are the survival rate
21 of the cows, which is the proportion of cows that live
22 through the year; herd trend is very sensitive to this
23 rate; second, the survival rate of the cows, which is
24 important because, as we all know, the herd can only
25 increase if calves make it through their first year; and,

1 third, the pregnancy rate of the cows. If many cows are
2 not pregnant, then few calves will be born in June.

3 The cow survival rate estimated for this herd
4 was about 78 percent from 2012 to 2015, and it needs to be
5 about 80 to 85 percent for a stable population.

6 Calf survival in the last three years has
7 averaged about 22 to 25 calves per 100 cows, and our
8 experience has been it needs to be at least 30 to 40 calves
9 per 100 cows to have a stable herd.

10 We do not have annual pregnancy rates for the
11 herd, but as I mention mentioned earlier, the June 2015
12 survey suggested that the herd's pregnancy rate was about
13 60 percent, much lower than the 80 percent we would like to
14 see in a healthy herd.

15 Together, these vital rates are consistent with
16 a rapid rate of decline, and unless they change
17 substantially in the near future, the herd is likely to
18 decline further in the next few years.

19 A question that is often asked when surveys have
20 documented a decline in numbers of caribou in a particular
21 herd is whether the caribou might have gone somewhere else.
22 You know, we heard that earlier already that question
23 raised today. The information we have from surveys and
24 collars suggests that movement from the Bathurst range does
25 not account for the decline documented in the herd,

1 including the most recent decline from 2012 to 2015.

2 This map again shows the extent of the flying in
3 June 2015 over the calving grounds of the Bathurst and
4 Bluenose East herds. All the north/south flight lines were
5 flown. Lines were flown between the two calving grounds
6 and to the east of the Bathurst calving range, including
7 some lines east of Bathurst Inlet. With this level of
8 coverage, it becomes very unlikely that any substantial
9 aggregations or numbers of caribou from either herd were
10 missed.

11 The locations of collared caribou also provide
12 some assurance, some confidence that a high percentage of
13 the herd was accounted for in the survey areas. For the
14 Bathurst herd, all 31 collared cows were accounted for in
15 the intensive survey area, nearly all of them in the
16 high-density survey block.

17 Similarly, 30 Bluenose East collared cows were
18 accounted for in the main survey area for this herd west of
19 Kugluktuk. Although they're not shown on this map, all of
20 the Beverly and Ahiak collared cows monitored by GNWT were
21 found to the east of Bathurst Inlet well separated from the
22 Bathurst collars. Areas between the Bathurst range and the
23 Bluenose East range have no collared caribou, and no
24 caribou were seen there during all the extensive survey
25 flying.

1 These findings increase our confidence that the
2 Bathurst herd's distribution was well defined and that the
3 herd's cows were well separated from the herds to the east
4 and the west.

5 This slide provides additional information about
6 movements of cows between the Bathurst calving ground and
7 the neighbouring Bluenose East and Beverly and Ahiak
8 calving grounds on either side.

9 We tracked information from 2008 to 2015 on
10 collared cows for which consecutive June locations were
11 known. In total, there were 259 cases where we had
12 consecutive June locations for cows calving from these
13 three herds.

14 In this figure, the curved arrows at the top
15 show how many times collared cows for each herd returned to
16 the same calving ground, and the straight arrows show the
17 switches. Of 259 pairs of locations, 254 were returns to
18 the same calving ground, and 5 were switches.

19 One cow switched from Bathurst to Beverly Ahiak,
20 and one switched in the reverse direction. Two Bathurst
21 cows switched to the Bluenose East calving ground, one
22 switched in the reverse direction, so overall, based on the
23 collared cows, 98 percent loyalty to calving grounds in
24 these three herds.

25 Similar evaluations for the Bathurst herd in the

1 past back to 1996 have shown a 96 to 98 percent loyalty of
2 collared cows to calving grounds, and we have found a
3 similar rate of loyalty to calving grounds in other herds,
4 including the Cape Bathurst, Tuktoyaktuk Peninsula and
5 Bluenose West herds in the Northwest Territories.

6 These results suggest that there has been a very
7 low rate of switching of cows between the Bathurst and
8 neighbouring calving grounds between 2008 and 2015 with net
9 movement to or from the Bathurst range being minimal.
10 Movement from the Bathurst range is unlikely to account for
11 the declining trend in the herd.

12 We'd like to take a look now at the herd's
13 likely trend in the near future. For this we have used a
14 population model.

15 Population model is simply a tool that helps us
16 understand what is going on within the herd, and it tracks
17 the kinds of vital rates we talked about earlier: The cow
18 survival rate, calf survival, and the pregnancy rate. At
19 its simplest, it is a form of balance sheet that tracks the
20 births and deaths in the herd and how they add up over
21 time.

22 We use all the information we have about the
23 herd, and we try to make sure that the modelled caribou
24 herd is consistent with what we know of the herd's trend in
25 the past up to the present time.

1 Once we are confident that the model is faithful
2 to what we know about the herd in the past, we can use it
3 to look ahead into the future. The model is not a crystal
4 ball. It does not predict the future, but it can give us
5 an idea where things might go next.

6 So in this simple example, the blue line shows a
7 declining trend in a herd to the present or current time.
8 The green, black, red, and purple arrows are all possible
9 future trends. If everything stays the same, the black
10 arrow is the likeliest trend. If things get better, the
11 green arrow is more likely, and the herd might be stable.
12 If everything gets a lot better, then the herd might
13 increase, and the purple line shows an increasing trend.
14 If things get worse, the red arrow might apply, and the
15 decline might speed up.

16 So this now is a model projection for the
17 Bathurst herd from the last survey in 2015 to 2018 when we
18 expect to do the next population survey for this herd.

19 In this example we have assumed that the cow
20 survival rate stays the same for the herd at 78 percent.
21 There is no harvest in these projections.

22 If the recent low calf productivity continues at
23 the same level, then the herd will follow a trend similar
24 to the blue line. If calf productivity increases to
25 average level, the red line is a more likely outcome, and

1 if calf productivity increases to levels seen between 2008
2 and 2010, then the green line is the likeliest trend.

3 Overall, unless the herd's vital rates improve,
4 the herd is likely to decline from the current estimate of
5 about 20,000 to less than 15,000 caribou in 2018.

6 The model projections underline a point
7 mentioned earlier. If the cow survival rate is low, the
8 herd is likely to be declining, and it is difficult for the
9 herd to produce enough young to offset all the caribou that
10 die.

11 So this concludes the first part of our
12 presentation on the Bathurst herd status, and I mention
13 will turn the microphone over to Lynda to talk about part
14 of our presentation more on harvest and on management.

15 MS. YONGE: Thank you, Jan.

16 Okay. So this map shows how harvest of caribou
17 was tracked during the winters of 2007-2008, and 2008 to
18 2009 in the North Slave region of the Northwest
19 Territories, and that's where the main harvest was during
20 the -- where the maintain Bathurst winter range has been
21 and where the harvest in the Territories.

22 So it's a little bit hard to see here, but the
23 green dots are Bathurst collared caribou and the blue dots
24 are Bluenose East collared caribou. There were more
25 Bluenose East collars than Bathurst collars at this time,

1 and most of the Bluenose East collared caribou were in the
2 northwest of the region south of Great Bear Lake.

3 Most of the Bathurst collars were further south
4 and east, and some of them were near the communities of
5 Gamèti and Wekweèti.

6 The coloured squares are ten by ten kilometres,
7 and they show where the caribou harvest occurred during the
8 winter of 2008-2009. Yellow squares show areas where a few
9 caribou were taken, and the red and dark red squares show
10 where there were more caribou harvested.

11 In the dark red squares, several hundred caribou
12 were taken in that area. Most of the harvest occurred
13 around winter roads to Gamèti and Wekweèti, and this was
14 primarily Bathurst caribou.

15 Some harvest also occurred around a trail to
16 Hottah Lake south of Great Bear Lake, and this was mostly
17 Bluenose East caribou. The information we gathered on
18 caribou harvest was collected from a combination of
19 community interviews, a check station, and information from
20 wildlife officers.

21 The total reported harvest in winter 2008-2009
22 was about 3,450 caribou, most of them cows; however, this
23 total was considered an underestimate by staff in the
24 field. Some hunters don't stop at the check station, some
25 don't report their harvest, or underreport it, and these

1 numbers do not account for wounding losses. So the true
2 harvest may have been as much as twice as the reported
3 total, but we don't know the number that was missed.

4 This slide shows the affect of taking the same
5 number of caribou every year from a declining Bathurst
6 herd. So the solid black line shows the estimated herd
7 size of the Bathurst herd from 1986 to 2012 and the
8 diamonds you see there are the seven herd estimates that
9 were taken over time.

10 The dotted red line shows a harvest of 6,000
11 caribou as a percentage of the herd. Our estimates of the
12 Bathurst annual harvest up to 2009 suggest that 4 to 6,000
13 animals were taken annually. So in 1986, when the herd was
14 estimated at 470,000 animals, a harvest of 6,000 caribou
15 would have been a little more than 1 percent of the herd
16 and would not have had much of an effect on the herd trend.

17 However, by 2009, the same annual harvest of
18 6,000 would have been almost 19 percent of the herd and
19 would have meant that the harvest would be a major
20 contribution to the herd's rapid decline. Next slide.

21 So this graph shows the Bathurst herd's
22 estimated size again from 1986 to 2015. After the 2006
23 survey showed a substantial decline, resident harvest of
24 the Bathurst herd was reduced, and the guided outfitter
25 harvest was reduced. At that time, no limits were placed

1 on the Aboriginal harvest.

2 Up to the winter of 2009-2010, as we said, the
3 overall Bathurst harvest was estimated at 4 to 6,000 a
4 year. Most of this was a winter harvest of cows by
5 Aboriginal hunters.

6 The herd at that time was very easy to access on
7 winter roads even as its numbers fell much lower.

8 After the 2009 survey that showed the herd had
9 declined from more than 100,000 animals to about 32,000 in
10 just three years, more severe action was taken on harvest
11 of Bathurst caribou. Resident harvest and guided outfitter
12 harvest was closed in 2010. Initially, Aboriginal harvest
13 was also closed, but late in 2010 an agreement was reached
14 with the Tlicho government, the Wek'èezhìi Renewable
15 Resources Board, and the Yellowknife Dene First Nation on
16 the limited harvest of only 300 Bathurst caribou with 80
17 percent to be bulls.

18 This represented a harvest reduction of about 95
19 percent in 2010. The herd shifted from a very rapid
20 decline between 2006 and 2009 to an approximately stable
21 trend between 2009 and 2012. Improved calf survival and a
22 possible improvement of natural survival rates likely
23 contributed to the stabilizing trend, along with the major
24 reduction of hunter harvest.

25 So in the winter of 2014-2015, a new approach

1 was taken to harvest management for the Bathurst herd.
2 Previously, between 2010 and 2014, there were two large
3 management zones, RBC02 and RBC03 on the map. These were
4 used to cover the main winter range of the Bathurst herd.

5 Within these large zones no harvest was
6 permitted except for an Aboriginal harvest of up to 300
7 with 80 percent bulls. This approach generally worked, but
8 in some winters Bathurst collared caribou were outside
9 these two large zones where harvest restrictions did not
10 apply. In addition, the restriction of harvest included a
11 very large area, and not all of it was being used by
12 wintering Bathurst caribou, which meant opportunities for
13 Aboriginal harvest from other herds was being restricted.

14 In 2014-2015, monitoring of collared caribou
15 showed that all Bathurst collared caribou were grouped in a
16 single area where there was little overlap with
17 neighbouring herds. An example is shown on this map from
18 February 2016. This, then, was used to form the basis of a
19 mobile no-harvest zone centered on the locations of
20 Bathurst collared caribou.

21 The mobile zone was adjusted on a weekly basis
22 to reflect the location of collared caribou. Note that in
23 this figure the Bathurst mobile zone included an area in
24 Nunavut because that's where some of the collared caribou
25 were, but the management zone had no status in Nunavut, so

1 the restrictions didn't apply in that area.

2 So the advantages of the mobile Bathurst
3 no-harvest zone are that it was defined by the areas where
4 the herd was actually wintering at the time, and the area
5 where harvest was restricted is considerably smaller than
6 the previous use of the two large management areas.

7 In the winter of 2015-2016, this mobile
8 no-harvest zone was continued as the herd, now defined by
9 about 45 collared caribou on both cows and bulls, again
10 wintered in a single area with little overlap with
11 neighbouring herds.

12 So the GNWT has recommended that the harvest of
13 Bathurst herd be zero for all of the herd's range for all
14 harvesters for the following reasons: First, the herd has
15 declined by about 96 percent from its peak numbers
16 estimated at 470,000 animals in 1986. Second, the herd
17 appears likely to decline further given its poor vital
18 rates, the cow survival rate of 78 percent is below what is
19 needed for a stable herd, the calf survival levels have
20 been well below levels associated with stable herds, and
21 the pregnancy rate was about 61 percent in 2015, well below
22 the 80 percent normally seen in healthy herds.

23 Finally, any harvest from the herd, even on a
24 small scale, adds to caribou mortality rates and increases
25 the likelihood of further decline. In the Northwest

1 Territories, the harvest of zero for the Bathurst range has
2 the support of the Tlicho government, the Yellowknife Dene
3 First Nation, the North Slave Métis Alliance, and the
4 Wek'èezhìi Renewable Resources Board. So essentially all
5 of the Aboriginal groups that do harvest this herd have
6 come forward and supported a zero harvest.

7 The GNWT fully understands that closure of
8 Bathurst harvest means real hardship in many communities.
9 Along with impacts, it will have impacts to traditional
10 cultures and ways of life. The recommendation for a zero
11 harvest is being made by the GNWT and other NWT parties for
12 the sake of conservation and future generations.

13 So this slide is borrowed from a harvest
14 management plan for the Porcupine caribou herd that was
15 completed in 2010 after several years through a
16 co-management process led by the Porcupine Caribou
17 Management Board, and Lisa in her presentation referred to,
18 and in the answers to some of her questions referred to
19 this plan a couple of times.

20 In this plan, the recommended harvest is based
21 on a colour chart that depends on herd size. So in the
22 green zone, if the herd is more than 115,000 caribou,
23 Aboriginal harvest is unrestricted, and licensed hunters
24 can take two bulls each. In the yellow zone, when the herd
25 is between 80,000 and 115,000 animals, Aboriginal harvest

1 is a voluntary bulls-only harvest, and licensed hunters can
2 take one bull each.

3 In the orange zone, if the herd is between
4 45,000 and 80,000, Aboriginal harvest is mandatory bulls
5 only, and the harvest rate is between 0.5 and 3 percent of
6 the total herd. And, finally, in the red zone, if the herd
7 is less than 45,000 animals, all harvest is closed except
8 for a ceremonial harvest of up to 0.1 percent of the herd.

9 So there is no harvest management plan like this
10 plan for the Porcupine in place for the Bathurst herd;
11 however, it is worth noting that the red zone threshold,
12 45,000 caribou for the Porcupine herd, is at about 23
13 percent or about a quarter of the greatest herd size
14 estimated to date in the Porcupine herd, about 200,000
15 animals.

16 By comparison, the Bathurst herd is now at about
17 4 percent of its greatest estimated size since the 1980s
18 and is still declining.

19 We don't have a red zone of no harvest in place
20 for the Bathurst herd, but we believe that we should treat
21 this herd as being well down in the red zone where all
22 harvest should be closed to give the herd its greatest
23 opportunity to recover.

24 There have been many meetings with communities
25 and political leaders and a number of hearings in the

1 Northwest Territories to talk about what to do about the
2 Bathurst herd's decline and low numbers, particularly since
3 2009. We're not going to list all of the meetings, but we
4 will highlight some of the key meetings that have taken
5 place since 2014. We recognize that in the Northwest
6 Territories Aboriginal governments and organizations,
7 boards, and other organizations have also had many, many
8 meetings about caribou.

9 So there were three meetings of Aboriginal
10 leaders and co-management boards in August and November
11 2014 and two two-day technical meetings in October 2014.
12 These were focused on evidence of serious decline in the
13 Bathurst and Bluenose East caribou herds and what could be
14 done about this. There were a number of Nunavut
15 organizations and the Nunavut government participated in
16 those meetings.

17 In December 2014, the Government of Northwest
18 Territories sent a proposal to the Wek'èezhìi Renewable
19 Resources Board for a Bathurst mobile conservation zone in
20 the NWT within which there would be no harvest permitted
21 except for a limited ceremonial harvest, and that was the
22 mobile zone that we showed in the map, the yellow area.

23 The Wek'èezhìi Renewable Resources Board
24 accepted this proposal on an interim basis for the
25 2014-2015 harvest season.

1 Once the calving photo survey for the Bathurst
2 herd was completed in June of 2015, updates on the surveys
3 and on proposed management were sent out in July,
4 September, and November of 2015. Community meetings were
5 held with the Lutselk'e Dene First Nation, the Yellowknife
6 Dene First Nation, and the NWT Métis Nation. Some meetings
7 included Chiefs, and the government was represented by our
8 deputy minister.

9 There has been a continuing series of meetings
10 between the Tlicho government and the Dene both at
11 technical staff levels and more senior levels. And there
12 were joint community meetings in the Tlicho communities in
13 December 2015 and January and February 2016. The last
14 series of meetings in the Tlicho communities included the
15 Tlicho Chiefs and the Minister of Environment and Natural
16 Resources.

17 In December 2015, the Government of Northwest
18 Territories and Tlicho government sent a joint management
19 proposal for the Bathurst herd to the Wek'èezhìi Renewable
20 Resources Board. This proposal included a recommendation
21 to continue the no-harvest mobile zone.

22 And the WRRB, the Wek'èezhìi Renewable Resources
23 Board, held a hearing on the Bathurst herd in February
24 2016, and in May they determined that there would be a zero
25 harvest on the Bathurst herd in the Tlicho land claim area.

1 The Board's determination is final and cannot be changed by
2 the Government of Northwest Territories.

3 So we recognize that this hearing is focussed on
4 a total allowable harvest for the Bathurst herd in Nunavut,
5 and that has been the main emphasis in our presentation;
6 however, in our experience in the Northwest Territories,
7 boards and communities want to see an inclusive approach to
8 management of caribou herds. So we would like to describe
9 the overall management context for the Bathurst herd in the
10 NWT and some of the programs that are under way.

11 So at this point, there is not yet an overall
12 management plan for the Bathurst herd; however, there have
13 been a number of meetings and workshops in recent years to
14 develop an overall management process for the herd. This
15 is a requirement under the Tlicho Land Claim Agreement.

16 The last meeting on overall Bathurst management
17 was held in January 2016 in Yellowknife. The meeting
18 lasted two days, and there was representation from across
19 the herd's range, including several organizations and
20 communities from Nunavut.

21 A draft terms of reference were developed, and
22 membership in an advisory Bathurst committee was agreed on.
23 A further meeting is planned for fall 2016. These are the
24 meetings that Lisa talked about earlier in her
25 presentation.

1 So the map on the left on this slide shows the
2 Bathurst caribou range in Nunavut and the NWT. It's a
3 little bit difficult to see, but it also shows the existing
4 all-season and winter roads, the existing diamond mines,
5 and a number of mines and roads that have been proposed.

6 Concern over the cumulative effects of
7 development on the herd have increased as the herd has
8 declined. The GNWT is leading a collaborative range
9 planning process for the Bathurst range which began in
10 2013. Again, a number of organizations and communities
11 from Nunavut are participating in this planning.

12 The range plan is meant to provide
13 recommendations on thresholds to limit industrial
14 development on the herd's range.

15 And there was a question earlier about using
16 traditional knowledge and information. In this process we
17 are using knowledge that's brought to the table about
18 traditional water crossings, about areas that traditional
19 knowledge indicates are important for the herd, and those
20 are all being mapped as part of this process.

21 Since 2009, there have been a number of
22 short-term proposals for management of Bathurst caribou in
23 the NWT from both the Tlicho government and the Government
24 of Northwest Territories to the Wek'èezhìi Renewable
25 Resources Board. At the same time, the GNWT has

1 collaborated with other aboriginal groups that have
2 harvested the Bathurst herd such as the Yellowknife Dene
3 First Nation and the North Slave Métis Alliance. And the
4 WRRB held hearings on Bathurst caribou in 2010 and 2016.

5 Reduction of wolf numbers to assist with
6 stabilization and recovery of the Bathurst herd has been
7 discussed at many meetings. Wolf reduction is always
8 controversial, and there is a diversity of views on
9 acceptable ways to manage predators.

10 Currently, there is a proposal from the Tlicho
11 government, with Government of Northwest Territories
12 support, to increase harvest of wolves on the Bathurst
13 winter range with community-based methods. The Government
14 of Northwest Territories also has a program of incentives
15 for wolf pelts in place, and incentives range from \$200 for
16 an unskinned wolf up to \$800 for a prime wolf pelt skinned
17 to taxidermy standards.

18 We have also initiated a collaborative process
19 to carry out a feasibility assessment for predator
20 management in the range of the Bathurst herd. The
21 feasibility assessment is meant to define a range of
22 predator management options that could be considered, their
23 costs, practicality, and likelihood of success. That
24 feasibility assessment is planned to be completed in 2016.

25 So that concludes our presentation on the

1 Bathurst caribou herd. Thank you very much for the
2 opportunity to speak to you, and we will do our best to
3 answer any questions you may have.

4 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much, Lynda and
5 Jan, for your very detailed presentation.

6 I'll first turn over to the Board, Board Members
7 if there's any questions.

8 NUNAVUT WILDLIFE MANAGEMENT BOARD QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

9 MR. KRITTERDLIK: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

10 Just wondering from both governments, from GN
11 and GNWT, any evaluations or findings on their studies and
12 surveys, do the two governments share any information
13 between them after finding out whatever studies or surveys
14 are done in the overlapping areas within NWT and Nunavut?
15 Thank you.

16 THE CHAIR: Thank you, David.

17 Jan.

18 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Jan Adamczewski with Government of
19 Northwest Territories.

20 Certainly at the level that I work at, I mention
21 would say up to director's level, the level of
22 collaboration between Government of Northwest Territories
23 and Government of Nunavut on caribou surveys and collar
24 information has never been better.

25 The information that comes from the surveys,

1 even when we have preliminary estimates, sometimes now
2 we're able to get those together a few weeks after the
3 survey. That is shared as quickly as we can make it
4 available.

5 As we described in the presentation on the
6 June 2015 surveys, I think we probably had as many
7 Government of Nunavut staff flying on those surveys as from
8 Government of Northwest Territories.

9 Our collar information that we have on shared
10 populations, shared herds is readily available to the GN,
11 and a number of other parties, including the diamond mines,
12 make use of that collar information. So I think the level
13 of sharing of information, especially the last few years
14 with declining herds and low numbers, I mean, it's been
15 very good. So that would be our perspective on that.

16 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jan.

17 Simeonie.

18 MR. KEENAINAK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

19 My name is Simeonie. I'm a Board Member for
20 NWMB.

21 You were talking about all different kinds of
22 caribou herds in the circumpolar arctic. It seems like
23 they're all declining all over the world, all over the
24 circumpolar arctic. And there were only a few areas where
25 they were increasing that were in the green zone.

1 You also mentioned that there were 100,000, and
2 they declined to 30,000 in a few years. Is there anything
3 why they are dying off? Is there a reason why? Was it
4 sickness, or were they diseased? Do they have any disease?
5 And perhaps if they did have a disease, we would see that.
6 You said that there were 70,000 that died off in a few
7 years. Have you studied that why they were dying off, the
8 result, the reasons why they were dying off? Or if there
9 was nothing, perhaps it seems that they were being killed
10 off by predators, and that would be obvious.

11 And this is my first question. I will have
12 another question. Thank you.

13 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Simeonie.

14 If I could just add to Simeonie's question too.
15 Not only disease or predation, but was there any drastic
16 weather events or development or any evidence whatsoever
17 why a drastic decline has happened?

18 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Jan Adamczewski with Government of
19 Northwest Territories.

20 I think our sense of the overall declines that
21 we've seen since about 2000 is that some of that is
22 probably part of a natural cycle that has occurred many
23 times in the past. And the fact that we see similar
24 declines or even worse declines elsewhere, you know, like
25 the George River herd in Quebec-Labrador kind of suggests

1 to us that's part of what we're seeing because we're seeing
2 consistent declines in all of our herds the last few years.

3 Weather almost certainly is a big part of that,
4 but people have looked for some time to sort of see, you
5 know, what is that big one factor that makes the huge
6 difference, and it never seems to be just one factor.

7 One bit of information that might be helpful
8 here, with the help of a biologist named Don Russell in
9 Whitehorse, we have environmental trend information for a
10 number of caribou ranges. And one of the patterns that
11 we've seen is that the drought index or the drying index on
12 the summer range has been going up and up and up.

13 Some people know in 2014 we had the biggest fire
14 year ever in the Northwest Territories, and it was also a
15 very hot, dry summer. And it's certainly possible, there's
16 some evidence, that if the feeding conditions are poor in
17 the summer, then the cows may be in poor shape in the fall
18 when they breed. And if they're in very poor shape, then
19 they will not breed.

20 And, indeed, in the winter of 2014-2015, we had
21 pretty strong evidence of a low pregnancy rate in the
22 Bathurst herd, and the neighbouring Bluenose East herd was
23 very similar, so that is one of the weather effects that we
24 think is making a difference for our caribou herds.

25 But it's always -- I think you always have to

1 look at each herd individually and look at the conditions
2 that it is facing. Predators obviously still play a role.

3 Our monitoring of wolves on the Bathurst summer
4 range den surveys that have been done since 1996 seems to
5 suggest that the wolf numbers are less than they were when
6 the herd was 350,000, which seems kind of reasonable. I
7 mean, if the herd declines by more than 90 percent, then
8 there will probably be fewer wolves, but many observations
9 from the communities and our own observations from the
10 surveys, there are still wolves out there, and we suspect
11 that their role is greater when the herds are at low
12 numbers and declining than when the herds are abundant and
13 they have very good calf recruitment.

14 The harvest, in our understanding, is probably
15 not a main driver of the big changes in numbers over time,
16 but we certainly found with the Bathurst herd that when it
17 was reaching lower numbers and it had a declining natural
18 trend but was very, very accessible on the winter range,
19 and there came a point where the winter harvest of Bathurst
20 caribou, because it was so easy with the winter road
21 access, pickup trucks doing the hunting, that became an
22 accelerating factor in the decline.

23 So there's no simple answer on this. We suspect
24 that a big part of the overall decline is part of a cycle
25 that has occurred many times in the past.

1 Climate change, in my understanding, is kind of
2 a big question mark because we know it will make
3 differences to caribou. Some of those could be good, some
4 of them could be bad.

5 So the long and the short of it, the past is not
6 necessarily an indicator of what may happen in the near
7 future, and we need to be very careful because we don't
8 know, we can't guarantor that the herd will hit bottom and
9 then start to increase again.

10 So I'm sure that's not a complete answer, but
11 maybe gives you a sense of some of the things that we've
12 looked at and some of the understanding that we have.

13 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jan.

14 Simeonie.

15 MR. KEENAINAK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

16 Yes, my name is Simeonie, I'm from NWMB.

17 These factors, the results for the declining,
18 and I mention was thinking that that might be the result.
19 Perhaps it's climate change, or if there was a drought
20 during the summer or have you noticed the ones that why
21 they were dying off, was it from the disease, or from
22 drought, or climate change?

23 Are you also including those when you're doing
24 the studies on caribou? That was my other question.

25 When you do a survey on a plane, do you ask the

1 communities when it is the best time to do a survey on
2 land, where you planned to do a survey?

3 At times you cannot see caribou, especially from
4 overhead when you're going over them. You cannot see them
5 because they're camouflaged, and if there's too many
6 mosquitos they're also very hard to see. I know you know
7 that.

8 But when you do a survey on a plane, have you
9 checked with the communities that are near the area where
10 you're going to do the survey when is the best time to do a
11 survey if you want to try and see all of the caribou?

12 Because you're always estimating, after you see
13 a few, and it seems that you try to set up a limit of
14 harvesting. And you should ask the communities when is the
15 best time to do a survey. You should check with the
16 communities that are near the area that you want to do a
17 survey. Thank you.

18 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Simeonie.

19 Jan.

20 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Jan Adamczewski with Government of
21 Northwest Territories.

22 Our calving photo surveys in June, and often
23 other surveys -- there was one completed just about a week
24 ago on the Bathurst calving ground, also Bluenose East --
25 wherever possible, we include observers from the

1 communities, and there are meetings in the communities
2 before the survey, and then we talk about the results, and
3 results go back to each of the communities as quickly as
4 possible.

5 The population surveys that we do, the
6 photographic surveys in June and then in July on our
7 western herds, we do them in the post-calving period. Both
8 of those have been established for 30, 40 years now.
9 Similar methods are used in Alaska, Quebec, and Labrador
10 and are part of the north.

11 Photographs are used because, you know,
12 photographs are just about foolproof. Observers flying in
13 a small plane, as you point out, can miss caribou. If a
14 background is kind of snowy and dark, it's easy to miss
15 caribou that way, but this is why we've gone to photography
16 because the photography is reliable. That way you can have
17 more than one person look at the photos, and we've
18 double-checked those counts many times.

19 The main reason that we do the photo surveys in
20 June and July is that this is when the herds are relatively
21 concentrated in a certain area. In June on the calving
22 grounds the cows reliably show up there every year, so
23 they're in kind of one area that we can survey.

24 To do that survey in the winter would be almost
25 impossible because they cover a much bigger area. They're

1 in the trees. It would be logistically more difficult to
2 try and do surveys in the winter.

3 And then the post-calving period in July, which
4 we use for some of our western herds, again it's taking
5 advantage of the fact that the caribou are bunching up.
6 I'm sure some of you have seen this, they can form groups
7 of hundreds or even thousands. I mean, I've seen 5,000
8 caribou in one photo frame in July from the Bluenose East
9 herd, and again, because you have the advantage of the
10 caribou bunching together and you can use photography,
11 which is very reliable.

12 So those are the population surveys that have
13 been established for, you know, 30 years or more, and we
14 use them because that's the time when the caribou are
15 bunching together and we can use photographic methods to be
16 really reliable.

17 And, again, I mention would emphasize that we
18 include community observers wherever we can, including
19 observers from Kugluktuk or other Nunavut communities, and
20 there's always lot of discussion. And we're using
21 observations from people out there. I mean, sometimes
22 people will say, you know, you flew here, but you should
23 look over here. And if that's the case, then the aircraft
24 is going to go over there, and it's going to check that
25 out.

1 So it's not just a matter of the observers being
2 there, but they're listening to us, and we're listening to
3 them. So that's continuing conversations.

4 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jan.

5 Charlie.

6 MR. INUARAK: Thank you. My name is Charlie
7 Inuarak from NWMB.

8 I have several. I'm going to make it short,
9 summarize my questions. The report that you gave to us, as
10 NWMB, we have to know the truth, most reliable evidence
11 when we make a decision.

12 First of all, I have a question. There were
13 lots of caribou. As you mentioned, you told us how many
14 there were, and today they have declined to a very low
15 number, it was questioned earlier some of the Elders asked
16 to GN, and they stated.

17 Have you studied the results? For instance,
18 mining where they make roads on the caribou migration
19 routes, they tend to go on a different route when their
20 route has been blocked. And that is the first. How much
21 have you studied that?

22 Because they tend to like to go to the same
23 route when they're on migration route, but if they're
24 blocked, they have to go elsewhere. And I mention just
25 want to know if you have considered that in your studies.

1 If that could be the reason why the caribou has declined,
2 maybe they're going on through a different route, migration
3 route.

4 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Charlie.

5 Jan.

6 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Jan Adamczewski with Government of
7 Northwest Territories.

8 We have some information on the effects of the
9 mines both from, I guess, the scientific studies, and
10 there's also a traditional knowledge study from the Tlicho
11 government.

12 What we have fairly good evidence of now is that
13 there is avoidance by caribou of the areas around the
14 diamond mines. We call that a zone of influence, but
15 basically an area around the diamond mines where caribou
16 are not very likely to be found. And the best evidence we
17 have on that is that it extends to a distance of about 14,
18 15 kilometres out from the mines.

19 So it appears that caribou tend to avoid those
20 areas, and they will change their migration somewhat to
21 stay away from the existing mines.

22 And the traditional knowledge study from Tlicho
23 government is just a year or so ago. That was based on
24 interviews with Tlicho Elders, and it kind of points in the
25 same direction. So I've seen some of the maps that they

1 generated, and they also are saying that there were
2 migration routes kind of through the areas where the mines,
3 the diamond mines are, and that caribou have been deflected
4 kind of north and south. So they're not moving through
5 those areas the way they used to. So that's kind of a nice
6 example of where some scientific research and some
7 traditional knowledge research are pointing in the same
8 direction.

9 What's difficult to figure out is what that
10 means at the scale of the herd. So they're moving
11 differently on the landscape and they're avoiding these
12 areas, but it's difficult to say what does that mean in
13 terms of the condition of the animals or the cow-calf
14 bonds. There's been a little bit of work with some
15 cumulative-effects models. They would suggest that there
16 are some negative effects at a population scale, but
17 probably relatively small to this point.

18 But clearly, the mines, at least the diamond
19 mines, we have do have effects on migration of caribou.

20 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jan.

21 Charlie.

22 MR. INUARAK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

23 I have another question. The ones that you work
24 with, especially the Aboriginal people and the people from
25 Kugluktuk and Bathurst, or the Aboriginal people from NWT,

1 have they told you -- I know when we were dealing with
2 caribou on Baffin Island when we had a hearing, the Inuit
3 that have knowledge were speaking out, and they told us
4 what -- and they said that there were no caribou for many
5 years, but then they came back. Because that's just the
6 cycle, and they tend to be away for many, many years, and
7 they'll come back many years later.

8 And my question is if you have a herd regarding
9 the Bathurst caribou or other herds in Nunavut or Northwest
10 Territories and the ones that you're asking for us to make
11 a decision on stating that the caribou has declined.

12 You mentioned briefly that, you said that the
13 population of wolf, there were lots. And there were lots
14 of wolves in Baffin Island, too, and even though you have
15 to consider that wolves that are going to be increasing,
16 they're going to keep hunting the caribou and killing off
17 the caribou. And you just say that there were incentives
18 to harvest wolves, and that was also mentioned, and the
19 wolves were also the result of the decline of the caribou,
20 and I mention keep hearing that same thing over here.

21 Can you tell me if that is the truth?

22 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Charlie.

23 Jan.

24 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Jan Adamczewski with Government of
25 Northwest Territories.

1 If I could just ask if you could clarify. I
2 didn't quite catch exactly what you're asking, so before I
3 mention try to answer, could you please just repeat your
4 main question? Thank you.

5 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jan.

6 Charlie.

7 MR. INUARAK: My question is, when we had a
8 hearing on Baffin Island caribou, the GN stated they had a
9 proposal for it. They said that the caribou on
10 Baffin Island were declining, hardly any caribou. And they
11 put a moratorium on it, and they told us that if we keep
12 harvesting them they're going to be extirpated. But then
13 the Inuit saying that many years ago there were hardly any
14 caribou on Baffin Island, and they said that they would
15 return.

16 My question is, the people that you're working
17 with, the Inuit organization, Aboriginal organizations,
18 have they also stated that there's a cycle where there's
19 going to be a decline, and then they will return to a
20 higher number in the future just like a cycle?

21 And another part of the question I have, if
22 there's going to be a total allowable harvest for the
23 people from Kugluktuk or Kitikmeot, you have to consider
24 also the wolf, predators. You have to have a plan to cull
25 the wolves because they're also the result of the decline

1 of the herd. And those are my two questions.

2 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Charlie.

3 Jan.

4 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Thank you. Jan Adamczewski with
5 the Government of Northwest Territories.

6 The existence of long-term cycles in caribou
7 abundance, yes, we've heard that from a number of sources,
8 different aboriginal groups in the Northwest Territories.
9 There's knowledge of that sort from Alaska also and from
10 Quebec-Labrador where the George River and Leaf River herds
11 are found and going through some major declines there as
12 well.

13 I mean, we all hope and pray that the numbers
14 will turn around, but we are living in a different world
15 now with climate changing and access and roads. And the
16 world is a little bit different from the last time when the
17 caribou herds were at very low numbers.

18 So I think the approach that we take is that we
19 can't guarantee recovery. What we need to try to do is to
20 give the herds, whether it's Baffin or Bathurst caribou,
21 the best opportunity we can to try to recover, to stabilize
22 and, hopefully, for those numbers to repopulate.

23 The reality is there are many things that affect
24 caribou, but as I think Mathieu was pointing out earlier,
25 the things that you can actively manage to try to change

1 caribou population trend, that list is very short. Harvest
2 and possibly predators, land use, those are the things that
3 we have some control of.

4 With the Bathurst herd, as the numbers have gone
5 lower and lower, the call to do something about the wolves
6 has gotten stronger and stronger, and we're well aware, as
7 Mathieu described, the experiences elsewhere and taking on
8 some kind of wolf reduction is -- there's a lot of
9 controversy that goes with it and not necessarily
10 guarantees of success.

11 But we are at a point where we need to be
12 looking at that in a more serious way, and the feasibility
13 assessment that Lynda mentioned in our presentation, the
14 pilot program from the Tlicho government that they have
15 proposed with community-based methods, we're getting closer
16 to a point where we feel like maybe we do need to do
17 something about the wolves.

18 So I mention hope that addresses your main
19 questions.

20 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jan.

21 Charlie.

22 MR. INUARAK: My last question. From what I
23 mention hear, there seems to be different herds that you're
24 talking about. Are there other herds in this area other
25 than the Bathurst herd, or are we just talking about

1 Bathurst, or are we talking about different herds? Do we
2 have to consider other herds other than the Bathurst herd?

3 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Charlie.

4 Jan.

5 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Jan Adamczewski with Government
6 Northwest Territories.

7 I'm wondering, can we go back to one of our
8 earlier slides for reference? I think it's the one with
9 the various -- it's early on with the herd ranges. That
10 one. Yeah.

11 So this is a relatively simple map, and we
12 presented this earlier. So some of these herds are
13 entirely in the Northwest Territories, so we basically do
14 the monitoring, and then there is collaborative management
15 with the various boards.

16 The Porcupine barely comes into the Northwest
17 Territories, and most of the monitoring and management
18 there is by Alaska and Yukon, although it is an important
19 herd for harvesters from Northwest Territories.

20 In general terms, and I think Mathieu talked
21 about this earlier, during calving and most of the summer,
22 each of those herds is relatively distinct and separate.
23 That's why we do the surveys then because we know what
24 we're counting at that time.

25 As you move to the south into the winter range

1 more in the Northwest Territories, they tend to be more
2 spread out. There's more variability from year to year as
3 to where they spend the winter, and there is more overlap
4 between neighbouring herds.

5 So for the Bathurst, the calving grounds here
6 and much of the summer range tend to be used pretty much by
7 that herd fairly predictably, fairly reliably.

8 As you get into the wintering area, it changes
9 more year to year, based on our collar information and our
10 surveys. And these two herds, particularly in the winter,
11 the Bathurst and Bluenose East, some years there's quite a
12 bit of overlap. So when we're trying to manage harvest on
13 the winter range, we have to be aware of those overlaps.

14 The Beverly and Ahiak animals sometimes have
15 wintered in this area west of the east arm of Great Slave
16 Lake. The last two winters they have been up in the Queen
17 Maud Gulf on the other side of Bathurst Inlet, so they've
18 been quite separate.

19 So some years there can be overlap. Typically
20 in the summer and in calving, there's very little overlap,
21 and what we've seen with the Bathurst herd as they've
22 dropped to very low numbers the last couple of winters,
23 they seem to have this one grouping extends a little bit
24 into Nunavut. You may remember the map we showed earlier.
25 And there hasn't been much overlap with the neighbours.

1 That makes it a little bit easier if we're
2 trying to manage the harvest for that herd, but as recently
3 as 2013 we had Bathurst collars all the way from Hottah
4 Lake, which is just south of Great Bear here over to the
5 east arm of Great Slave Lake.

6 So those collared caribou, I know people have
7 issues with the collars, but they are absolutely critical
8 to monitoring where the herds are and now with harvest and
9 trying to manage harvest on different herds.

10 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jan.

11 Caleb.

12 MR. SANGOYA: Thank you.

13 I want the other Board Members to have an
14 opportunity and the other parties to have an opportunity.
15 I have a question for GNWT because some of the questions I
16 mention had were not able to be answered.

17 We're speaking about regarding the climate
18 change. That always comes up. According to the Inuit
19 traditional knowledge, it's not because -- it's not because
20 it's too hot.

21 And also, when there's winter and the snow gets
22 really hard, the caribou tend to move elsewhere where
23 there's easier access to their food. And also, according
24 to the climate change, it seems that we all know that if
25 there's going to be a change, there's no -- they will

1 return to the area, if there's too much dust, and I'm just
2 wondering if that is also the question.

3 If there's been an earthquake. I know in Russia
4 and Greenland and Canada, it was mentioned that all the
5 caribou are.

6 If they increase too much in one area, we have
7 to manage them. If they become too large, they will tend
8 to die off from disease because they're too densely
9 populated. Canada is not prepared to deal with that. How
10 can we make sure not to increase the population too much so
11 that they won't die off from the disease?

12 And there's also the circumpolar, it's known in
13 the circumpolar where you cannot -- if the Inuit population
14 of wildlife becomes too huge in numbers, they tend to die
15 off from disease, and we don't want that to happen to the
16 caribou. Have you considered that?

17 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Caleb.

18 Jan.

19 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Jan Adamczewski with Government of
20 Northwest Territories.

21 I mention really do wish we had that problem
22 now. I don't think we're too worried about overgrazing and
23 high numbers at this point, but in the longer time scale, I
24 mean, you're right. It's something to be aware of.

25 The one caribou herd where I know there was some

1 evidence of overgrazing on the summer range was the George
2 River herd, and this was early 1990s, so 20 some years ago,
3 and that herd reached possibly 800,000 caribou. And their
4 summer range is relatively small, and so there was evidence
5 for that herd that all those animals feeding and trampling
6 had effects on the vegetation.

7 I think we're a very long way from those kinds
8 of numbers. No matter how you add up the herds, we have
9 far less caribou now than we did 10, 15 years ago.

10 Whether you can actually manage a herd, a big
11 herd, a migratory herd at that scale to prevent it from
12 going to very high numbers, I think that be would be a real
13 challenge. The obvious thing that you can do is increase
14 the harvest and allow people to take as much as they want,
15 which is what we had not long ago.

16 If a herd reaches 300,000, 500,000, I don't
17 know. Can we manage that? I mean, they're probably going
18 to do what they're going to do, and then perhaps you go
19 back to that natural cycling, and eventually if they reach
20 high numbers, they will come down again.

21 So I'm not sure I've entirely answered your
22 question. I mean, I think you could try to manage, but it
23 would be a very difficult thing to do on the scale that
24 we're talking about.

25 MS. YONGE:

Lynda Yonge with the GNWT.

1 The other thing that we do take into
2 consideration is when we are working on things like the
3 range plan for caribou, we're looking at the range that's
4 used when the herd is at a large number. So that kind of
5 planning takes into consideration that even though the herd
6 is small now and may not need as much space, hopefully it
7 will again be big, and so all of that range needs to be
8 looked after as well.

9 THE CHAIR: Thank you. Lynda.

10 David Igutsaq.

11 MR. IGUTSAQ: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

12 A question and a comment. You said photographic
13 evidence is foolproof, and we have realized through
14 documentaries on TV that caribou have been killed off with
15 pesticides and other things.

16 And also, we know for a fact that there will be
17 a decline in herds, but it will not become extinct in our
18 lifetime. We know that.

19 And I know that you do surveys and you calculate
20 by estimating the numbers.

21 And have you considered at all illegal poaching
22 of caribou in NWT? Is there any poaching when there's
23 regulations to not harvest the caribou? That's my second
24 question.

25 THE CHAIR: Thank you, David.

1 Jan.

2 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Jan Adamczewski with Government of
3 Northwest Territories.

4 I'll try and address your questions. You
5 mentioned pesticides and their effects on caribou.

6 So as our colleagues with GN are aware, there is
7 contaminants monitoring that has been ongoing for probably
8 30 years now, and a lot of that depends on samples that
9 hunters bring in various tissues, organs. So that's kind
10 of an ongoing program to try to monitor whether there are
11 pesticides or other contaminants. And generally speaking,
12 those levels have been quite low. They're there, but the
13 levels are quite low.

14 Sorry, you asked about poaching or illegal
15 harvest, and there's no simple answer on this. I think our
16 assumption is that there will always be some undocumented
17 harvest.

18 The Bathurst mobile zone that we talked about
19 where we've been managing the Bathurst harvest, that area
20 is relatively isolated. There's really only one winter
21 road access to there. We've had wildlife officers
22 patrolling from the air and on the ground. We have
23 community monitors with the Tlicho communities with
24 Lutselk'e, some of the other communities.

25 But the reality is that it's a very big country,

1 and, you know, we don't have enough people to be kind of
2 watching everywhere. So I think we make the assumption
3 there will always be some undocumented harvest, and I think
4 this is where it becomes really critical for Aboriginal
5 communities and harvesters, Nunavut, NWT, to kind of work
6 with government agencies with the Board. It's not very
7 helpful if we have a harvest limit that's agreed on and
8 then that many more animals are taken illegally.

9 So I guess the short answer is we know there is
10 some undocumented harvest. We try to get numbers on it as
11 best we can, but just the scale of the country is such that
12 it's pretty difficult to sort of see everything all the
13 time.

14 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jan.

15 David.

16 MR. IGUTSAQ: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

17 If Nunatsiak, NWT (verbatim), if the caribou are
18 healthy, I'm sure people will harvest the healthy caribou.
19 And as you know, in Baffin Island there's been restrictions
20 on caribou harvesting, and we have heard they are back to
21 health.

22 And our traditional practice is that in our
23 tradition, we take only what we need and that also what we
24 harvest we have to share with less fortunate people, and
25 that is one of our hunting rules that we have to share our

1 food and that we have to respect the herd as well, which in
2 turn helps in controlling the population. Thank you.

3 THE CHAIR: Thank you, David. It was more of
4 a comment than a question.

5 Okay. We're going to move on, then. Is there
6 any questions from staff or legal counsel of the Board?
7 Michael?

8 NUNAVUT WILDLIFE MANAGEMENT BOARD STAFF QUESTIONS AND
9 COMMENTS

10 MR. D'EÇA: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

11 Just a quick question. I think it would go to
12 Lynda, and it comes from an exchange I mention had with
13 Lisa this morning, who I think was referring to the
14 development of a Bathurst harvest management plan and the
15 formation of an advisory committee. And you may have
16 touched on this in your presentation, but, if so, if you
17 don't mind kind of going over it again.

18 I'm just kind of wondering what the status of
19 that plan is, which organizations -- I'm assuming it's
20 cross-jurisdictional; and, also, the advisory committee,
21 what's going on there? If you could give a little bit more
22 information, that would be helpful.

23 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mike.

24 Lynda.

25 MS. YONGE: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Lynda

1 Yonge, GNWT.

2 So I think we're getting several things a little
3 bit confused here about where we're at. We are in the
4 initial stages of establishing the Bathurst advisory -- and
5 I mention won't get the name quite right -- the Bathurst
6 advisory committee.

7 Our last meeting, everybody agreed. So at the
8 last meeting there were representatives from all the
9 traditional user groups in the Northwest Territories and
10 Nunavut. I mention can get you the list of the names of
11 people that were actually there. I don't have it in front
12 of me.

13 And we all agreed that an advisory committee was
14 needed and that it would be a place where communities,
15 traditional harvesters could bring their concerns, discuss
16 those concerns, and make recommendations to governments and
17 other management authorities and that one of the tasks that
18 that advisory committee would have would be to develop a
19 Bathurst management plan. Not just a Bathurst management
20 plan, but a management plan for Bathurst caribou, and that
21 that would form a recommendation to governments and other
22 management authorities with respect to -- and provide
23 guidance on how the Bathurst herd should be managed,
24 including harvest, including looking at how harvest might
25 be allocated and managed across the jurisdictions.

1 So the committee is not yet formally in
2 existence. Each of the organizations is reviewing the
3 terms of reference. Our hope is that that committee will
4 be able to convene in the fall.

5 Most of the organizations that would be involved
6 in that have also been involved in a series of hearings and
7 other management actions that have taken a lot of time and
8 energy, so nobody really was able to commit until probably
9 September, we're hoping. And at that time we will have
10 asked each of the organizations to have agreed with the
11 terms of reference and appointed somebody to that
12 committee. Then we would move forward with actions for
13 that committee.

14 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lynda.

15 Okay. Michael. Short.

16 MR. D'EÇA: Just one last thing.

17 So we're going to get recommendations, and what
18 about the development of the management plan? Is the
19 committee doing that, and what kind of timeline are we
20 looking at for that?

21 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Michael.

22 Lynda.

23 MS. YONGE: Lynda Yonge, GNWT.

24 It's hoped that that committee will come up with
25 a long-term management plan for the Bathurst herd. So

1 we're looking at this as a mechanism to inform management;
2 long-term management of the Bathurst plan.

3 When management plans are developed by committee
4 like this, they tend to take quite a long time, and so it's
5 anticipated that we will have to have more short-term
6 management proposals; possibly, before that long-term
7 management plan can be completed.

8 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lynda.

9 Okay. Thank you. No other questions from the
10 Board or staff.

11 The next on the list for questions is Department
12 of Environment. Drikus.

13 MR. GISSING: Thank you, Mr. Chair. No
14 questions from you.

15 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thank you very much.

16 We'll go on to the next one then. We have a
17 little bit of time before we break. The next questioner is
18 the Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife Board.

19 KITIKMEOT REGIONAL WILDLIFE BOARD QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

20 THE CHAIR: Go ahead, Simon.

21 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Simon from
22 Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife Board. I have a few questions
23 to government of NWT.

24 As we all know that, you know, the Bathurst herd
25 is declining, and it is obviously the management plan that

1 we have to put in place. My question is, you know, we have
2 mining companies in the area where the Bathurst caribou
3 herd route is.

4 My question to the Government of NWT is, as they
5 do the study on the Bathurst caribou herd, have they ever
6 noticed any natural death or caribou death around the
7 winter roads or around the mining area? I'm not saying
8 right in the mining area, but close by the mining area?
9 That's my question.

10 And also another question is, on the Bathurst
11 caribou herd, by saying that, with the Bathurst caribou
12 herd we're looking at two Territories, Nunavut and NWT. I
13 mean, especially dealing with the management, Nunavut
14 Wildlife Management Board, it's a pretty tricky issue with
15 the Bathurst caribou herd. And I think the panel and the
16 Nunavut Wildlife Management Board has to hear from both
17 Government of Nunavut and government of NWT.

18 I know that, you know, when they did the study
19 they pass the information on to both departments. But my
20 question is, when the government of NWT does a caribou
21 study on especially the Bathurst caribou herd, do they pass
22 the information on to the Government of Nunavut?

23 By saying that, you know, when Government of
24 Nunavut is doing the presentation on the Bathurst caribou
25 herd to their Nunavut Wildlife Management Board they may

1 not have the correct information? But by me asking the
2 government of NWT, you know, by the two governments working
3 together, they will have more information passed on to the
4 Nunavut Wildlife Management Board.

5 And the last question I have for Government of
6 Nunavut is on your report 2015 you have a very low
7 pregnancy of 16 percent. That pregnancy, is the Government
8 of NWT doing a study on why the pregnancy was really low,
9 or do they already have the information? Thank you.

10 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Simon.

11 NWT, Jan or Lynda.

12 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: I think I have three questions,
13 and if I mention miss something, please let me know.

14 Sorry, Jan Adamczewski with Government of
15 Northwest Territories.

16 I think the first question was about deaths of
17 caribou near the mines. As far as I know, certainly the
18 diamond mines, any of the mines we have are required to
19 keep fairly detailed notes on any problem with wildlife
20 that happens. I think, to my knowledge, there's been maybe
21 one or two animals that died somewhere near the mines that
22 maybe went into a tailings pond or something.

23 But by and large, it seems that there's very
24 little mortality of that sort near the mines, and it may be
25 partly because both are our studies and the Tlicho

1 traditional knowledge study says that they're basically
2 largely avoiding those mines sites. So they're kind of
3 staying away from those disturbed areas, to begin with.

4 In terms of the collaboration and the
5 information from GNWT working with Nunavut, I think it's
6 just a reality that, for some herds, GNWT have generally
7 been the lead in terms of doing the surveys, putting the
8 collars out and so on. As we go further east, it becomes
9 more a Nunavut responsibility, so we don't survey the
10 Qamanirjuaq herd, we don't put collars on Qamanirjuaq.
11 That's basically a GN lead.

12 But I think the information sharing between the
13 two agencies, as we mentioned earlier, has been very good.
14 And last year, I mean, we had all kinds of participation on
15 the surveys themselves. As soon as we get even the most
16 preliminary estimates of numbers, those are shared. So I
17 think at that level I think the collaboration is quite
18 good.

19 And then your last question, I believe, was
20 about the low pregnancy rate. We have not been monitoring
21 pregnancy on an annual basis. We get information about
22 that from the surveys every three years because that's part
23 of what we learned in the June surveys is the proportion of
24 cows that were breeders and gave birth versus the ones that
25 didn't.

1 This year, for the first time in late winter,
2 Bruno Croft was out, and he collected a whole bunch of
3 fecal samples on the winter range. And it turns out that
4 the hormone progesterone, which is high in pregnant
5 females, can be detected in fecal samples. And you can
6 actually tell whether that animal was pregnant or not just
7 based on picking up a poop sample. So we're trying that
8 for the first time, and we're trying to monitor that
9 annually to sort of see if this is a typical pattern or
10 just an exceptional one.

11 Something else that we're doing is trying to
12 keep monitoring these environmental trends like this
13 drought index, keep updating those things on an annual
14 basis to help give us some idea where, you know, those
15 environmental trends are going.

16 I mention hope I mention answered your
17 questions.

18 THE CHAIR: Lynda.

19 MS. YONGE: Lynda Yonge, GNWT.

20 I mention also just want to add on the comment
21 about collaboration. And I mention agree completely. It
22 becomes much more difficult when you have more than one
23 jurisdiction involved, and that's one of the reasons it's
24 taking time. But we do have some good examples of it
25 working.

1 The Porcupine Caribou Management Plan, which we
2 have referred to a couple of times, is a
3 multi-jurisdictional plan, and there's even an
4 international Porcupine caribou management agreement, so
5 it's Alaska, Yukon, NWT, and in the NWT, a number of
6 different land claim areas. So it can be done, but yes, it
7 is more calculated, and it does take more time.

8 THE CHAIR: Thank you Lynda.

9 Simon? Any more from the Kitikmeot?

10 Okay. I think at this time Kugluktuk HTO is up
11 next, but at this time -- pardon me?

12 MR. L. ADJUN: Can I mention just make a short
13 statement and then do the questions after supper?

14 THE CHAIR: Okay. Go ahead, make a short
15 statement, and then we'll break for supper but go ahead,
16 Larry.

17 MR. L. ADJUN: Thank you, itsivautaaq.

18 Larry Adjun, Chairman of the Kugluktuk Hunters
19 and Trappers Association.

20 I mention disagreed with what GNWT said in
21 regards to collaboration and working with the affected
22 communities.

23 We were not informed of TAH allocations for the
24 Bluenose East meetings in Behchokò, and also, we were not
25 informed of the recent caribou aerial surveys done by

1 the -- I'm not sure what the agency was in Kugluktuk, but
2 usually we get consulted on these activities within our
3 side of Nunavut, but none was done.

4 So on that note, I have six questions I'll ask
5 after supper. And that's just a statement.

6 THE CHAIR: Okay. We'll leave that for food
7 for thought, and you'll have time for questions after.

8 So we will all break now, and can we all be back
9 here by 6:45 sharp, okay? Thank you very much. We'll see
10 you then.

11 (ADJOURNMENT)

12 THE CHAIR: Thank you, everybody. We'll
13 resume. Thank you very much for coming back on time.

14 Just before we get to Kugluktuk, I mention just
15 want to just mention a couple things, and thanks for coming
16 back for this evening because, as you're all aware, we're
17 quite a ways behind on this agenda. So why we're meeting
18 this evening, too.

19 As we move forward, just so everybody has a fair
20 chance to ask their questions and everybody has a fair
21 chance to make their presentations during this hearing,
22 we'd ask that you just keep time in mind a little bit, if
23 you can, and be concise with your questions and with your
24 answers, too.

25 So with that, I'll turn it over to Larry and the

1 Kugluktuk HTO.

2 MR. L. ADJUN: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

3 Larry Adjun, Kugluktuk Angoniatit Association.

4 Once again, I want to reiterate from one of my
5 directors that it be pointed out that consultation happened
6 with our HTO or affected HTO from either GN or GNWT as we
7 were caught off guard last week from the last caribou
8 surveys. There was no information given to the HTO prior
9 to the survey being done. I mention just want to reiterate
10 that statement again.

11 Okay. GN, prior to 2010 and onward, what has
12 been estimated Inuit harvest of Bathurst caribou per year?
13 And compare that to 40,000 or 40 to 60,000 caribou per year
14 in the NWT prior to 2010, what has been the Inuit harvest
15 or estimated Inuit harvest per year?

16 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry.

17 Jan.

18 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Jan Adamczewski with Government of
19 Northwest Territories.

20 So in terms of Inuit harvest of Bathurst herd, I
21 mean, we would be kind of depending on our colleagues with
22 Government of Nunavut, possibly communities in Nunavut, in
23 terms of what those numbers would be.

24 We do recognize that the bulk of the harvest in
25 the winter range from Bathurst herd has been from

1 Aboriginal groups on that side, but as to the Inuit
2 harvest, we would defer to our colleagues with Government
3 of Nunavut.

4 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jan.

5 Do you want to supplement that, Mathieu?

6 MR. DUMOND: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

7 Well, to just reiterate what I mention before
8 was that our estimate was roughly that Nunavut had, over
9 the years, per year an approximate of 200 plus caribou from
10 the Bathurst, which is, as you mention, a very small
11 proportion of the harvest as of 2010 and before.

12 In the recent years, though, our harvest started
13 to be higher than the NWT because of the management actions
14 they've taken to reduce the harvest on their side, but it
15 remains. We don't have a firm number, but our best
16 information leads to saying that it's in the order of 200
17 plus, maybe between 200 and 300, at the most.

18 Thank you.

19 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mathieu.

20 Larry.

21 MR. L. ADJUN: Qujannamiik, itsivautaaq.

22 I have five more questions, just so it keeps the
23 countdown going.

24 From 2006 to 2010, the Bathurst caribou
25 population dropped from 100,000 to 32,000. During the

1 time, the GNWT estimated the GNWT harvest rate was between
2 20,000 and 30,000 were harvested.

3 Now, what was the effect of this alarming rate,
4 alarming level of harvest on the current caribou population
5 issues in the GNWT?

6 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry.

7 Jan.

8 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Jan Adamczewski with Government of
9 Northwest Territories.

10 Maybe just a little bit of clarification on the
11 harvest numbers. We estimated up to the end of 2009 that
12 the harvest, the winter harvest, which is the bulk of it,
13 was on the order of 4 to 6,000 per year, not quite the
14 numbers that Larry was mentioning.

15 In our presentation, we talked about the effect
16 of that harvest, and if you keep taking roughly the same
17 number of animals from a herd that is shrinking, then the
18 effect of that harvest becomes stronger and stronger as the
19 herd declines. So we acknowledged that in that situation,
20 even though most of the herd's decline was not driven by
21 harvest in the later stages of the decline we do believe
22 that the harvest became a fairly significant part of the
23 rapid decline between '06 and '09.

24 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jan.

25 Larry.

1 MR. L. ADJUN: Third question. I'll skip the next question
2 regarding the ice road use.

3 But there is the issue also of the airline use
4 for harvesting. That comes into play with the shutdown of
5 the Bathurst caribou hunts and then they've moved. GNWT
6 had the Aboriginal hunters hunt more on the Bluenose East.

7 How big of a significance was the population
8 done on the caribou, on the Bluenose East?

9 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry.

10 Jan.

11 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Jan Adamczewski with the
12 Government of Northwest Territories.

13 I think the answer to that depends, in part, on,
14 I guess, which Aboriginal group we're talking about.
15 Dèline, which is on Great Bear Lake, has a long history of
16 harvesting this herd. We have harvest numbers there
17 actually going back to the 1940s. So their harvest was
18 there some time ago, and they continue to harvest. So we
19 don't think their harvest really changed that much in the
20 last few years.

21 In the Tlicho area, Wek'èezhìi, we do think that
22 the drastic reduction in the Bathurst harvest meant that
23 there was some deflection of harvest by some aboriginal
24 groups, Tlicho hunters, possibly a few others who had
25 primarily hunted the Bathurst herd previously. And once

1 the harvest restrictions were in place for Bathurst, some
2 of that harvest was deflected to the west to the
3 Bluenose East herd, and perhaps some of it in the eastern
4 direction over into Beverly Ahiak range, possibly
5 Qamaniruaq in some winters.

6 So, you know, we'll be getting to the
7 Bluenose East harvest and so on, I guess, in the second
8 hearing, but it does appear that that Bathurst harvest
9 restriction did result in some deflection, some increase of
10 Bluenose East harvest because Bathurst was no longer
11 available except for small numbers.

12 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jan.

13 Larry.

14 MR. L. ADJUN: Qujannamiik, itsivautaaq.

15 You already answered one question in regard to
16 the decline of BNE caribou appears significant between 2010
17 and 2013. You've already answered that.

18 Now, is it possible that this entire caribou
19 management problem was a GNWT-initiated problem that has
20 now been resolved by the GNWT; and, if so, why are we
21 making Inuit solve the GNWT or DNWT problem with the
22 caribou population?

23 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry.

24 Jan.

25 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Jan Adamczewski with Government of

1 Northwest Territories.

2 We think that the harvest was important to the
3 Bathurst herd in particularly between 2006 and 2009. But
4 our understanding of the herd's numbers and the indicators
5 that we monitor would suggest between 2000 and 2006,
6 perhaps even later, the Bathurst herd had a naturally
7 declining trend, almost certainly would have declined to a
8 large extent even if there had been no harvest at all. We
9 had very poor calf numbers for that herd between 2000 and
10 2006, six or seven straight years, when calf numbers were
11 poor.

12 With the Bluenose East herd in 2010, we actually
13 did a calving and a post calving survey on that herd, and
14 all our estimates at that time were saying that the herd
15 was at least a hundred thousand, and the recent calf
16 numbers have been quite good.

17 So a harvest of perhaps 2 or 3,000 by itself
18 should not have been that big of a problem, but we believe
19 that things tundra around right about that time with the
20 Bluenose East herd, and so the underlying downward trend
21 with that herd would have been there without any harvest,
22 and so, again, the harvest probably increased that rate of
23 decline.

24 As far as dealing with it from a management
25 perspective, you know, we acknowledge with Bathurst that

1 most of the harvest was on the NWT side. Bluenose East was
2 a little bit more mixed, but probably still more than --
3 certainly more than half the harvest was NWT.

4 But the reality is that we have two herds that
5 are in really poor shape. Our best understanding of their
6 trend is that they would continue to decline even if there
7 was no harvest on either of them, and so we think that we
8 need to focus on where those herds are and what can be done
9 to try to turn things around and give them an opportunity
10 to recover, and so we think that the harvest needs to be
11 addressed regardless of which jurisdiction it occurs in.

12 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jan.

13 Larry.

14 MR. L. ADJUN: Qujannamiik, itsivautaaq.

15 The only reason I mention brought these up,
16 because Kugluktuk and its resident hunters are right into
17 the middle of the Bluenose East herd, Bathurst caribou
18 herd, and the Dolphin Union herd. And we're more or less
19 affected by whatever agency, government -- be it GN or
20 GNWT -- affects all of Kugluktumiut and part of the
21 Nunavummiut.

22 And I mention just heard today that Wek'èezhii
23 wildlife board wants to put a moratorium or total ban on
24 the Bluenose East. Correct me if I'm wrong or I'm watching
25 the wrong channel on CBC.

1 But you get to see where we're coming from. We
2 got to be more proactive from the Kugluktuk side because
3 we're getting more affected by all GN agencies or GNWT and
4 other wildlife boards below the treeline. Quana.

5 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much, Larry.

6 Jan, you'd like to make a comment?

7 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Yeah, Jan Adamczewski with the
8 Government of Northwest Territories.

9 We have our observer, I guess witness. Jody
10 Pellissey is with the executive director of the Wek'èezhìi
11 Renewable Resources Board.

12 But maybe just to clarify, that Board recently
13 made available a report and recommendations on harvest of
14 Bluenose East caribou follow-up to the hearing that was
15 held in April, and I believe the Board has recommended or
16 determined a harvest of no more than 750 caribou. But
17 because that Board only has jurisdiction within that Land
18 Claim area, they can't formally apply that to the entire
19 herd, so that applies only within Wek'èezhìi. But no, they
20 have not recommended a zero harvest on Bluenose East
21 caribou.

22 THE CHAIR: Thank you, very much, Jan.

23 And I think we'll address some of those issues
24 at our next hearing when we deal with the Bluenose East
25 public hearing, too.

1 Larry, go ahead.

2 MR. L. ADJUN: I believe that's all I have to say
3 for myself. I don't know if anybody else from the Board
4 has anything. Qujannamiik.

5 THE CHAIR: Thank you. Peter.

6 MR. TAKTOGON: Thank you, Mr. Chair. I mention
7 just want to clarify something.

8 I have a question to Nunavut GN. This past
9 winter we never harvested Bathurst caribou. It was part of
10 Bluenose, and some part of it was Dolphin Union.

11 And my question to GNWT, the pregnancy rate is
12 pretty low, of 60 percent. I mention was wondering if they
13 ever consider surveying wolf population plus wolverine
14 population, because once the bulls start mating in
15 November, I mention always tell them in the past they get
16 really puffed out, and they can't move. It's really easy
17 for the wolverine and the wolf or the grizzly bears to
18 start killing them off. I mention seen that in the past.
19 Just north of Contwoyto Lake, I observed it and seen it.
20 Used to see maybe eight, or more than that, wolverines
21 killing them off. That's when they start mating, and they
22 get really tired. You could walk right up to the bulls and
23 just grab the horns.

24 My question is, is there a plan for the future
25 to survey the predators, wolves, and the wolverines. Thank

1 you.

2 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Peter.

3 Jan.

4 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Jan Adamczewski with Government of
5 Northwest Territories.

6 Large predators, by and large, are very
7 difficult to survey. I mean, we certainly record what we
8 see during surveys for caribou or moose or muskoxen. I
9 know the Government of Nunavut, when they do the surveys,
10 they also record wolves or wolverines that they see. But
11 it is actually very difficult to get an actual, accurate
12 count population estimate for those animals.

13 For wolverine, there is a survey methodology. I
14 think it has been used in both territories. It's a hair
15 snagging post operation basically trying to get a sample
16 that can be tested for DNA or genetic material and allows
17 for an estimate of the numbers of wolverines within that
18 survey area.

19 So we do have some survey areas in NWT where
20 that has been done for a number of years, and if I mention
21 recall, the wolverine numbers, Daring Lake is an area that
22 has been surveyed by one of our biologists, and the
23 wolverine numbers there have been declining. And I think
24 our biologist, Robert Mulders, our carnivore biologist,
25 believes that their numbers have declined because they also

1 depend on caribou. They may not kill them as much as
2 scavenge them. So those wolverine numbers have declined.

3 In terms of surveying for wolf numbers, again,
4 we don't have a population count for wolves associated with
5 the Bathurst herd. We have had den surveys at known wolf
6 dens kind of in the late summer fall range of the Bathurst
7 herd that goes back to 1996. And those surveys -- Dean
8 Cluff is our biologist who has been monitoring wolves --
9 seem to indicate that the numbers of wolves associated with
10 the Bathurst herd have declined. Pup survival has been
11 less in the few years. There's not as many pups near the
12 end of summer at those dens.

13 So it appears that the overall wolf numbers have
14 declined but they may still be a very important predator on
15 caribou, probably more so at low numbers than when the herd
16 is at very high numbers. Thank you.

17 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jan.

18 Peter.

19 MR. TAKTOGON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

20 Traditional knowledge in the past, like, native
21 people surrounding Yellowknife and people surrounding
22 Kugluktuk area. I mention was raised in Contwoyto Lake
23 area. In the past, I know they did a lot of wolf controls
24 going through the dens and everything.

25 But so with the wolf pup populations in the

1 past, is it possible if we could go on in the future like
2 this? Thank you.

3 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Peter.

4 Jan.

5 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Jan Adamczewski with Government of
6 Northwest Territories.

7 Could I just -- I'm not entirely completely
8 clear on the question. Was the question about counting
9 wolves at dens, or was it about killing wolves? If you
10 don't mind, if I could just get clarification.

11 MR. TAKTOGON: Okay. Thank you.

12 Like in the past, the native peoples and Inuit
13 peoples, they used to go in the dens and control wolves,
14 like, kill off the little pups and just leave one. That's
15 how I mention got to know some Elders, too, from Sahtu
16 region surrounding Yellowknife, plus on my tradition side,
17 that's how it was done in the past to control the wolves.

18 Also wondering if it could be looked up into the
19 future to do the same thing. Thank you.

20 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Peter.

21 Jan.

22 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Jan Adamczewski with the
23 Government of Northwest Territories.

24 Thank you for the clarification on the question.
25 That approach has also been brought up at quite a few

1 community meetings in Northwest Territories, in other
2 words, going to the wolf dens in the old days and killing
3 either all the pups or leaving one, that kind of thing.
4 And I mention spent some time in the Yukon, and that was
5 also raised by First Nations people there.

6 The feasibility assessment that we talked about
7 in our presentation I think would be an appropriate place
8 where, you know, that could be one option that we would
9 look at. And, you know, I think we were trying to keep
10 sort of fairly open mind about options, at least at the
11 beginning of it, and try and assess all of them as to how
12 realistic they are and what they would cost and then
13 whether people would accept them. Because we certainly
14 found in Northwest Territories that there's a very wide
15 range of views about what is acceptable in terms of killing
16 wolves or doing anything to wolves. Everything from,
17 should just leave them alone to we should kill every last
18 one.

19 So what might be acceptable to our communities
20 and the boards that we work with, that remains to be
21 determined, but that certainly could be an option that we
22 would look at in our feasibility assessment.

23 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jan. Peter, good? You
24 done? Is there any other members from Kugluktuk that would
25 have questions? If not we'll move on, then. Thank you.

1 Next one is Bathurst Inlet HTO. Any questions
2 for GNWT?

3 MR. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Sam
4 Kapolak with Bathurst Inlet Hunter and Trappers. I'd like
5 to thank the GNWT for their presentation, and all my
6 questions in mind were put on the table, so no further
7 questions. Thank you.

8 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much, Sam.

9 Next is Bay Chimo HTO, any questions for NWT?

10 BAY CHIMO HTO QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

11 MR. P. KAPOLAK: Thank you. Peter Kapolak.

12 I have a couple of questions, short ones. You
13 mentioned that there was only 20 bull calves collared. Do
14 you know where the uncollared bulls go, or do they interact
15 with other herds and mate with other herds resulting in
16 lower pregnancy rates in females of Bathurst herd?

17 THE CHAIR: Thank you.

18 Jan.

19 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Jan Adamczewski with Government of
20 Northwest Territories.

21 With respect to the Bathurst herd, the main
22 limitation in previous years was basically objections of
23 Tlicho Elders to use of collars on caribou, and so
24 initially in 1996 they gave permission for ten satellite
25 collars on cows, which was then increased to 20 after a few

1 years. And it was only in 2015 that we had agreement from
2 Tlicho Elders to go to 50 collars, and that was their
3 recommendation; 30 on cows, 20 on bulls. So that's what we
4 have now. We have had bull collars on some of the more
5 western herds in the Northwest Territories.

6 Our general experience is that's where those
7 collared animals are, and that's where the bulk of the
8 animals will be, so it seems in winter they tend to be on
9 somewhat peripheral areas maybe a little bit further south
10 than the cows, and then in the spring they lag behind. The
11 cows will go up to the calving grounds, and the bulls kind
12 of stay back further, and then gradually as the summer goes
13 on they tend to sort of mix again.

14 As far as whether they're breeding the cows, we
15 don't really think that a scarcity of males is a problem.
16 We do monitor the bull-to-cow ratio. Those are surveys in
17 October. There are always more cows than bulls, but the
18 bull-to-cow ratio has still been quite healthy, so we don't
19 think there's any scarcity of bulls to breed the cows.

20 We think the low pregnancy rate is probably more
21 likely related to the cows being in poor shape in summer
22 and then perhaps into the breeding season, and it's because
23 of that that they most likely are not getting pregnant. So
24 a very skinny cow in the breeding season is not likely to
25 breed. I think that's fairly well-established, so we don't

1 think the issue is the lack of bulls or the bulls not
2 breeding the cows. Thank you.

3 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jan.
4 Peter?

5 MR. P. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

6 A short question now just for curiosity. You
7 gave an answer to one of the Board Members from NWMB
8 regarding the photo survey. Do you use panoramic view or
9 series of regular view photos to count the caribou on the
10 photo?

11 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Peter.
12 Jan.

13 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Jan Adamczewski with Government of
14 Northwest Territories.

15 I'm sorry. Was the question about how many
16 people count the photos? Is that what you're asking?

17 THE CHAIR: Go ahead, Peter, clarify.

18 MR. P. KAPOLAK: Okay. Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

19 I'm asking if you use panoramic view photos or
20 regular photo views.

21 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Peter.
22 Jan.

23 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Jan Adamczewski Government of
24 Northwest Territories.

25 There's a slightly different technology that's

1 used on the post-calving surveys which we do on herds
2 further to the west, but Bathurst and Bluenose East we're
3 using a calving photo survey. And for many years the
4 technology there was around, actually, in World War II, and
5 the photos, what you end up with is stereo pairs. And with
6 the right viewer it's the same sort of technology that
7 foresters used for many years to look down on photographs
8 of the forest; and if you line them up correctly, it sort
9 of jumps into 3D and makes it much easier to see animals
10 because they more or less project.

11 Just in the last few years the technology has
12 shifted from film cameras to digital, and my understanding
13 is that they also have -- I mention haven't done this
14 myself, but they're using a technology that also kind of
15 gives you that 3D effect so that what you're looking at
16 isn't quite flat, and animals actually kind of stand out
17 from the background.

18 Thank you.

19 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jan.

20 Peter.

21 MR. P. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chair. No further
22 questions.

23 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much.

24 Next questions to be asked are by Cambridge Bay
25 HTO. Bobby.

1 CAMBRIDGE BAY HTO QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

2 MR. GREENLEY: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

3 Just a question also to the photo surveys. Are
4 pictures taken as you're doing the whole grid, or is it
5 just when someone spots a caribou they take a shot and then
6 continue on, or are they each section of the grid lines?
7 Are they continuously taking pictures as they're doing
8 their whole area for the survey?

9 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Bobby.

10 Jan.

11 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Jan Adamczewski with Government of
12 Northwest Territories.

13 The photo plane flies lines, and when they're
14 over the block that's been identified with the higher
15 numbers -- where we bring in the photo plane -- they're
16 flying a continuous strip, and then the lines are spaced in
17 such a way that the ground coverage, the proportion of the
18 whole thing that is photographed, is usually somewhere
19 around 40 percent. Last year with Bathurst and
20 Bluenose East, actually a little over 50 percent of the
21 ground was photographed in those high-density areas or
22 relatively high-density areas. So with that kind of
23 coverage, you know, you're really not missing very much.

24 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jan.

25 Bobby.

1 MR. GREENLEY: Thank you, Bobby from EHTO. A lot
2 of my questions were answered, but I mention got one more.

3 When you guys are collaring a caribou, are you
4 guys taking samples from that herd as you're collaring just
5 to make sure they're from the specific herds; and, if so,
6 are you finding -- I know you've stated that they don't mix
7 that often, but as you collar the caribou, are you taking
8 samples from that caribou for genetics?

9 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Bobby.
10 Jan.

11 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: January Adamczewski with the
12 government of Northwest Territories.

13 Lynda pointed out on the previous question -- if
14 I could go back to it -- you asked whether the photos only
15 started when we saw caribou, and the answer is no, they
16 photograph the entire line, and some of it won't have any
17 caribou, but the whole thing is covered, so just on that.

18 In terms of the caribou that are captured for
19 collaring, that generally happens late March, maybe as far
20 as early April on the winter range. Partly, that is
21 probably the best time when you have, south of the tree
22 line, you have relatively soft snow, and so it's easier on
23 the animal that way.

24 And for every animal that is captured we try to
25 get a blood sample, poop sample, some hair for DNA. Blood

1 will be sent away to look at some nutritional indices. It
2 will be set aside for genetics if a study is underway. And
3 with the females, at that time of year, from the serum you
4 can tell if it's a pregnant cow or not a pregnant cow.

5 So there's a whole range of things that can be
6 done with the blood sample, and we try to take that from
7 each animal. We also try to get the approximate age from
8 the incisors and a condition score to see what kind of
9 shape it's in.

10 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jan.

11 Bobby.

12 MR. GREENLEY: Thank you. No more questions from
13 me.

14 THE CHAIR: Any other questions from
15 Cambridge Bay? George.

16 MR. G. ANGOHIATOK: Yeah, one question that come to
17 mind. You mentioned earlier about the predators. You
18 mentioned \$200 for an unskinned wolf and 800 for a
19 taxidermy-ready fur. How do you get the funding for that?
20 Is it funded by the government, by the GNWT, or is that
21 funded some other way? And, if so, what kind of numbers,
22 if you don't mind by asking, are we looking at? Quana.

23 THE CHAIR: Thank you, George.

24 Jan.

25 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Jan Adamczewski with the

1 Government of Northwest Territories.

2 I think the funding -- I mean, it would be
3 through Government of Northwest Territories. Some of the
4 money, if it goes through the Mackenzie Valley Fur Program,
5 comes through that program, and if it's a good pelt and
6 it's in good shape and it is sold, then, you know, it may
7 sell for 6 or \$800. So that covers off those costs.

8 We just kind of changed our program on those
9 incentives just within, I guess, the last year or so. So
10 that \$200 for the unskinned wolf is relatively new. So we
11 had incentives previously, but we kind of changed the
12 program this year.

13 In terms of results, by and large, it has not
14 been all that effective. We have gotten a number of wolves
15 harvested every winter, but a fair number of them are from
16 communities from sewage dumps and town dumps and things
17 like that.

18 Our hope was that people would kind of target
19 the Bathurst caribou winter range, but so far, the numbers
20 that have been taken per year, a few dozen, but probably
21 not at the level of harvest that would be needed to really
22 have a serious effect on caribou survival rates.

23 THE CHAIR: Lynda.

24 MS. YONGE: Lynda Yonge, GNWT.

25 Just to add to that, the wolves that are brought

1 in unskinned for the \$200 are then given to somebody to
2 skin, somebody who's hired to do the skinning, and they
3 send it to auction, and so the money that comes from
4 auction also goes into that period of time to help pay for
5 that program.

6 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lynda.

7 Go ahead, George.

8 MR. G. ANGOHIATOK: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

9 Just one more. The hunters, can they be anyone,
10 or is it local hunters out of each community or, in this
11 case, the Bathurst herd hunters that harvest the wolves?
12 Quana.

13 THE CHAIR: Thank you, George.

14 Jan.

15 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Jan Adamczewski with Government of
16 Northwest Territories.

17 The incentives are actually available pretty
18 much across the territory. We've certainly put an emphasis
19 on the Bathurst herd, but we have other herds, and most of
20 them aren't doing all that well. So the incentives are
21 available kind of across the territory.

22 They are available to Aboriginal hunters, also
23 resident hunters, and outfitters would be able to access --
24 no? Pardon me.

25 Yeah, and the other thing I mention would

1 perhaps again mention is there's an initiative from the
2 Tlicho government. They're the lead on this, and they're
3 putting together a program to use community-based method
4 that are culturally acceptable and to target wolves on the
5 Bathurst winter range specifically associated with the
6 Tlicho community. So that's in the early stages, and the
7 lead on that is not us but Tlicho government with our
8 support.

9 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jan.

10 MR. G. ANGOHIATOK: Thank you, Mr. Chair. No further
11 questions.

12 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much.

13 Okay. Moving on in questions, now we'll have
14 the Elders or the representatives for the Elders for the
15 four HTOs if they have any questions to GNWT and, Jorgen,
16 you're up.

17 ELDERS QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

18 MR. BOLT: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

19 I mention just have a quick question for, I
20 guess, GN or GNWT, doesn't matter. My question is, what
21 kind of information are you getting out of the satellite
22 collars other than location, movement of these animals?
23 What kind of other information are you getting from these
24 collars?

25 Because I know for a fact that they can use --

1 they can get all kinds of information with these collars,
2 and I've seen shows where they put collars on lions where
3 they put accelerometer on a the collar, and they can tell
4 what a lion has been doing for that whole month; how many
5 kills, how many animals that he's chased.

6 So I mention just want to know what kind of
7 information are we getting from these satellite collars
8 other than location, movement, and what other information
9 that you guys gather. I'd like to see more information put
10 into these collars because we can easily put accelerometers
11 on these collars, and we can see how often -- you want to
12 put it on a predator, you want to put it on the prey -- how
13 often are these wolves chasing?

14 You can tell once this device is on, that you
15 can see it's been walking along, walking along. All of a
16 sudden the animal starts to run, and then you slow down
17 again, they'd be feeding, feeding now. Can be there for a
18 couple days, whatever it may be. And they go again
19 walking, walking. All of a sudden, boom, run again.

20 Just what kind of information are you getting
21 out of these satellite collars other than, like I said,
22 location and movement of these animals?

23 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

24 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jorgen.

25 Jan.

1 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Jan Adamczewski with Government of
2 Northwest Territories.

3 Interesting question, Jorgen. Thank you. The
4 technology on the collars keeps changing. They've gotten
5 lighter in the last few years, which we're happy to see
6 because it's less of a burden on the caribou. It used to
7 be that the locations were accurate within about 500
8 metres, a kilometre. Now they're accurate to GPS location
9 of a few metres.

10 As the technology improves and as new things
11 become possible, we try those collars, and there are
12 activity transmitters, as you described, that we haven't
13 tried those yet, but we're thinking about maybe trying a
14 few of those collars to get that more detailed information.

15 One of the applications that has tundra out to
16 be very interesting and very useful is looking at how
17 caribou respond to disturbed sites, and so some of the last
18 collars that we placed just this year on the Bathurst herd,
19 they're programmed so that if the caribou is within I think
20 about 30 kilometres of one of the mine sites or one of the
21 winter roads or any other area that has been disturbed, the
22 frequency of locations goes up dramatically so we get a
23 location every hour as opposed to once or twice a day. And
24 we're hopeful that that application will allow us to look
25 in more detail at just exactly what caribou are doing when

1 they're in the vicinity of mines or roads or disturbed
2 areas like that.

3 The uses that we make of the collar information
4 are many. Certainly where the animals are, where they're
5 moving, that's kind of primary. They're also central to
6 our surveys. So if we do surveys in June or in October or
7 in late winter, we need to know where the caribou are, and
8 those collared locations are critical for those surveys.

9 One of the applications we talked about a little
10 bit earlier, and that's looking at exchange rates between
11 herds. So if we have consecutive locations in June, we can
12 tell if that cow or that bull went back to the same place,
13 or did it shift somewhere else. So it's providing
14 information on exchange rates between neighbouring herds.

15 And with the Bathurst herd, if you remember, in
16 the earlier part of our presentation we talked about that
17 Bathurst mobile conservation zone. That is completely
18 dependant on having those Bathurst collared caribou because
19 that's what's telling us this is where the herd is. We do
20 a little bit of survey flying to add to that, but that
21 mobile conservation zone to protect Bathurst caribou from
22 harvest in the NWT is only possible because we have
23 collared caribou, and they're telling us where the herd is,
24 and so we can manage harvest accordingly.

25 I mention could probably list off a few more

1 applications, but those give you, perhaps, some idea of
2 what we're doing. And as the technology changes and more
3 things are possible, we do test those things.

4 We occasionally have tried out new collars.
5 Different company comes along, we try a few collars, and
6 sometimes they don't work. So we tend to go with what we
7 know is reliable. As new technologies come along, we test
8 them, we try a few collars. If that works well, then we'll
9 take a few more.

10 So maybe that gives you some idea of what we've
11 been doing the last few years with our collars.

12 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jan.

13 Jorgen, any other questions?

14 MR. BOLT: Yeah, thank you, Mr. Chair.

15 I guess it didn't really -- didn't answer my
16 question there. But, like, can you put these in place, or
17 is it just going to be too much money to monitor these
18 things? Like, I know you, like said, you were saying
19 movement and location and all that. But I'm asking, can we
20 get, like, weather information out of these things, too, of
21 where the caribou is and stuff like that? Is it freezing
22 rain there, or what's going on, like, where the caribou is?
23 And how often are these guys getting chased? Every week?
24 Every day?

25 You know, it would be nice to know through

1 these. Because you said you got all these new technology,
2 and I know for a fact that they can put a little monitor,
3 they can monitor a Monarch butterfly from Nova Scotia to
4 the Gulf of Mexico, you know. Just a little butterfly.
5 They can monitor it all way down.

6 We have the technology. We'd like to know
7 what's going on, how often they're running, how often
8 they're getting chased, and you can tell.

9 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

10 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jorgen.

11 Jan, would you care to respond?

12 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Jan Adamczewski with the
13 Government of Northwest Territories.

14 I guess the short answer, Jorgen, we know there
15 are now collars with that type of technology, activity
16 transmitters. We have not tried them yet on caribou, but
17 we're thinking about that as kind of a next step.

18 One thing to keep in mind when it comes to this
19 sort of collar transmission, 80 to 90 percent of the weight
20 of collar is battery, and every time that collar sends
21 information you're using up battery life. So if you get a
22 huge number of locations and very detailed information,
23 then the battery is not going to last very long. So
24 currently we set up our collar programs to last so that the
25 collars last approximately three years, two and a half to

1 three years.

2 So we will be looking into the technology that
3 you mentioned, but just be aware that you don't get
4 something for nothing. If you want very detailed
5 information, then you'll fairly quickly use up the battery
6 on the collar, and so you may have very detailed
7 information but only for a very short time. So there are
8 some trade-offs there.

9 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jan.

10 Jorgen? Done?

11 Is there any other Elders, representation for
12 HTOs, that would like any questions? If not, none. Okay.
13 There is.

14 Okay, we'll carry on. Thank you very much,
15 Jorgen.

16 Next is NTI. Paul.

17 NUNAVUT TUNNGAVIK INCORPORATED QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

18 MR. IRNGAUT: Qujannamiik, itsivautaaq.

19 Thank you for your presentation. It was very
20 good. I've got a couple questions, and then I'm sure Bert
21 will have some questions.

22 I mention mentioned that you guys are monitoring
23 the access road. Can you let us know how many were being
24 harvested prior to the monitoring? That's my first
25 question.

1 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Paul.

2 Jan or Lynda.

3 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Jan Adamczewski with Government of
4 Northwest Territories.

5 In the range of the Bathurst herd there was a
6 harvest study going back a few years in, I think it would
7 be late '80s, early '90s, that was referred to as the
8 Dogrib harvest study. I don't know very much about it. It
9 was long before I mention was involved with the GNWT.
10 There were estimates from that time of estimated Bathurst
11 harvest sort of on the order of 10 to 15,000 a year. But
12 keep in mind that that was from a time when the herd was
13 much bigger, you know, 350,000 or more.

14 The harvest monitoring that we talked about in
15 our presentation didn't pick up again until about
16 2007-2008. But, again, remember, before that, this herd
17 was hundreds of thousands, and people didn't worry so much
18 about what the harvest was or trying to manage it. It was
19 kind of more, as the surveys kept telling us, the herd is
20 getting smaller, and then we started to get more concerned
21 about, well, we should at least know what the harvest is.
22 So there's a gap there from the '90s until about 2007 where
23 we didn't really have a lot of monitoring of Bathurst
24 harvest.

25 Since that time, we've tried to monitor that

1 harvest fairly closely. We know we don't always get all of
2 it. There's always going to be some unreported. So
3 that's -- I guess, that's where we're at now in terms of
4 harvest monitoring.

5 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jan.

6 Paul.

7 MR. IRNGAUT: Thank you for that information.

8 So I take it there's more, still, harvesting through that
9 access road. Is that my understanding? Thank you.

10 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Paul.

11 Jan.

12 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Jan Adamczewski with Government of
13 Northwest Territories.

14 If you recall our presentation, the last two
15 winters -- the one just ended, the one previous to that --
16 these were the first winters when we used this Bathurst
17 mobile conservation zone, so, basically, a line around all
18 the collars, and that became the no-harvest zone.

19 As best we can tell from monitoring, there
20 hasn't been a lot of harvest there. I mean, you know,
21 there's a few people that will sort of go harvest anyway,
22 but we think those numbers have been fairly low.

23 Previous to that when we were using those two
24 large zones to manage the Bathurst harvest of about 300, we
25 do believe those were fairly effective at keeping the

1 numbers within that range, but we do also realize that in
2 some winters Bathurst caribou, based on collars, were also
3 outside of those two zones, and there there was no
4 protection from harvest, so there was probably some
5 additional harvest going on there.

6 I guess, just to get to your point, we believe
7 with the Bathurst herd that that mobile zone in the last
8 two winters has been fairly effective, and there's probably
9 always some unreported harvest, but probably very low
10 numbers.

11 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jan.

12 Paul.

13 MR. IRNGAUT: Thank you. Paul Irngaut from NTI.

14 Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

15 Last question. You mentioned that you set aside
16 cultural purposes. How many numbers are we looking at for
17 cultural harvest? Thank you.

18 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Paul.

19 Jan.

20 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Okay. So on the NWT side since
21 2010, from 2010 to 2014, we had that harvest limit of 300,
22 and that was by agreement with the Yellowknife Dene, Tlicho
23 government, the Wek'èezhìi Board approved that. The last
24 two winters, we've basically tried to put that at zero.

25 The previous winter, not this last one just

1 ended but the one before, we tried to include a ceremonial
2 harvest of 15 caribou, and I think that was partly borrowed
3 from the Porcupine harvest management plan because they
4 included that very low level of harvest for ceremonial
5 purposes. I don't think any caribou were actually taken
6 under that umbrella.

7 And then this past winter, it was just basically
8 zero, no ceremonial harvest.

9 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jan.

10 Bert.

11 MR. DEAN: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

12 Bert Dean with NTI.

13 I think sort of following Paul's questions, from
14 the experiences on the NWT side, like, just that whole
15 relationship with the communities, what's your sense? Is
16 there more buy-in? Is there support for the zero harvest,
17 or has it made it a lot more difficult?

18 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Bert.

19 Jan.

20 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Jan Adamczewski with Government of
21 Northwest Territories.

22 That's a kind of a -- kind of a difficult
23 question, Bert. I think at this point, even if you just
24 check the registry for this hearing, there are written
25 submissions from the Wek'èezhìi Board, the Yellowknife's

1 Dene, Tlicho government, North Slave Métis Alliance, all
2 basically supporting zero harvest on Bathurst.

3 And, I mean, I'm probably not the best person to
4 speak on their behalf, but for those -- for those groups,
5 those governments to say we're not going to harvest
6 Bathurst anymore, that's an incredibly huge step. Tlicho
7 government, Tlicho and Yellowknives, were two of the main
8 groups that hunted this herd, and their traditional
9 territories -- I mean, that history goes back literally
10 thousands of years. So for them to step forward in that
11 way and indicate they support a zero harvest, those are
12 very, very difficult decisions.

13 So I guess our overall sense is that it's very
14 hard, it's very hard on communities, but we seem to be
15 seeing more support and buy-in just the last couple of
16 years than even five years ago.

17 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jan.

18 Bert.

19 MR. DEAN: Yeah, thanks, Jan.

20 And I guess the reason I mention ask, and I
21 mention had the opportunity -- it's a number of years ago
22 now, but there was a caribou conference, and there was
23 representatives from Alaska, and they were talking about a
24 similar experience when the herd had crashed. And it's my
25 memory so, I'm not sure if it's the Fortymile herd or who

1 the exact person or situation was, but what they said
2 really stuck with me.

3 And it was that they had worked really hard with
4 the communities, you know, to have a relationship and a
5 management system for caribou. And the caribou, the
6 numbers had declined quite severely, and they implemented a
7 zero harvest, and it created a lot of difficult situations.
8 And in that person's comments, he wasn't quite sure if it
9 was worth the price they paid because it really made it
10 tough for having that trust or that working relationship
11 with the community.

12 Now, I don't know the details of how they
13 implemented it, I don't know the details of the
14 enforcement, but even though there was a zero harvest,
15 there was still people that went out and harvested. And I
16 don't know if charges were laid or how it affected the
17 community, but the following year, they went back to having
18 a small harvest and trying to work with the community to
19 re-establish that working relationship and trust.

20 And just, personally, I don't want us to fall
21 into that same situation. And I know, especially because
22 it was in the news, initially when there was restrictions
23 on the NWT side, there was some difficult situations, and
24 there's the whole monitoring and enforcement part of it;
25 and, again, the importance or significance of caribou.

1 So I guess that's why we're asking, from your
2 experiences or things you've learned. And again, earlier,
3 the questions, you know; is a harvest of, whether it's 30
4 bulls or 70 or 100 on a population of 15,000 caribou, the
5 risk, you know, versus that working relationship and
6 working with the communities to try and get information.
7 Even some of the comments earlier about, you know, outside
8 of Kugluktuk, are those Bathurst caribou or Bluenose
9 caribou, or what are the animals doing?

10 So, yeah, just any insight or comments you could
11 provide. And maybe it's later talking to some of the
12 delegates, but it's just these communities are going to be
13 facing some hardship, and any advice you could give would
14 be helpful. Thank you.

15 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Bert.

16 Lynda?

17 MS. YONGE: Lynda Yonge, GNWT.

18 What happened this year with the zero harvest is
19 that -- so we did implement a zero total allowable harvest
20 in 2014-2015 because of the situation.

21 This past proposal that went to the Wek'èezhìi
22 Renewable Resources Board, the Tlicho Chiefs actually
23 called our minister in, and said that they had decided that
24 they would not harvest the Bathurst herd. And it was their
25 decision, and they made it very clear to us that it wasn't

1 because the government said we wanted to implement a total
2 allowable harvest of zero. It was their decision that they
3 were not going to do anything that would interfere with the
4 recovery of the herd, and it was part of their way of
5 showing leadership around conservation for that herd.

6 And so, because of that commitment -- which I
7 can't even imagine how difficult that is for elected
8 leaders to do that -- I think we're seeing a much higher
9 level of buy-in in those communities.

10 I think, also, people have just found it
11 extremely difficult to find caribou, and so the reality of
12 the decline is really hitting home for people now, and I
13 think that also had a lot to do with it.

14 But in terms of advice, I mention can tell you
15 if you stand on the outside and say we know what's best,
16 we're going to shut this down, it doesn't work at all. So,
17 yeah, a lot of talk, a lot, a lot of meetings.

18 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lynda. Okay.

19 Thank you, NTI.

20 Next on the questionnaire is KIA, Kitikmeot
21 Inuit Association. Geoff.

22 KITIKMEOT INUIT ASSOCIATION QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

23 MR. CLARK: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Geoff

24 Clark, Kitikmeot Inuit Association. We have a few
25 questions.

1 Thank you very much for the presentation. I
2 mention was at a presentation at the Sabina NIRB hearing,
3 and this presentation was different but as good as the
4 previous one.

5 And important information I mention wasn't aware
6 of from this presentation is that the approximate 4 to
7 7,000 caribou harvested per year, in that period of the
8 decline from 100,000 to about 32,000 Bathurst caribou,
9 which I think is around 2006 to 2009 or '10, were mostly
10 female.

11 It's fairly -- you don't need to be a
12 statistician to be able to tell that, you know, you take
13 out 20-25,000 female caribou from a population of 100,000
14 that's already in a state of decline that the harvest is
15 going to have a significant effect on the population.

16 And so a thank-you to the GNWT for stepping in
17 to limit that harvest because, potentially, we wouldn't be
18 here to have a hearing today. If that harvest continued
19 for the next three, four years, we'd be talking about there
20 being no Bathurst caribou herd.

21 That, combined with the fact that there has been
22 some discussion about mining and winter roads, and so on,
23 it's important for the Board to know that there are no
24 operating mines in Nunavut in the Bathurst range. There
25 are no winter roads in Nunavut in the Bathurst range.

1 So whenever there's discussion about winter
2 roads, effects of mining and so on, that is all in the
3 Northwest Territories. So that, along with the harvesting
4 that's been managed and natural effects like the drought
5 which likely had a cause of forest fires, undoubtedly maybe
6 exacerbating a natural cycle in the caribou population.

7 But it does appear -- And would the GNWT agree?
8 -- that the management issues in relation to the
9 approximate 100 or 200 number of male or whatever gender of
10 caribou harvest it is, is insignificant statistically,
11 scientifically -- I'm not speaking politically; I'm saying
12 insignificant scientifically or statistically relative to
13 the other effects, and there's potentially other natural
14 effects that we didn't talk -- I didn't mention on the
15 Bathurst herd.

16 So I guess, to be more clear, the 100 to 200
17 Bathurst caribou potentially harvested in Nunavut, do you
18 believe that that is scientifically or statistically
19 significant? Again, I'm not talking about politically.
20 What is the GNWT's view on that?

21 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Geoff.

22 Jan.

23 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Jan Adamczewski with Government of
24 Northwest Territories.

25 There's a number of ways of sort of looking at

1 that. We've had a good statistician do some harvest
2 modelling and looking at the effects of various levels of
3 harvest on a caribou herd if that herd is increasing, if
4 it's decreasing; and there's at least one report that we
5 provided to this Board, the NWMB, as supporting
6 documentation on, I guess, our submission.

7 So if the question you're asking is, can we
8 demonstrate that a harvest of, say, 100 Bathurst bulls will
9 sink the Bathurst herd, no, we can't demonstrate that.
10 That becomes a fairly small number in relation to all the
11 animals that die of natural causes every year. There's
12 always turnover, there's always natural mortality of
13 calves, adults, and so on.

14 I think the decision to go to zero, from us and
15 the Aboriginal groups that are supporting this and the
16 Wek'èezhii Board, 100 isn't much, but it is something that
17 adds to mortality. It's another 100 dead caribou in a herd
18 that is in deep trouble, and so this is probably more of a
19 value decision rather than something, you know, can I
20 mention demonstrate statistically that we would be able to
21 detect that level of harvest in our next population survey?
22 And, no, we can't do that. I think you know that. I think
23 the sense is just this herd has declined 96 percent from
24 peak numbers, and the indicators are further decline, most
25 likely, and we're at a point where small things matter.

1 And just so you know, the level of scrutiny on
2 the last proposal, the Jay proposal, the next additional
3 kimberlite mine, that was looked at very, very carefully by
4 the Mackenzie Valley Impact Review Board. Even recognizing
5 that the likely additional effects of that mine as an
6 add-on to an existing disturbed area was probably fairly
7 small, but the board felt small things matter, you know,
8 with a herd that is kind of teetering on the edge.

9 And so that's kind of, I think, more the way
10 we're looking at this, not that we can demonstrate that
11 that harvest would kill off the Bathurst herd. No, we
12 can't do that. It's simply that the herd is in a state
13 where we need to do whatever we can, and for conservation
14 reasons, we believe we should not be harvesting that herd
15 further.

16 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jan.

17 Geoff.

18 MR. CLARK: How much direct funding does the
19 Government of Nunavut provide to the Government of
20 Northwest Territories for the monitoring of the Bathurst
21 herd that the Government of Northwest Territories executes?
22 I'm not talking about in-kind funding. I'm talking about
23 direct dollars. Do you have a percentage or a dollar
24 amount estimate?

25 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Geoff.

1 Jan.

2 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Jan Adamczewski with Government of
3 Northwest Territories.

4 We don't have an arrangement in place whereby GN
5 is putting money into our surveys as such. We have
6 certainly had, as you mentioned, the in-kind support,
7 accommodation, you know, participation in surveys, that
8 sort of thing. But it just sort of has become established
9 that our agency is the lead on monitoring of that herd and
10 the Bluenose East herd.

11 But there's always a flip side to this because
12 the last few surveys of the Beverly and Ahiak caribou in
13 the Queen Maud Gulf, even though that is shared with
14 Northwest Territories, those have been a GN lead. They
15 have done most of the flying, provided most of the funding.

16 Collars, we have some; they have some on those
17 caribou. Qamaniruaq, we basically don't put any money into
18 that program, and Government of Nunavut is basically doing
19 all of the surveys, putting out the collars, monitoring,
20 etcetera, although that herd in some winters does come into
21 the Northwest Territories.

22 So it's just kind of the way it's worked out
23 that, you know, we have a lead role in monitoring certain
24 herds, and Government of Nunavut has a lead role in
25 monitoring other herds. Some of it is shared, and I think

1 a lot of it just kind of comes down to who has the dollars
2 and the resources to be able to do it.

3 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jan.

4 Geoff.

5 MR. CLARK: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

6 And I'm not sure if this was clearly stated. I
7 think there was questions about sharing data and so on, but
8 the GNWT, does it own the data on surveys that it conducts
9 on the Bathurst herd? Does GNWT own that data, and then it
10 is, I guess, shared as the GNWT desires, or does the GN own
11 the data, or does some other entity own the data?

12 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Geoff.

13 Jan.

14 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Jan Adamczewski, Government of
15 Northwest Territories.

16 I think our view, the long and the short of it
17 is that the tax payer owns the data. The tax payer pays
18 for all this stuff, so we don't own any of it. We have
19 custodial rights, we have responsibility to make sure that
20 collar information doesn't go to the wrong places,
21 particularly now with conservation measures in place and,
22 you know, in the past we used to fax out collar location
23 maps to every band office, and that's how people planned
24 their hunts, and we were asked to stop doing that in 2007,
25 so we don't do that anymore.

1 But we see the collar data as essentially a
2 public resource that we are in charge of. We have a data
3 release form, and we get requests for collar data from the
4 diamond mines, from Sabina, from various researchers; and
5 as long as they can provide a rational reason for making
6 use of that information and they don't do something
7 irresponsible with it, we'll make it available.

8 The survey information, by necessity, we've been
9 getting those numbers out within a few months, sometimes
10 within a few weeks of the survey. And, you know, we
11 collect the data, but we don't see ourselves as owners of
12 it. I think it belongs to everybody, and anyone that needs
13 to access that information for management purposes, it's
14 going to be available.

15 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jan.

16 Geoff or John?

17 MR. CLARK: Thank you, Jan.

18 I mention presume the taxpayer is the GNWT
19 taxpayer, or is it -- I guess, what I'm getting at is,
20 first of all, the GNWT delegation is always great visitors
21 to our communities, polite, nice, and professional. But
22 you're more than visitors. You're important powerful and
23 influential, at least in relation to the herd we're talking
24 about today because, as questions were asked earlier, but
25 they were just sort of nibbling around the edges -- the

1 GNWT holds the money, holds the funds which is the power in
2 relation to creating the dialogue and the discussion around
3 the herd and the talking points and the agenda around
4 management of the herd. And in Nunavut, we do not --
5 obviously we're not politically represented by the
6 Government of Northwest Territories, and so we have little
7 accountability to the process, and so it's natural that
8 there would be issues of trust in regards to this.

9 And it would seem logical that there would be
10 fast sharing of data, for example, with the GN because it's
11 a known interest of the GNWT to get information to the GN
12 so that they can make a management decision that the GNWT
13 would like the GN to make.

14 And, you know, I'm not suggesting there's some
15 scheme or anything. It's just the natural way that things
16 work, but it's an awkward, I guess, situation for all of
17 the Nunavummiut sitting around the table, basically,
18 relying on an entity to drive the conversation that isn't
19 accountable or represented in Nunavut.

20 That is the -- that was a comment, and those are
21 the end of the questions. John Donihee has a couple
22 questions.

23 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Geoff. Okay. Go
24 ahead, John.

25 MR. DONIHEE: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

1 Just, the first question is just in relation to
2 the operation of your mobile conservation areas. You said
3 at one point, while you were describing how they worked and
4 why they worked, that obviously they couldn't Junivik
5 (verbatim) could not have implemented that approach to
6 caribou management if there weren't radio collars out
7 there, satellite collars out there on the caribou.

8 So the question I'm wondering about is whether
9 there's a minimum number of collars, I guess, below which
10 you couldn't make that work, and -- or you could answer the
11 alternative question which is simply, are there enough
12 collars on both the -- obviously, there are on the Bathurst
13 herd, but maybe I mention should save the question for
14 tomorrow, but anyway, are there enough collars out there on
15 the Bluenose herd, Bluenose East herd for something like
16 that to work as well?

17 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Juan.

18 Jan.

19 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Jan Adamczewski with Government of
20 Northwest Territories.

21 Maybe just to provide a little bit of context,
22 John. There are some caribou herds in Alaska, George River
23 herd, Leaf River herd, and Quebec-Labrador where they keep
24 something in the order of 80 to 100 collars on each of
25 those herds as ongoing monitoring. Partly that's because

1 they have more resources and they don't seem to have quite
2 the issues with concerns about captures and collaring and
3 things of that nature.

4 We have had a couple of contract reports where
5 we looked at that question of how many collars is enough,
6 and the answer isn't quite that simple because it depends
7 on what you're using them for.

8 To maybe put this in a little bit of
9 perspective, from the George River herd some years ago,
10 they did a study, and the reason they wanted to know how
11 many collars they should have on that herd is because they
12 do low-level jet flights out in that country, which are
13 pretty noisy, and the military wanted to know how many
14 collared caribou needed to be on the herd so that they
15 could basically go fly somewhere else.

16 So they did some analysis, and for the winter
17 range, the number they came up with for a 95 percent
18 probability was 64 collars. And if they had something like
19 50, then the probability dropped down a bit, but still
20 fairly good confidence that they were defining where the
21 bulk of the herd was. And that's about where we are now
22 with Bathurst and Bluenose East.

23 So we are adding some collars every year to
24 bring it back to 50. And, of course, as time goes by, some
25 of those animals die, so we're trying to bring it back up

1 to 50 and maintain it at that level for the next few years
2 for both herds. And we've had enough evaluations
3 statistically that I think we're confident those are
4 certainly adequate for the kind of harvest management that
5 we're involved with.

6 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jan.

7 John?

8 Oh, Lynda.

9 MS. YONGE: Sorry, Lynda Yonge, GNWT.

10 I mention just wanted to add. The reason we
11 went -- one of the reasons we went with the mobile scene
12 zone was because the Bathurst herd started exhibiting
13 somewhat unusual behaviour where the collars were all
14 clumped very close together, and there didn't seem to be a
15 lot of animals in the area around. And so it made it
16 possible to a put relatively small zone around them and
17 have a high level of confidence that we were covering them
18 all. That's not always the case.

19 Sometimes the animals are much more dispersed
20 during the winter, so it would be contingent on that kind
21 of behaviour, whether or not it would be appropriate for
22 other herds.

23 THE CHAIR: Thank you.

24 John.

25 MR. DONIHUE: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

1 I have one more question I mention hope we can
2 deal with quickly, and it's in relation to the -- you
3 called it a Bathurst advisory committee, the organization
4 that's not going to meet until the fall of 2016, which you
5 indicated was ultimately going to, or hopefully going to
6 develop a Bathurst caribou management plan.

7 And so the first part of the question is really
8 just, assuming you do meet this fall, what's your
9 optimistic guess for how long it might take before you
10 actually have a management plan that you're ready to put
11 forward to the authorities who have approval authority?

12 THE CHAIR: Thank you, John.

13 Lynda.

14 MS. YONGE: Lynda Yonge, GNWT.

15 I don't know how long that will take. I mention
16 would expect it would take two or three years, and so until
17 that time, we would continue to manage the way we do now
18 where we would put forward shorter-term proposals and do
19 consultation with the various groups.

20 One of the reasons for having the advisory
21 committee is so that, rather than doing sort of one-off
22 consultations with all the various groups that harvest, we
23 would be able to get everybody into the room together, and,
24 hopefully, those groups that harvest would be people who
25 would find solutions and management approaches that would

1 be appropriate.

2 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lynda.

3 John.

4 MR. DONIHÉE: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Just one
5 follow-up.

6 I'm wondering. Nunavut, of course, is fortunate
7 in that it's one jurisdiction, one board. That's certainly
8 not the situation in the NWT. But regardless, I guess,
9 this advisory committee is kind of ad hoc. I'm not quite
10 sure how else to describe it.

11 I mean, you get everybody together that has an
12 interest in the management of Bathurst caribou, you take
13 the time that it takes to develop a management plan,
14 presumably some form of buy-in results. But then when
15 actual decisions have to be made about, you know, what's
16 going to be done with respect to Bathurst caribou in the
17 future, you then still have to come back to Land
18 Claims-based organizations, where they exist -- at least
19 certainly in Nunavut it's clear.

20 And so I'm kind of wondering if you can help me
21 understand sort of, what authority does that plan that
22 everybody agreed to really have? You know, in the context
23 of a hearing like this, three years from now, let's say
24 with a plan in place where Nunavut communities are not
25 particularly happy with the management proposals being

1 advanced, and the argument I mention suppose being offered
2 by government is, well, we have a management plan, but it's
3 not really a management plan for the Bathurst herd in
4 Nunavut.

5 And so I'm trying to come to grips with the
6 status, if you will, the authority of that plan and how you
7 see it operating and contributing to the job that the
8 Nunavut Wildlife Management Board has to do in the future.

9 THE CHAIR: Thank you, John.

10 Lynda.

11 MS. YONGE: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

12 Lynda Yonge, GNWT.

13 So one of the reasons it has taken this long to
14 get that advisory committee going is we have tried to reach
15 agreement with each of the organizations that they will
16 participate in this and that they will accept a plan
17 developed by the advisory board as recommendation.

18 You're absolutely right. We need to still go
19 through the co-management process. Each of the Land Claim
20 Agreements has requirements, but it's no different from
21 guidance that's provided by the plan demonstrated by the
22 ACCWM for the Bluenose East, Bluenose West, and Cape
23 Bathurst herd.

24 The intent is that the people at the table at
25 the advisory committee will bring the concerns of whichever

1 organization they're representing to the table so at least
2 they can be addressed and acknowledged, we can have full
3 discussion about it, and then the plan that comes out of
4 that should be much more acceptable to each of the
5 organizations that it would be provided to as a
6 recommendation.

7 It's really no different from the way we operate
8 with other things, the way we developed the Wildlife Act,
9 the way we work on species at risk where we bring together
10 all the conference of management authorities. The more
11 input people have prior to receiving a recommendation the
12 more likely the organization will be to accept it.

13 And in the terms of reference for this advisory
14 committee, each of the representatives are tasked with
15 taking information back to their organization and bringing
16 those views back. So it's not consultation. It does not
17 in any way go around the requirement to meet the terms of
18 the Land Claim Agreements, but it is intended to have real
19 input that has had feedback from the organizations into a
20 plan. So that's our hope.

21 THE CHAIR: Thank you, very much, Lynda.

22 Thank you, John.

23 MR. DONIHUE: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

24 Thank you for those answers. Those are all our
25 questions.

1 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much, KIA.

2 Okay. We'll move on. The North Slave Métis
3 Alliance, Shin.

4 MR. SHIGA: North Slave Métis Alliance. All
5 of my questions have been asked and answered. Thank you.

6 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much, Shin.

7 All right. Next, then is Adventure Northwest
8 Limited. Boyd.

9 MR. WARNER: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

10 Boyd Warren, Adventure Northwest.

11 Jan, you brought up the mention of the ARC
12 review in your presentation, and I believe -- I don't have
13 a copy in front of me -- but one of the main
14 recommendations also in that review was that all the
15 caribou populations on the mainland be treated as one
16 population, and I'm just wondering whether the GNWT has
17 accepted that recommendation as well.

18 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Jan Adamczewski with Government of
19 Northwest Territories.

20 I mention was fairly heavily involved in getting
21 that review done and was sort of the main contact for
22 documents, at least for my department.

23 What the ARC review recommended is that we
24 consider the use of the meta population concept. But a
25 meta population is not one big population. It is a

1 population of populations. So they did not in any way
2 invalidate the herd-based management. In fact, they
3 endorsed it as the logical way that everybody does it in
4 North America.

5 The meta population concept says that there may
6 be some herds or subpopulations that have an association at
7 a higher level. How that would be done at a management
8 level I'm not sure anybody knows, but I know the report
9 quite well, and they basically did endorse the herd-based
10 management that we use, that GN uses, and everybody else.
11 They're simply suggesting that there may be a higher level
12 where some of those herds or populations have some linkage
13 or association. Thank you.

14 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jan.

15 Boyd.

16 MR. WARNER: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

17 And I believe you're correct. It was a meta
18 population. But does it not make sense, then, if we're
19 talking management advisory committees because of these
20 herds and your map, fortunately, on the screen behind you
21 and history has shown such an overlap, especially on the
22 use of the east side of Bathurst by the now the Beverly
23 caribou -- previously it was Ahiak and then Bathurst.

24 Does it not make sense to have management plans
25 that, instead of trying to be individual like on a Bathurst

1 herd, that these animals are all managed as one group
2 instead of -- to me, it looks like, look at an example.
3 You're taking a riding in one city and trying to manage the
4 population of people in a small area without all the other
5 factors. It just makes more sense to me to have a
6 management plan that might incorporate the Bluenose East,
7 the Bathurst, the Ahiak, and all those animals are using
8 the traditional winter ranges together.

9 It's my understanding -- again, as being a
10 long-time resident, in 1996 when the collars were first put
11 on, nobody had any idea, really, where the caribou were all
12 going, other than traditional knowledge and flight lines
13 and surveys.

14 So collars were first established, and people,
15 the biologists, flew out to the Indian Lake area, which is
16 north and west of Yellowknife, and collared a whole bunch
17 of caribou. And from those collars, we saw where the
18 caribou went. Some went to what is now the Bluenose East
19 calving grounds, some went to the Bathurst calving grounds,
20 some went to the east side of Bathurst, which I mention
21 would argue is Bathurst caribou calving ground.

22 So those populations were identified based on
23 winter ranging of animals interacting. It wasn't based on
24 going to calving grounds and calving caribou there, just
25 seeing if they always returned to the same.

1 So all of these populations spend a good
2 majority of time intermingling in the wintertime. It just
3 makes more sense to me to treat it as one group of caribou
4 that arguably have separate calving areas but that overlap
5 on their ranges.

6 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Boyd.

7 Jan.

8 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Jan Adamczewski with the
9 Government of Northwest Territories.

10 You're correct about mixing on the winter range,
11 and there is an area north of Saskatchewan, kind of the
12 east arm Great Slave Lake out Artillery Lake out that way.
13 And just based on collar information, Qamaniruaq caribou
14 have been there, caribou that calve in the Queen Maud Gulf,
15 Bathurst caribou, and the old Beverly herd that used to
16 calve inland south of Garry Lake, all of those at some
17 point have made use of that winter range, not always in the
18 same year.

19 But in the summer on the calving grounds they go
20 back to their home ground. That's what they know. And all
21 the collars that we've ever had go to the Bathurst calving
22 ground since '96 -- and that's when the collars started --
23 they behave as one distinct group.

24 And all the collars that have ended up in the
25 Queen Maud Gulf have a different movement pattern. They

1 behave like a different group of caribou. And as you go
2 west, Bluenose East range, Bluenose West range, the same
3 pattern applies.

4 For us, the communities and their ability to
5 harvest is important, and we would argue because of that
6 that, whether you call them herds or something, each of
7 them is deserving of respect. Each of them matters to some
8 communities, and we don't think it's appropriate that we
9 would ever try to manage any of those herds so that they
10 disappear.

11 They may repopulate. They may come back 50, 100
12 years later, but to the communities that depend on each one
13 of those populations, they're all important.

14 And so herd-based management is what we have
15 used. It's what the GN uses, it's what Alaska uses, and we
16 really don't see any reason to change that, recognizing
17 that, yes, there is mixing on the winter range, and
18 sometimes communities may be accessing one herd or another
19 herd, depending on the winter that it is.

20 But we believe that each herd has value, has
21 history, and matters to some communities, and so should be
22 managed as best we can sustainably.

23 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jan.

24 Boyd?

25 MR. WARNER: Thank you, Mr. Chair. And thank

1 you, Jan.

2 And I mention would agree with you. I guess the
3 point I'm trying to drive home at this meeting is that
4 prior to '96, all of the caribou on the mainland were
5 Bathurst caribou, and we've now divided the populations on
6 the mainland into three, at least three different groups
7 since '96, and that you've shown that they go to different
8 calving grounds, there's a little bit of switching. But
9 prior to '96, that was all considered Bathurst caribou, so
10 just for a statement.

11 I guess a question regarding the herd decline.
12 When it went from 100,000 to 35,000, that's a loss in three
13 years of about 67,000 animals. And I think some HTO
14 members referred to the fact that no dead animals were ever
15 found or things, but was there a proportionate loss of
16 collared animals at that same time?

17 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Boyd.

18 John.

19 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Jan Adamczewski with the
20 Government of Northwest Territories.

21 So I'll address a couple of things there,
22 because that question has come up is, where's all the dead
23 caribou?

24 If you were to look at a caribou herd of, say,
25 100,000 in a period when it is stable, it's not declining,

1 it's not increasing, there are many thousands of caribou in
2 that herd that die every year. That herd might produce
3 40,000 calves, but six months later 30,000 of those calves
4 might be dead. And there is mortality of adult males,
5 adult cows, and in a herd that size there will be thousands
6 of adult caribou that die every year, but they die over a
7 very big area, and they die throughout the year, so you
8 don't find bodies accumulating because predators either
9 have eaten them or the scavengers have gotten to them.

10 The only time that you're going to see caribou
11 littering the landscape, a bunch of dead bodies, would be
12 if you had a massive winter die-off -- and we've seen that
13 with Peary caribou, Bathurst Inlet, some of the other
14 islands. You can get a situation where, you know, you've
15 got winter icing, the animals can't eat, they starve, and
16 you will find dead caribou all over the landscape. But
17 normally there's a lot of turnover, there are thousands of
18 caribou from each herd that die every year. It's normal,
19 but you won't see them all over the landscape.

20 As to your other question about, did the
21 collared caribou reflect that mortality? Essentially, we
22 weren't able to detect it at the time because, at that
23 time, we never had more than 20 Bathurst collars out there,
24 and, in fact, on average it worked out to something like 12
25 or 14 at any time of year.

1 And that number of collars, it's simply too
2 small to detect those kinds of changes in mortality. So
3 the Alaskans, you may recall I mention mentioned earlier
4 Porcupine herd, Western Arctic herd, one of the reasons
5 they maintain up to 100 collars per herd is to be able to
6 monitor mortality and survival of those collared animals.
7 And that's an important indicator in their monitoring
8 programs. But if you only have 12, 15 collars, it's just
9 not enough to detect those kinds of changes in mortality.

10 We're in a little better shape now with 50
11 collars, but if you wanted to monitor survival closely,
12 you'd actually need something more like a hundred collars
13 on the caribou herd.

14 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jan.

15 Boyd.

16 MR. WARNER: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

17 And thank you, Jan.

18 I guess I'd like to perhaps just ask you a
19 similar question I mention asked the GN biologist is that,
20 our harvest of caribou with the HTOs on Contwoyto Lake were
21 harvesting bulls only, and there's 70 to 100 a year. And
22 in addition to that, we're harvesting wolves. Potentially
23 this total allowable harvest request would likely eliminate
24 that operation and, consequently, eliminate the wolf
25 harvesting that also goes on.

1 So do you not see that as an equalizer, that if
2 a harvest of caribou, when we're harvesting bulls only,
3 they're fat, they're mature, the meat's going back to the
4 communities, guys are getting their winter meat, and, in
5 addition, we're helping the herds in the neighbourhood of
6 saving 200 to 250 caribou? Removing us as a factor would
7 actually hurt the Bathurst herd more than it would help it,
8 in my opinion. I'm just wondering how it would affect it
9 in your opinion.

10 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Boyd.

11 John.

12 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Jan Adamczewski with the
13 Government of Northwest Territories.

14 It's a fair question. And because we're
15 starting the process of this feasibility assessment to look
16 at wolf management options on the range of the Bathurst
17 herd, we've kind of looked at wolf control programs from
18 Alaska, Yukon, other places, and we've had some contact
19 with Alaska Fish and Game because they have more experience
20 with this than anyone else does.

21 And the answers are not that simple. Their rule
22 of thumb is that you can sustainably take about 30 percent
23 of the wolf population every year from one of their caribou
24 or moose ranges and essentially have no difference to
25 caribou or moose because those animals are quickly

1 replaced.

2 Smaller packs take more prey than bigger packs
3 do because more goes to the scavengers, and there are
4 always some floaters, some wolves that aren't part of a
5 pack that can come in and sort of fill in where there might
6 be gaps.

7 As a sort of a rule of thumb, people who have
8 done this type of wolf control, wolf reduction, will tell
9 you you need to take probably something in the order of 50
10 percent or more of the wolves out to actually have a
11 measurable effect on caribou or moose survival rates.

12 Less than that, it just isn't effective. Some
13 of the Yukon programs that we've looked at -- one, I
14 mention spent some years in the Yukon -- they aimed at 80
15 percent reduction, 80 percent removal of the wolves for
16 seven years in the range of a caribou herd, and you may
17 have heard reference a little bit earlier from Mathieu and
18 from GN, I guess, perhaps a reluctance to get helpfully
19 involved in a wolf removal or wolf reduction programs
20 because that, by and large, has been the lesson learned
21 elsewhere. If you're going to get serious about this and
22 you really want to make a difference, you got to hit the
23 wolves pretty hard.

24 And so our view of the incentives we have so far
25 for the Bathurst range, 40-50 wolves taken, perhaps, per

1 year probably hasn't really made much difference. So it's
2 nice simple math, and there's some logic to it that you put
3 forward, but the experience seems to be that you have to
4 hit the wolves really hard. You got to be taking out half
5 the pack or more over a big area, and you got to do it for
6 a few years, and then it may start to make a difference.

7 So just to provide that bit of context and
8 experience that's being learned elsewhere.

9 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jan.

10 Boyd.

11 MR. WARNER: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Thank you,
12 Jan.

13 And I'm not suggesting it as the solving of the
14 problem, but again, I'm suggesting that removing that hunt
15 would actually be a negative effect on the Bathurst herd
16 because the amount of animals that are harvested through
17 the sports hunt is about half of what would be saved, even
18 having said it's not going to be the end all solution to
19 the problem. So I mention just wanted to, I guess, guess
20 that message across.

21 That's the only questions I have at this time
22 for the GN.

23 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

24 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Boyd.

25 Okay. We'll move on. All we have left now,

1 then, is there any members of the public that would like to
2 ask any questions of the Government of Northwest
3 Territories? James? Go ahead, James.

4 PUBLIC QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

5 MR. PANIOYAK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman, and good
6 evening to everyone.

7 I mention just wanted to thank Jan for your
8 presentation earlier today, and it's good to see you again.

9 I mention just wanted to comment, Mr. Chairman,
10 on a little bit of what I mention went through with a
11 chairman for the Ikaluktutiak HTO over the years. I know
12 in 2012 -- or '11 or '12, anyway -- it was a process of
13 where all the interagency groups from Nunavut and NWT were
14 starting to meet with the concerns of the Bathurst caribou,
15 and I guess those were what were called the Bathurst
16 caribou range plan.

17 And over the years we met with GNWT, Aboriginal
18 people, along with Nunavut Inuit, and there was always a
19 consensus between the Aboriginal groups and the Inuit that
20 the wolf population has dramatically increased over the
21 years, which start to have an affect on the Bathurst
22 caribou.

23 As you may know, over the years the Métis
24 people, as well, have commented that a lot of wolf packs in
25 the area between Yellowknife and Fort Smith, you go down to

1 Gamèti area, all those Aboriginal people they, too, had
2 concerns that the wolf population was increasing so much
3 that there needed to be something done in order to protect
4 the caribou herd or the Bathurst caribou herd.

5 So I'm not sure where all that, like, all the
6 information that was gathered over the meetings, where that
7 went to. Because I know for a fact it was a big concern
8 that the wolf packs were affecting the Bathurst caribou
9 herd.

10 So I guess the question to Jan would be, during
11 your research or your surveys, have you, with the
12 traditional knowledge that the Aboriginal people put on a
13 table, have you worked with Aboriginal people in terms of
14 traditional knowledge for caribou surveys and wolf surveys?
15 It's not just wolves that we're talking about, as well as
16 predators. We have grizzly bears, which is a big concern
17 on our island as well.

18 So, yeah, my question would be, have you worked
19 with Aboriginal people in terms of traditional knowledge?
20 So that's my first question, Mr. Chairman. Thanks.

21 THE CHAIR: Thank you, James.

22 Jan.

23 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Jan Adamczewski with Government of
24 Northwest Territories.

25 I guess it depends a little bit on how you

1 define working with traditional knowledge. Certainly in
2 terms of meetings, workshops, hearings that we've been to,
3 there has been a lot of input, lot of comments about
4 wolves, and also about the need to do something about them.
5 But it's also quite clear.

6 You know, we had a hearing in Dèline in March,
7 the Sahtu Renewable Resources Board, and some fairly strong
8 beliefs about wolves there and not a whole lot of support
9 certainly for any sort of government wolf cull. So kind of
10 a strong sense that we need to do something, but we need to
11 do it in the right way.

12 And I'd perhaps reference the Tlicho
13 government's proposal for a wolf harvesting program on the
14 Bathurst winter range. That is their initiative. But what
15 came before that was a workshop in the fall that they
16 organized with Tlicho Elders, and it was following that
17 that they came up with the proposal, the approach that
18 they're putting forward now.

19 I think some of concerns from the Elders were
20 where you take a dead wolf, you can't take it into town.
21 You got to be careful how you handle it, where the blood
22 goes. So a pretty clear sense that there's a problem with
23 wolves, and they want to do something about it, but they
24 want to do something in ways that are appropriate to their,
25 I guess, traditions and ways of going about things.

1 So I think that's kind of our feasibility
2 assessment would be relatively technical, but we will need
3 to be looking at what can be done and then what might be
4 ways of doing things that our communities and our
5 Aboriginal groups will find acceptable.

6 So I think we're trying to do what you're asking
7 about, but it's not a simple thing to approach, and we have
8 found there are definitely regional differences in terms of
9 how people perceive wolves and what might be appropriate.

10 THE CHAIR: Thank you Jan.

11 James.

12 MR. PANIOYAK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

13 Thank you, Jan, for that answer. It seemed to
14 be every time Inuit or Aboriginal people bring up wolves,
15 there seem to be both from the Nunavut government and GNWT
16 that there seem to be a conception where maybe the wolf is
17 not the problem. It's not part of the problem. And I
18 mention find that very -- I don't know what word I mention
19 would use -- but hard to believe that here we have Inuit
20 and Aboriginal people talking about wolves for so long.
21 Not just wolves, but grizzly bears as well, where grizzly
22 bears would probably have a lot of devastation on caribou
23 calving grounds as well.

24 So has there been any surveys done on the
25 calving grounds where predators may be preying on the

1 newborn calves and making a big impact on killing off the
2 calves or the young ones.

3 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

4 THE CHAIR: Thank you, James.

5 Jan.

6 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Jan Adamczewski with Government of
7 Northwest Territories.

8 We fly surveys for caribou at various times of
9 the year, and we always record any observations that we
10 make; so bears, wolves, wolverine. Any of those mammals
11 are recorded.

12 Thinking of the calving ground specifically,
13 because I've been on calving ground surveys for Bathurst
14 and Bluenose East a number of times now, we do always see a
15 few bulls, wolves. We actually seem to see more bears on
16 the calving grounds. There are more sightings of them than
17 the wolves.

18 Those surveys are not set up to really give us
19 an accurate population count of wolves or bears. They tend
20 to occur at fairly low densities. They're fairly
21 scattered. To get a really accurate count you'd have to do
22 some really intensive flying. So we do get information
23 about the predators. We certainly get reports from
24 community members.

25 And I think, in terms of the feasibility

1 assessment, at this point we're not taking any options off
2 the table. And, you know, the lower the herd goes the
3 closer we have to look at that.

4 In terms of active management that may turn
5 things around, there aren't that many things you can do.
6 And if we reduce the harvest on Bathurst to zero, that's
7 about all that can be done with the harvest. So addressing
8 the wolf issue in a more serious way is one of the very few
9 options that's still out there. So we haven't set aside
10 any options, but as our colleagues from Nunavut have
11 pointed out, people have been down this road before of
12 trying to go out and kill wolves and bears, and in many
13 cases they were ineffective, or they really don't know if
14 they had any effect all.

15 So I guess our view is, if we're going to do it,
16 we need to do it properly, and that's part of what we're
17 trying to look at with this feasibility assessment.

18 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jan.

19 James.

20 MR. PANIOYAK: Yeah, thank you, Mr. Chairman.

21 Just a comment that we have a lot of hunters
22 around the table. I know it's pretty hard to believe that
23 what a hunter sees out on the land a biologist or person
24 doing the survey doesn't see. So, you know, there's a
25 catch-22 there.

1 So I think we got to work together, the Inuit,
2 Aboriginal people, the biologists on both governments, to
3 really take a good look at the problems and try to work
4 together and not say, "I didn't see that."

5 So that's just a comment. Appreciate it. Thank
6 you, Mr. Chairman.

7 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much, James.

8 Okay. With that, that concludes our two major
9 presenters, both governments from the territories.

10 Next on the agenda for presentation is the
11 Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife Board, Simon. I'm not sure.
12 Is your presentation very long? No? Okay. Then we'll
13 listen to your presentation, and then I think probably
14 after that we'll end it for the day and come back, start
15 fresh in the morning with questions for the Kitikmeot
16 Regional Wildlife Board.

17 Go ahead, Simon.

18 KITIKMEOT REGIONAL WILDLIFE BOARD SUBMISSION

19 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Thank
20 you to the government of both territories.

21 I mention just want to point out we have a short
22 submission. By saying that, we would like to make a longer
23 submission.

24 But I want to inform the Board and the public we
25 were hoping to have this public hearing in the fall time.

1 That's why we have such a short submission. And we were
2 notified by the NWMB Board that we will have this public
3 hearing this month. That's why we have such a short
4 submission.

5 Dated May 25, 2016, written submission to NWMB
6 public hearing on Bathurst and Bluenose East caribou herd.

7 First of all, thank you for extending the
8 submission deadline for this important management concern.

9 We'd like to start by saying that putting the
10 total allowable harvest would be very negative for many
11 reasons. We do not feel that the Government of Nunavut
12 consulted with the affected communities of Kugluktuk,
13 Ekaluktutiak, Umingmaktok, and Kingaut.

14 We also do not feel that the management by HTOs
15 has been taken into consideration by the GN. These HTOs
16 and communities have put their own harvest restriction for
17 the two herds in the past. As a result of concerns raised
18 by GN, the HTOs are developing a community-based management
19 plan. This plan does not include a total allowable harvest
20 right now. Instead, the management plan will take into
21 account Inuit knowledge and the rules that address the
22 concerns raised by the GN.

23 Some of these rules include hunting areas such
24 as IQ principles and harvest reporting. These are some of
25 the points we are addressing at this point in time.

1 The affected communities were consulted and
2 agreed to these most valid points Kitikmeot Regional
3 Wildlife Board wanted to address.

4 And if I mention may add, Mr. Chair, with the
5 submission I mention would like to also add with this very
6 important issue on this public hearing on the Bluenose
7 herd, which is the Kugluktuk area.

8 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Simon. Simon, I think
9 if you're going to speak to the Bluenose East herd, we'll
10 wait until that public hearing comes, and you'll have
11 another chance to address that part of it. Okay? Is that
12 all right?

13 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Thank you
14 again for allowing me to make a short but understandable
15 note on this. Thank you.

16 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much, Simon.

17 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: That's all we have for our
18 submissions. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

19 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Simon.

20 Okay. So tomorrow, everybody, we'll go around
21 the table again for anyone that has any questions for Simon
22 and the regional wildlife board. We'll go through the same
23 process.

24 In the mean time, I mention got a couple things
25 here before everybody runs off. First of all, I mention

1 forgot to thank the GNWT for your presentation. Very much
2 appreciated, and it obviously stirred a lot of questions
3 and interest into what you had to say, so thank you.

4 Also, if anybody tomorrow -- we're going to have
5 a long day and lots of presentations tomorrow. If anybody
6 does have a presentation that requires any PowerPoint or
7 NWMB hasn't got a copy of it, would you please provide that
8 to Eric back here.

9 And so I think that does it for the day. Thank
10 you all very much for coming back this evening. And this
11 is such an important issue that we needed to do this. And
12 we'll try and be back here for 8:30 tomorrow morning. Is
13 that okay with everybody? Get an early start. Thank you
14 very much. Have a good night.

15

16 (Proceedings ended at 8:52 p.m.)

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1 Certificate of Transcript

2

3 I, the undersigned, hereby certify that the foregoing pages 1
4 to 279 are a complete and accurate transcript of the
5 proceedings taken down by me in shorthand and transcribed
6 from my shorthand notes to the best of my skill and ability.

7

8 Dated at the City of Calgary, Province of Alberta, on the day
9 24th of July, A.D. 2016.

10

11 "Adele Jones"

12 Adele Jones

13 Official Court Reporter, CSR(A)

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

NUNAVUT WILDLIFE MANAGEMENT BOARD

PUBLIC HEARING TO CONSIDER THE ESTABLISHMENT
OF A REGIONAL TOTAL ALLOWABLE HARVEST FOR THE
BATHURST CARIBOU HERD

June 15, 2016

Pages 280 TO 587

HELD AT THE COMMUNITY HALL

CAMBRIDGE BAY, NUNAVUT

VOLUME 2

BOARD MEMBERS

Daniel Shewchuk	Acting Chair
Simeonie Keenainak	Member
Charlie Inuarak	Member
Caleb Sangoya	Member
David Igutsaq	Member
David Kritterdlik	Member

NUNAVUT WILDLIFE MANAGEMENT BOARD STAFF

Jason Akearok	Executive Director
Eric Kan	Director of Administration
Peter Kydd	Director of Wildlife Management
Erin Keenan	Terrestrial Wildlife Management Biologist
Eric Idlaut	Communications Coordinator
Sheila Oolayou	IQ Coordinator
Michael d'Eça	Legal Counsel
Evie Amagoalik	Interpreter
Leetia Janes	Interpreter
Henry Ohokannoak	Interpreter
Joe Otokiak	Interpreter
Adele Jones	Stenographer

GOVERNMENT OF NUNAVUT

Drikus Gissing	Director of Wildlife
Lisa Marie Leclerc	Kitikmeot Regional Biologist
Mathieu Dumond	Wildlife Manager

GOVERNMENT OF NORTHWEST TERRITORIES

Lynda Yonge	Director of Wildlife
Jan Adamczewski	Wildlife Biologist, Ungulates

NUNAVUT TUNNGAVIK INCORPORATED

Paul Irngaut	Director of Wildlife & Environment
Bert Dean	Assistant Director of Wildlife & Environment

KITIKMEOT REGIONAL WILDLIFE BOARD

Simon Qingnaqtuq	Chair
Ema Qaqqutaq	Regional Coordinator
Eva Ayalik	

KUGLUGTUK HTO

Kevin Klengenber	Secretary-Treasurer
Larry Adjun	Chair
Gustin Adjun	Vice-Chair
Peter Taktogon	Director
Jorgen Bolt	Director

BATHURST HTO

Peter Kapolak	Chair
---------------	-------

Mary Kaniak	Elder
-------------	-------

Joseph Tikhak	Elder
---------------	-------

BAY CHIMO HTO

Connie Kapolak	Chair
----------------	-------

Sam Kapolak	Director
-------------	----------

CAMBRIDGE BAY HTO

Bobby Greenley	Chair
----------------	-------

George Angohiatok	Vice-Chair
-------------------	------------

KITIKMEOT INUIT ASSOCIATION

Attima Hadlari	Vice-President Wildlife & Environment
----------------	--

Paul Emingak	Executive Director
--------------	--------------------

Geoff Clark	Director of Land, Environment & Resources
-------------	--

John Donihee	Legal counsel
--------------	---------------

NORTH SLAVE MÉTIS ALLIANCE

Shin Shiga	Regulatory Analyst
------------	--------------------

WEK'ÈEZHÌI RENEWABLE RESOURCES BOARD

Jonas Lafferty	Board Member
Jody Pellissey	Executive Director

ADVENTURE NORTHWEST LIMITED

Boyd Warner	President
-------------	-----------

PUBLIC

Jimmy Haniliak	Cambridge Bay Elder
James Panioyak	Cambridge Bay Elder
Sam Angohiatok	Elder

I N D E X

PAGE

Opening and Prayer	289
KITIKMEOT REGIONAL WILDLIFE BOARD SUBMISSION (Cont'd)	
Nunavut Wildlife Management Board Questions and Comments	290
Nunavut Wildlife Management Board Staff Questions and Comments	294
Government of Nunavut Questions and Comments	296
Kugluktuk HTO Questions and Comments	297
Nunavut Tunngavik Incorporated Questions and	299
Kitikmeot Inuit Association Questions and Comments	300
North Slave Métis Alliance Questions and Comments	304
KUGLUKTUK HTO SUBMISSION	308
Nunavut Wildlife Management Board Questions and Comments	310
Nunavut Wildlife Management Board Staff Questions and Comments	314
Government of Nunavut Questions and Comments	319
Government of Northwest Territories Questions and Comments	322
Nunavut Tunngavik Incorporated Questions and Comments	327
Kitikmeot Inuit Association Questions and Comments	333

North Slave Métis Alliance Questions and Comments	399
Adventure Northwest Limited Questions and Comments	348
BATHURST HTO SUBMISSION	353
Nunavut Wildlife Management Board Questions and Comments	365
Government of Nunavut Questions and Comments	368
Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife Board Questions and Comments	372
Kugluktuk HTO Questions and Comments	373
Nunavut Tunngavik Incorporated Questions and Comments	381
Kitikmeot Inuit Association Questions and Comments	388
Adventure Northwest Limited Questions and Comments	389
BAY CHIMO HTO	395
Nunavut Wildlife Management Board Questions and Comments	396
Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife Board Questions and Comments	397
Kugluktuk HTO Questions and Comments	398
Nunavut Tunngavik Incorporated Questions and Comments	398
Kitikmeot Inuit Association Questions and Comments	399
Adventure Northwest Limited Questions and Comments	400
CAMBRIDGE BAY HTO SUBMISSION	401
Nunavut Wildlife Management Board Questions and Comments	409
Kugluktuk HTO Questions and Comments	415

Bathurst HTO Questions and Comments	418
Quajimaniliit Questions and Comments	420
QUAJIMANILIIT SUBMISSION	424
Nunavut Wildlife Managements Board Questions and Comments	428
NUNAVUT TUNNGAVIK INCORPORATED SUBMISSION	435
Nunavut Wildlife Management Board Questions and Comments	441
Government of Northwest Territories Questions and Comments	445
Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife Board Questions Comments	452
Kugluktuk HTO Questions and Comments	454
Bathurst HTO Questions and Comments	456
KITIKMEOT INUIT ASSOCIATION SUBMISSION	458
Nunavut Wildlife Management Board Questions and Comments	469
Government of Nunavut Questions and Comments	486
Government of Northwest Territories Questions and Comments	501
Kugluktuk HTO Questions and Comments	504
NORTH SLAVE MÉTIS ALLIANCE SUBMISSION	508
Nunavut Wildlife Management Board Questions and Comments	511
Kugluktuk HTO Questions and Comments	514

Bay Chimo HTO Questions and Comments	517
Nunavut Tunngavik Incorporated Questions and Comments	519
Adventure Northwest Limited Questions and Comments	520
ADVENTURE NORTHWEST LIMITED SUBMISSION	521
Nunavut Wildlife Management Board Questions and Comments	530
Government of Northwest Territories Questions and Comments	531
Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife Board Questions and Comments	536
Kugluktuk HTO Questions and Comments	538
Cambridge Bay HTO Questions and Comments	543
Nunavut Tunngavik Incorporated Questions and Comments	546
Kitikmeot Inuit Association Questions and Comments	548
WEK'ÈEZHÌI RENEWABLE RESOURCES BOARD SUBMISSION	550
Kugluktuk HTO Questions and Comments	558
Kitikmeot Inuit Association Questions and Comments	562
Nunavut Wildlife Management Board Legal Counsel Summary	566
Closing Remarks	576
Stenographer's Certificate	588

1 (OPENING AND PRAYER)

2 THE CHAIR: Good morning, everybody. (No
3 audio transmission) to start the meeting off, I would ask
4 Caleb if he'd say a prayer.

5 (PRAYER)

6 THE CHAIR: As I said, we do have a long day
7 again. As you see, we have a long agenda ahead of us. I
8 think we have another ten interveners to hear from and
9 answers and questions like we did around the table
10 yesterday, so just keep that in mind. And I would ask
11 people that they be brief in their questions and their
12 answers, but relevant, and state what you need to say.

13 With that, we heard from Kitikmeot Regional
14 Wildlife Board yesterday in their presentation. I think
15 you all have a copy of that in front of you if you need to
16 review that. So we're going to start off with there.

17 Simon, I would just ask, we all heard your
18 presentation, do you have anything else to add to your
19 presentation at this point, or else we'll start going
20 around the table for questions to you. Thank you.

21 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: Thank you, Mr. Chair. We have
22 nothing to add.

23 THE CHAIR: Thank you. We'll start off first
24 by the Board Members. Is there any questions for Kitikmeot
25 Regional Wildlife Board?

1 NUNAVUT WILDLIFE MANAGEMENT BOARD QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

2 THE CHAIR: Go ahead, Charlie.

3 MR. INUARAK: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

4 My question: The Nunavut government presented
5 their request for a TAH recommendation on Bathurst caribou.
6 My question is to the Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife Board, as
7 an organization, have you worked with the Nunavut
8 government to come up with this consensus to recommend a
9 TAH for caribou in Bathurst? Have you done consultation or
10 any meetings with GN to come up with this number?

11 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Charlie.

12 Simon.

13 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: Thank you. Simon Qingnaqtuq
14 Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife Board.

15 The Nunavut government -- we have met with
16 Nunavut government on Bathurst caribou, but there haven't
17 been any consultations on total allowable harvest
18 recommendations, although we met about the Bathurst
19 caribou. And, as I recall, we haven't really sat down with
20 the Nunavut government on consultation, although we have
21 met with different organizations from GNWT. Thank you.

22 THE CHAIR: Okay. Charlie.

23 MR. INUARAK: My other question: The
24 recommendation put forth is a very low number. Have you
25 considered using the Nunavut Land Claims Agreement for a

1 subsistence harvesting? Because Inuit have the right to
2 harvest for a basic needs level for subsistence, and is the
3 recommended total allowable harvest based on that basic
4 needs level for Inuit under the Land Claim Agreement?

5 Thank you.

6 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Charlie.

7 Simon.

8 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

9 Simon Qingnaqtuq, Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife
10 Board.

11 And I have been trying to meet with the
12 Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife Board, but it's sometimes
13 really hard to get together. Sometimes we can't get a
14 quorum to meet, and although I've been trying to keep them
15 informed at the Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife Board on the
16 proposed TAH that is being recommended, Kugluktuk community
17 have been part of that wildlife board discussion. We are
18 informing the communities and consulting with the
19 communities about this total allowable harvest
20 recommendation. Thank you.

21 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Simon.

22 Any other questions from the Board? Caleb.

23 MR. SANGOYA: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

24 According to the written submissions, they will
25 recommend this TAH according to the Inuit qaujimajatuqangit

1 and the submissions from the Nunavut government. Did they
2 consult with you and try to get information on Inuit
3 qaujimajatuqangit?

4 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Caleb.

5 Simon.

6 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Simon
7 Qingnaqtuq, Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife Board.

8 Yes, we met on the caribou herd on Bathurst. We
9 tried to get information from Elders, Qaujimaniliit, about
10 IQ.

11 I hope that answered your question.

12 MR. SANGOYA: No. What I was asking is, the
13 recommendation from the Nunavut government, is it based on
14 Inuit qaujimajatuqangit? The recommendation by GN, do you
15 agree with that?

16 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: Thank you.

17 In Nunavut we base our decision as a board from
18 Article 5, and I have been trying to -- I will be meeting
19 with the board on this issue.

20 THE CHAIR: Thank you.

21 Caleb.

22 MR. SANGOYA: Mr. Chairman, am I understanding
23 correctly that you agree with that total allowable harvest
24 that is recommended?

25 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Caleb.

1 Simon.

2 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

3 Simon Qingnaqtuq, Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife
4 Board.

5 The total allowable harvest recommended in
6 Kitikmeot, Ekaluktutiak, Kugluktuk, Bathurst; we don't
7 agree with the total allowable harvest recommendation for
8 this reason: The Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife Board should
9 have the authority for allotment. That's why we don't
10 agree with it.

11 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Simon.

12 David.

13 MR. KRITTERDLIK: David Kritterdlik, Board Member
14 for NWMB.

15 My question: We understand you don't agree with
16 the total allowable harvest recommendation, and --
17 Kugluktuk, Ekaluktutiak, Bay Chimo, Bathurst communities --
18 all the communities were not aware of this recommended TAH.
19 So you don't agree with it because there was no
20 consultation? Thank you.

21 THE CHAIR: Thank you, David.

22 Simon.

23 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: Simon Qingnaqtuq, Kitikmeot
24 Regional Wildlife Board.

25 Yes. This total allowable harvest

1 recommendation, we don't agree with it at Kitikmeot
2 Regional Wildlife Board because Kugluktuk, Ekaluktutiak,
3 Bay Chimo, and Bathurst were not aware of it.

4 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Simon.

5 Any other questions from Board Members? None
6 that I see.

7 Staff, Peter.

8 NUNAVUT WILDLIFE MANAGEMENT BOARD STAFF QUESTIONS AND
9 COMMENTS

10 MR. KYDD: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

11 Thank you, Simon, for your submission. It's
12 very helpful for our hearing process.

13 I just have a couple of questions to try and
14 provide a little more clarity on the submission. In the
15 second paragraph, it states that the Kitikmeot Regional
16 Wildlife Board doesn't agree with a TAH because it would be
17 very negative right now for many reasons. Would you be
18 able to provide a few of those reasons as to why the TAH
19 would be negative?

20 Thank you.

21 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Peter.

22 Simon.

23 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: Thank you. Simon from Kitikmeot
24 Regional Wildlife Board.

25 The reason for that is that the Kitikmeot

1 Regional Wildlife Board feel that the reason for that is we
2 been attacked. We weren't very prepared for that, and the
3 reason for that is on the second paragraph there states
4 development of community-based management plan. That's one
5 reason why we are not in agreement with that total
6 allowable terms.

7 I hope that answers your question.

8 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Simon.

9 Peter.

10 MR. KYDD: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

11 Thank you, Simon. Yeah, that helps.

12 Another quick question in regards to the
13 management plan. I understand that the management plan is
14 not fully developed, but do you have any indication of
15 whether there would be harvesting restrictions included in
16 that plan? Or maybe just any context as to what the
17 management plan will be. If there's any information on
18 that, that would be greatly helpful, too. Thank you.

19 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Peter.

20 Simon.

21 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: Simon Qingnaqtuq from Kitikmeot
22 Regional Wildlife Board.

23 Yes, we have plans on restrictions, and to
24 educate that there are restrictions in the region. That's
25 the plan that Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife Board has

1 planned. But as I said, we have to discuss that further,
2 more.

3 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Simon.

4 Any other questions from staff or legal counsel?

5 No? Okay. Thank you very much. That's the Board's
6 questions.

7 The next would be the Government of Nunavut. Is
8 there any questions for the Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife
9 Board? Drikus?

10 GOVERNMENT OF NUNAVUT QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

11 MR. GISSING: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

12 No questions. Just a comment that we do not
13 agree that there was no consultation. There's been
14 extensive consultations over the last number of years, and
15 we provided the record of consultation to the Board. So
16 you have access to those consultations and the opinions of
17 the various communities on our consultations.

18 Thank you.

19 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Drikus. It's a
20 comment.

21 Simon, you can reply if you want to or not. You
22 don't have to. Thank you.

23 The next round of questions, then, go to the
24 GNWT.

25 MS. YONGE: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

1 Lynda Yonge for the GNWT. We have no questions.

2 Thank you for the presentation.

3 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much.

4 The next round of questions going to the

5 Kugluktuk HTO.

6 KUGLUKTUK HTO QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

7 MR. L. ADJUN: Thank you very much, Mr. Chair.

8 Larry Adjun, Kugluktuk chairman. As Simon

9 stated, we are working on the Bathurst co-management or

10 integrated caribou management plan.

11 We did not have enough time to fully integrate a

12 system or put a plan in place due to the fact that NIRB

13 hearings were going on with TMAC and Sabina, and we didn't

14 have time allotted. That's why we wrote submissions to

15 adjourn this meeting to September.

16 So for the time being, Kugluktuk HTO was the

17 only proponent that wrote a submission or a draft plan for

18 the Bluenose East which I'll be presenting in the next

19 couple of days. But due to the time frame, as Simon said,

20 we did not have enough time to write a full submission in

21 for the draft, but we are working on it with the four HTO

22 members, along with Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife Board and

23 Simon's board or along with our chairman Simon Qingnaqtuq.

24 Quana. Just a statement.

25 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much, Larry. Is

1 there any direct questions, then, from Kugluktuk HTO to
2 Simon? Go ahead.

3 MR. L. ADJUN: None whatsoever, Mr. Chairman.

4 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry.

5 Okay. Any questions from Bathurst HTO to the
6 Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife Board?

7 MR. BOLT: Thank you, Mr. Chair, and good
8 morning to everybody. No questions.

9 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much.

10 Bay Chimo HTO, any questions?

11 MR. P. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chair. No
12 questions at this time. Thank you.

13 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Peter. Cambridge Bay
14 HTO?

15 MR. GREENLEY: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

16 Bob Greenley from the HTO. We have no questions
17 at this time. Thank you.

18 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Bobby.

19 Any Elders representing the four hunters and
20 trappers organization have any questions? If not.

21 MR. BOLT: We don't have any questions at the
22 moment from Kugluktuk HTO.

23 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jorgen. All right. If
24 not, we'll carry on.

25 NTI, any questions for Kitikmeot Regional

1 Wildlife Board? Paul.

2 NUNAVUT TUNNGAVIK INCORPORATED QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

3 MR. IRNGAUT: Good morning. Paul Irngaut, NTI.

4 You mentioned that you did not agree with the
5 TAH, and you're saying that there was lack of
6 consultations, but at the same time, the government is
7 stating that they have done a lot of consultations. Is it
8 my understanding that the issue of TAH was not mentioned
9 during those consultations? Is that your understanding?

10 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Paul.

11 Simon.

12 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: Simon Qingnaqtuq, Kitikmeot
13 Regional Wildlife Board.

14 We do have consultations with the GN, but as far
15 as I'm concerned, there may be a misunderstanding. But as
16 far as I know, there was no TAH issue with those
17 consultations.

18 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Simon.

19 Paul.

20 MR. IRNGAUT: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Paul
21 Irngaut, Tunngavik.

22 One last question. The TAH that is recommended,
23 of 30, if that was to be implemented, would you suggest
24 that all the TAH go to Inuit?

25 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Paul.

1 Simon.

2 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: Thank you. Simon Qingnaqtuq,
3 Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife Board.

4 If the total allowable harvest was implemented,
5 yes, I believe that we would have to follow the
6 restrictions and the rules.

7 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Simon.

8 Paul. Taima. Bert? Okay.

9 Our next questionnaires are from the Kitikmeot
10 Inuit Association. Geoff.

11 KITIKMEOT INUIT ASSOCIATION QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

12 MR. CLARK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Geoff
13 Clark, Kitikmeot Inuit Association. KIA's executive
14 director would like to ask a question, and then we have a
15 couple other questions of the KRWB.

16 MR. EMINGAK: Paul Emingak, Executive Director
17 for Kitikmeot Inuit Association. Just a process question
18 to Simon.

19 In your written statement you indicated you were
20 not prepared to submit a submission to this hearing. I'm
21 just wondering if the Kitikmeot Wildlife Regional
22 Organization has funds to do such submissions with the help
23 from other entities.

24 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Paul.

25 Simon.

1 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

2 I don't fully understand. Could he clarify that
3 question, please?

4 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Simon.

5 Paul, do you want to rephrase your question.

6 Thank you.

7 MR. EMINGAK: Thank you.

8 My question is, does Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife
9 Organization have funds to prepare reports with the help of
10 other consultants or other entities?

11 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Paul.

12 Simon.

13 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

14 Simon Qingnaqtuq from Kitikmeot Regional
15 Wildlife Board. Yes, we are prepared. With help from
16 other organizations, we are prepared, yes.

17 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Simon.

18 Paul.

19 MR. EMINGAK: Just a supplementary,

20 Mr. Chairman.

21 I'm just wondering if the Kitikmeot Regional
22 Wildlife Organization had requested any assistance from
23 either NTI or KIA or others to prepare a submission.

24 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Paul.

25 Simon.

1 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

2 Simon Qingnaqtuq from Kitikmeot Regional
3 Wildlife Board.

4 Yes, we have asked KIA.

5 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Simon.

6 Paul.

7 MR. EMINGAK: Thank you, Simon. That's all my
8 questions.

9 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thank you very much. Back
10 to you, Geoff.

11 Thank you.

12 MR. CLARK: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

13 Thank you for the presentation. As the KRWB
14 chair, in the meeting minutes for the January 14th-15th
15 meeting, the KRWB chair was listed as the co-chair of the
16 meeting in January 14-15, 2016. As the co-chair, did you
17 assist with developing the agenda of the meeting, or were
18 you just provided the agenda like everybody else was when
19 you got to the meeting?

20 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Geoff.

21 Simon.

22 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

23 Simon Qingnaqtuq from the Kitikmeot Regional
24 Wildlife Board. I was just given the itinerary just like
25 everybody else.

1 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Simon.
2 Geoff.
3 MR. CLARK: So would it be fair to say that
4 you would not have known anything about the TAH proposal in
5 advance of the meeting or in advance of you being asked to
6 be the co-chair of the meeting? Would that be fair to say?
7 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Geoff.
8 Simon.
9 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: Simon Qingnaqtuq, Kitikmeot
10 Regional Wildlife Board. That's correct, yes.
11 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Simon.
12 Geoff.
13 MR. CLARK: Thank you, Mr. Chair. That's all
14 our questions. Oh, Attima has a question.
15 THE CHAIR: Thank you. Attima.
16 MR. HADLARI: Attima Hadlari. I just have one
17 question. With the consultation that took place from GN
18 with the Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife Board, were there
19 community hunters? Were the communities approached as a
20 consultation, or just with the board itself? Thank you.
21 THE CHAIR: Thank you Attima.
22 Simon.
23 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
24 Simon Qingnaqtuq Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife
25 Board. When we had that consultation, there was hunters

1 from the community. Same with the Elders that were
2 attending that consultation.

3 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Simon.

4 Attima.

5 MR. HADLARI: To my understanding now, so the
6 consultation took place in all the communities? Thank you.

7 THE CHAIR: Thank you Attima.

8 Simon.

9 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

10 Simon Qingnaqtuq, Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife
11 Board. We have the consultation hearings in Cambridge Bay,
12 but there was some people from Kugluktuk that were
13 attending that consultation.

14 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Simon.

15 Okay. Thank you very much, KIA.

16 We will move on to the North Slave Métis
17 Alliance. Shin, any questions?

18 NORTH SLAVE MÉTIS ALLIANCE QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

19 MR. SHIGA: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Shin Shiga,
20 North Slave Métis Alliance.

21 Thank you, Simon, for the presentation. I have
22 hopefully one question. I just want to understand the
23 capacity that KRWB has because I know how it's like to work
24 for a small organization. I'm the only staff, and I'm
25 always overloaded with work.

1 So my first question is, are there other
2 management plans that your Board has developed before and
3 you're currently implementing?

4 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Shin.

5 Simon.

6 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

7 Simon Qingnaqtuq Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife
8 Board. Yes, we do have other plans in place, if I answered
9 you correctly.

10 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Simon.

11 Shin.

12 MR. SHIGA: Thank you, Simon. Shin Shiga,
13 Slave Métis Alliance. Do any of those plans include
14 harvest restrictions?

15 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Shin.

16 Simon.

17 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

18 Simon Qingnaqtuq from Kitikmeot Regional
19 Wildlife Board. Yes, we have. We have started a plan in
20 place, and we are trying to get the harvest restriction in
21 place.

22 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Simon.

23 Shin.

24 MR. SHIGA: Shin Shiga, Métis Alliance. May I
25 ask which species those restrictions are applied on?

1 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Shin.

2 Simon.

3 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: Thank you, Mr. Chair. I have to
4 get him to clarify that question.

5 Could you please repeat your question?

6 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Simon.

7 Shin, go ahead.

8 MR. SHIGA: Shin Shiga, Slave Métis Alliance.

9 What I'm trying to understand is if there are management
10 plans that you currently implement on species other than
11 Bathurst caribou that has harvest restrictions. I want to
12 understand, because you're proposing to develop a
13 management plan along with KIA and others that includes
14 harvest restriction of Bathurst caribou. I want to
15 understand if there are other examples, other species where
16 it's been succesful. Thank you.

17 THE CHAIR: Thank you for the clarification,
18 Shin.

19 Simon.

20 MR. QAQQUTAQ: Paul Qaqqutaq, KRWB.

21 I don't think the initial question, if we have
22 any other management plans, was fully understood by the
23 chair. The KRWB does not have any other management plans
24 in place with any other caribou herds, but we are in the
25 initial stages of developing with the Kugluktuk Hunters and

1 Trappers Organization harvest restriction plans in the
2 future.

3 There was not a lot of work done on our part,
4 but Kugluktuk was in the stages of developing their own
5 harvest restrictions plan, if you may. And I think that
6 was with Dolphin and Union caribou. Thank you.

7 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much.

8 Shin.

9 MR. SHIGA: Thank you. That's all my
10 questions.

11 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much.

12 Okay. We'll move on. The next is Adventure
13 Northwest Limited, I think Boyd.

14 MR. WARNER: Thank you, Mr. Chair. And, Simon,
15 thank you for the presentation and clarification. We have
16 no questions.

17 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much.

18 Okay. Then the last questioner would be the
19 public. Is there anybody in the public gallery that would
20 like to ask questions of the Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife
21 Board? There is none.

22 Thank you very much, Simon, for your
23 presentation and, Ema, for answering our questions.

24 We'll move on now to Kugluktuk HTO for your
25 presentation and submission. Larry.

1 KUGLUKTUK HTO SUBMISSION

2 MR. L. ADJUN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

3 We have no submissions, but just a statement
4 that we sent prior to this meeting. The submissions we
5 have will be for Bluenose East for the next part of the
6 meetings on caribou, so I'll just read a statement that we
7 have submitted. This also includes Bluenose and the
8 Bathurst part of the meeting. So if I may.

9 THE CHAIR: Yeah, if you have it all in one
10 presentation, we might ask you to do it again at the next
11 hearing, but go ahead. Is it very lengthy?

12 MR. L. ADJUN: Thanks for the warmup.

13 Whereas Nunavut Wildlife Management Board (NWMB)
14 has given notice that it intends to hold hearings in
15 Cambridge Bay in June to consider the imposition of total
16 allowable harvest for the Bathurst caribou and Bluenose
17 East caribou herds.

18 And whereas the Kugluktuk Hunters and Trappers
19 Organization Association has not been adequately or fairly
20 consulted with respect to the wildlife management
21 information about the populations of these herds held by
22 the GN.

23 And whereas the timing of that Nunavut Wildlife
24 Management Board hearings leaves virtually no opportunity
25 for the Kugluktuk Hunters and Trappers Organization to work

1 with the GN to address options for management of the
2 caribou herds.

3 And whereas Kugluktuk Hunters and Trappers
4 Organization prefers to address the decline of the Bathurst
5 and Bluenose East herds using measures such as predator
6 control and the HTO authorities under Article 5 of the
7 Nunavut Land Claims Agreement.

8 And whereas Kugluktuk Hunters and Trappers
9 Organization are convinced that community-based wildlife
10 management initiatives will be more effective and
11 acceptable. (There's no coffee here, sorry.)

12 And whereas Kugluktuk Hunters and Trappers
13 Organization and Kitikmeot Inuit Association (KIA) plan to
14 develop a community-based plan for caribou management as an
15 alternative to a TAH:

16 Now, it is therefore resolved by the Kugluktuk
17 Hunters and Trappers Organization that: The Nunavut
18 Wildlife Management Board hearings should be postponed to
19 allow better KHTO consultation and collaboration with the
20 GN; the imposition of the TAH on the Bathurst and Bluenose
21 East caribou herds is not acceptable except as a last
22 resort; the KHTA or KHTO intends to use its powers under
23 section 5.7.3 of the Nunavut Land Claims Agreement and
24 increase predator control efforts to manage the Bluenose
25 East caribou herd; the KHTO will work with KIA to develop a

1 community-based and controlled management plan for the
2 Bluenose East caribou; and finally, the KHTO, KHTO and KIA
3 and the Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife Board should work
4 together to develop local solutions to managing caribou.

5 And that's it.

6 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much, Larry.

7 Okay. With that, I'll open questions up to
8 Board Members. Caleb.

9 NUNAVUT WILDLIFE MANAGEMENT BOARD QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

10 MR. SANGOYA: The Kugluktuk, have you worked
11 with any traditional knowledge to go forward? According to
12 the Inuit knowledge, do you know that the caribou tend to
13 cross boundaries, or are you just following the
14 Government's survey results? Thank you.

15 THE CHAIR: Continue, Larry.

16 MR. L. ADJUN: Yes, IQ. We have a lot of Iakmiut
17 (phonetic) that live or to used to live in Contwoyto Lake,
18 and back then, traditional knowledge states there was a lot
19 of trades, trading between the Indians and the Inuit back
20 then, so we do have a lot of knowledge, as one of my
21 directors, states that he was brought up inside Contwoyto
22 Lake. So we are using a lot of IQ to be part of our
23 management plan.

24 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry.

25 Caleb.

1 MR. SANGOYA: A second question. What about the
2 total allowable harvest that is trying to be imposed? Has
3 people from Kugluktuk decided as to, or are they just going
4 to be agreeing with the total allowable harvest
5 recommendation or have you talked about it?

6 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Caleb.
7 Larry.

8 MR. L. ADJUN: Just to give a little quick
9 background, we have a high turnover rate for the HTO at the
10 moment. We're on our third secretary manager, so we have
11 not been able to implement a public meeting with regards to
12 the caribou issues. And with all the meetings that have
13 gone on with the caribou, we have not been able to hold a
14 public meeting, nor have we been able to hold an AGM.

15 But, at the moment, we're just flying by the
16 seat of our pants and trying to be accountable for what we
17 do or say here.

18 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry.
19 Any other questions? Charlie.

20 MR. INUARAK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

21 I have several questions to you. Do you look
22 after the people from Kugluktuk? Because you're near that
23 area, that I understand. You're the managers. I know
24 you're going to be involved with development of the
25 management plan.

1 And according to what you know, the GN's
2 proposal and the GNWT submission, they're stating that the
3 caribou are declining, that the Bathurst herd is declining.
4 Is that true according to what you see? What is that like,
5 according to your knowledge? Are they declining, or are
6 they not declining?

7 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Charlie.

8 Larry.

9 MR. L. ADJUN: Qujannamiik, itsivautaaq.

10 We've been involved with the last caribou aerial
11 survey last year, and prior years it was also done with the
12 GN and GNWT, but we are taking their information.

13 And for the HTO part, yes, we do feel there is a
14 decline in some areas of our three caribou populations that
15 we have to live with in Kugluktuk. I'll just state the
16 herds names. There's the Bathurst, Bluenose East and the
17 Dolphin Union.

18 Yes, we do notice there are some decline in some
19 of the herds. Whether it is significant or not, we are
20 working in collaboration with the GN. We have submitted a
21 few -- what's the word -- I'm sorry. We have given GN
22 permission to collar I believe it's 20 or 25 more Dolphin
23 Union caribou collars this year. We gave them, I believe
24 it was 25, if I'm correct, last year also. So we are
25 trying to work closely with the GN to get more information

1 on the Dolphin Union herd that is supposedly declining
2 also.

3 I hope that answers your question.

4 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry.

5 Charlie?

6 I have a question. I would like to get the
7 feeling of the Kugluktuk HTO on how you feel about
8 consultation and whether adequate consultation was done in
9 regards to this herd. And just from my understanding --
10 and correct me if I'm wrong, Larry -- but I think you're
11 fortunate in Kugluktuk to have the regional office of
12 Department of Environment there with research staff right
13 in your community. Is that helpful to you, too? Do you
14 have a very good working relationship, then, on a daily
15 basis with those people? Thank you.

16 MR. L. ADJUN: Qujannamiik, Mr. Chairman.

17 Yes, we feel the information was given, but
18 sometimes it's only given firsthand, as the chairman might
19 have some information, and then I'd have to relay that to
20 our HTO board. But having the regional office does help
21 the Kugluktuk HTO. I don't have to hunt them down. I know
22 where they live.

23 Yes, we are trying to work hand in hand with the
24 Department of Environment. There's a lot of issues as in
25 what type of consultation have arisen, but like I stated,

1 due to the fact of our high turnover rate with the
2 secretary-manager position with the HTO, we have not been
3 able to hold an AGM; and part of our AGM is to give this
4 information to the public.

5 I hope that answers your question.

6 THE CHAIR: Thank you, very much, Larry.

7 Yeah.

8 Any other questions from the Board? Staff?

9 Peter?

10 NUNAVUT WILDLIFE MANAGEMENT BOARD STAFF QUESTIONS AND
11 COMMENTS

12 MR. KYDD: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

13 And thank you, Larry, for your statement. I've
14 got a couple questions. The first kind of gets to the
15 general knowledge in the community of your caribou herds
16 over time, but speaking specifically to Bathurst, would you
17 be able to give any indication of changes that you guys
18 have seen over time with, you know, calving grounds,
19 migration routes, stuff like that that you've seen over the
20 long term, maybe the last 25 or 30 years? Thank you.

21 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Peter.

22 Larry.

23 MR. L. ADJUN: Yes, we have seen decline in the
24 Bathurst herd. In the '70s they used to winter around
25 Kugluktuk. I believe it was done -- yeah, I believe they

1 wintered around Kugluktuk. I know in 1970s they spent the
2 winter there, and I believe, in that one month alone, 1,200
3 wolves were harvested -- just in that one month alone --
4 when the caribou were there.

5 But, yes, we are seeing a decline in the
6 Bathurst population. It's not as big as it was back then.
7 And for, I believe the last eight years, we have not seen
8 the herd come as close as it did this winter. We've had
9 the herd seen around the Putulik area. So the Kugluktumiut
10 have been able to go to the Putulik area which is a kind of
11 ways to harvest along the coastline to harvest the Dolphin
12 Union, and this early spring to harvest from the Bluenose
13 East.

14 But I forgot to mention, too, our chairman here,
15 earlier, that we have a close relationship with the DoE
16 wildlife department -- wildlife officers, I should say. We
17 try to give and encourage hunters to give their information
18 of animals seen, animals caught, sex, gender, age, as
19 information also goes to their database. This, along with
20 the muskox, which has helped out the muskox population,
21 higher quota for the Kugluktuk area as we now have to
22 subsist more on the muskox due to the caribou population
23 getting lower and getting further to access.

24 I hope I didn't elaborate too much on that.

25 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

1 Peter.

2 MR. KYDD: Thank, Mr. Chairman.

3 Thanks, Larry. No, you didn't elaborate too
4 much. We like as much information as we can get in these
5 settings.

6 So I understand that you have been seeing a
7 decline over the years, and the NWMB has received
8 correspondence from Kugluktuk HTO in the past regarding
9 concerns with the decline of Bathurst and Bluenose East and
10 wanting to see some harvest management. Whether it's
11 community-led or government-led, I think the concerns were
12 valid that there are declines and it's concerning to the
13 community.

14 So are you able to speak to or indicate if there
15 were any harvest management measures prior to the GN
16 initially indicating that they were considering a total
17 allowable harvest? I think the first one would have been a
18 year and a half ago, the 300 or the 100 that was indicated
19 back then. Thank you.

20 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Peter.

21 Larry.

22 MR. L. ADJUN: Yes, Kugluktuk has been proactive
23 in implementing some of its own initiatives for the
24 management of the caribou. I'll give an example.

25 In 2007, when the first decline started, we had

1 a joint partnership with an outfitter, Webb Outfitting
2 Limited. He voluntarily stopped his sports hunts out of
3 two herds, Dolphin Union and the Bathurst herd. The
4 Bathurst herd sport hunts were done in Contwoyto Lake, and
5 Dolphin Union herds were done at Nuluktuk (phonetic) on
6 Victoria Island.

7 And on that point also, the HTO had initiated a
8 total ban on community caribou harvest subsistence hunts --
9 or commercial hunts, I should say. And we have also
10 initiated that no caribou sales be done for sale or barter
11 with other communities, or a tag or a caribou being sold to
12 transients within the community.

13 It's kind of frowned upon within the community
14 to sell caribou, caribou meat, back then as our tradition
15 is to feed the needy. And as part of that initiative, the
16 Kugluktuk HTO has the country food program.

17 We get the funding from ED&T for 30,000 a year
18 or annually to hunt muskox or other animals except caribou.
19 We pay the hunter 'X' amount of money to harvest a muskox,
20 bring it to the HTO. The HTO distributes it to the needy
21 and to the Elderly within the community and to the people
22 that cannot hunt these other animals. All these other
23 animals include moose, muskox, geese, seals, fish, and
24 whatever else we can get.

25 I hope that answers your question.

1 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much, Larry.

2 Peter.

3 MR. KYDD: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

4 Thanks, Larry. Yeah, that's great. And is it
5 safe to assume that these harvest measures, harvest
6 management measures, that the HTO is implementing on their
7 own are either the ones that will go directly into the
8 management plan or something very similar? And, if not, do
9 you know what those harvest management measures would be
10 that are going to be in the management plan developed
11 jointly between the Hunters and Trappers Organization and
12 KIA? Thank you.

13 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Peter.

14 Larry.

15 MR. L. ADJUN: At this moment, I can't comment
16 because we don't have the plan for the Bathurst joint
17 management plan in place yet. I can only speak on
18 Kugluktuk's Bluenose East management plan, but I can't
19 speak on that because it's not the time yet.

20 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry.

21 Peter.

22 MR. KYDD: Thanks, Mr. Chairman.

23 Thank you, Larry. That's good. We're
24 definitely interested in hearing what will be included in
25 those management plans, but at this point, I don't have any

1 further questions. Thank you.

2 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Peter. Legal counsel?

3 No?

4 Okay. The GN, any questions for Kugluktuk? Go
5 ahead, Mathieu.

6 GOVERNMENT OF NUNAVUT QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

7 MR. DUMOND: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

8 Maybe just a statement first to emphasize on the
9 work that Kugluktuk HTO has done over the years in trying
10 to address the situation. And at the same time, also to
11 emphasize that we have been working together in different
12 forms of consultations and working together basically for
13 the past ten years. I mean, we've worked together before
14 that, but since the early sign of decline of those herds in
15 2005-2006. And this collaboration has resulted, like Larry
16 was describing, to a lot of local initiatives that I think
17 helped in the situation.

18 And then the question is, is, you know, we've
19 been talking together and working together for all those
20 years, and there's a lot of good initiatives that came out
21 of it, but the herds are still declining. And I know your
22 plan is not developed fully yet and all that, but maybe to
23 try to have a sense on how you see the harvest part being
24 managed at the local level in the absence of a TAH or
25 regulations assisting with that, if you have at least a

1 rough idea. If not, that's fine, like.

2 But I just wanted mainly to emphasize all the
3 good work that has been done so far and recognize that from
4 the HTO, like, that the HTO did it. And just remind people
5 that we did have work together and knew about the situation
6 for the past ten years, and tried to address it together,
7 and I think that was a good way to go about it. It's just
8 that the decline is continuing, and it's hard to find new
9 solutions to really address other than some harsh decision.

10 Thank you.

11 THE CHAIR: Thank you for those comments,
12 Matthew.

13 Larry.

14 MR. L. ADJUN: Sorry, I never got to understand
15 the first part of the question. Sorry.

16 THE CHAIR: Okay. Larry.

17 Go ahead, Mathieu.

18 MR. DUMOND: It wasn't as much of a -- I mean,
19 there was a question. The question was if you have any
20 details or ideas on how you going to implement in a plan or
21 implement a plan to have some kind of restrictions on the
22 harvest, and if you can give us some details, a little bit,
23 or some rough ideas of how you envision that aspect of the
24 plan.

25 And like I said, I recognize that you said it's

1 at the early stage. And, if you don't, that's fine. But
2 if you have, it would be interesting to hear.

3 Thank you.

4 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mathieu.

5 Larry.

6 MR. L. ADJUN: Quick question. Is this on
7 Bluenose East, or are we talking about the Bathurst?

8 THE CHAIR: Mathieu.

9 MR. DUMOND: Well, we're still on the Bathurst,
10 I guess, and my question is regarding the Bathurst more
11 specifically here. We can come back to the Bluenose East
12 tomorrow, I guess.

13 THE CHAIR: Yeah, I think what you want is
14 just a general overview of how Kugluktuk HTO envisions that
15 some of the things that might be in the plan to assist in
16 the recovery of caribou.

17 MR. L. ADJUN: Thanks for the statement.

18 Well, from the HTO side, for the Bluenose East
19 plan, we are talking sex, gender hunters, seasonal hunts.
20 Whether or not they're going to be implemented in the four
21 combined HTO hunts is a different story. Ideas thrown
22 around are sports hunts, residents' hunts, aboriginal hunts
23 only. Those are only ideas, and I can't say anything else;
24 otherwise, I might get in trouble with my other HTO
25 colleagues.

1 Maybe just for another star from the DoE side, I
2 stated before that wildlife office takes information, or
3 the regional wildlife office takes information from all
4 hunts from the local hunter, and with that combined
5 information, we have information from muskox, grizzly bear
6 quotas. And from my knowledge from what he told me, back
7 then it was at 60 percent information gathering from the
8 local hunters and trappers organization. But within the
9 past year, due to the caribou declines, that percentage
10 from the wildlife officer's point of view has gone up.

11 So the information that Kugluktuk has, in regard
12 to the more recorded information from the hunters, from
13 local hunters, is giving GN a good side on the HTO book for
14 having all the information readily from the hunters. So
15 that's just going to be a statement from me to the DoE.

16 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry. Thank you very
17 much.

18 Any other questions from Department of
19 Environment?

20 MR. DUMOND: No further questions. Thank you
21 for the presentation and the answer, and no further
22 questions. Thank you.

23 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mathieu.

24 We'll move on, then, to the GNWT. Lynda.

25 GOVERNMENT OF NORTHWEST TERRITORIES QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

1 MS. YONGE: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

2 Lynda Yonge from the GNWT. I do have a couple
3 of questions. We're certainly interested in following how
4 these community plans develop. We're working with some of
5 our communities in a similar capacity on some of these
6 herds.

7 So, Larry, you talked about relying more on
8 predator management and predator control rather than a TAH,
9 and I'm wondering if at this point you have any ideas about
10 what that might look like and what methods you might use.

11 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lynda.

12 Larry.

13 MR. L. ADJUN: Just initially brought up that we
14 will also work on predator initiatives. GNWT has their
15 initiative of I believe the magic number is 800, 850 per
16 carcass or wolf.

17 GN hunters or Nunavut hunters only get about 300
18 to 400 bucks a wolf, dressed, primed, ready for taxidermy.
19 What we're talking about is finding funding from other
20 agencies to bump up our fur that we generally send to fur
21 auctions. All it is, is just a bump-up to further initiate
22 more predator hunting for the local hunters themselves,
23 because the only money that we get is from the sales at the
24 Canadian fur auctions. I hope that answers your question.

25 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry.

1 Lynda.

2 MS. YONGE: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

3 Thank you, Larry. I have, then, two questions
4 about -- so the Bathurst herd is a shared herd. We
5 recognize that what happens in the NWT affects the herd and
6 harvesters here, and the other way around. So I'm just
7 wondering whether you see any role for collaboration or
8 input from any of the aboriginal groups on the NWT side
9 when you're developing these community plans or any
10 exchange of information, any value in that sort of
11 approach.

12 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lynda.

13 Larry, go ahead.

14 MR. L. ADJUN: Yes, we are working with the same
15 principle that Dèline have used or is using.

16 Dèline implemented their management plan right
17 after the last caribou management meeting in Yellowknife, I
18 believe, and it was implemented into your system, so that's
19 a plan we try to use, something similar to that that the
20 Kugluktuk HTO will implement or try to element on the
21 Bathurst -- I'm sorry -- Bluenose East. I'm getting a few
22 meetings ahead of my time here.

23 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry.

24 Lynda.

25 MS. YONGE: Thank you.

1 Lynda Yonge, GNWT. My last question is about
2 the Bathurst advisory committee. So in our presentation
3 yesterday we did talk about this advisory committee that
4 has representatives from all the various users groups,
5 including the Kugluktuk HTO.

6 And I'm wondering if you see value in a role for
7 an advisory committee like that. Given that you're working
8 towards a community management, I'm just wondering how you
9 see that advisory committee; what kind of role it might
10 have and if it might be useful in this context.

11 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lynda.

12 Larry.

13 MR. L. ADJUN: Yes, itsivautaaq.

14 We do have two members from the HTO from
15 Kugluktuk Angoniatit Association Limited -- I'm sorry,
16 KAA sitting on the Bathurst advisory committee, and for any
17 information or any subcommittees that do arise will help in
18 our plan to set up a management plan for the Bathurst side.
19 As you stated, we already have two members from the
20 advisory committee, and maybe I'll let one of my directors
21 who's already on the advisory committee speak on that.

22 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry. Go ahead,
23 Peter.

24 MR. TAKTOGON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

25 I've been involved with the Bathurst working

1 group for NWT for the last few years. Next meeting is next
2 week.

3 We share a lot of information, and from the
4 information and Kugluktuk HTO's working closely trying to
5 implement what Northwest Territories is trying to do for
6 the predators and whatever for the future. Thank you.

7 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Peter.

8 Lynda?

9 MS. YONGE: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. No
10 further questions.

11 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much.

12 Okay. We'll move on. The next is Kitikmeot
13 Regional Wildlife Board. Simon, do you have any questions
14 for Kugluktuk?

15 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Simon
16 Qingnaqtuq from Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife Board. No
17 questions at this time.

18 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thank you.

19 Bathurst Inlet, any questions?

20 MR. S. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

21 Sam Kapolak, Burnside HTO. We have no questions
22 at this time.

23 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Sam.

24 Bay Chimo HTO, any questions?

25 MR. P. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chair. No

1 questions.

2 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Peter.

3 Cambridge Bay HTO.

4 MR. GREENLEY: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Bobby

5 Greenley, EHTO. No questions at this time. Thank you.

6 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Bobby.

7 Is there any Elders that have any questions of
8 Kugluktuk HTO -- that represent any of the Hunters and
9 Trappers Organization? I don't see none here right now,
10 anyway. We'll carry on.

11 NTI, do you have questions for Kugluktuk? Paul,
12 go ahead.

13 NUNAVUT TUNNGAVIK INCORPORATED QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

14 MR. IRNGAUT: Qujannamiik, itsivautaaq.

15 Thank you for your comments. I have a question.
16 You speak about capacity in your HTO. Is it because of the
17 capacity that the public meetings were conducted by GN on
18 Bathurst herd on the TAH?

19 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Paul.

20 Larry.

21 MR. L. ADJUN: We've had public meetings in the
22 past with the DoE in Kugluktuk. Kugluktuk hunters or
23 residents of Kugluktuk have always been politically active.

24 And on that sense I forgot to mention, too,
25 Kugluktuk HTO had its 22nd anniversary last week.

1 I'm sorry, I forgot the first part of the
2 question.

3 THE CHAIR: Thanks, Larry.

4 Paul.

5 MR. IRNGAUT: Thank you.

6 Thank you, Larry, for that answer. My question
7 was, with the capacity that you were facing, to your
8 knowledge, did the GN hold public hearings on the TAH of
9 Bathurst Inlet -- Bathurst caribou?

10 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Paul.

11 Larry.

12 MR. L. ADJUN: Yes, they have. But as I stated
13 earlier, due to a high turnover at the HTO secretary-
14 manager level, we have not been able to hold a public AGM
15 or public meeting on the caribou issues at hand.

16 And part of our AGM is to have our financial
17 accountability up to par. Our last secretary-manager was
18 just at the stage of getting all the financial information
19 set for the AGM, but, unfortunately, she accepted a job
20 with the GN, so now we're back to square one again, and we
21 have to train our new secretary- manager to where we want
22 to be. So we're back to square one as of same thing as
23 January. I hope that answers your question.

24 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry. I think that
25 challenge lies with a lot of hunters and trappers

1 organization in Nunavut, just like you explained it.

2 But, Paul, go ahead.

3 MR. IRNGAUT: Thanks, Mr. Chairman.

4 One last question as I asked the same question
5 to KRWB. With the small TAH for Bathurst, what's your
6 feeling? Would you consider that TAH to go to Inuit, all
7 the TAH go to Inuit? Thank you.

8 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Paul.

9 Larry.

10 MR. L. ADJUN: Qujannamiik, itsivautaaq.

11 Yes, I. Under our Land Claim Agreement we are
12 accountable to the public, general public. Voting members
13 are all Inuit, so we would have to consider Inuit first,
14 residents next, and whatever goes down the tree after that.

15 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry.

16 Bert?

17 MR. DEAN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

18 Bert Dean with NTI. Larry, and this is more for
19 all of us, I guess. Could you explain how many different
20 herds of caribou or subpopulations of caribou Kugluktuk
21 harvests from, and any kind of overall picture? Thanks.

22 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Bert.

23 Larry, go ahead.

24 MR. L. ADJUN: Quana, Mr. Dean.

25 Kugluktuk hunts Bluenose East during the spring,

1 late fall on the return back from the Bathurst or Beaufort
2 Sea area of the arctic coast.

3 During the spring and early winter or late --
4 I'm sorry -- late winter we harvest Dolphin Union caribou
5 which migrate from Victoria Island to the mainland. This
6 is early winter. And then during late winter we go down to
7 the napaaqtuq area. That's way down south, Coppermine, and
8 we harvest Bathurst.

9 Oh, yeah, and also, during the winter, when the
10 Bathurst caribou are too far down, we also go towards the
11 Great Bear Lake area, and we harvest from the Bluenose
12 East.

13 But in all these hunting that we do, none of it
14 is funded by any other agencies except out of our own
15 pockets. So you're looking at over 300 bucks for the fuel,
16 I'm guessing under 200 for grub, so you're spending a
17 little close to about 400 or 500 bucks, depending on how
18 far you want to go. So you got to carry about 30 gallons
19 of gas on your sled, and somehow, you got to carry back
20 five. And you try to carry one more caribou back for an
21 Elder or for the needy within the community. And that's
22 how we roll in Kugluktuk.

23 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry.

24 Bert.

25 MR. DEAN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

1 Thank you, Larry. Just expanding on that. So
2 which herd would Kugluktuk depend on the most? Like, which
3 would be the most -- at this time -- and I realize the
4 migrations have changed in different years. Sometimes
5 different herds would be closer or relied upon more, but in
6 the current last few years, which is the most important
7 herd for the community? Thank you.

8 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Bert.

9 Larry.

10 MR. L. ADJUN: Primarily we now harvest from the
11 Dolphin Union and the Bluenose East. Bathurst hasn't --
12 Bathurst herd hasn't come around for, I'm guessing, the
13 last eight, as I stated earlier. So we primarily hunt now
14 from the Dolphin Union and Bluenose East.

15 It all changes with the migration per year, so
16 it's a hit-and-miss if you get one herd or another. Like I
17 stated, for the last eight years or so, the big Bathurst
18 caribou herd hasn't come around to Kugluktuk.

19 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry.

20 Bert.

21 MR. DEAN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

22 Thanks, Larry. So is it fair to say there
23 probably hasn't been any Bathurst caribou harvested in the
24 last eight years, or very few?

25 And I realize this winter, this past winter

1 might be a little bit different, and I know that the
2 Northwest Territories is putting these mobile zones in
3 because the caribou are sort of changing their migration or
4 their movements a bit in the winter. But, again, for the
5 hearing or for the Board, has Kugluktuk HTO harvested any
6 Bathurst caribou in the last eight years?

7 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Bert.

8 Larry.

9 MR. L. ADJUN: No. Like I said, it's hard for us
10 to distinguish between Bathurst and the Bluenose unless you
11 get a DNA sample after you shoot them. Either that or
12 paint the Bluenose herd on its nose, but that herd, like I
13 stated, hasn't been around to Kugluktuk for a while.

14 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry.

15 Bert.

16 MR. DEAN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. That's
17 all my questions.

18 Thanks a lot, Larry.

19 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much.

20 Okay. I think at this time we're going to take
21 a 15-minute coffee break, and then we'll get the KIA.
22 Thank you.

23 (ADJOURNMENT)

24 THE CHAIR: Thank you, everybody. Everybody's
25 got their coffee, and we'll sit down and continue.

1 Okay. Next on the list is questions from the
2 Kitikmeot Inuit Association. Geoff or Paul?

3 KITIKMEOT INUIT ASSOCIATION QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

4 MR. EMINGAK: Qujannamiik, itsivautaaq.

5 Just a question to Kugluktuk HTO. It's Paul
6 Emingak, Executive Director for the Kitikmeot Inuit
7 Association.

8 Without getting into the aspects of the
9 management plan, I know that your organization is working
10 on that. My question is, I guess, pretty straightforward.
11 In terms of GN's suggestion or recommendation of a total
12 allowable harvest on Bathurst, they've suggested 30
13 caribou. Does the Kugluktuk HTO agree with that, or do
14 they have a different idea of what the total allowable
15 harvest should be?

16 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Paul.

17 Larry.

18 MR. L. ADJUN: Qujannamiik, itsivautaaq.

19 Hello, Mr. Executive Director. Our basic need
20 level is usually about a thousand caribou per year for the
21 residents of Kugluktuk. With our population of little over
22 1,400, we're easily at, give or take, plus or minus, a
23 thousand caribou annually needed for Inuit from Kugluktuk
24 to subsist off country food.

25 As we all know, the price of food in the stores

1 is a little expensive. Caribou is our main staple for
2 Inuit, along with muskox, and for some of us on the
3 mainland, we have the option of moose.

4 So we do not agree with the TAH of 30. As
5 stated previously by the previous chairperson for the HTO,
6 we generally need about a thousand caribou harvested for a
7 BNL in the Kugluktuk.

8 Hope that answers your question.

9 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

10 Paul.

11 MR. EMINGAK: Thank you, Larry. That helps.

12 But the question, I guess, supplementary to my
13 question is, if the suggested or recommended 30 total
14 allowable harvest for the Bathurst herd were to be
15 implemented, my question would be, how much of an impact
16 would that have on Kugluktumiut in terms of subsistence
17 hunting and living off, you know, other type of species --
18 moose, you know, so on -- or, in this case, store-bought
19 food? So that's my question.

20 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Paul.

21 Larry.

22 MR. L. ADJUN: Yes, it will have a huge impact on
23 the HTO members and residents of Kugluktuk of only 30 TAH
24 imposed on us. We would have to rely more on our country
25 food program from ED&T, which we're still running currently

1 and still run annually. So in that sense, the HTO would
2 have to beg, barter, or whatever you want to call it, but
3 we'd have to solicit for funding from the GN, Economic
4 Development and Tourism department to get more funding for
5 other harvests of animals; muskox, seals, geese. So it
6 would be a big impact on the community. Our diet would
7 have to change, our type of hunting would have to change,
8 and, basically, our way of life will have to change.

9 I hope that answers your question.

10 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry.

11 Paul.

12 MR. EMINGAK: Thank you, that helps a lot.

13 I just want to make a comment in terms of, you
14 know, KIA, we do provide, through our Inuit Insurance Fund,
15 and the Kugluktuk HTO in the past have accessed the funds
16 to assist in community harvests. So we're happy to provide
17 any assistance to Kugluktuk HTO or any other HTO that, you
18 know, that wants to help their community in terms of
19 community harvest. And as well, HTO has, you know, those
20 type of funds. So I'd like to just pass that information
21 on. Quana.

22 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much, Paul. More
23 of a comment.

24 Anything else from KIA? Geoff.

25 MR. CLARK: Just one question, Mr. Chair.

1 So it's understood that the Kugluktuk HTO
2 opposes a TAH and proposes to develop an alternative plan,
3 and it's clear that the Kugluktuk HTO feels that there
4 hasn't been enough time to develop this plan with the other
5 hunters and trappers organization to present to the Board,
6 and that's been clearly stated.

7 There have been questions floated, so far in the
8 questioning, about what would be in the management plan for
9 the Bathurst herd alternative to a TAH.

10 In spite of the fact that everyone knows that
11 there hasn't been time to develop that, do you feel it's
12 fair to be asked questions of a proposed plan that you
13 haven't developed yet in collaboration with the other
14 hunters and trappers organization when everyone knows that
15 it hasn't been developed yet?

16 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Geoff.

17 Larry.

18 MR. L. ADJUN: Yes, I strongly do agree. It's
19 not fair for the HTO to be put in this position where we
20 have not developed a plan yet, but we have a plan in place
21 for the Bluenose East; but as you have stated, it's not
22 fair to me or my board of directors or residents of
23 Kugluktuk that I be asked these questions with the plan not
24 being in place yet. Yes, I do strongly agree.

25 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry.

1 Geoff.

2 MR. CLARK: Do you believe that the Kugluktuk
3 HTO, with the other hunters and trappers organization, will
4 be able to develop a management plan alternative to a TAH
5 as you've demonstrated with the Bluenose East?

6 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Geoff.

7 Larry.

8 MR. L. ADJUN: Qujannamiik, itsivautaaq.

9 Yes, I do strongly agree that we would have a
10 positive management plan coming from the Kugluktuk HTO
11 side. And I'll speak and strongly support the four hunters
12 and trappers organizations in developing a Bluenose or a
13 Bathurst caribou management plan. As the residents of the
14 mainland -- Kugluktuk, Bay Chimo, Kingaut and
15 Cambridge Bay -- that do subsist off the Bathurst caribou
16 herd, we do need a plan in place to help collaborate with
17 the declining caribou population, but we got to impose our
18 own rights as harvesters to have that right to hunt that
19 caribou herd.

20 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry.

21 Geoff? Attima.

22 MR. HADLARI: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

23 Attima Hadlari. My question to you at the
24 January meeting with the GN, was that consultation on the
25 total allowable harvest?

1 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Attima.
2 Larry.
3 MR. L. ADJUN: It's pretty hard to answer. It
4 felt like a consultation at the end, but for our part, it
5 felt more like information session on the Bathurst
6 population, the health of the herd, but near the end, it
7 seemed an imposition on the hunters and trappers
8 organization that a TAH was given out, if I could say that.
9 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry.
10 Attima.
11 MR. HADLARI: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
12 Attima Hadlari. I was interested in attending
13 that, knowing that that was going to take place and some
14 discussion to the point. Being a wildlife and environment
15 vice-president for Inuit association, I was interested in
16 attending that, but I was told not to attend, so why, I
17 don't know. That's just information. Thank you.
18 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Attima. A comment.
19 Any other questions from KIA?
20 MR. CLARK: Thank you, Mr. Chair. We have no
21 further questions.
22 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much.
23 Larry.
24 MR. L. ADJUN: I just realized and remembered one
25 of your board of directors from NWMB pointed out the IQ

1 information. I just want to point out that KIA has the
2 traditional knowledge study on the non-IQ traditional
3 knowledge (verbatim) study done on Bathurst caribou herd,
4 and from what I believe, they are upgrading the system or
5 the information.

6 That's just a point I wanted to bring out from
7 one of your board of directors' question to me earlier.

8 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry.

9 Okay. We'll move on, then, to the next
10 questioner, and that's the North Slave Métis Alliance.
11 Shin.

12 NORTH SLAVE MÉTIS ALLIANCE QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

13 MR. SHIGA: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

14 Shin Shiga, North Slave Métis Alliance. Thank
15 you, Larry, for the presentation. I have a couple of
16 questions.

17 So yesterday I asked Mathieu or GN roughly how
18 many Bathurst caribou are being harvested in this area, and
19 the number I got was roughly between 70 and 300, and about
20 70 from the outfitters, and then the rest from, I suppose,
21 communities. But then I heard from you that there hasn't
22 been any Bathurst caribou harvested in the last six years,
23 and I'm a little confused. Would you say 70 to 300 is a
24 fair number, or would you not? Thank you.

25 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Shin.

1 Larry.

2 MR. L. ADJUN: I'll have Peter Taktogon answer
3 that question. He has more information on this.

4 THE CHAIR: Go ahead, Peter.

5 MR. TAKTOGON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

6 This past winter, in March and April, they had
7 some radio-collared Bathurst caribou. I think it was some
8 of them were hiding around napaaqtuq area. I went there
9 twice, March and April. The Kuglumuit was only getting the
10 Bluenose, Bluenose East caribou from there, but we never
11 see Bathurst caribou. Thank you.

12 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Peter.

13 Shin.

14 MR. SHIGA: Thank you, Peter.

15 Shin Shiga, North Slave Métis Alliance. So it
16 may have been just confusion because caribou were in about
17 the same location, and then people were hunting Bluenose
18 East, but just the collar information was near there. Is
19 that right?

20 MR. TAKTOGON: Yes, it is right, and we know the
21 three herds. They're different -- the Bathurst, Bluenose
22 and Dolphin Union -- and it's all different on the sizes.
23 We know the difference between those three herds. Thank
24 you.

25 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Peter.

1 Shin.

2 MR. SHIGA: Thank you, Peter.

3 Shin Shiga, North Slave Métis Alliance. Okay.

4 I'll move on to my second question. It's the same question
5 that I asked Simon earlier about examples that you have of
6 managing other species, and you just mentioned there's a
7 quota for muskox harvest. Do you have a management plan
8 for muskox as well?

9 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Shin.

10 Larry.

11 MR. L. ADJUN: Yes, we were given a quota by the
12 GN DoE department. Our management for the muskox comes on
13 as a first-come, first-serve basis at the renewable
14 regional office, and that's where our usual wildlife
15 officer works. Comes in as a first-come, first-serve
16 basis. For resident hunters or nonresident hunters, they
17 have to travel to Victoria Island. They do not hunt the
18 muskox on the mainland. I'll give you an example. If I
19 was a teacher, I lived in Kugluktuk for a year, or
20 wherever, you cannot hunt on the mainland. You have to go
21 to Victoria Island to subsist or to get tags from that
22 area. You cannot use the muskox tags on the mainland,
23 unless you were sport hunting, I believe.

24 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry. You want to
25 defer to GN?

1 MR. L. ADJUN: Yes, I'll defer that question to

2 GN.

3 THE CHAIR: Okay. Go ahead, Mathieu.

4 MR. DUMOND: Thank you, Chairman.

5 Just to precise, like, the allocation to
6 Kugluktuk HTO for the muskox tags is, the HTO has power to
7 distribute those tags as they wish. It was chosen in the
8 past to delegate that distribution to the wildlife officer
9 with some role that the HTO put in place in terms of
10 harvesting areas where different users can harvest.

11 So they have, in that sense, a community-based
12 management plan for muskox, and like Larry mentioned, it's
13 first-come, first-serve, but there's a rule also that if,
14 after two weeks, usually, you didn't get your muskox you
15 have to return your tag to give another person another
16 chance.

17 And all that is under the direction of the HTO,
18 and the officer is only implementing what the HTO has
19 decided for the distribution of those tags. So that's one
20 example where it works well between the two.

21 And if I may, because there was some confusion
22 about something, a quote of what I said, if I may add
23 something about the caribou harvest and the Bathurst
24 harvest. What I said, first of all, in the past decade,
25 anyway, Kugluktuk is not the main harvester of the

1 Bathurst. What I said is that the maximum of 70 that are
2 harvested through the sports hunts in Pellett Lake area,
3 Contoyto Lake area.

4 And in terms of subsistence harvest, we have
5 much less information, but there's some subsistence harvest
6 happening. And this past winter, what happened, from the
7 information we got, it seems that the collar information
8 was showing Bathurst caribou in the area where Kugluktuk
9 harvester were going. But it seems that from the harvester
10 themselves they harvested Bathurst caribou at the beginning
11 of the winter in February, but then after that, later on,
12 as Peter mentioned, it seems that most of the harvest was
13 on Bluenose animals that were in the same area. And there
14 was, as well, Dolphin and Union caribou in that area, but
15 just to precise a little bit.

16 So there was some harvest, a little bit by
17 Kugluktuk on the Bathurst at the beginning of the winter,
18 and it increased a little bit, the harvest on the Bathurst
19 for that past winter, but it was a mix of caribou, as Peter
20 mentioned.

21 Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

22 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mathieu.

23 Shin.

24 MR. SHIGA: Thank you for the answer and
25 clarifications. Shin Shiga, North Slave Métis Alliance.

1 So is the muskox management plan, would that be
2 an example of a community-based management plan where the
3 HTO has some restrictions, but without TAH? Is that fair
4 to say? Thank you.

5 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Shin.

6 Larry.

7 MR. L. ADJUN: Qujannamiik, itsivautaaq.

8 Yes, as Mathieu stated, the implementation is
9 done by the HTO for the harvest of muskox.

10 We also have areas that Mathieu did not -- or he
11 might have pointed out. One side of the river we have
12 previous diseased muskox, so there's only a smaller amount
13 or small quota of animals to be taken from that area, and
14 then we have a higher number of quota from a healthy
15 population in another area, and then we have another
16 population on Victoria Island that nonresidents or resident
17 hunters use.

18 I hope that answers your question.

19 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry.

20 Shin.

21 MR. SHIGA: Thank you, Larry.

22 So do I understand right that there is no total
23 allowable harvest set by the Nunavut Wildlife Management
24 Board respecting muskox in your area?

25 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Shin.

1 Larry.

2 And I just remind folks that we're speaking to
3 the Bathurst caribou here, too. Go ahead.

4 MR. L. ADJUN: Yeah, I was going to point that
5 out. We're getting off the topic.

6 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry.

7 Shin.

8 MR. SHIGA: Shin Shiga, North Slave Métis
9 Alliance.

10 What I'm trying to understand is if the
11 communities have experience in managing wildlife without
12 TAH, but, nonetheless, having the harvest restriction on
13 those animals. So I was using muskox as an example. I'm
14 trying to understand if the harvest quota that is being
15 implemented is sanctioned by the board, or is it entirely
16 community-led initiatives? Thank you.

17 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Shin.

18 Larry, do you understand? Thank you.

19 MR. L. ADJUN: Kind of, but I think that one,
20 that I got a big political question over my head. So I
21 don't know who to defer that question to, either to yours,
22 your department, or GN's.

23 THE CHAIR: I think I'll just maybe summarize
24 here and clarify. I think what Shin is asking, is does
25 Kugluktuk HTO have any experience in managing wildlife

1 populations that do not have a TAH on them? Do you have
2 any plans in place or rules for animals like that in your
3 area? Thank you.

4 MR. L. ADJUN: Yes, we do. We have the grizzly
5 bear quota system, which we manage fairly; muskox. We
6 don't have a quota on moose. Polar bears -- we have a
7 management system for polar bears, which we co-manage with
8 the NWT Beaufort Sea area.

9 THE CHAIR: Yeah, thank you, Larry.

10 And you're stating right. I think what his
11 point is: Do you have any management plans in place for
12 species that don't have a TAH on or quota on them? I think
13 the ones that you have mentioned -- muskox, polar bear, and
14 grizzly bear -- there's a quota in place for all those
15 animals.

16 And do you have anything in place that doesn't
17 have any quotas on them for any species? Any rules for
18 hunting any species that don't have a quota on them? I
19 think that is the question.

20 Shin, am I right?

21 MR. SHIGA: Yes. Thank you, Mr. Chair, for
22 the clarification.

23 And, specifically, management plan that involves
24 harvest restrictions that is not sanctioned by the Board.
25 I guess that's kind of confusing, but, yeah, that is my

1 question.

2 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Shin.

3 Larry, do you care to respond?

4 MR. L. ADJUN: Yes.

5 We utilize a good rule of thumb by good hunting
6 practices being, like, say, I'll give you an example. For
7 wolf hunting, we don't have a quota system for that, but we
8 stay away from the wolves during early spring because
9 females are birthing or pregnant. Those kind of
10 situations; we use for good hunting practices; good hunter,
11 that we have from traditional knowledge.

12 Spring, we rarely hunt from the pregnant cows.
13 They're the first ones that do come up. We have different
14 seasons in which we hunt different animals. As Jorgen Bolt
15 stated yesterday, we have different times, different
16 seasons for hunting practices, and this is all using
17 traditional knowledge.

18 I hope that answers your question. Otherwise,
19 I'm getting way off the topic, and I'm get more confused
20 each time he asks me the questions.

21 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry.

22 I hope that answers that for Shin, and we'll
23 move on. But, Shin, go ahead.

24 MR. SHIGA: Shin Shiga, North Slave Métis
25 Alliance. Thank you very much, Larry. That answers this

1 question.

2 And I just wanted to clarify, because there was
3 some exchanges, and I got confused. So when -- picking
4 muskox as an example. I'm sorry. So in managing muskox, I
5 heard that is mostly managed by HTO, but then Mathieu said
6 it is implemented by GN. Is that fair to say, or -- thank
7 you.

8 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Shin.

9 Larry, go ahead.

10 MR. L. ADJUN: It's implemented by the HTO and
11 administered by the GN, just due to the fact that the
12 wildlife office has an office there to issue the tags.

13 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry.

14 Shin.

15 MR. SHIGA: Thank you, Larry. That's all my
16 questions.

17 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much.

18 Okay. We'll move on, then, next, to Adventure
19 Northwest Limited. Boyd.

20 ADVENTURE NORTHWEST LIMITED QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

21 MR. WARNER: Thank you, Mr. Chair. And thank
22 you, Larry. Hopefully you'll get off the seat here soon.
23 One of the advantages of almost last is that lots of
24 questions get answered.

25 So I do have a question for you, Larry, or

1 perhaps Peter, is that I'm just curious as to when in
2 Kugluktuk's experience the Bluenose East herd kind of
3 started to be talked about or was created. Like, in the
4 '70s, it was all the Bathurst herd, everything on the
5 mainland. From the Kugluktuk HTO's experience, when was it
6 that the herds got split so we had Bathurst and Bluenose
7 East? Do you remember?

8 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Boyd.

9 Peter.

10 MR. TAKTOGON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

11 Yeah, for the last eight years, or whatever,
12 Bathurst caribou used to hang around close to six miles
13 south of Kugluktuk, but due to the migrations change and
14 routes and whatever been happening in the past, in the
15 future -- I think for the last eight years we never see
16 that Bathurst around close to Kugluktuk.

17 Thank you.

18 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Peter.

19 Boyd.

20 MR. WARNER: Okay. Thank you, Peter, for that
21 information. My understanding, Larry, is that Kugluktuk
22 used to have quite a few families in the Contwoyto Lake
23 area, and they were harvesting. Can you maybe tell us how
24 many of those families are still in the Contwoyto-Pellett
25 area today?

1 THE CHAIR: Thank you.

2 MR. L. ADJUN: Thank you, Mr. Warner.

3 Currently we have one resident outpost camp in
4 Contwoyto Lake now, Mr. John Fredrick Kaunak (phonetic).
5 In the past, we've had, under our trap funding, I believe
6 there was five, if I remember, back then. But now we are
7 down to only one family, and I believe one, Mr. John Uaruk
8 lives seasonally there when he works at Lupin. But the
9 current year-round resident would be one family currently.

10 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry.

11 Boyd.

12 MR. WARNER: Thank you. And just another
13 question for you, Larry. In the Kugluktuk HTO or your
14 opinion, would you say that an increase in predator harvest
15 would benefit the caribou more than a total allowable
16 harvest at this time?

17 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Boyd.

18 Larry.

19 MR. L. ADJUN: Yes, that issue has all been
20 brought up. It would, in our opinion, help the decline of
21 the caribou.

22 As you know, there are a lot of wolf hunters
23 between here and Contwoyto Lake, or experienced wolf
24 hunters, and we have quite a few in Kugluktuk that hunt on
25 the tundra and in the tree line around Great Bear Lake area

1 and around Contwoyto Lake area. That goes to say, with the
2 Kingaut and Bay Chimo and Cambridge Bay, we do have a lot
3 of experienced wolf hunters.

4 But our problem now with the younger generation,
5 they want to sit in front of the computer, work for the GN,
6 and we're losing that traditional knowledge that should be
7 passed on. But, fortunately, we have some youth that
8 are -- I'm going to say the word, I don't know go it rubs
9 off on some guys -- but are taught up properly to live off
10 the land and use the land and animals properly to the best
11 of their knowledge from their educator. But, yes, we do
12 strongly support that culling might help.

13 And maybe just to answer another question that,
14 or I could answer a question if it might come up: We have
15 a higher quota now for grizzly bear hunts, and just this
16 past year there's an open season now for wolves, and there
17 is now a no-quota system for residents or aboriginal hunt
18 for grizzly bears in Kugluktuk area.

19 I hope that answers or might answer another
20 question, too.

21 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry.

22 Boyd.

23 MR. WARNER: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

24 And thank you, Larry.

25 I'd just like to -- you mentioned in great

1 clarity how, if a total allowable harvest was established,
2 you might have to look at funding other species. I'm just
3 wondering if you feel those other species like moose would
4 be able to sustain a population if people couldn't hunt
5 caribou and went after moose instead. Would there be
6 enough moose to sustain the community, or would it soon be
7 detrimental to the moose?

8 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Boyd.

9 Larry.

10 MR. L. ADJUN: Quana, itsivautaaq. Quana, Board
11 for the question.

12 Yes, we have a huge population of moose within
13 our area. They come down the delta system of the
14 Coppermine River, Richardson River, Tree River, High Lake
15 area around Grays Bay. We have a healthy population of
16 moose to harvest or to change our harvest methods, too.

17 But, like I said earlier, if we do change or do
18 get a TAH imposed on us, our hunting technique's going to
19 have to change. Our way of lifestyle is going to have to
20 change, our diet's going to have to change.

21 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry.

22 Boyd.

23 MR. WARNER: Thank you, Chairman. And thank
24 you, Larry, for your answers. No more questions.

25 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much, Boyd.

1 Okay. Our last questioner would be the public.
2 Is there any questions from the anybody in the public that
3 would like to ask Kugluktuk HTO? Doesn't seem to be any.

4 Okay. Thank you very much, Larry and your
5 board, your representatives here, for your presentation and
6 question answering. Thank you. You're off the hot seat.

7 Next presentation is by Bathurst HTO. Sam.

8 BATHURST HTO SUBMISSION

9 MR. S. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

10 We don't have a written submission. Our
11 chairperson would like to make a presentation, if that's
12 okay with the Board. Thank you.

13 THE CHAIR: Yeah, that's fine. Whoever you
14 choose to make it, that's fine.

15 Just for the record would you state your name
16 and organization for the record. Thank you.

17 MS. C. KAPOLAK: Connie Kapolak, Burnside HTO
18 chair. I'll wait for my presentation to go up on the
19 whiteboard here.

20 I have an Elder who, at the time that we were on
21 break, mentioned something about the wolves in our area.
22 And I have been lucky to be back in Bathurst and Bay Chimo
23 area after I've gone through residential school all my life
24 as a teenager, I went to school since I was 12.

25 Then I moved back home when I was 19, and

1 because the residential school system didn't teach you our
2 way of life as an Inuk, I had to relearn all that right
3 from my language to sewing, looking after family,
4 butchering meat, and to be able to relearn all that and
5 hunting on the land, and I was lucky enough to be accepted
6 by a family who had taught me all that, along with my mom
7 and the Elders around me at the time when Bay Chimo and
8 Bathurst were fully populated, when we still had the
9 schools, the store, and the health system, and the
10 petroleum products that were based out of Bay Chimo and
11 Bathurst.

12 In order for Inuit to learn the traditional way
13 of life and their culture, it doesn't happen overnight. It
14 took me a good 10 years to 20 years to really learn how to
15 live off the land, look after family, help our Elders. You
16 know, I just had to relearn my whole language back.

17 It took going to school to find that my language
18 is Inuk, and Inuinnaqtun-speaking language -- it took me to
19 go to Arctic College and McGill University to realize that
20 my language is very important and that we were losing it.

21 After we were losing our language, I realized
22 that my culture is very important, as well, and what the
23 Inuit hunted off the land. Like Larry said in his
24 presentation that, as Inuk on the land or in each
25 community, we have different seasons to hunt different

1 types of animals. And my presentation is the Kingaumiut
2 and the Tuktu, and this is where we're from.

3 I'm not too sure who is doing the slide show.
4 Okay. So you can go on to the next slide.

5 So if it wasn't for our Elders, like I stated
6 earlier, we would not have the caribou and the land
7 knowledge because the caribou is very important to us as
8 Inuit, and this is how we are here today because they have
9 survived all that off the land before we were ever put into
10 communities such as Bay Chimo, Bathurst, and right across
11 Nunavut. They had their own way of living off the land,
12 and they were in places, and this is why there are so many
13 places on the map in Nunavut that all have Inuinuqtun
14 names because those names are the ones that were indicators
15 as to where we should hunt, where the caribou have calving
16 grounds or they winter and where they migrate.

17 All these indicators on the land, if you look at
18 the map and you ask in Inuk, they'll tell you all the
19 indicators of mapping on the land before they were ever
20 given any English names because those were the indicators
21 that they used before their ancestors.

22 So if it wasn't for our Elders, you can see the
23 picture here -- these are the people that are from
24 Umingmaktok and Bay Chimo and Kingaumuit. And those are
25 the Elders and we just have a few left.

1 And the reason why they are here today is
2 because the GN -- I'm sorry to say this, but, you know,
3 over time, slowly shut down our communities. But because
4 those of us who are able to travel back and forth, we can
5 stay there as much as we could, but it's like Larry said,
6 it's costly to travel by snowmobile from here to Bay Chimo
7 and Bathurst. It's roughly about 500 bucks, a thousand
8 dollars, if you're going to stay longer, and for us to
9 charter back and forth, having Adlair not based out of here
10 anymore; the aviation company that used to be in
11 Cambridge Bay. If we're lucky enough that they're here in
12 town doing business, we would be lucky enough to fly them
13 home, and that cost to fly home is about \$5,000 one way.

14 So for our ancestors, because they have survived
15 on this land for a long time, their tools and way of
16 surviving has been with us for many years. This is why we
17 know the traditional way of living on hunting seasons. And
18 we should be able to pass that on to our kids.

19 They are the ones that passed it on to us, but
20 because there's so much restrictions going to be in place,
21 how are we going to pass that on to our kids? Like, it was
22 already bad enough that they had taken away my culture and
23 my language that I had to take 20 years to regain it back.
24 And to teach kids how to butcher and look after the animal
25 properly, use all that you can possibly use off the

1 caribou, or any type of animal. You can't teach a child in
2 one day. It takes a long time. And it makes me wonder,
3 how? How are we going to pass that on to our kids if we're
4 going to have a TAH set at 30?

5 If we do not start early in a child's life, the
6 land skills and basic living in our time, we would lose
7 what was passed on for generations on the Inuit way of
8 life.

9 I started teaching my kids the Inuit way of
10 life, whereas if somebody in the community or anywhere in
11 your life has done something to you that is so bad that you
12 have to rebel back, it's not going to help anybody. It's
13 not even worth it to try and fight back. You know, if you
14 haven't done anything wrong, then why fight back? That's
15 just the way Inuit were taught.

16 So if you teach your kids how to respect the
17 land and their animals, and how to look after the land, my
18 brother used to always say to me when I was growing up, but
19 I didn't understand why -- and he was my oldest brother.
20 He would always tell me, "Don't do that." "Don't do that."
21 You know, just, "Don't do that." I didn't have a dad
22 because he passed away when I was seven years old, so my
23 brother was the one that looked after us with my mom.

24 I didn't think that making fun of an animal was
25 not okay. And I didn't understand why my brother would say

1 something like that to us, so if you don't teach your kids
2 properly, at the end they won't understand.

3 As I came out of residential school, I finally
4 understood why my brother would always say that to me,
5 "Don't play with the animals," or "Don't do that." I
6 finally understood that. So if you start with your kids at
7 a young age, then you would be lucky enough to be able to
8 understand what it's like to be an Inuk.

9 So what we pass on to our children, you have to
10 use it with patience. You have to be patient with your
11 kids. You need to teach them the land skills if you're
12 going to be able to be on the land with them most of the
13 time as they are growing up. You need to be patient with
14 them. You can't just rush everything all the time.
15 Otherwise, if you're rushing and being impatient with
16 children, they tend not to hear you anymore.

17 I didn't understand why Elders always say,
18 "Please stop yelling. Stop yelling." It's no wonder when
19 you yell too much at a child they don't hear you anymore.
20 You know, they just get so used to it, and then they just
21 stop.

22 Because our ancestors had survived on the land
23 for many years, our children need to find new ways of
24 respecting the Inuit culture and the traditional way of
25 living. Today Larry had mentioned earlier that young

1 adults are so busy in front of the computer or the TV --
2 and it's good for them. In some way, it's good for them
3 because, in the future, they will need to provide for
4 themselves if this is what we're going to be faced with.

5 You know, the cost of living in the north is not
6 cheap. You compare the prices of beef up here to Edmonton;
7 it's more expensive to buy the meat here than it is
8 anywhere else. This is why Inuit live so much off of the
9 land when they possibly could. Even if it means that we
10 provide food for other communities, such as Grise Fiord
11 because their caribou are so far, that we would have to
12 provide food for them as well. We butcher the meat and
13 preserve it. It can last you a long time throughout the
14 year until your next season of hunting for good caribou or
15 any type of animal you're hunting.

16 As you can see, there are traditional pictures
17 of Inuit where they have their freezers and their meat
18 caches, and these are one of them that are located in our
19 area.

20 If we are not using the traditional way of
21 making our clothing, we are wasting the material that can
22 be of good use for travelling on the land. Like, today,
23 people don't really use that caribou skin anymore because
24 they have no teaching of how to use it. Today, we use the
25 inner clothing made of the fall caribou skins. Inuit in

1 the past used to use both inner and outer caribou clothing.
2 The outer caribou clothing are on your left, and the inner
3 clothing are on your right. Today, we use the clothing
4 that are on your right, when you're looking at the picture,
5 for travelling.

6 And making that type of clothing you need only
7 one type of caribou clothing -- fur. And that is in the
8 fall time because it doesn't shed right away, and this was
9 passed on down to our families from generations before us.
10 Because if you use any type of clothing using fur and you
11 don't use the right type of season, it doesn't work very
12 well. This is why we always have different types of
13 hunting seasons throughout Inuit way of life.

14 So any time Inuit catch animals from the land,
15 we make sure we put it to good use. It's never wasted.
16 Today, we can use the bones, antlers, for making tools
17 and/or jewellery. Even the intestines. When you have an
18 Elder who cannot go out hunting anymore, and you always
19 have to inform them, this is what we're going to do for
20 that day. And if it means that you're going caribou
21 hunting, they make sure and tell you, "Please bring me the
22 inulonginuk (phonetic). The inulonginuk are the intestines
23 with the fat on them on the inside. And they'll tell you
24 how to prep it in order for you to bring it back.

25 So those are things that you do for our Elders

1 when they tell you how to do it. And it doesn't happen
2 overnight that somebody is going to learn that. You need
3 to be able to listen and figure out what it is that they
4 need.

5 Even just cooking the head, whereas today you
6 see a lot of caribou head out on the land. One day my
7 husband went out with a family and came back. He only
8 caught the four caribou that we needed, but he came back
9 with 12 heads, 12 caribou heads. You give those to the
10 Elders, it could feed a whole family. It may look small,
11 but you butcher it up, you could get eight pieces out of
12 it. And the broth is much richer than any part of the
13 animal as you boil it.

14 So these are things that you need to pass on to
15 your families in order for them to learn how to look after
16 the animals that are in such decline, and especially if
17 you're going to put a TAH, you need to be able to teach
18 some of the younger generations how to look after it just
19 so there's not so much wastage.

20 Today we live off of the land to our best
21 ability. We take in as much as we can of the animal to
22 provide food for our families and our Elders. Here is an
23 example of a fish. On your right are the fish eggs. We
24 eat as much as of the fish as we could, and this is just
25 one of the delicacies that we have.

1 On seasonal springtime seasons, we usually have
2 the geese, eider ducks, and the seagulls to provide Inuit
3 with fresh eggs. This is one of the ways we have country
4 food.

5 Again, if we're able to catch what we can
6 provide for our families with traditional food, this is one
7 of them. You need to make sure that you catch what you
8 need for that family.

9 We make sure that what is taught to them begins
10 at a very young age, because if you start at a young age,
11 the child will always follow in what was taught to them.
12 On your left we're butchering a caribou. On the right are
13 kids going up the hill, and there's always a small child
14 that's always going to follow.

15 Again, as Inuit, the tuktu has always been a big
16 part of the way that we have been living off of the land.
17 We use as much as we can with what is caught any time of
18 the year. There's different seasons of the year that you
19 catch your caribou. We don't get all our caribou in the
20 fall to last us all year. There's different types. If you
21 get just as much as you need in the fall, then you wait,
22 catch enough until you catch more caribou in the spring.
23 So this is what we do with the caribou: We butcher it all
24 up. You even take the skin for anything that you possibly
25 could use it for.

1 Because it's the only way Inuit know how to live
2 off of the land, the survival skills on the land with what
3 is taught to them from generations and generations before
4 us, we try and preserve that as much as we could and pass
5 it on to our kids. This is one of the pictures that we
6 have at home where you butcher all your meat, and this
7 stand is about 10 by 12, and we fill it as much as we
8 could. Once we're done butchering it, then we preserve it
9 in bags or in freezers. And if we had a TAH in place of
10 30, this would have to, you know, cut it down, slow down,
11 and what we have to teach our kids would be detrimental to
12 our families.

13 In the meetings, I've been in and out. There's
14 always something that has to do with the caribou decline.
15 I'm from Kingaut and Umingmaktok area, and when we go home
16 in the summertime, we go boating. In the past, we
17 didn't -- my son is 11 years old now.

18 In the past 11 years, we would see one or two
19 grizzly bears, but today we do go out boating, and we would
20 boat the inlet. You'd be seeing about 10 to 13 bears with
21 cubs, either together or by themselves, in total of 10 or
22 13.

23 And when I was talking to my mom earlier at the
24 break, she said because there are so limited people that go
25 in and out of both areas now these days. In her time Inuit

1 used to go to the wolf dens and take the pups, because if a
2 caribou can calf one caribou per fall, look at how many
3 wolves can den pups per year, and that's a lot higher than
4 the caribou.

5 So in my mom's time, because the decline of the
6 caribou was happening, they would go to the wolf dens and
7 take the wolf pups, and that's how they would manage an
8 increase of predators in her time, at that time that she
9 was telling me in the coffee break area. And I told her,
10 if she has information about her history, she needs to
11 share it with you guys. She said she's just listening
12 here, but she has information from her time.

13 And for us, for a TAH in our community, because
14 we are mostly -- as Larry said, we mostly live off the
15 tuktu. In Inuit life we would have to make a big change if
16 we would have to change our diet, and that's not easy.
17 It's not easy. It takes time. Like, it doesn't happen
18 overnight.

19 Quana. That's it. Thank you.

20 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much, Connie, for
21 your very good presentation.

22 So with that, with Bathurst Inlet HTO, is there
23 any more information that you would like to provide before
24 we get the questions? Sam?

25 MR. S. KAPOLAK: Yeah, thank you, Mr. Chairman.

1 Yeah, I would just like to add that the Burnside
2 HTO strongly does not agree with the proposal that the GN
3 is making for the TAH mostly because of not enough
4 consultation. I mean, there's been consultation, but not
5 enough. Thank you.

6 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Sam.

7 All right. I'll open up questions to the Board
8 of the NWMB Board Members. Any questions? Caleb.

9 MR. SANGOYA: Can I have a comment?

10 THE CHAIR: Yes, you can have a question and a
11 comment, sure. Go ahead.

12 NUNAVUT MANAGEMENT WILDLIFE BOARD QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

13 MR. SANGOYA: I'm Inuk. I'm going to make a
14 comment and a question.

15 I'm 100 percent Eskimo. These Inuit, they lived
16 off, for many, many years. That was the tradition, when
17 they were trying to live on with their tradition, I'm going
18 to keep supporting you, but what I've noticed, the Inuit,
19 they live here for 365 days a year, but the researcher only
20 stays here for about two weeks. So I just want to thank
21 you very much for that presentation. Thank you very much.

22 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Caleb. That was more a
23 comment, I think, than anything else. Any other questions?
24 Charlie?

25 MR. INUARAK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

1 The Nunavut government and GNWT, they're dealing
2 with Bathurst. They're saying that Bathurst caribou are
3 declining, and they're trying to set a TAH that is very
4 low. I just want a clarification that tuktu, are they
5 disappearing? Are they disappearing, or are they just
6 going through a cycle, perhaps?

7 Because the caribou tend to come back. At times
8 there's a few. Do you know what the reason is for their
9 decline? Are they being over-harvested, or is it because
10 of the mines that are disturbing them, or the wolves that
11 are killing them off, if you know? If you know, I want
12 clarification as to why you think the Bathurst caribou are
13 declining.

14 Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

15 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Charlie.

16 Sam.

17 MR. S. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

18 Thank you for your question. Okay. I'll start
19 off with, when I was growing up, the Bathurst caribou, we
20 used to have that big range, they used to be all Bathurst
21 caribou, and then the Bathurst caribou used to calve to the
22 northeast of our community. Ever since I've been growing
23 up when I'm five, six years old, my parents would be
24 looking up to the south every May to see if there's any
25 sign of caribou migrating through. Then when they do come

1 through, I still remember everywhere you look, there would
2 be thousands of caribou.

3 And then one year there was nothing. We waited
4 and waited and waited, and we didn't know why the caribou
5 didn't come. And the next year, the same thing; the
6 caribou didn't come. Then we finally heard from other
7 sources that the caribou, the herd was calving to the
8 southwest of us about 80, 90 miles from the community.
9 That's the reason why they haven't come in off the hills.
10 That's one reason why.

11 So I got curious, and I started talking to the
12 Elders, asking them questions, you know, why they have
13 moved their calving grounds. And I talked to them
14 individually or asked them questions individually, and I
15 got the same answer from every Elder I asked, that they
16 said that was their original calving grounds before they
17 moved over to the northeast of us. Now they're back.

18 And after hearing that, I think the caribou have
19 cycles like any other wildlife does. Like, for instance,
20 mouse, rabbits, whatever. And after saying that, the
21 Elders always tell me, too, that the caribou have a cycle.
22 There never used to be caribou a long time ago, and all of
23 a sudden they're there. And a lot of people say that one
24 day there's going to be no more caribou again, and then
25 they will come back.

1 So I think it's just going through a cycle, but,
2 I mean, I've noticed it, too. We don't see the great
3 numbers like we used to, anymore. I mean, I'm not sure if
4 they're declining or the herd has separated into -- like,
5 some people say, "Where did that Ahiak herd come, or the
6 Bluenose East herd come from?" It might have been just one
7 big herd that kind of went separate ways. I hope that
8 answers your question. Thank you.

9 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Sam.

10 Any other questions comments or questions from
11 the Board? Attiq (phonetic), you want to add something?
12 Go ahead.

13 MS. C. KAPOLAK: Sorry, as an educator, I have to
14 leave, so this is our last day of school, and as an
15 educator, I can't just apply for leave, you know, on my
16 last holiday, so, sorry, I'm going to have to leave quana.

17 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much, and thank you
18 for your presentation.

19 Any questions from staff of the Board? No
20 questions from staff or legal counsel?

21 Government of Nunavut, do you have any
22 questions?

23 GOVERNMENT OF NUNAVUT QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

24 MR. DUMOND: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

25 Mathieu Dumond, Government of Nunavut.

1 Sam, just to help with the discussion and,
2 unfortunately, the fuzzy number we have on the harvest,
3 could you give us an idea of how many caribou from the
4 Bathurst would be harvested per year, at least over the
5 past ten years, like, by Kingaumiut for the subsistence?
6 Like, I'm not talking about the commercial or the sports
7 hunts. Quana.

8 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mathieu.

9 Sam.

10 MR. S. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

11 Thank you for the question. In the last 15, 20
12 years, I guess ever since they have moved their calving
13 grounds, we Kingaumiut have not hunted the Bathurst herd in
14 great numbers. Like, we hunt mostly the Dolphin Union in
15 the wintertime and maybe a little bit of Ahiaik that comes
16 over from the east. But like I said, in the last 15, 20
17 years for our personal use, we haven't hunted out of the
18 Bathurst herd. The reason for that is they're just too far
19 in the summertime. Thank you.

20 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Sam.

21 Mathieu.

22 MR. DUMOND: Thank you. Mathieu Dumond,
23 Government of Nunavut.

24 So at this time, the main concern over
25 limitation on the harvest would be for the continuation of

1 the economic activity of the sport hunt, but not as much
2 for the subsistence harvest if the herd continue to stay
3 away from the community? If they shift back, of course,
4 you would harvest more for subsistence, I understand that,
5 but at this time, the concern is mainly over limitation
6 that would affect the sport hunts. Is that right?

7 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mathieu.

8 Sam.

9 MR. S. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

10 Yes, I think that would be fair to say. Like we
11 said, the caribou do come back. And like I said, they do.
12 Caribou come back. I don't think the numbers that we kill
13 will be the same as the years past as we don't have the
14 amount of people living there anymore, and, just in the
15 wintertime, there's just four or five of us there in the
16 wintertime. I hope that answers.

17 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Sam.

18 Mathieu.

19 MR. DUMOND: And maybe -- so just one last
20 comment on the harvest.

21 If there was a TAH established, whatever the
22 number is, from your perspectives, would you say you would
23 be likely to assign those tags to the sport hunts rather
24 than keeping them for subsistence? Because that would be
25 one of the power of the HTO over their BNL or their share

1 of the TAH if a TAH is established. So would that be
2 something that you would consider? If there was a TAH and
3 you have a share of that TAH, would you keep them for
4 subsistence? Would you keep that share for subsistence, or
5 would you consider assigning them for economic ventures
6 like the sport hunts? Thank you.

7 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mathieu.

8 Sam.

9 MR. S. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

10 I guess it all -- whatever the numbers of the
11 TAH would be. If the numbers are too low, we would have to
12 talk about it with the Board and stuff like that, but, to
13 my knowledge, if the numbers are low, it would be probably
14 for subsistence.

15 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Sam.

16 Mathieu.

17 MR. DUMOND: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

18 No further question. Thank you. And thank you
19 to Sam.

20 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much, GN.

21 GNWT? Lynda?

22 MS. YONGE: Lynda Yonge, GNWT. Thank you very
23 much for the presentation. We have no questions.

24 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lynda.

25 Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife Board, any questions

1 for Sam?

2 KITIKMEOT REGIONAL WILDLIFE BOARD QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

3 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

4 Simon Qingnaqtuq, Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife
5 Board. I have a question. On the Bathurst caribou herd,
6 to your knowledge, since the mining companies started
7 getting into around your area, have you noticed a decline,
8 or the herd moving to different area?

9 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Simon.

10 Sam.

11 MR. S. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

12 It's kind of hard to answer that question, I
13 guess, because the Bathurst herd calving grounds is quite a
14 distance from the proposed Goose Lake property and stuff
15 like that, which there's other herds that combine with the
16 Bathurst herd. I guess the Beverly herd is more
17 concentrated around the George and stuff like that, Ahiak
18 herd.

19 And we're talking about the Bathurst herd right
20 now, but it's hard for me to say the caribou are changing
21 their migration routes already because, like I said, the
22 calving grounds have changed, the Bathurst caribou calving
23 grounds have changed long before the proposed gold mine at
24 Goose Lake.

25 Does that answer your question?

1 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Sam. Simon? Any
2 further questions? Okay.

3 Okay. We'll move on then to Kugluktuk HTO.
4 Larry.

5 KUGLUKTUK HTO QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

6 MR. L. ADJUN: Qaujimajatuqangit, itsivautaaq and
7 quana to Connie and Sam for their presentation and answers.

8 I believe we have two of our questions answered
9 already from our board of directors. I myself have nothing
10 to say, but just to commend Burnside about them not
11 supporting the TAH. I believe one of our directors has a
12 statement.

13 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry. Jorgen.

14 MR. BOLT: Thank you, Mr. Chair, Jorgen Bolt
15 with HTO. I just want to kind of add to the presentation
16 that was just given earlier on, five minutes ago, about
17 traditional knowledge, educating kids, adolescents,
18 whatever you want to call them, you know.

19 I've been trying to teach my kids about the
20 caribou, how to go about cutting them up, where to get
21 materials from to make tools. Traditional needles, I show
22 them where to get them, show them what they use different
23 parts of the caribou for.

24 I know they use what we call niuktuut is a
25 drill, fire starter. We know where to get those pieces

1 from. I've been trying to teach my kids, my grandchildren
2 where to get these from. I've made a few traditional
3 needles. I just told them where to use these, how to use
4 them, when to use them, and so on, and how to prepare skins
5 and stuff like that.

6 And like she was saying, if you don't educate
7 the kids, they're not going to be, how would you say --
8 they're going to be intimidated by the land. They're
9 scared right now, these days, to go out. I mean, you can
10 go out now. On a nice April day, you could go out 10, 15
11 miles, no problem. But previously, like my dad's
12 generation, for sure, every other week the men were going
13 out all winter long bringing in caribou for families.
14 Every other house you can see frozen caribou meat on top
15 the house, porches, whatever it may be, while you're
16 walking down the street.

17 But today we have more people but less stress on
18 the caribou. We have twice as many people in Kugluktuk,
19 but we don't have many hunters as we used to. But, still,
20 the caribou are declining. Why? Is there something else
21 that's killing these caribou off? Environment? Predators?
22 Diseases? Mosquitos? Whatever.

23 Like I said, you know, we don't hunt, we don't
24 put as much stress on these herds as we used to, like, long
25 ago, because we used have -- I mean, I grew up on caribou,

1 too. I ate it, bake it, fry it, frozen, dried, you name
2 it. I live on it every day. And to pass these knowledges
3 on, we need to have more than just, I don't know how would
4 you say, a TAH -- because it's just going to be, shoot the
5 30 caribou, then good enough, gone, without teaching
6 anybody, teaching the kids or anything like that.

7 And just to more or less add on to what Al
8 (verbatim) was saying about caribou moving to different
9 migration route, I don't know how you say: Down south,
10 farmers plow their fields to grow their wheat and grass and
11 whatever, and they use plows, right, to chew up the land.
12 Same thing with caribou. That's why they move from one
13 area to another area. One area is grazed out. That's all
14 been "plowed" by the caribou, so they know this area is now
15 useable again. So they move to that area one year for a
16 number of years. Now that area gets grazed out, and then
17 they move to another area, back to their original calving
18 grounds, maybe, back to their original calving grounds.
19 Like I said, these caribou, they do their feeding, but
20 they're regenerating their food at the same time.

21 I just wanted to add to the presentation for
22 Kingaumiut. Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

23 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jorgen. Just more
24 information, comment. Okay. If there's no more further
25 questions from Kugluktuk, we'll move on.

1 Bay Chimo HTO, any questions for Sam? Peter.

2 MR. P. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. No
3 questions, but I'd just like to comment on the great
4 presentation because we're closely related and tied as an
5 HTO. Thank you.

6 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much, Peter.
7 Cambridge Bay HTO?

8 MR. GREENLEY: Thank you, Mr. Chair. We have no
9 questions at this time.

10 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Bobby.

11 Any Elders representing any of the hunters and
12 trappers organizations, any questions at all or comments?
13 Go ahead.

14 MS. M. KANIAK: I just want to make a short
15 comment. The caribou are declining.

16 As a young lady growing up, my parents lived out
17 on the land. My dad walked miles and often told us, once
18 he got home, there used to be a lot of wolves or when
19 there's a lot of wolves maybe 20 carcasses are found out on
20 the land. He's often told me of those instances when
21 wolves are in the dens and have young ones. And they've
22 often gone out on the land and watched some of these
23 instances. They often tell us about carcasses left out on
24 the land, like, 20 carcasses found dead. We're no longer
25 in that area. I've often thought to myself that that area

1 has got to be plentiful of wolves now.

2 My father's often told me a lot of stories while
3 having tea. Wolves have a good appetite, and when in the
4 dens with their young ones, they hunt a lot of caribou, and
5 it seems like maybe somewhere down the road, my father's
6 often said maybe we'll have no caribou. I've often thought
7 of these instances when people tell me that caribou are
8 depleting in those areas.

9 During the fall, during the spring, caribou
10 migrate through those areas, and I've seen how plentiful
11 they were, and wolves follow behind at times. Maybe that
12 might be one of the reasons why caribou are depleting, and
13 I've often thought of these things when people catch
14 caribou, wherever.

15 At times, people often tell us that other things
16 are depleting. Many years ago during the spring, wolves
17 were caught in numbers because they hunt caribou when we're
18 out on the land. That's what we've seen. They eat
19 caribou. At times, I forget what I want to share, but I've
20 often thought of these things.

21 Thank you very much.

22 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much.

23 There's no other -- go ahead, Joseph.

24 MR. TIKHAK: I grew up year-round that, at the
25 time, Tuktoyaktuk, there is a lot of caribou in that area,

1 as far as I can remember. Today, there's not too many
2 caribou hunters. It seems like, yes, the numbers would
3 increase, but people are telling us they're depleting, as
4 yesterday. Caribou around Bathurst area are depleting.
5 They should be in numerous numbers. Our parents, years
6 ago, had lots of children because they were using caribou
7 skins for clothing, so they'd catch a lot of caribou. When
8 they're used for clothing, when the skins are used for
9 clothing, they shoot a lot of caribou, even for making
10 tents.

11 In the fall, they'd catch a lot of caribou.
12 Because they didn't have any other materials for making
13 tents, they'd use caribou skins.

14 Today what I've heard is that Bathurst herd is
15 depleting. People are not shooting them there, it seems.
16 Our parents often -- our ancestors have told us many times,
17 when you see wildlife out on the land, maybe shoot them and
18 make good use of them because they will not be around all
19 the time.

20 Yesterday I heard a discussion around depletion
21 of the Bathurst herd. Maybe they're moving elsewhere.
22 Maybe later on in the years they'll return.

23 The lakes where there is plentiful fish stocks,
24 at times, people are saying we've fished there. It seems
25 to be, like, there's no fish there.

1 My father's often said, "Don't leave those areas
2 that are hunting grounds." "If you don't shoot or if you
3 don't go fishing for food, they'll disappear," is what my
4 father told me. I've thought of his words. Caribou are
5 not shot anymore, people are not catching a lot of caribou.
6 I've heard for a long time, paqaluaq (phonetic), and
7 yesterday they were talked about. My father's words to me,
8 they came back to me, and that's why I had to comment. My
9 father said if you see wildlife that's edible, shoot it,
10 catch it, and store it if you need to. Today we have
11 southern-style clothing. Caribou clothing are rarely seen
12 in some places. Long ago a lot of caribou was shot. Now
13 caribou is not used that way.

14 It seems like caribou should be plentiful
15 because they're not shot in those numbers as they were
16 years ago. My father's told me, "Shoot the caribou. If
17 you don't pay attention to them, then they're going to
18 disappear. Even those places where people go fishing,
19 don't leave those places. Go fish. If you don't go after
20 them, then they're going to disappear. You need to look
21 after them and shoot, go fishing, go hunting. If you
22 don't -- it seems like we've left them alone for some time.
23 We don't use hides for clothing anymore as much as we used
24 to. Maybe that's why they're depleting.

25 And I've often thought, why are they depleting?

1 Maybe people don't want to prepare the pelts for clothing
2 to soften them and that. We only have store-bought
3 clothing that needs to be prepared, that's already put
4 together.

5 I used to prepare skins for clothing, but
6 nowadays not as much. My dad, my grandfather: "Don't
7 leave those wildlife. If you do, they'll disappear." The
8 discussion around the depletion of caribou around the
9 Bathurst area, we've heard this conversation around the
10 table for the last day and a half. They shouldn't be
11 depleting. They should be in numerous numbers because
12 there's not that many caribou hunters that go out and hunt
13 in the numbers that they used to years ago.

14 A lot of families had large families. They
15 killed a lot of caribou to make clothing, later on, to use
16 the furs, food for the dogs also. A lot of it was cached,
17 the meat, so it was edible later on the. The whole caribou
18 was utilized. The meat, the antlers were made into tools.
19 Even the bones were not thrown away. They were used for
20 knives, and they were well made. They made well-made
21 tools. The antlers were used for harpoons or into knives;
22 were made into tools that were usable.

23 The whole caribou was kept. They never threw
24 anything away. Things were put away. Meat was cached so
25 that, you know, they'd go back when they need the meat.

1 Today there's store-bought clothing, and maybe that's one
2 reason why people don't catch as many caribou as they used
3 to. I've often thought of this, why is caribou depleting
4 in the Bathurst area, because people haven't caught that
5 many caribou over the last few years, not as much as they
6 used to years ago.

7 My grandfather and my dad have often said,
8 before they passed away: "Don't leave the wildlife just
9 the way -- even if you need to get a few. If you don't
10 catch any, they'll move into other areas and disappear to
11 far away places." The Elders, what they've said, I think
12 that that's true.

13 Thank you for giving me the opportunity to say
14 what I need to. Thank you.

15 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Joseph.

16 NTI.

17 NUNAVUT TUNNGAVIK INCORPORATED QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

18 MR. IRNGAUT: Thank you, Mr. Chair. I'm from
19 Iqaluit. I'd like to thank the submission by Bathurst, and
20 also, they stated a very important issue, that even though
21 we're talking about total allowable harvest and they're
22 saying how much impact that is going to have if we set a
23 TAH.

24 I have a question to Bathurst hunters and
25 trappers. Are the caribou from Bathurst HTO, qujannamiik?

1 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Paul.
2 Sam.
3 MR. S. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
4 I'm sorry. I didn't catch the question. Can
5 you please repeat? Thank you.
6 MR. IRNGAUT: My question is, are these the only
7 herd that you harvest from the Bathurst HTO submission?
8 Thank you.
9 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Paul.
10 Sam.
11 MR. S. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
12 Are we just talking caribou, or are there more
13 caribou? Okay. Thank you.
14 Okay. No, we do -- the Dolphin Union are
15 starting to winter right around Bathurst, so we harvest a
16 little bit out of the Dolphin Union herd, and like I had
17 mentioned earlier, probably a little bit of what you call
18 Ahiak herd when they come over from the east, and this is
19 probably in May.
20 Does that answer your question? Thanks.
21 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Sam.
22 Paul or Bert.
23 MR. DEAN: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
24 Bert Dean with NTI. Thanks, Sam. And I'll have
25 to thank Connie later for her presentation. And I think

1 Mathieu maybe touched on it a bit earlier in some of his
2 questions, but you're involved with the sport hunts as
3 well, and could you tell us a bit about that, like, how
4 many from your community are involved in those sport hunts
5 and what happens with the meat, etcetera?

6 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Bert.

7 Sam.

8 MR. S. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

9 Thank you for your question, Bert.

10 Like I said, we do all of our sports hunts in
11 Contwoyto Lake. Before that, it used to be all out of
12 Pellett Lake, but we've moved over to Contwoyto Lake just
13 due to the movement of caribou. We notice that they're
14 staying up further north, and then they're coming later on,
15 later on in the season. And they haven't come into Pellett
16 Lake. The first two weeks there's no caribou at Pellett
17 Lake. That's the reason why we moved to Contwoyto.

18 And to answer your question about who is all
19 involved, we get all of our guides out of Kugluktuk. We
20 get three guides, plus myself, that pay for -- plus we also
21 get Peter from Umingmaktok, the guide. And what happens,
22 all the meat we get first dibs at -- the guides get the
23 first dibs of the meat or whatever food they want to take,
24 and we leave some for the camp use, and whatever we don't
25 use we fly. We have charters coming from Yellowknife to

1 that caribou camp in Contwoyto Lake, so once a week,
2 whatever we don't use we fly, get rid of all the meat, try
3 not to keep the meat in camp. We fly it all to
4 Yellowknife, and it's distributed there, usually put into
5 the community freezer, and whoever wants it just comes down
6 and gets it. Thank you.

7 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Sam.

8 Bert.

9 MR. DEAN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

10 Thanks, Sam. And we've heard a bit -- I think
11 it's 70 tags that you use, and it's for how many weeks that
12 you're out there?

13 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Bert.

14 Sam.

15 MR. S. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

16 Yeah, it's about 70 tags for the Burnside HTO.
17 We run five-day hunts, or six hunts at eight hunters per
18 week. The start is probably -- the first week is not
19 usually full, but we do hunts for muskox, caribou, and
20 muskox used to be one-on-one. And then the next five
21 weeks, it's probably eight hunters a week. Thanks.

22 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Sam.

23 Bert.

24 MR. DEAN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

25 Thanks, Sam. And I'm asking these questions,

1 and I'm not sure, maybe we'll hear from others, but it's my
2 understanding it's this hunt that happens in sort of
3 mid-August through September that's probably where the bulk
4 of the harvest is happening on Bathurst caribou from
5 Nunavut. Would that be correct, or is there other
6 harvesting on the Bathurst herd that you'd be aware of?
7 Thank you.

8 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Bert.

9 Sam.

10 MR. S. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

11 You're correct there that, not to my knowledge,
12 there's no other harvest on Bathurst caribou other than our
13 hunts on Contwoyto Lake, no. Thank you.

14 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Sam.

15 Bert.

16 MR. DEAN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

17 That's all the questions I have. Thanks.

18 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much.

19 Okay. We'll move on to Kitikmeot Inuit
20 Association. Geoff.

21 KITIKMEOT INUIT ASSOCIATION QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

22 MR. CLARK: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

23 Geoff Clark, Kitikmeot Inuit Association.

24 Thanks for the presentation and your comments.

25 The first question is, in your time at Contwoyto Lake in

1 the south end of Bathurst Inlet, how many non-Inuit
2 residents -- maybe pick the last five years or time frame
3 that you wish. How much non-Inuit residents -- meaning, I
4 guess, non-Inuit from Cambridge Bay and Kugluktuk -- have
5 harvested caribou at Contwoyto Lake and south Bathurst
6 Inlet? Or how many caribou have been harvested by
7 non-Inuit residents in those areas?

8 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Geoff.

9 Sam.

10 MR. S. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

11 To my knowledge, none. To my knowledge, there
12 has been none taken by nonresident.

13 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Sam.

14 Geoff.

15 MR. CLARK: In the executive summary of the
16 January 14-15, 2016 meeting of the Government of Nunavut,
17 one of the more significant or, I guess, firm statements in
18 the summary is that, "The hunters and trappers organization
19 understand that more restriction measures on the
20 nonbeneficiary are necessary to preserve the Bathurst
21 caribou and to do that require a TAH being implemented."

22 So given that there's no harvest, that you're
23 aware of, of Bathurst caribou at Contwoyto Lake and south
24 Bathurst Inlet, does that statement that I just read to you
25 make sense?

1 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Geoff.

2 Sam.

3 MR. S. KAPOLAK: Can you repeat that statement, or
4 is it in the binder here? Thank you.

5 THE CHAIR: Geoff, repeat it.

6 MR. CLARK: I can repeat the statement.

7 The statement is, "They" -- and I presume that
8 means the HTO -- "understands that more restriction
9 measures on the nonbeneficiary are necessary to preserve
10 the Bathurst caribou and to do so requires a TAH." So if
11 there's no harvesting of Bathurst caribou, how does that,
12 in your mind, justify a TAH, or is a TAH justifiable based
13 on, I guess, the statement that there's harvest by
14 nonresidents?

15 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Geoff.

16 Sam, do you understand?

17 MR. S. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

18 Yeah, I'm not sure how to answer that question.
19 If you care to try and clarify it more, maybe I'll be able
20 to answer. Thank you.

21 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Sam.

22 Geoff.

23 MR. CLARK: Actually, Sam, I think your answer
24 that there's no harvest by residents at Contwoyto Lake and
25 south Bathurst Inlet is adequate for everyone's knowledge.

1 Thank you.

2 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thank you. Any other
3 questions? Attima.

4 MR. HADLARI: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

5 Just a couple of questions. My first question
6 is: The sport hunt tags, who made the decision on your
7 numbers of the sport hunts tags? Is it GN or HTO?

8 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Attima.

9 Sam.

10 MR. S. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

11 Yeah, it was the Board's decision to allocate
12 the tags. Thanks.

13 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Sam.

14 Attima.

15 MR. HADLARI: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

16 It was the board's decision to allocate the
17 tags. Thanks.

18 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Sam.

19 Attima.

20 MR. HADLARI: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

21 Burnside HTO, how many board members do you have
22 for Burnside HTO? Thank you.

23 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Attima.

24 Sam.

25 MR. S. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

1 Thank you, Attima. There's four of us on the
2 board right now. Like, there was four of us on the board
3 on Burnside right now and then, like Peter was saying,
4 we're kind of working closely together, more kind of joint
5 hunters and trappers organization. So there's four of us
6 for the Burnside HTO. Thanks.

7 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Sam.

8 All right. KIA, no further questions? Okay.
9 Thank you. We'll move forward, then.

10 North Slave Métis Alliance, Shin.

11 MR. SHIGA: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

12 Shin Shiga, North Slave Métis Alliance. Thank
13 you for the presentation. I have no questions.

14 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thank you, Shin. Moving on
15 to Adventure Northwest Limited, Boyd.

16 ADVENTURE NORTHWEST LIMITED QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

17 MR. WARNER: Thank you, Mr. Chairman, and thank
18 you, Sam. And I'll thank Connie later.

19 Sam, I just want to explore a little bit about
20 the sports hunts. And you've probably spent more time on
21 Contwoyto Lake in the last five years than anybody else I
22 know, and you've spent two months there every summer with
23 your family, your wife working, and your family, and you're
24 guiding hunts. So, arguably, you could be the most
25 experienced person right now on the land, or recently, and

1 I'm just wondering, Sam, what you've seen in those five
2 years in the way of caribou, how healthy they are, cows,
3 calves, and if there's been a change in those numbers that
4 you've seen while you've been there. Thank you.

5 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Boyd.

6 Sam.

7 MR. S. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Thank
8 you, Boyd.

9 In about the last five years, when the caribou
10 are migrating through there, I have not seen a great number
11 either decreasing or increasing. Like, the caribou, when
12 they come through Contwoyto Lake, they don't come all at
13 once. They come in waves. Like, they come in pockets of
14 maybe sometimes 50 animals, sometimes 600 animals, and
15 health-wise, it all depends on the temperature, the flies,
16 mosquitos, whatever. Depends. If it's cooler, they have a
17 lot of back fat.

18 Like I was saying, the health of the animals, it
19 all depends on the temperature. Some years we have a real
20 hot fall, some years we have a cool fall, and when we do
21 have a cool fall, we have real healthy animals, a lot of
22 back fat; and then when it's warm or hot and a lot of bugs
23 and stuff like that. When there's a lot of bugs, lot of
24 warble flies, the caribou are doing a lot of running.
25 That's the year they burn up a lot of energy, but most

1 years it's the bulls that we catch are very healthy
2 animals.

3 And for cow and calf observations, we see some
4 years -- every year is different. Some years we see a lot
5 of calves, some years we see a few calves. One year I
6 noticed that a lot of cows -- I mentioned in some other
7 meetings that one year that we seen a lot of cows with
8 twins.

9 And there was a question raised, that someone
10 asked me if they're adopting from other caribou, but
11 caribou won't adopt another calf, from my knowledge,
12 because I've seen them. I've observed them, calf lose his
13 mother, and he tried to go to another cow, and it'd nudge
14 him off.

15 Did that answer your question?

16 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Sam.

17 Boyd.

18 MR. WARNER: Yeah, it does, Sam. Thank you
19 very much. And, Sam, although I know you don't have an
20 official written plan in the sense of managing, but how
21 important do you think that the wolf harvests, from the
22 sports hunters when you're hunting at Contwoyto Lake, is in
23 relation to the caribou?

24 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Boyd.

25 Sam.

1 MR. S. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

2 Okay. I think it's going to be an important
3 role in helping the numbers of caribou. We know that the
4 wolves kill a lot of caribou, especially if they're in a
5 pack. A lot of people say a pack of wolves is a killing
6 machine. Like, they kill a caribou, and they don't usually
7 finish that caribou, and they move on. They kill another
8 caribou.

9 And one of the Elders in Cambridge Bay, at the
10 last, previous meeting mentioned that around Cambridge Bay
11 he went for a trip one day and he ran across probably, I
12 think he said, eight wolf kills in a matter of -- I don't
13 know how far apart the kills were, but in a short distance.

14 By saying that, I think it would be important to
15 not only wolves but for bears. I think, any predator,
16 mostly wolves and bears, because, like, our chairperson was
17 saying that around Bathurst Inlet we're starting to see a
18 lot more bears, but we're starting to see bears with three
19 cubs, like, which we never used to see. So the numbers of
20 the bears are also going up, and I've seen bears with cubs,
21 two cubs, but I've never seen a sow with three cubs until
22 this last fall and, not only one, but four with three cubs
23 in one day. Thanks.

24 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Sam.

25 Boyd.

1 MR. WARNER: Yeah, thank you. Just a couple
2 quick questions. Thank you, Sam.

3 Just on the meat, it was touched on a little bit
4 here, Sam, but just to maybe help understand, although
5 you're not harvesting personally, like, shooting the
6 caribou yourself, is it safe to say that your family and
7 the other guide's family are getting their winter meat from
8 the sports hunts at Contwoyto?

9 THE CHAIR: Thank you Boyd. Sam.
10 Sam.

11 MR. S. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

12 Yeah, I would totally agree with that. I myself
13 get enough caribou meat from those hunts to last me the
14 whole winter.

15 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Sam.
16 Boyd, briefly.

17 MR. WARNER: Okay. Thank you, Sam.

18 And I guess the last question for you, Sam, is
19 the lowest number that's been discussed on the Bathurst
20 herd, even if we define it now with the small range, is,
21 well, say 19,000 for argument's sake. Do you feel that the
22 harvesting of a few hundred of those caribou is detrimental
23 to the health of that herd.

24 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Boyd.
25 Sam.

1 MR. S. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

2 I feel that that low number we're taking, I
3 don't think it's going to cause too much disturbance to the
4 herd, the 19,000, compared to other regions, stuff like
5 that. From what I hear, on Baffin Island they have a
6 smaller population but a greater number that they can take,
7 so that small amount, I don't think it will really impact
8 on the caribou. Thanks.

9 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Sam.

10 Boyd.

11 MR. WARNER: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

12 And thank you, Sam. No further questions.

13 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much.

14 Okay. Quickly, if there's any questions from
15 the public. I don't think there is, so we're finished with
16 Bathurst HTO, and we'll take a lunch break and be back here
17 at 1:30. Thank you very much.

18 (Proceedings ended at 12:04 p.m.)

19

20 (Proceedings to recommence at 1:30 p.m.)

21

22 (Proceedings recommenced at 1:30 p.m.)

23 THE CHAIR: Good afternoon, everyone. Welcome
24 back. Thank you for being here on time -- and Paul, who
25 never made it out; no planes today.

1 Just a quick update here. So we have eight more
2 interveners to present yet and the rounds of questions, so
3 just in time, I ask that everybody make their points known,
4 give us your presentations and questions and be as brief
5 and as short as you can without losing the information that
6 you want to portray. And just to remind everybody, too, we
7 do have, for the record of the NWMB, all your written
8 submissions, so that is in as evidence to the Board.

9 So with that, we're going to try and finish.
10 We're going to go probably until 5, 5:30, and, if not,
11 we'll meet this evening, if we need to do that, so keep
12 that mind, too.

13 So next up is Bay Chimo HTO. Peter, do you have
14 a presentation?

15 BAY CHIMO HTO SUBMISSION

16 MR. P. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

17 Not a submission, just a statement. Umingmaktok
18 Hunters and Trappers Organization is against and will not
19 support the establishment of regional total allowable
20 harvest which is being recommended here at this hearing.
21 We're working closely with KRWB. Umingmaktok Hunters and
22 Trappers Organization and all other west Kitikmeot HTOs are
23 capable of managing their own caribou harvesting and other
24 wildlife management.

25 The residents of Umingmaktok and Bathurst Inlet

1 have not harvested any caribou of the Bathurst herd since
2 the animals have changed their migration route and calving
3 grounds west of Bathurst Inlet since 15 to 20 years now.
4 The herd was too far and too rocky for us to travel to
5 harvest the herd. We have mainly relied on the Dolphin
6 Union herd since they pass through Umingmaktok to their
7 wintering grounds.

8 That's nice and sweet. Thank you.

9 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Peter. Thank you very
10 much.

11 Okay. We'll start off with questions. Any
12 Board Members have questions from the Board? Charlie.

13 NUNAVUT WILDLIFE MANAGEMENT BOARD QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

14 MR. INUARAK: Clear and precise. Thank you.

15 And we'll take your information as noted, and they are
16 being recorded, and we'll not forget them.

17 My question for you is, the Kitikmeot Regional
18 Wildlife Board, you will be working with them to establish
19 a community-based management system. Are you in
20 preparation of establishing these community-based
21 management systems?

22 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Charlie.

23 Peter.

24 MR. P. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

25 Yes, we are. It's still in the works, but we

1 still have to work on it. Thank you.

2 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Peter.

3 Okay. No further questions from Board Members,
4 I'll pass it on to staff and legal counsel. No questions?
5 Okay.

6 Government of Nunavut, any questions?

7 MR. GISSING: No questions.

8 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Drikus.

9 Government of Nunavut?

10 MS. YONGE: No questions.

11 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lynda.

12 Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife Board, Simon.

13 KITIKMEOT REGIONAL WILDLIFE BOARD QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS.

14 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: Qujannamiik, itsivautaaq.

15 Simon Qingnaqtuq, Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife
16 Board. I have one question. As you said, the caribou went
17 further into the rocky areas. Do you have any idea or any
18 information as to how come they moved further out?

19 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Simon.

20 Peter.

21 MR. P. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

22 As Sam said, I'll give you the same answer.
23 They're always moving. They don't stay in one spot for so
24 many years. That gives the vegetation time to grow again
25 in one spot, and then they move to another place. Thank

1 you.

2 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Peter.

3 Simon? Okay.

4 Kugluktuk HTO, Larry.

5 KUGLUKTUK HTO QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

6 MR. L. ADJUN: No questions from the Board, but
7 just a statement from the Chairman.

8 We are working with the four HTO organizations
9 to develop a Bathurst caribou management plan from the west
10 Kitikmeot Region, this along with KIA.

11 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry. A statement.

12 Bathurst Inlet HTO, any questions?

13 MR. S. KAPOLAK: No questions.

14 THE CHAIR: Thank you. Cambridge Bay HTO,
15 Bobby.

16 MR. GREENLEY: Thank you, Mr. Chair. No
17 questions.

18 THE CHAIR: Thank you.

19 Any questions from the Elders in the room to the
20 Bay Chimo HTO?

21 MR. BOLT: I don't have any questions from
22 the Kugluktuk HTO representative. Thank you, sir.

23 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much.

24 NTI, Paul.

25 NUNAVUT TUNNGAVIK INCORPORATED QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

1 MR. IRNGAUT: Qujannamiik, itsivautaaq.

2 Paul Irngaut from NTI. One quick question. Did
3 you harvest Bathurst caribou, to your knowledge, in the
4 past? Were they ever harvested?

5 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Paul.

6 Peter.

7 MR. P. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

8 Yes, we have harvested about 20 years ago in
9 each migration. Thank you.

10 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Peter.

11 Paul.

12 MR. IRNGAUT: Thanks for that answer. Paul
13 Irngaut from NTI. No further questions.

14 THE CHAIR: Thank you, NTI. Moving on to
15 Kitikmeot Inuit Association, Geoff.

16 KITIKMEOT INUIT ASSOCIATION QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

17 MR. CLARK: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

18 Geoff Clark, Kitikmeot Inuit Association. A
19 question for the presenter. Can you tell the difference
20 between a Bathurst Inlet caribou, Ahiak caribou, and
21 Beverly caribou when you're out hunting? Thank you.

22 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Geoff.

23 Peter.

24 MR. P. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

25 That's a good question. Personally, no.

1 They're all the same caribou to me. Thank you.

2 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Peter.

3 Geoff.

4 MR. CLARK: Thank you. No more questions.

5 THE CHAIR: Thank you, KIA.

6 North Slave Métis Alliance, Shin.

7 MR. SHIGA: Thank you. Shin Shiga, North

8 Slave Métis Alliance. I have no questions.

9 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much.

10 VENTURE Northwest, Boyd.

11 ADVENTURE NORTHWEST LIMITED QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

12 MR. WARNER: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

13 And thank you, Peter. Just a couple quick

14 questions kind of similar to what I asked Sam. I know

15 you're working with us and we're outfitting using your

16 tags, part of your tags, too, at Contwoyto Lake. I'm just

17 wondering what your observations, for the Board's sake and

18 others, that you see of the caribou there, if they're

19 healthy and the numbers of caribou. Maybe you could speak

20 to that a little bit, Peter.

21 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Boyd.

22 Peter.

23 MR. P. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

24 Yes, I have been working with Boyd, Adventures

25 Northwest, for the last three years now, and I have noticed

1 that they were pretty healthy. Like Sam said, it all
2 depends on the weather each fall. When it's cold, they're
3 nice and fat. And I'll repeat that, when they're running
4 away from the mosquitos, they're kind of lean. Thank you.

5 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Peter.

6 Boyd.

7 MR. WARNER: And, Peter, you guys are up there
8 for about six to eight weeks every fall. Is there usually
9 a consistent amount of caribou? Are they all the same
10 caribou, or do you notice different animals moving in and
11 out of the area? What do you see in that respect?

12 MR. P. KAPOLAK: Like I said to KIA, I can't tell
13 the difference between the caribou, but I have seen quite a
14 few caribou moving in and out of Contwoyto, and I have
15 worked at Pellett, but they're pretty slow around Pellett
16 Lake, so there's more caribou around Contwoyto moving on
17 their migration.

18 MR. WARNER: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

19 And thank you, Peter. No more questions.

20 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Boyd.

21 Is there any questions of the public to HTO? If
22 there is none, we'll move on. Thank you very much.

23 All right. For next presentation, Cambridge Bay
24 HTO. Bobby.

25 CAMBRIDGE BAY HTO SUBMISSION

1 MR. GREENLEY: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

2 Bobby Greenley, Cambridge Bay HTO.

3 A lot of you are probably wondering why we are
4 sitting in on this. I've been pushing to be more involved
5 with this Bathurst herd, as we are also affected by it. We
6 don't harvest or see very many of them. They mostly travel
7 in the summertime down that way when we see them. We do
8 travel a lot from here south, long distances to the east,
9 even to the west. We're central with all the other herds,
10 so we are affected by this decision also.

11 So I'm just going to pass the mic over to
12 George, and he's just going to give a background on some
13 information of how Cambridge Bay is also affected and what
14 we have done. Thank you.

15 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Bobby. George, go
16 ahead.

17 MR. G. ANGOHIATOK: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

18 It's going to be a little bit lengthy, but I
19 feel it's important that everybody understands our position
20 why we're here. As you all know, Bay Chimo and Bathurst,
21 way back, was a couple of large communities, and the
22 communities have separated, some moving to Kugluktuk and
23 some moving here to Cambridge Bay. So our board feels very
24 strongly that in order to represent our members fairly and
25 effectively we don't exclude any of our members, so that's

1 the reason why we're sitting here.

2 Anyways, I had a bunch of stuff written down.
3 To start out our submission to NWMB on the Bathurst caribou
4 hearing on total allowable harvest. Some history first to
5 share on local hunters from early 1970s. At that time, our
6 animals that we hunted, muskox and caribou were
7 nonexistent. I mean, there was very few island caribou
8 that we harvested in the middle of the island north up the
9 island about 40 to 50 miles.

10 So that left us no choice but to go south, and
11 we went south to the Hope Bay area over the winter. And as
12 a young man, I followed my father, rode on his qamutik, and
13 we went down with a lot of hunters travelling together, and
14 we would harvest, on average, between five to ten animals
15 per sled, and they were Bathurst caribou. They went right
16 through the inlet in great numbers back in the '70s. We
17 all heard Sam and Peter's submission.

18 My wife is from Bay Chimo, so I felt very
19 strongly, and ties with Bay Chimo is very strong. We go
20 down there all the time, not only to harvest, but just to
21 enjoy the beautiful country, especially in the summertime.

22 Having said that, we noticed that after the mine
23 was put in place, Echo Bay Mines, the caribou migration
24 altered, so we quit seeing them passing through Bathurst.

25 So at the time, my brother and I and Sam and

1 Peter's brother went up to do some hunting, and we watched
2 the caribou. They had built a winter road from Yellowknife
3 to Echo Bay, and these large numbers of caribou we would
4 observe for hours and hours, large numbers that would not
5 cross the winter road. It was a barrier.

6 So, you know, a lot of people think or say that
7 mining has no effect on the north, but this is proof. This
8 is evidence that, you know, the migration route is altered
9 because of mining. They couldn't cross the road. It was a
10 barrier that they couldn't cross.

11 So we brought up that at several of our meetings
12 way back.

13 You know, when our government officials gave out
14 their land leases for the exploration, the mining and
15 exploration to come and do their things, you know, they
16 have to be considered also. I'm going to include them,
17 too, because it's affected Bay Chimo and Bathurst big time,
18 and some of the locals have no idea as to why the caribou
19 had rerouted, but from our observations, we had photographs
20 of all big large numbers of caribou that would not cross.

21 So when KIA gives out these land use permits,
22 they have to, you know, consult with the community so that
23 the effects of mining could be discussed at length and
24 everybody could understand what's going on.

25 You know, mining is a big part of the north now.

1 In my eyes, it's short-term. We get a little bit of money
2 for a very short period of time, but in the long run, it
3 affects some of our country food, mainly the caribou. And,
4 you know, we would urge the government officials that have
5 the right to give out these permits to think about the
6 beneficiaries first, because we are an Inuit entity, and
7 consideration to impacts on Inuit should be addressed
8 before they make their decisions.

9 During the summer -- I'm just going to add a
10 little bit to what Connie said. During the summer, my wife
11 and I went down there a couple years ago. On our trip for
12 about six days, we saw no caribou, one ox on King
13 Peninsula, but we did see daily sightings of carnivores,
14 nothing but carnivores. We saw bears every day, we saw
15 wolves every day, and wolverines, so, you know, we
16 discussed that at length. And the carnivores are
17 outnumbering the caribou in Bathurst Inlet.

18 Although our hunters, our local hunters do take
19 the odd caribou on our boating trips, we're not sure
20 exactly if it is the Bathurst herd. I know on the coast
21 right along King Peninsula there are some island caribou,
22 and you can tell the difference very easily by observing
23 them, the colour, the short snout on them. But we know
24 that there was a problem with the Bathurst herd when we
25 couldn't see any. There was a lack of caribou down there.

1 And I'm going to go on to, you know, what our
2 ancestors understood. They never over-harvested. You
3 heard today that the Elder here with us, they found ways to
4 control the predators that were affecting the caribou,
5 which is nonevident today in our GN's positions. And that
6 proves that our ancestors knew and understood that
7 over-harvesting was not right. They conserved the animals.
8 Not only the caribou, but fishing and all that they used to
9 survive over the years.

10 I'm going to go back to some examples of our
11 organization in dealing with issues that have come into our
12 community. One of them was our char. This is just an
13 example now of what our community members have done and
14 continue to do and feel strongly about this, is that our
15 fish, as young men growing up, were very small. Like, they
16 were three-, four-pounders, and a big char would be eight
17 pounds. And our community got together. We held a
18 community meeting and a voluntary ban on fishing was put in
19 place by the community members. They voluntarily, you
20 know, agreed to stop fishing in the bay, because in the bay
21 here, in the immediate bay, each person had their own
22 little selected spot where they would put a gill net. And
23 when we consulted with the community members and they
24 understood that there was a problem, they automatically
25 ceased fishing, and the only fishing that was allowed was

1 for the Elders that couldn't get out, couldn't get out to
2 the farther areas where the fish were. So this shows that
3 our community is very strong in pulling together and coming
4 up with answers and solutions.

5 So the total allowable harvest that is set or
6 trying to be set by the GN, we do not agree with it because
7 all avenues were not looked at. Well, they know of some of
8 them that the GNWT has ways to work with them, and Nunavut
9 government. Being relatively new to all this, you know,
10 we're learning as we go along from each other, from hearing
11 what the other places are doing to conserve their animals
12 or their country foods. So, you know, take lessons from
13 them and we thank them for sharing with us their
14 experiences.

15 The caribou meetings that were held here, a lot
16 of them that were held here, we were never invited. So
17 when we did become invited, it was like, you know,
18 something that you went to that you didn't understand what
19 was going on. So it took a while for us to catch up with
20 what was going on at their meetings and try and, you know,
21 catch up. You can't have any input when you don't know
22 what's going on. So very important, I think, that every
23 community that is part of caribou management plans that are
24 being put in place, we should be included in that as well.

25 We've never felt that the Bathurst caribou herd

1 was in trouble until we started seeing on the news that
2 there was a problem that numbers were going down big time,
3 and it was mentioned by a lot of our community members that
4 a cycle is being taken.

5 A lot of the suggestions have been against the
6 predators, but our GN delegates always seem to send it away
7 because it's costly, and nobody's tried it. But the GNWT
8 has showed us that there are ways that you can work on
9 this, and I feel strongly that this total allowable
10 harvest -- well, we are not in support of it because we
11 feel that all avenues haven't been looked at or considered;
12 and once that is done, you know, we may support it. We may
13 not. But with that incomplete -- what am I trying to look
14 for? -- the incomplete study and sharing with the
15 communities, I feel that it's incomplete and a total
16 allowable harvest should not be imposed.

17 And I agree with Connie's submission today that,
18 you know, we need to share with our young people, pass on
19 what we know. Our language is gone, most of it, in the
20 Kitikmeot -- not so much in the east, but in the Kitikmeot,
21 and then next is going to be our harvesting rights, you
22 know. That's going to disappear too, how to properly
23 handle the animals that we harvest.

24 So we feel strongly that TAH is not the answer
25 at this time. Quana.

1 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much, George.

2 Okay. With that, I'll open questions up from
3 Board Members. Any questions? David.

4 NUNAVUT WILDLIFE MANAGEMENT BOARD QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

5 MR. KRITTERDLIK: Thank you. David Kritterdlik,
6 NWMB Board Member, Inuktitut.

7 The wildlife and caribou, there's a lot of
8 deterrence where cumulative efforts concerning the decrease
9 in the population, like mining and other carnivores or
10 predators, and in Qikiqtarjuaq beside our community there's
11 been a lot of development going on in our community area.
12 There's been about four years they have helicopters. Every
13 single year they use helicopters that fly low, and the
14 caribou that migrate through our communities have moved
15 away using different routes.

16 And I think I'm asking you, is that the same
17 over here that helicopters are causing them to move away
18 because of the sound?

19 THE CHAIR: Thank you, David.

20 Bobby.

21 MR. GREENLEY: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

22 I believe that, with all the noise, that it does
23 drive the animals to different areas. I know our board, at
24 our meetings, we've discussed this kind of stuff. And with
25 all the helicopters and mining, the noise I think does

1 cause an issue with making them move to different areas.

2 Thank you.

3 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Bobby.

4 Charlie.

5 MR. INUARAK: I don't want to be the only one
6 asking questions, but I do have questions for you. You
7 mention you specifically notice that when they started
8 mining in your area that the caribou changed their route,
9 migration route. And when you noticed that -- I mean, I'd
10 like to know what you've noticed.

11 Have you seen a vast number of caribou dying
12 off? Is there carcasses? Do you think they're moving away
13 because of the mining companies, or their habitat area is
14 depleted and they are moving away to other area? Do you
15 think that, since they have moved somewhere else, different
16 route, do you think they're in danger of extinction or
17 extirpating to somewhere else?

18 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Charlie.

19 George.

20 MR. G. ANGOHIATOK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

21 In our observations at Contwoyto Lake, we stayed
22 on an island -- there's a building there -- and our
23 observations from that point was that the large number of
24 caribou were moving to the west, a lot of them. I mean,
25 there wasn't just a hundred. There was thousands and

1 thousands of them that there were moving to the west. That
2 road was a barrier that they would not cross. We didn't
3 observe any kind of caribou that were killed in great
4 numbers. It was just that they would not cross this
5 barrier. It was a barrier to them. Quana.

6 THE CHAIR: Thank you, George.

7 Any other questions from the Board? Simeonie.

8 MR. KEENAINAK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

9 And thank you very much for your presentation,
10 George. You actually saw with your own eyes the vast
11 number of caribou that were migrating through your thing.
12 So those mining companies, through your organization, have
13 you discussed this with the mining companies or the people
14 who built the roads? Have you talked to the officials of
15 those organizations or industry and let them know, this is
16 what you're doing to our herd? Have you talked to them?

17 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Simeonie.

18 George.

19 MR. G. ANGOHIATOK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

20 Back in those days, I had just begun with the
21 HTOs, and at the time, I became a chairperson of what back
22 then was the Kitikmeot Hunters and Trappers Organization.
23 And we discussed at length, at one of our meetings with the
24 mine explorations, a process that they called IIBA, Inuit
25 Impact and Benefits Agreement.

1 And I mentioned to them that there was a big
2 change in the Bathurst herd that was not coming down
3 through Bay Chimo and Bathurst and was a concern to us, and
4 I mentioned that the IIBA was in place. But because there
5 was nothing written, nothing in written submission about
6 our agreement, they just shook it off, and nothing ever
7 came of that. Quana.

8 THE CHAIR: Thank you, George.

9 Simeonie.

10 MR. KEENAINAK: Qujannamiik. Just a comment.
11 That's always the same practice to this day. When
12 everything is orally presented or submitted, our government
13 doesn't hold true our oral presentations or comments. And
14 the government will not include Inuit traditional knowledge
15 if it was orally presented, and when it is submitted orally
16 and not written, it's as though that these oral
17 presentations are excluded, and there's considerations of
18 the government because our tradition is an oral traditional
19 for generations, that there is room for improvement.

20 It has become obvious that there's room for
21 improvement, and our Elders were saying that the Inuit
22 survive on wildlife according to the Inuit traditional
23 knowledge on survival and culture of working together, and
24 this oral history and oral language should not be a
25 deterrent to stop us from being involved in establishing

1 management systems. And the other carnivores or cumulative
2 effects like mining have never been blamed for anything
3 except hunters.

4 Thank you. I just wanted to say that.

5 THE CHAIR: Thank you for that comment,
6 Simeonie. Caleb.

7 MR. SANGOYA: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

8 I know that there was a mine on Baffin Island.
9 I'm just wondering if the same results have been observed
10 that every 15 minutes the helicopters fly over. From June
11 to October they're always flying. They always fly every 15
12 minutes for 24 hours.

13 And when they make the routes, the great big
14 vehicles start going back and forth, and you cannot cross
15 those roads, and it is difficult for the caribou to cross
16 the roads. Is that the case, too, here? And I know -- 20
17 mile -- on either side that that was built -- that can kill
18 off the caribou. Without consulting us the roads were
19 made. I'm just wondering if that is the case, too, here.

20 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Caleb.

21 George.

22 MR. G. ANGOHIATOK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

23 I don't believe that the traffic -- or we have
24 very few helicopters at the time. This was at the end of
25 the winter season, the winter road closure, there was no

1 more traffic on that road. But, still, the caribou found
2 that ice road, the high windrows from the snow was a
3 barrier. Like, it's probably from the smell, too, of the
4 road, of the equipment driving through, I believe. Thank
5 you.

6 THE CHAIR: Thank you, George.

7 Any other questions? Charlie.

8 MR. INUARAK: There's lots of comments to be
9 made, but I just want to make it clear. On Baffin Island,
10 when we were dealing with the caribou, there was a
11 moratorium, and Inuit that have the knowledge, they were
12 saying what they've seen. And the local HTOs were also
13 invited. I just wanted information, that you can write to
14 us as Board Members. And I know that the correspondence
15 that we get from Kugluktuk are going to assist us. But if
16 you want to make it more clear, you should write to the
17 Board, make a submission to the Board, because we do deal
18 with written submissions or letters, correspondence. Thank
19 you.

20 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Charlie, for that
21 comment. Any other questions from the Board? If not, any
22 questions from NWMB staff? Michael?

23 The Government of Nunavut, any questions?

24 MR. GISSING: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. No
25 questions from us.

1 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Drikus.
2 Government of Northwest Territories?
3 MS. YONGE: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
4 Lynda Yonge, Government of Northwest
5 Territories. No questions.
6 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lynda.
7 Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife Board. Simon, any
8 questions?
9 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
10 Simon Qingnaqtuq, Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife
11 Board. We don't have any questions at this moment.
12 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Simon.
13 Kugluktuk HTO, Larry, any questions?
14 KUGLUKTUK HTO QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS
15 MR. L. ADJUN: Larry Adjun, chairman, HTO.
16 Just another comment again that we will support
17 Cambridge Bay in our endeavour to do the combined Bathurst
18 Island management committee, and I will have one of my
19 directors make a comment.
20 THE CHAIR: Go ahead, Jorgen.
21 MR. BOLT: Thank you there, Mr. Chair. Thank
22 you. I just want to kind of add to the mine effects here.
23 I've been fortunate enough to work as a wildlife
24 technician with the Ekati Diamond Mine, and the Diavik
25 Diamond Mine, and I did a lot of aerial surveys on a weekly

1 basis. I worked there at the Ekati mine for a good eight
2 years as a wildlife technician, as an environment
3 technician.

4 And they asked me a few times to -- they knew
5 that I hunted that area quite extensively, and so they
6 asked me to -- I don't know, how would you say --
7 judge or -- because they were putting these crossings in
8 place on the road which were affecting their migration
9 route.

10 I would drive down this Misery road, and my job
11 was to see if the caribou were getting deflected from the
12 road. And you can see that some of the areas where the
13 roads have been plowed, you can see that it was quite a
14 barrier for them. And so they were asking us or asking IQ,
15 traditional knowledge, "How can we do this?" So I said,
16 "Well, we need to put some crossings in place," so they
17 did. But they didn't ask, Where do we put them? They just
18 kind of threw them all over the road there onto the road.
19 Because the caribou are not going to say, oh, hey, guys,
20 there's a crossing at kilometre 17. Let's go check it out.
21 The caribou are not going to say that.

22 They need to find these traditional routes and
23 then put their crossing. And I've watched caribou come
24 down. The animals have the right-of-way at the mine site.
25 And I watched caribou come through that mine site, through

1 these crossings, and I know how fast they go when they're
2 moving through when they're heading to their wintering
3 grounds, but these passages that they built for these
4 caribou crossings were not sufficient enough. The caribou
5 were literally picking their way through these big sharp
6 rocks. Some of them getting cut, I believe, I'm sure.
7 Some of them are razor sharp, and you can see them, it
8 would take them all day. For an area for them to go
9 through, say, two or three miles, it's just going to take
10 them a few minutes. But when that barrier was there, it
11 took them all day to pick through that crossing.

12 Like, there's, I don't know, 4 or 5,000 one time
13 I seen. It took them all day, all day, all day trying to
14 get through that crossing. So I said, this is the wrong.
15 The caribou don't go looking for the roughest part to
16 cross. They need to have a good smooth road, if you will.
17 And so they said, okay, well, what do we need to do, then?
18 Well, you need to make those crossings a little bit
19 smaller, real smooth so the caribou just move right on
20 through without any hesitation or anything like that.

21 Then we tried to -- I don't know, how would you
22 say -- mitigate some of the concerns that were on the mine
23 site. We tried to use traditional knowledge. We used
24 Inukshuks around the runways and stuff like that, but those
25 are used only as when they're actually hunting. You can't

1 just place a bunch of Inukshuks out there and expect the
2 caribou to, say, oh, look, there's an Inukshuk. Better go
3 the other way. It's not going to work like that.

4 The only time they utilize those things is when
5 actually the caribou come in, and then they start building
6 these Inukshuks. And so they tried to use these to deter
7 caribou around the runway or whatever. But I told them
8 it's just a pile of rocks to the caribou. You know? They
9 use these when they're actually hunting and the caribou are
10 under stress and they get confused, and so they use them to
11 drive them to the lakes where the men in kayaks wait with
12 spears and bow and arrows.

13 But just to come back to those crossings for
14 those mines, they need to be -- like I said, these guys
15 need to be informed where they're going to put these
16 crossings, and they need to put them on traditional
17 crossing routes, not just anywhere on the road.

18 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

19 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jorgen.

20 Any other questions, comments from Kugluktuk?
21 Larry.

22 MR. L. ADJUN: None, itsivautaaq. Quana.

23 THE CHAIR: Bathurst Inlet HTO, any questions
24 for Cambridge Bay?

25 BATHURST INLET HTO QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

1 MR. S. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Thank you,
2 Ikaluktutiak.

3 Just one quick question. In your statement you
4 said that, you're invited to some of the caribou meetings
5 there. As we all know, caribou is a big issue on the table
6 now, and it has been and always will be for a while in the
7 future. Just wondering why you were not invited to some of
8 the meetings. Do you know the reason why? Thank you.

9 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Sam.
10 Bobby.

11 MR. GREENLEY: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
12 I don't know, in the binder here you could see
13 the previous meetings. There was about ten. We probably
14 attended Bluenose ones, maybe. There was never Bathurst.
15 The first one we've attended was here in January. This is
16 the second one.

17 It could be funding. I have no idea why. Maybe
18 they didn't know that we're also affected. It could be
19 many -- couple reasons here, but maybe lack of knowledge
20 that we also could be affected. Like I said, it could be
21 funding also. I don't know. Funding shouldn't stop us.
22 We should also be invited, from my point of view. Thank
23 you.

24 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Bobby.
25 Sam.

1 MR. S. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

2 That's the reason why I raised that question is,
3 caribou is caribou, and we all live on it, and we all need
4 to be all participating and help one another. Thank you.

5 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Sam.

6 Bay Chimo HTO. Peter, anything?

7 MR. P. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

8 No questions, but I'd like just to support all
9 the comments and statements that they made. Thank you.

10 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Peter.

11 Elders. Is there any Elders that would like to
12 ask questions of Cambridge Bay HTO? Sam.

13 QUAJIMANILIIT QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

14 MR. S. ANGOHIATOK: I just want to make a few
15 comments. As I listened to the discussions, I just wanted
16 to make some comments. The caribou discussions that went
17 on, I wanted to make a few comments.

18 As I've been here for years and the depletion
19 issue, that's how they are as caribou. They move around to
20 different areas. As a young man, for years I didn't see
21 caribou. The first time that I saw one, because at the
22 time when we started travelling around the Contwoyto Lake
23 area, there was no caribou. Caribou started to come
24 around. They were more plentiful as years went by.

25 And I've taken part in the flights where surveys

1 are done. I've seen so many caribou. Counting caribou,
2 trying to count caribou, we're low, and the herd is huge.
3 And once you get high, then it seems like they'd be
4 difficult to count because there was no photography
5 technology at the time. I've seen these instances.

6 Caribou are depleting, maybe. Maybe wolves,
7 because wolves eat them for food, the wolves, if they don't
8 have much to eat. And Inuit that go out on the land not
9 knowing where to go. Some of the wolves tend to be in
10 packs, because when wolves are in this kind of situation,
11 like, one has to be very careful around them because
12 wolves, once they're hungry, then one needs to be very
13 weary about getting close to them. I've often come across
14 these instances. I came across some wolves, and one
15 started following me, so I took off. They're not afraid.

16 I just wanted to make a few comments about some
17 of my thoughts. When I worked at Echo Bay, caribou in June
18 and July were like a big white blanket on the land on the
19 move. That's what it seemed like. I've seen that in the
20 Echo Bay area. I was in a vehicle all day because I drove
21 heavy equipment at the time as part of my employment.

22 We wanted to go fishing at times. Once we were
23 done our work during the day, we'd walk to the lake. Once
24 we got onto the lake, we started fishing through the ice
25 where there was holes. We never caught any fish. I often

1 thought to myself, near our camp, heavy equipment go
2 underground. The miners are underground just underneath
3 the buildings, and you can feel the vibrations when they're
4 blowing the ore underneath the buildings. That's where the
5 mine was.

6 I've heard the depletion of caribou. That
7 discussion's gone on for years now. If it depletes, then
8 it won't come back. But they go to different areas.
9 Because their food is depleting in one area, they move on
10 to other areas to feed, and it takes them years to return.
11 I just wanted to make a comment on these.

12 Why are these -- like, wolves and grizzlies, why
13 are they being protected, it seems? Because many years ago
14 before the guns were introduced, these animals that killed
15 off the caribou or lived off the caribou were killed with a
16 knife because of no guns at the time. I've never tried
17 that because, even though I have a gun now, still I have to
18 be very leery about those kind of situations when I come
19 across wolves and grizzlies.

20 That's how to live. We need our country food,
21 too. That's why people go out hunting. And grizzlies are
22 often killed because people want to eat them, too. That is
23 the way life was. Those are the comments I want to make.

24 To go and get country food, one needs to get
25 out, and I've heard a lot of comments -- those are true --

1 as Inuit go out hunting. In terms of the mining and the
2 impact it has on wildlife, I'm not too sure. I just wanted
3 to make a few of these comments. To hear some of the
4 comments, those are right on. They're true because they
5 are speaking what they've lived, what they've experienced.
6 Those are my comments.

7 Flying over in an aircraft trying to count when,
8 we're low, it's difficult to count, but once they're up
9 higher, it's even harder because animals get very small.
10 Picture taking was not available at the time.

11 Thank you for those that are wanting to assist
12 on this issue. We, as Inuit, it is our traditional food.
13 Caribou is a favourite food of not only the Inuit; of
14 others, too. Those are my thoughts, my comments to this
15 moment.

16 I thank you for your comments because of the
17 things that you've thought about. I'll close there. Thank
18 you.

19 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Sam. Anything else?

20 If not, next, NTI. Paul or Bert, anything?

21 MR. IRNGAUT: Qujannamiik, itsivautaaq.

22 Paul Irngaut. No comment.

23 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thank you.

24 KIA. Geoff.

25 MR. CLARK: Mr. Chair, thank you. We have no

1 questions.

2 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Geoff.

3 The North Slave Métis Alliance, Shin.

4 MR. SHIGA: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

5 We have no questions.

6 THE CHAIR: Thank you.

7 Adventures Northwest Boyd.

8 MR. WARNER: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

9 And no questions. Just a comment that I hope
10 that you're included at Bathurst advisory.

11 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much. Any
12 questions from the public for Cambridge Bay HTO? I don't
13 think there's any.

14 Thank you very much, gentlemen, for your
15 presentation.

16 Okay. We'll move on to the next intervener, I
17 should say, and that's the Elders, Elders' committee and
18 the Elders represented by the four HTOs. And I think,
19 Jorgen, you're going to lead this? Or if you have anything
20 to say or any Elder has anything to say or present to this
21 Board, we would appreciate that be done now.

22 QUAJIMANILIIT SUBMISSION

23 MR. BOLT: Okay. Yeah maybe just to add on a
24 few comments again.

25 Like, I grew up at home, too, and just kind of

1 going back to Mary Kaniak's comments earlier on about --
2 even some of the comments that some of people may have made
3 that the wolves are a killing machine.

4 I've hunted a few wolves back home. I got a few
5 wolves back home, do lots of hunting around Great Bear, up
6 through there, and hunted with my dad a lot, lots of other
7 men.

8 And when there's a lot of caribou around, you
9 can see -- me and my dad, we've come across dead caribou
10 where only the tail had been pulled off, and the wolves are
11 just checking for how healthy that animal is. Just the
12 tail is pulled off. You could see it's still steaming.
13 The caribou had just been killed.

14 And you leave that, and you keep tracking those
15 wolves. Another mile or so, there's another dead caribou
16 with only its tail pulled off. And you can see that they
17 just kind of nibble on it a bit, and then off again they
18 go; go killing another caribou just to check to see how
19 healthy is it and is it worthwhile eating.

20 So I just kind of wanted to add to Mary's
21 comments on finding all these dead caribou around on the
22 tundra at times when she was inland. So that kind of put
23 more oomph into what I was going to say, I guess. So
24 that's all I have to say. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

25 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jorgen.

1 Peter.

2 MR. TAKTOGON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

3 I grew up around Contwoyto Lake area. The
4 Bathurst herd was real big. When they're migrating north,
5 it used to shake the ground and everything, and you could
6 see the land just moving. That's how that herd was the
7 biggest herd from the three herds.

8 Anyways, in those days there was lots of bulls.
9 Bulls used to be the last ones to migrate through going
10 north and south. In those days when we used to live up
11 there, we used to rarely see grizzly bears. Just once in a
12 great while. That's how it was. Us people, we used to
13 live off the land, they control the predators, the wolves
14 and grizzly bears, you know, for subsistence and trapping
15 and whatever. Like I said, that's how it was controlled.

16 Same thing with the caribous, certain species of
17 what caribou you need to use. I learned that. And I
18 observe caribou while growing up there. During fall time,
19 like I said yesterday, when the bulls are mating, they get
20 so tired, and it's so easy for the wolverines and the
21 grizzly bears to get them.

22 And there's a few times I observed in my
23 growing-up life with caribou, I used to see some golden
24 eagles. We get a lot of those golden eagles right around
25 Kugluktuk and south around Contwoyto Lake and everything.

1 When caribou get a little far, and they just come out, and
2 they just grab them, and that's how they get them.

3 Like I said, it's not fair shooting off the
4 bulls. The bulls are the main breeders. I'm always
5 against that. That's what's been happening from the
6 beginning. There was a lot of sport hunters and everything
7 all over the north just killing off bulls, you know. Now,
8 I don't agree what GN, Northwest Territories, to get only
9 bulls. You want to kill off bull caribou; then to what it
10 is now, what's happening?

11 You know, like now, I go in and out lots south,
12 west, and north. Nowadays you can't see very much bulls on
13 Bluenose in the Bathurst. You rarely see them now. Maybe
14 that's the reason why the predators, when they're mating
15 and whatever -- like I observe it -- they're killing off
16 bulls, and I'm still against government enforcing to shoot
17 only bulls.

18 That's my comment. Quana.

19 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Peter.

20 Is there any other comments by any Elders or
21 representation from Elders? If not, those that spoke, we
22 will go around the table for questions again.

23 Is there any Board Members that have questions?
24 Questions to the Elders that represented right now, Jorgen
25 and Peter.

1 MR. SANGOYA: Just comment.

2 THE CHAIR: Comment? Go ahead, Caleb.

3 NUNAVUT WILDLIFE MANAGEMENT BOARD QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

4 MR. SANGOYA: Thank you, Mr. Chairman, for
5 giving them an opportunity, the Elders, because they know
6 more than us because they've lived through it. They were
7 the managers before the government came around. They've
8 managed them well, so that's why we have caribou today
9 because they were managing very well. And their knowledge
10 is different from the people that are here.

11 So I just want to encourage them that the Inuit
12 knowledge -- the government that will be the managers in
13 the future -- to manage caribou using traditional knowledge
14 is the best. If the traditional knowledge were written
15 down and if we start writing them down regarding when we're
16 dealing with caribou, they should guide us when we make
17 decisions. Because they tried to run our affairs by the
18 people that don't live here; they're just visitors here in
19 our land.

20 And that is the place, too, that the people from
21 Greenland are saying, because when they live here for one
22 year, they think they have more knowledge than the people
23 that live here forever. So I want to make that clear
24 because that's how I grew up.

25 You just estimate and think what you want to

1 think about. And my grandfather would have slapped you on
2 the face if you tried that on him. Okay. Inuit, let's be
3 strong. Thank you.

4 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Caleb for a comment.

5 Larry, do you want to respond to that?

6 MR. L. ADJUN: Just a further comment, not to
7 respond to it.

8 Kugluktuk, from our area, from the mainland
9 area, as you've heard from the Elders, our knowledge, our
10 traditional knowledge, we'll state, it's a variety of
11 issues that have driven this -- it's a cycle. That's what
12 it's always been told from the Elders. It goes up, it goes
13 down.

14 So what we've got to do with the younger
15 generation, we've got to work hand in hand using
16 traditional knowledge and using the wildlife department,
17 use scientific fact and traditional knowledge to make one
18 known fact. So we've got to combine both traditional
19 knowledge and scientific fact to alleviate our issues with
20 the caribou. That's all I got to say.

21 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry.

22 Any other comments or questions from the Board?
23 Okay. If not -- oh, Charlie.

24 MR. INUARAK: Perhaps I'll ask the Elders. The
25 Nunavut government and the GNWT regarding working on the

1 caribou. They're saying that the caribou is declining.

2 I'm asking you: Will the Bathurst herd be returning?

3 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Charlie.

4 Peter.

5 MR. TAKTOGON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

6 Yeah, they are declining pretty fast. In the
7 past, they used to go around close to Kugluktuk, and there
8 used to be thousands of them. In my travelling time and
9 everything, I go in and out on the lands for the last eight
10 years, I never harvested Bathurst caribou. It is sad, but
11 I think they're migrating further south into Yellowknife.

12 That's my answer.

13 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Peter.

14 Simeonie.

15 MR. KEENAINAK: My question is to the Elders. We
16 know the fox and the wolves, the predators. And we see
17 that they tend to have rabies or whatever. I haven't seen
18 the Baffin Region -- there hasn't been any rabies outbreak.
19 When that is the case, the predators, they tend to die off
20 from rabies.

21 But the people from around here, I'm asking the
22 people that the rabies epidemics, perhaps, do you feel that
23 is the case, too, that the predators are increasing because
24 there haven't been any rabies epidemics for many years?

25 Thank you.

1 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Simeonie.

2 Peter.

3 MR. TAKTOGON: Yeah, Thank you, Mr. Chair.

4 Like I said, in the past, predators were
5 controlled. People used to live on the land. Native
6 peoples trap and whatever.

7 And one more thing I forgot to make a comment.
8 In the past, wolf population was so high in Contwoyto Lake
9 they had to do wolf control one winter, maybe for a few
10 years. Anyways, they did a poisoning to kill them off,
11 plus they did, no matter what time of year, even just the
12 cubs go in the dens, and they had a wolf bounty for \$40
13 each. That's what was done when the wolf population really
14 climbed up in the past in Contwoyto Lake.

15 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Peter.

16 David Igutsuq.

17 MR. IGUTSAQ: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

18 I haven't heard, so I'm asking to the Elders.
19 There's also people that go around to, I think it's on
20 Victoria Island. I've heard that there have been, back in
21 the 1970s, that there were plenty of caribou, and they said
22 there were bulls. But nowadays I wonder, do you know if
23 there were still lots of bulls around this camp on Victoria
24 Island? Thank you.

25 THE CHAIR: Thank you, David.

1 Peter or Jorgen, can you answer that? If not,
2 it's okay.

3 MR. TAKTOGON: Sorry, I didn't understand that
4 question.

5 THE CHAIR: Okay. It looks like Peter's
6 deferring it to Bobby at Cambridge Bay. Go ahead.

7 MR. GREENLEY: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

8 Is he talking about the outpost camp on Victoria
9 Island? Must be nugyuktok (phonetic) area. It would be
10 deferred back to you guys. When I heard him say "outpost
11 camp," I was figuring it was nugyuktok. Thank you.

12 THE CHAIR: Go ahead, Jorgen.

13 MR. BOLT: Yeah, thanks there, Mr. Chair.

14 That is what they're talking about here at
15 nugyuktok, Richardson Island on the south end of Victoria
16 Island. Yeah, that's my dad's camp, and I was fortunate
17 enough to hunt there a couple times in the fall.

18 And, yeah, there is some bulls yet, but to what
19 extent we're not really sure. We haven't really been
20 hunting down there as hard as we have in the past. Like I
21 said, we've been fortunate enough to hunt other herds, so
22 it was not really critical for us to go down that far. And
23 so the main reason why I was down there in the fall is we
24 were sport hunting down there, so I spent the fall down
25 there a few times well into October. And you can see lots

1 of caribou bulls down there.

2 But just to get back to the question, yeah,
3 there is some bulls yet, but I don't think they're in as
4 great a number. But like I said, we haven't really been
5 hunting down there as hard as we did. Not like before.
6 Because people used to go down to Tuktutuk (phonetic),
7 around through there, what we call Pin Three. That's where
8 they usually traditionally cross, too, and they do come
9 around there. But like I said, we haven't really put any
10 stress on the Dolphin Union herd other than when they cross
11 down the east coast of us about a hundred miles or so, and
12 that's when we come out to hunt the Dolphin Union.

13 Yeah, there's still a lot of bulls around, but
14 I'm going to be honest, and say I'm not going to say 100
15 percent sure that they're stable or increasing. I'm just
16 going to say that I've seen quite a few bulls around yet
17 from the Dolphin Union herd.

18 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

19 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jorgen.

20 Any other questions? If not, staff, NWMB staff,
21 any questions? Michael, no?

22 Okay. Government of Nunavut?

23 MR. GISSING: No questions, Mr. Chair.

24 THE CHAIR: Thank you.

25 Government of Northwest Territories?

1 MS. YONGE: No questions, Mr. Chair.

2 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lynda.

3 Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife Board, Simon?

4 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: Thank you, Mr. Chair. No

5 questions.

6 THE CHAIR: Thank you.

7 Kugluktuk HTO.

8 MR. L. ADJUN: Sorry, Your Honour -- Worship -- I

9 need coffee. No questions. Quana, itsivautaaq.

10 THE CHAIR: I would have felt more comfortable

11 if you had said "Mr. Minister." Okay. Thank you, Larry.

12 Bathurst Inlet HTO, any questions?

13 MR. S. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chair. No

14 questions.

15 THE CHAIR: Bay Chimo HTO, Peter.

16 MR. P. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chair. No

17 questions. Thank you.

18 THE CHAIR: Cambridge Bay HTO.

19 MR. GREENLEY: Thank you, Mr. Chair. No

20 questions.

21 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Bobby.

22 NTI.

23 MR. IRNGAUT: No questions. Thank you.

24 THE CHAIR: Thank you.

25 KIA any questions, Geoff?

1 MR. CLARK: No questions, thanks.

2 THE CHAIR: Thank you.

3 North Slave Métis Alliance, Shin.

4 MR. SHIGA: We have no questions. Thank you,

5 Mr. Chair.

6 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Shin.

7 And Adventure Northwest.

8 MR. WARNER: Thank you, Mr. Chair. And thank

9 you for the presentation. No questions.

10 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much.

11 Any questions from the public? I don't think

12 there is. None.

13 So we'll carry on. Thank you very much for

14 representing the Elders.

15 We'll take a 15-minute break and take a coffee

16 break. Coffee's here. Thank you.

17 (ADJOURNMENT)

18 THE CHAIR: Okay. Can I have everybody get

19 back to their places. Thank you.

20 All right. Welcome back, we'll carry on. So

21 the next intervener is NTI. Paul and Bert, would you like

22 to make your presentation?

23 NUNAVUT TUNNGAVIK INCORPORATED SUBMISSION

24 MR. DEAN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

25 Paul was supposed to be on a plane today, so

1 he's kind of sad. But I'll quickly go through, not so much
2 a presentation. But two letters were sent by NTI to the
3 Board, and give a bit of an oral or verbal overview on some
4 of the work we've done with the region.

5 So thanks once again. My name is Bert Dean.
6 I'm with NTI's Wildlife and Environment Department based in
7 Rankin Inlet.

8 When we first heard about the concerns with
9 caribou in this region, we tried to give support when and
10 where we could to the regional wildlife board, as well as
11 the HTOs. I think, as you've heard and seen in some of the
12 minutes, it can be a challenge at times. If there's a
13 turnover of delegates, either at the HTO chairperson or
14 manager level or at the regional level, keeping track of
15 all of these different herds, all of the different
16 organizations, all of the different meetings can be
17 difficult. So when we heard that the NWMB was going to be
18 doing a hearing on caribou, we knew it would be helpful for
19 the communities to have an opportunity to participate in
20 this process and make sure that their voices are heard.

21 Initially, the hearing was going to be located
22 in Yellowknife, probably more for logistical reasons and
23 the fact that it is interjurisdictional. But this was a
24 concern to NTI, and we wrote a letter to the Board on April
25 8, 2016, in regards to some concerns we had about the

1 hearing process and the location, as well as the fact that
2 a TAH or a total allowable harvest was being proposed.
3 Because, as per the Land Claim, it's not just the total
4 allowable harvest; it's also the basic needs level.

5 And what the basic needs level identifies is:
6 What are Inuit basic needs for caribou? And that's the
7 priority. So those were two points that were highlighted,
8 and a copy of the letter is in the binder if people want
9 more information or more detail. But that was two of the
10 points that we raised back in April requesting that these
11 things be discussed a bit further or looked at.

12 Ideally, the location for the public hearings we
13 had requested for the Bathurst caribou be here in Cambridge
14 Bay, and for the Bluenose East, because it's primarily
15 Kugluktuk harvesting the Bluenose East herd, that that
16 hearing be held in Kugluktuk.

17 Based on that and conversations and then back
18 and forth and different letters, KIA became more involved,
19 as well, because they were hearing from their communities
20 and constituents and probably especially because their
21 offices are located here in Cambridge Bay and in Kugluktuk.

22 And we sent a second letter in May, on May 12th,
23 again providing support for KIA, and I guess NTI took a bit
24 more of a back seat role because KIA took a much more
25 active role in working with the regional wildlife board and

1 the hunters and trappers organizations from the communities
2 to see if they could address this issue or the concerns
3 that were coming up from the communities.

4 And so our second letter on May 12th of 2016,
5 emphasizes support for the KIA request to postpone the
6 hearing on the Bluenose East caribou especially, but to
7 look at postponing it until September, and also, the
8 concern about the level of consultation.

9 And we've heard a lot over the last couple of
10 days about different meetings and workshops or
11 opportunities, people have gotten together to try and talk
12 about this issue. But it's not just having a meeting.
13 There's a lot of work, and I think that was identified
14 earlier this week, as well. There's a lot of work that has
15 to accompany all of that to help the organizations, because
16 capacity is a huge challenge for us. Whether it's at the
17 HTO level -- and Larry mentioned a turnover of staff -- or
18 just having technical expertise to help you review some of
19 the information or the documents and ask some of those
20 tougher questions or hold things to a higher standard.

21 So those are two letters and two or three areas,
22 I guess, that NTI had raised. They're not specific to the
23 TAH or the TAH number, in this case, for Bathurst caribou.
24 Because in one of the consultations, if you read through
25 the documents in the binder, when there was a meeting about

1 a year or so ago, I think, year and a bit ago -- I should
2 have looked for the date, I guess -- but I know Lisa Marie
3 and other staff had met with Bathurst and Bay Chimo to talk
4 about a potential TAH of 100.

5 And as we've heard, the approximate harvest of
6 Bathurst in Nunavut's been about 70 caribou a year. So I
7 think there was a genuine attempt to have those
8 discussions, or to try and figure out how we could look at
9 implementing the Land Claim and have a TAH established;
10 have a number that wasn't controversial in the sense it
11 was, you know, close to what the actual harvest might be.

12 But when the updated survey results came in and
13 then all of a sudden the concern about a TAH being at 100
14 was too high, it got reduced down to 30. That's when you
15 could start to see people get their backs up a bit and, you
16 know, what's going on? And things are being forced a bit
17 more.

18 And again, I think it just emphasizes the
19 importance to provide that support and that working
20 relationship with the HTOs or the communities because, in
21 our opinion, the biggest challenge we're going to have is
22 implementing this; whether it's at the HTO level and
23 working with their membership or whether it's at the
24 government level and wildlife officers that have to monitor
25 and enforce this TAH if it comes into place. And I think

1 there's still quite a bit of work that needs to be done to
2 figure out how to do that.

3 So I won't go into the details of all the work
4 KIA has done with the communities, but I think the fact
5 that they've provided that outreach to look at some options
6 or some things is a positive step and is one that NTI
7 definitely supports. And, again, our role will be more to
8 ensure that Inuit rights, as per the Land Claim, are being
9 respected. There is a process, this public hearing
10 process, not a written hearing or a hearing in a faraway
11 place. I mean, Connie was able to come and make a
12 presentation today by stepping out of school for an hour.
13 If we were meeting somewhere else other than Cambridge Bay,
14 she wouldn't have been able to do that. Some of the Elders
15 that are here are able to participate because it's in their
16 home community.

17 So if we're calling it a public hearing, that's
18 what it is, and I think Cambridge Bay and, hopefully, the
19 delegates from Bathurst and Umingmaktok will benefit from
20 this hearing this week, but I know in a couple of days
21 we're going to hear concerns from Kugluktuk about that
22 process or what's going to happen with Bluenose East
23 caribou.

24 And these herds -- whether it's Bathurst, the
25 Bluenose East, or depending what happens with the Dolphin

1 Union caribou over the next few years -- they're all
2 intertwined. And if we want communities to support
3 whatever management system we're trying to implement, they
4 have to be a part of it, they have to understand it, they
5 have to support it for it to work. Because if they don't
6 and it's pushed on them -- maybe we've had the hearings and
7 we've done all this work and on paper we can say we've done
8 our due diligence, but if people don't respect the process
9 or don't feel that there's a genuine conservation concern,
10 who knows how that will affect their decisions when it
11 comes to harvesting.

12 So I'll stop there. And I'm sure Paul may want
13 to add something, if I've missed something. But I, again,
14 just wanted to highlight those two letters that NTI sent
15 and some of the work we've done to date.

16 So thank you, Mr. Chair.

17 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much, Bert, for
18 your information, presentation.

19 So now we'll start off with questions, then, to
20 NTI.

21 Is there any questions from the Board? Charlie.

22 NUNAVUT WILDLIFE MANAGEMENT BOARD QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

23 MR. INUARAK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

24 My question: The recommendations from Nunavut
25 and GNWT recommend the TAHs of 30 and, at that time, that

1 it would be bulls only. And if they were concerning this
2 sex-selected ratio, if they are only to harvest bulls and
3 they accidentally harvest a female, according to the
4 calculation, they will deplete that number, and if they had
5 harvested over that amount of total allowable harvest, if
6 it can be enforced and taken to court and they say, yes,
7 they can. So how are you going to implement that
8 enforcement?

9 Thank you.

10 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Charlie.

11 Bert.

12 MR. DEAN: Yeah, it won't be our job to
13 enforce it; it will be the Government's job. I mean, we'd
14 work with communities, and as has been indicated, the bulk
15 of the harvest right now on Bathurst caribou is happening
16 in August and September; and if you're looking for big
17 bulls in August and September, usually -- I don't know --
18 Sam could answer better than I, but you're probably mostly
19 killing bulls; right?

20 MR. IRNGAUT: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

21 Thank you for the question.

22 I know we would be very concerned about
23 over-harvesting because we support local HTO and regional
24 wildlife boards. We would have to look at all these
25 management plans, especially enforcement, if there's too

1 many females over-harvested, that there's a possibility of
2 taking them to court, and we would have to work with our
3 Inuit to support them and protect them. And I know we want
4 to be able to put limitations. But on the other hand, they
5 need basic needs level to sustain themselves when they're
6 harvesting for food to survive. You don't want to take
7 them to court when they're trying to survive. So on that
8 alone we would have to discuss this issue with the
9 government if it's for basic needs level.

10 And I can say that we would protect and support
11 our Inuit because they're hunting for basic needs level to
12 survive. That is the case. We have to work with the
13 governments. We have to hash out all these issues before
14 we implement any type of enforcement positions.

15 Thank you. I hope that's clear.

16 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Paul.

17 Charlie.

18 MR. INUARAK: Thank you very much for your
19 answer.

20 Last year there was -- we had to deal with
21 Baffin Island caribou, and the Government of Nunavut
22 recommended TAH of 60 for whole of Baffin Island initially.
23 And your region also are requesting almost the same amount,
24 and in the Baffin Region we had requested more than that.
25 And I know the Minister of Environment will have the sole

1 authority to make the decision. Are you going to be giving
2 us any type of document or submission similar to GNWT
3 information?

4 Thank you.

5 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Charlie.

6 Paul.

7 MR. IRNGAUT: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

8 And thank you, Charlie, for the question.

9 If you look in the Baffin Region when we were
10 doing the Baffin Island workshop, we completely supported
11 our local HTOs and the Baffin Regional Wildlife Board. And
12 if you look at Coral Harbour caribou, Southampton Island
13 caribou, we had stated that the basic needs level -- to not
14 set a basic needs level and only deal with a total
15 allowable harvest first, and that if they set up a TAH, all
16 of that would be for all Inuit basic needs level.

17 And you ask if we're going to be producing
18 similar documents like we did for Baffin. I can't really
19 say at the moment whether we're going to be doing that, but
20 if we are requested to do so from the local organizations,
21 we can help, and I would have to refer to our president on
22 that.

23 I hope that answers the question.

24 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Paul.

25 Simeonie.

1 MR. KEENAINAK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

2 I was going to ask that same thing like Charlie
3 did. Charlie already asked it. I don't have any more
4 guess. Thank you.

5 THE CHAIR: Thank you. Any other questions
6 from the Board? If not, staff, any questions? Michael?
7 No?

8 Okay. Thank you, Government of Nunavut, any
9 questions to NTI?

10 MR. GISSING: No questions, Thank you,
11 Mr. Chairman.

12 THE CHAIR: GNWT, any questions, to NTI?

13 GOVERNMENT OF NORTHWEST TERRITORIES QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

14 MS. YONGE: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

15 I just have a couple of questions about the
16 basic needs level, and I apologize, this is my ignorance of
17 the Nunavut Land Claims Agreement. Is the basic needs
18 level established by community and by species or by
19 community by herd? Like, how was that established?

20 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lynda.

21 MS. YONGE: It's clearly a good question.

22 THE CHAIR: NTI, you can defer if you want.

23 MR. DEAN: I'll ask for some help on this,
24 but a quick overview just to try and explain it.

25 When the Land Claim was first signed, a harvest

1 study was done, and that harvest study was a tool to help
2 the Board establish what the basic needs levels would be
3 for Inuit, whether it's caribou, fish, whales, whatever the
4 case may be, and that sets the priority, priority needs.

5 Harvest studies were done on a
6 community-by-community level and multi-species, so I think
7 it was comprehensive. It covered everything. It was done
8 over a period of five years.

9 So where it gets complicated, especially in this
10 situation, is you have people originally from Bathurst,
11 Umingmaktok, that have moved, as was mentioned, to
12 Kugluktuk and to Cambridge. You have people from different
13 communities that travel to the same -- to the similar
14 areas. So how that would be administered or be approached,
15 I don't know if the NWMB could explain it better or how
16 they would look at it. But in the previous meetings for
17 Southampton Island -- example, Paul mentioned Coral
18 Harbour -- no basic needs levels were set, and the same
19 thing for Baffin Island.

20 So we have yet to implement this part of the
21 Claim, so there's a lot of new territory we're trying to
22 sort out.

23 And maybe coming back to Charlie and Simeonie's
24 question or comments, we would have brought a lawyer and we
25 could have brought a whole bunch of documents and spent

1 another couple of days talking about basic needs levels,
2 and say this shouldn't happen until there's a basic needs
3 level set. But we're trying to work with the government,
4 with the Board to get this system to work.

5 The important point is it sets the priority. So
6 if the basic needs level for Bathurst caribou -- you'd have
7 to figure out for the outpost camps, for Kugluktuk, for
8 Cambridge -- what are those basic needs levels?

9 And when a TAH is set, the Kitikmeot Regional
10 Wildlife Board would have to decide, okay. We have a TAH
11 of, whether it's 30 or 100. How are we going to divide it
12 among our communities? And one of the tools they would use
13 was, what are the basic needs levels for Bathurst caribou
14 for those outpost camps and those communities?

15 So without that information from the harvest
16 study or without the BNLs in place, it's a gap because what
17 we figure is the balances are a lot higher than what the
18 TAH will be. So we know all, or we're expecting that all
19 the TAH would go to Inuit, and that's where Paul's
20 questioning was coming throughout the last couple of days.

21 There would not be a surplus, and it's only when
22 there's a surplus that other parts of the Claim start to
23 kick in, in terms of allocating it, whether it's to
24 non-Inuit residents or to sport hunts or commercial
25 ventures or those sort of things.

1 MR. IRNGAUT: And I'll just add: If you ever
2 come across an NLCA, I'm sure you can look at it, 5.6.19
3 and 5.6.20 talk about setting up of a TAH or basic needs
4 levels. So those are the ones for everybody, they can look
5 it up. Thank you.

6 Maybe Michael wants to add?

7 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Bert. I think you
8 explained that quite well, actually.

9 But, Michael, are you fine with that? Do you
10 want to add, briefly?

11 MR. D'EÇA: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I will
12 be very brief.

13 Yeah, there is a large history behind, and much
14 controversy about, establishing basic needs levels. We
15 have disagreements between the NWMB and governments, both
16 territorial and federal, as to what harvests are included
17 in the basic needs level, and that's the main reason why
18 basic needs levels haven't been established yet.

19 But, very briefly, first of all, it is the NWMB
20 that strikes basic needs levels. What it does, ideally,
21 under the Land Claim is it establishes a total allowable
22 harvest.

23 If it only applies to one community, it's a
24 community total allowable harvest. If it applies to more
25 than one community, it's a regional total allowable

1 harvest. So the NWMB makes that decision and then must
2 turn to striking a basic needs level which attaches either
3 to a community or a regional total allowable harvest. And
4 it's essentially looking at past harvest, through the
5 harvest study and other kinds of harvests, and you follow a
6 formula and you come up with a number.

7 One of the challenges is that basic needs level,
8 at least in Qallunatitut, implies a certain kind of a
9 harvest. People think it's a subsistence harvest or what
10 you absolutely minimally need, and really, it's a term of
11 art under the Land Claim, and it means something else; but
12 it's a very, very important number for Inuit.

13 So we're working with federal and territorial
14 government. The Southampton Island caribou hearing which
15 will take place, we believe in 2016, will move this matter
16 forward because it's all about the basic needs level for
17 that caribou population.

18 I'll leave it at that, Mr. Chairman. Taima.

19 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Michael.

20 Lynda.

21 MS. YONGE: Thank you. And thank you for
22 that. I didn't realize I was wading into quite such deep
23 waters.

24 The other part of my question is, am I
25 understanding correctly that there would then be a basic

1 needs level set for the Bathurst herd and possibly a basic
2 needs level set for the Bluenose East herd, or would it be
3 a basic needs level set for the community for caribou?

4 Because that makes it also complicated.

5 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lynda.

6 Bert.

7 MR. DEAN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

8 Thank you for that question, because that's the
9 same question we have.

10 When you look back at the harvest study, the
11 information from Kugluktuk doesn't distinguish whether it
12 was a Bathurst caribou or a Bluenose caribou or a Dolphin
13 Union caribou; and things change over time. The harvest
14 study was done, I don't know, 20 years ago, 15 -- 15? So,
15 yeah, that makes this particular situation a bit more
16 complicated on a technical level.

17 But if you're sitting down with the community
18 and approaching it, you know: What does your community
19 need for caribou? And if you're looking at management
20 options, which is, I think, something that's being proposed
21 and talked about, there's tools you could use to address
22 that. And especially, because one of the questions we were
23 asking Kugluktuk was: When are you harvesting Bluenose
24 East caribou? When are you harvesting Bathurst? If
25 Kugluktuk is not harvesting Bathurst caribou, it's sort of

1 a moot point. But if, all of a sudden, something unique
2 comes up like this March or April where the collars of some
3 Bathurst caribou show up in an area where people are
4 hunting Dolphin Union caribou, it gets really complicated.

5 And that's where we were. Yeah, we're
6 concerned. If we don't put the time and effort to figure
7 out all these different situations and how we're going to
8 approach them, you're really at the mercy of, how is it
9 going to be enforced?

10 And I realize -- I mean, Charlie was asking that
11 question earlier about a male and a female caribou. My
12 answer was kind of blunt because, if you're an enforcement
13 officer, you have your regulations, and it's a pretty
14 tricky area if you're trying to tell enforcement people who
15 or what or when they should or shouldn't charge. So it
16 makes for it to be a really sensitive situation, and it can
17 create some really hard feelings and divisions within the
18 communities. And a lot of the people are either related or
19 from the community, and it's going to create, like, a lot
20 of pressure.

21 So there's got to be a well-thought-out plan,
22 and if there is going to be an enforcement policy on what
23 to do if male-female or if it is accidentally from one herd
24 instead of another, we haven't heard about it yet. It's
25 something that we'll react to it again. We're very much in

1 a reactive mode.

2 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Bert.

3 Lynda.

4 MS. YONGE: Thank you very much, and thank you
5 for the answers. No further questions.

6 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lynda.

7 Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife Board, Simon, any
8 questions for NTI?

9 KITIKMEOT REGIONAL WILDLIFE BOARD QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

10 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

11 Simon Qingnaqtuq, chairperson of KRWB. I have a
12 question for NTI that is regarding the total allowable
13 harvest that are being set by Bathurst caribou. It's going
14 to be different from the Baffin caribou.

15 There's two governments. We have to work with
16 GNWT and GN. The GN recommended that total allowable
17 harvest that they're saying, if we're going to use that,
18 will NTI be assisting the Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife Board
19 and the local HTOs in Ikaluktutiak, Bathurst, and
20 Umingmaktok?

21 Yeah, we have to follow the rules, management
22 rules. But here we will be asking your assistance from NTI
23 so that the laws will be enforceable. But us KRWB here,
24 the GN's recommendation -- we don't all agree with it. But
25 if that was decided upon, would NTI be helping us? Because

1 we're dealing with two different governments regarding the
2 harvesting rights of Inuit. They're different in GNWT and
3 Nunavut.

4 The Nunavut government recommended total
5 allowable harvest. As Inuit, we know we are more able to
6 manage our wildlife better than the governments can. You
7 have to work with GNWT, but us Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife
8 Board will want assistance from NTI.

9 Thank you.

10 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Simon.

11 Paul.

12 MR. IRNGAUT: Thank you.

13 Thank you, Simon. That was a good question.

14 I know if we don't assist you, you're going to
15 hit us with a whip. We know we have to work with our
16 Inuit.

17 We all know that NTI always tries to assist the
18 Inuit from the three different regions, the organizations,
19 and the public, as long as they're beneficiaries of our
20 Land Claims Agreement. The Nunavut Wildlife Management
21 Board was established through the Nunavut Land Claims
22 Agreement, and the RWOs and the HTOs are there through the
23 Land Claims Agreement. They included in that Land Claims
24 Agreement, and our Land Claims Agreement is protected by
25 the convention, and they cannot be changed by any of the

1 governments that are around. And because of that, we will
2 try and assist the RWOs and also the local HTOs.

3 Is that clear? Thank you.

4 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Paul.

5 Simon.

6 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Simon
7 Qingnaqtuq, Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife Board. I don't
8 have any more questions.

9 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Simon.

10 Kugluktuk HTO, Larry?

11 KUGLUKTUK HTO QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

12 MR. L. ADJUN: Qujannamiik, itsivautaaq.

13 Just to reiterate what Mr. Bert Dean stated, I
14 have a letter emailed to me as chairman of the HTO from the
15 Hamlet giving us a letter of support to have the meetings
16 in Kugluktuk for the Bluenose East part. I don't know if
17 it's a little premature to say it now, but I will email it
18 to Mr. E. Kan, and I'll do that tonight. So just to let
19 you know I have a letter of support from the Hamlet, and I
20 will email it to you tonight.

21 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thank you, Larry. Any
22 other questions from Kugluktuk HTO to NTI? Jorgen?

23 MR. BOLT: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

24 Just a quick question, actually. I just wanted
25 some clarification. I just want to NTI's full capacity.

1 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

2 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jorgen.

3 Bert.

4 MR. DEAN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

5 Thank you Jorgen. We have a Wildlife and
6 Environment Department. There's been some staff turnover.
7 We have one biologist on staff, David Lee, who's worked on
8 some of the surveys and been in the region and worked with
9 staff from both the GNWT and GN on these surveys. Paul is
10 in the Iqaluit office, I'm in the Rankin office. We are
11 trying to staff up on a couple more positions, but it's
12 limited. There's not a lot there on a capacity level. But
13 as Paul mentioned, we'll provide as much support as we can
14 to assist the HTOs and the RWOs.

15 Having said that, a lot of the work we've been
16 doing is been trying to get increased funding for the
17 wildlife secretariat and improved funding for the HTOs and
18 RWOs so that you're able to hire your own staff and so to
19 more in your own regions and build up strength there.

20 So when KIA stepped up and really assisted with
21 this file, it was sort of a welcome bit of help because the
22 staff are right there in Kugluktuk and can work with your
23 HTO or with the regional wildlife board.

24 So, I mean, we have a decent budget, we have
25 staff, we can do as much as we can, but you know, we don't

1 have 20 or 30 people sort of standing in the wings waiting
2 to come in.

3 THE CHAIR: Go ahead, Paul.

4 MR. IRNGAUT: Yeah, just to add that our role at
5 NTI is to protect Inuit rights, your rights, and that's
6 what we do. We make sure that our rights are not being
7 impeded, and we try and protect our rights as much as
8 possible.

9 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Paul.

10 MR. BOLT: Thank you, Mr. Chair. No further
11 questions.

12 THE CHAIR: Thank you.

13 Larry.

14 MR. L. ADJUN: No further questions from the HTO
15 board. I just want to apologize before. Some of us do
16 wear hats when we come to these meetings. That's why I
17 called you "Your Honour" earlier. I am a hamlet
18 councillor, along with one of our board of directors, Mr.
19 Taktogon, so I do apologize.

20 THE CHAIR: No apology is needed at all.

21 Bathurst Inlet HTO, then, any questions for NTI?

22 BATHURST INLET HTO QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

23 MR. S. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

24 Thank you, NTI. Yeah, my question I had was
25 already raised and answered, but I thought I'd like to just

1 thank NTI for all the help and support that they have been
2 giving Kitikmeot. Thank you.

3 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Sam.

4 Bay Chimo HTO, Peter, any questions?

5 MR. P. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

6 No questions.

7 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Peter.

8 Cambridge Bay HTO any questions for NTI?

9 MR. GREENLEY: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

10 No questions.

11 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Bobby.

12 Any questions for NTI from the Elders,
13 representatives? Okay. No questions.

14 Kitikmeot Inuit Association, is there any
15 questions for NTI?

16 MR. CLARK: Thank you, Mr. Chair. We have no
17 questions.

18 THE CHAIR: North Slave Métis Alliance, any
19 questions, Shin?

20 MR. SHIGA: Thank you, Mr. Chair. We have no
21 questions.

22 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Shin.

23 Adventures Northwest Limited, Boyd, any
24 questions?

25 MR. WARNER: Thank you Mr. Chair.

1 And thank you for the presentation. Very
2 informative. No questions.

3 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much.

4 Any questions from the public at large? No
5 questions. Oh, maybe there is a question. No? Okay.

6 All right. So we'll move on, then, to the next
7 presenter, which is Kitikmeot Inuit Association. Geoff,
8 the floor is yours -- or Attima.

9 KITIKMEOT INUIT ASSOCIATION SUBMISSION

10 MR. HADLARI: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

11 Thank you for inviting us to this table. I'm
12 just going to introduce Geoff. He's going to be the one
13 that's presenting the submission, and our legal counsel
14 will be sitting here, as well, and I will be listening
15 here.

16 Go ahead, Geoff.

17 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Attima. Geoff, go
18 ahead.

19 MR. CLARK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

20 And thank you for the Board and everyone that's
21 here. We've had very thorough and good discussions over
22 the last day and two-thirds already. The Board has our
23 submission that we made two, three, four weeks ago. I
24 can't remember how long it was. So we're not going to go
25 through that word for word, as you already have that

1 information and can review it at your leisure.

2 So we will do a summary of our submission of, I
3 think, the important matters, many of which have been
4 discussed already, so in the interests of time, I'll try to
5 be expedient. Next slide, please.

6 So the purpose of this presentation is to
7 present a summary of KIA's views of the proposal for a
8 total allowable harvest of 30 male caribou from the
9 Bathurst herd requested by the Government of Nunavut to the
10 Nunavut Wildlife Management Board. Next slide, please.

11 KIA is the regional Inuit association for the
12 Kitikmeot Inuit. KIA's mandate is to manage Kitikmeot
13 Inuit lands and resources and to protect and promote Inuit
14 social, cultural, political, environmental, and economic
15 wellbeing. KIA is the owner of 100,000 square kilometres
16 of land, some of which is important caribou habit. Can you
17 advance the slide, please. Thank you.

18 And KIA applied for and was granted party status
19 to these proceedings on May 17th.

20 So as a background to KIA's submission, we
21 became aware of this formal proposal to the Nunavut
22 Wildlife Management Board around mid-April, and we quickly
23 met with the Kugluktuk HTO chair to ask if there was
24 adequate consultation and if they'd worked through other
25 alternatives; and the answer was no. And so we advised

1 that we'd be willing to help the Kugluktuk HTO if they
2 requested support, and at a future meeting there was a
3 request for support.

4 The same thing happened. It was a different
5 forum; it was actually the NIRB hearing for the Sabina Back
6 River project where the KRWB chair, the chair of the
7 Ikaluktutiak HTO, and the Kugluktuk HTO, and Sam and Peter
8 Kapolak were all present. And we met again and advised
9 them of this TAH proposal and advised that, if they asked
10 for assistance, the KIA would be prepared to help them. We
11 also asked them the questions again if they had been
12 consulted, and the answer was no, and if an alternative to
13 TAH had been developed, and there was no alternative.

14 So we recognized that there would need to be a
15 lot of preparation in advance of the Nunavut Wildlife
16 Management Board hearing and that there was not a lot of
17 time available, given the schedule where we were busy with
18 two NIRB reviews, and we also had a KIA board meeting
19 within that about four-week, four-and-a-half-week period
20 for preparing a submission.

21 So KIA requested an adjournment to get better
22 prepared, and that was denied by the Nunavut Wildlife
23 Management Board. And we also requested that the GN
24 withdraw their proposal to allow for more time to get
25 prepared, and there was no response from the Government of

1 Nunavut. Next slide, please.

2 So KIA's position on the total allowable harvest
3 proposal, first and for most, establishing a total
4 allowable harvest is an important transfer of power from
5 Inuit and from the HTOs to government over harvesting when
6 a total allowable harvest is imposed.

7 KIA opposes the proposal for the GN total
8 allowable harvest, and the reasons are that it appears
9 there's been a consultation failure by the GN on the
10 specific TAH proposal, and it does not appear that GN has
11 worked with the west Kitikmeot hunters and trappers
12 organizations to establish management systems under the
13 NLCA Article 5.7.3 to avoid the TAH proposal. Next slide,
14 please.

15 KIA, through board resolution, opposed the TAH
16 proposal and also supported the west Kitikmeot and HTOs in
17 developing an alternative to a TAH. And the KIA supports
18 the west Kitikmeot HTOs' plans to develop an HTO-controlled
19 alternative to a TAH for Bathurst caribou.

20 Because it requires coordination amongst four
21 HTOs and the schedules of -- we had appointed or, I guess,
22 delegated a committee of representatives from the HTOs, and
23 there was a lead from the HTOs for KIA to work with; but
24 due to the short time period allowed by the Nunavut
25 Wildlife Management Board and the schedules of the

1 respective individuals, we did not have time to discuss and
2 prepare an alternate plan that would be controlled by the
3 HTOs.

4 And we'd like to note that there's precedent for
5 alternatives to a TAH. And the precedents include,
6 specifically for Bluenose East caribou, the community of
7 Dèline has developed a plan -- I don't believe it's been
8 formally approved yet, or not. I don't know where it is in
9 that process, but they've developed a plan to have
10 community control over the Bluenose East harvest. And as
11 the Board will see, possibly tomorrow, the plan that the
12 Kugluktuk HTO has developed to manage the Bluenose East
13 harvest. Next slide, please.

14 So in regards to the GN consultation, we were
15 provided, early on, a table with ten meetings, ten dates of
16 meetings over a couple of years. There were -- and we
17 don't deny that those meetings did not happen (verbatim).
18 We're certain that they did happen. But nine of the ten
19 are not in relation to the specific TAH proposal that's
20 currently considered by the Nunavut Wildlife Management
21 Board. In fact, nine of the ten occurred prior to the
22 specific proposal being prepared and submitted.

23 Three of the ten didn't have documentation in
24 the records, so we could not review that to see
25 specifically what was discussed, but they were very early

1 on in 2014, or thereabouts. So it's probably impossible
2 that it would have included anything about the current TAH
3 of 30 male caribou for the Bathurst herd.

4 And further, two of the ten in that list were
5 meetings held in the Northwest Territories and led by the
6 Government of Northwest Territories, in which the
7 Government of Nunavut was a participant. So those
8 obviously couldn't be considered a GN consultation.

9 There was a meeting January 14th-15th, 2016, and
10 I can personally attest to that as a fact because I was in
11 Cambridge Bay at a KIA board meeting that same week, and so
12 I knew that there was a GN representatives and HTO members
13 and others here.

14 The document that we see that's been filed to
15 the Board is listed also a draft, so it's a little
16 confusing as to whether that's the final consultation
17 summary. We're also confused -- it's the second or third
18 page, but it says this document doesn't necessarily
19 represent the GN, and that is of concern to KIA.

20 The minutes to this meeting that that were
21 submitted, as well, did not have a clear agenda about a
22 TAH. If you look at the purposes of the meeting, there are
23 four bullets, and the first, I think, three of the four are
24 about understanding and working together and things like
25 that; and then the very last bullet was something about a

1 TAH. So it wasn't like this meeting is about consultation.
2 We're going to put a TAH of 30, and we want to hear your
3 views. It was clear from the minutes and the consultation
4 summary that that's not how the meeting rolled out.

5 Also, it didn't appear that there was any clear
6 discussion about the Nunavut Land Claims Agreement and, in
7 particular, NLCA Article 5.7.3 and alternatives for the
8 community or for the HTO to control the management of
9 harvest.

10 There was general conversations about predators
11 and so, but there was no real attempt to sit down and say:
12 What's the alternative before a TAH, and how can we work
13 with you to get that done? And there was also some
14 internal inconsistency with the meeting minutes in regards
15 to what is in the consultation summary. Next slide,
16 please.

17 Section 3.5 of the consultation summary
18 regarding accommodation of the HTO input received said:
19 There's little accommodation to be made on the TAH
20 recommendations as they are based on biological facts;
21 however, there are additional issues that were consistent
22 throughout the meeting on which there is room for
23 additional actions.

24 The GN suggestions that the DoE conclusion that
25 a TAH is needed because of the biological facts is narrow

1 and shortsighted. The conclusion is inconsistent with the
2 Nunavut Land Claims Agreement and jurisprudence which
3 applies when government or an institution of public
4 government like the Nunavut Wildlife Management Board
5 proposes to restrict Inuit harvesting rights.

6 One of the obvious effects of the establishment
7 of a TAH is local control of harvesting is eliminated. In
8 KIA's submission, this is not necessary because other valid
9 alternatives have not been considered or tested. The NLCA
10 provides guidance in this situation, and NLCA 5.3.3 says:
11 "The decisions of the Nunavut Wildlife Management Board or
12 a minister made in relation to Part 6 shall restrict or
13 limit Inuit harvesting only to the extent necessary." And
14 "(a), to effect a valid conservation purpose." Next slide,
15 please.

16 This provision mirrors the jurisprudence which
17 provides other description of what is required of
18 government when it imposes, infringes aboriginal rights.
19 Within the analysis of justification, there are further
20 questions to be addressed depending on the circumstances of
21 the inquiry. These include the question of whether there
22 has been as little infringement as possible in order to
23 effect the desired result, whether in a situation of
24 expropriation fair compensation is available, and whether
25 the Aboriginal group in question has been consulted with

1 respect to the conservation measure being implemented.

2 Next slide, please.

3 There appears to be no issue in this matter
4 about the requirements for consultation of the west
5 Kitikmeot HTOs. Case law makes it abundantly clear that
6 such consultation is required in a land claims context.
7 KIA submits that the law is clear. The GN DoE must consult
8 about the actual activity which it proposes and which will
9 infringe on Section 35 rights of west Kitikmeot HTO
10 members. KIA suggests that there's an important difference
11 between the general and ongoing information efforts of the
12 Department of Environment which we acknowledge the
13 Government of Nunavut Department of Environment has done a
14 good job of that, of sharing information with the HTOs.
15 There is an important difference between that and
16 consultation which is required by law once government
17 proposes a specific restriction on an Aboriginal right.

18 We submit that the consultation meetings in 2014
19 could not speak to this specific proposal by the Government
20 of Nunavut and certainly couldn't constitute consultation
21 about this proposed TAH.

22 Likewise, the January and February 2015
23 meetings, which talked about generalities of a possible
24 Bathurst TAH of 100, could not be consultation on the
25 current proposal of 30 for the TAH.

1 Only the January 2016 meeting addressed the
2 proposed TAH, and it was the first time that that specific
3 intent to infringe west Kitikmeot HTO harvesting rights was
4 discussed, and it appears that no consensus was reached on
5 that proposed TAH.

6 The GN filed its submission to the Nunavut
7 Wildlife Management Board for the TAH of 30 bulls in
8 February of 2016, and the GN has an obligation to consult
9 about the actual restrictions that it proposes. There's
10 evidence of the west Kitikmeot HTOs' willingness to work on
11 a locally based harvest management framework, and it goes
12 back to 2014 and beyond and is clear from the GN's own
13 meeting reports where the HTOs say that they will reduce
14 their harvest if they are asked and it's required. It
15 didn't say that they'll accept the TAH. Next slide,
16 please.

17 Further, there isn't any concrete evidence of
18 the GN working through NLCA 5.7.3 option as an alternative
19 to a TAH. What we see here is a wildlife management
20 concern being addressed and the government jumping from a
21 concern, past HTO rights to manage their harvest, to a TAH
22 proposal. The west Kitikmeot hunters and trappers
23 organizations clearly have the power to regulate, allocate,
24 and enforce harvesting, of its own members, and that's
25 found in 5.7.3 of the NLCA in (a), (b), and (c).

1 And a west Kitikmeot HTO-controlled alternative
2 for a TAH for the Bathurst herd has not yet been developed
3 or tested, although there seems to be a strong commitment
4 amongst the HTOs to want to do that. And the KIA board has
5 indicated it is willing to assist, as needed, to help get
6 there. Next slide, please.

7 There's no reason to believe that the west
8 Kitikmeot HTOs cannot implement management tools to protect
9 the Bathurst herd by using their NLCA rights and remain in
10 control of their resources.

11 The GN has done a good job of providing
12 information to the HTOs; however, with the specific TAH
13 proposal based on not only the information that the GN has
14 presented, but from what the HTO and the KRWB
15 representatives have consistently told KIA, the GN has
16 failed to consult the HTOs on the specific TAH. The GN
17 accommodation to avoid a TAH through assisting the HTOs or
18 working with the HTOs to implement their NLCA 5.7.3 rights
19 has been inadequate, and more is required of the GN in this
20 regard, and the Nunavut Wildlife Management Board must rule
21 accordingly. Next slide, please.

22 So the recommendations to the Nunavut Wildlife
23 Management Board. The KIA is not debating whether or not
24 there's a conservation concern with the Bathurst caribou
25 herd. Scientific evidence is clear, what we've heard from

1 Inuit is clear that the numbers seem to be down.

2 The recommendation is that the west Kitikmeot
3 HTOs must be provided adequate time to develop an
4 alternative to a total allowable harvest, which is a
5 Nunavut Land Claims Agreement right. I believe that the GN
6 Department of Environment and the west Kitikmeot HTOs
7 should collaborate and the GN should provide assistance as
8 required to develop an Article 5.7.3 alternative to a total
9 allowable harvest.

10 Another recommendation is that the GN must begin
11 meaningful consultation and seek accommodation to this TAH
12 alternative -- not to the current TAH proposal, but to the
13 alternative to a TAH. And the GN and Nunavut Wildlife
14 Management Board must fund the west Kitikmeot HTOs
15 appropriately to do this.

16 And, lastly, there's a slide of a caribou up for
17 you. We thought we'd ask if you can tell if it's an Ahiak
18 or Beverly or Bathurst. It's an interesting question in
19 this whole matter.

20 Quana and taima. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

21 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much, Geoff. And
22 that concludes KIA's presentation? Thank you very much.

23 All right. With that, is there any questions
24 from the Board? Caleb.

25 NUNAVUT WILDLIFE MANAGEMENT BOARD QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

1 MR. SANGOYA: It is not much of -- but I have a
2 question, but you didn't mention it.

3 Because we are divided on Baffin Island, we have
4 seen it when we were told to have 35 total allowable
5 harvest, and I know because I'm an Anglican minister. I
6 saw from the Elders; because that person was living off
7 caribou, and because he was so used to eating caribou, the
8 herd, the diet changed so much that whatever she ate or he
9 ate was vomiting it up.

10 And I know that there was three students. I
11 also went to see them. If they're not going to eat what
12 they're used to, they didn't want to go to school anymore.

13 And, also, I was told -- perhaps you will
14 realize this, too -- that in Nunavut. There is too much
15 suicide in Nunavut, more so than all across Canada.
16 Because it was mentioned that we have to teach them while
17 they're young. If that's going to be taken away by the
18 government, the suicide attempts got higher when the rights
19 were taken away by the government. Have you considered
20 that? Because we saw that.

21 Have you seen this, too? Thank you.

22 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Caleb.

23 Geoff.

24 MR. CLARK: Thank you for the question.

25 KIA has been largely staying out of the

1 conversation about caribou management and allowing the
2 Government of Nunavut and the HTOs to work together. Once
3 there was a line crossed that affected Inuit rights, in
4 terms of transferring power from Inuit to the government
5 regarding the management of the harvest of the Bathurst
6 caribou, KIA got involved, mostly from a legal and NLCA
7 perspective.

8 We know there are many social issues and that
9 there is strong cultural attachment to the land and to
10 harvesting, but KIA has not gotten involved specifically in
11 our work with the HTOs on this specific matter to talk
12 about the social or economic, socioeconomic or cultural
13 costs of this TAH proposal.

14 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Geoff.

15 Caleb.

16 MR. SANGOYA: Mr. Chairman, I want to mention
17 that the people that are going to be before the courts are
18 the ones that are more suicidal, and I know already in my
19 community there are 30 people in my community, and one of
20 them committed suicide, and I want you to realize that
21 because you are representing Inuit.

22 Thank you.

23 THE CHAIR: Is there any other questions?

24 Paul, do you want to speak? Go ahead.

25 MR. EMINGAK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

1 Thank you for the question. Paul Emingak,
2 Executive Director for the Kitikmeot Inuit Association.

3 We do have a social development department
4 similar to Kitikmeot and Kivalliq Inuit Association, and we
5 work together with those RIAs and, as well, with NTI and
6 with GN to, you know, come up with, hopefully, solutions
7 to, you know, the epidemic of suicide in the communities
8 across Nunavut.

9 In terms of our strategy on suicide, yes, it's a
10 big issue in our region, as well, in our communities, and
11 there's so much we as KIA can do. We try work with other
12 agencies, the GN and others in the community to, come up
13 with a strategy to do suicide prevention. And we
14 understand, you know, there are people or Inuit
15 beneficiaries that do need help, whether it be if they're
16 facing court charges or incarceration or any type of mental
17 illness that they're going through.

18 And we understand that, you know, any type of
19 impact on our society such as Inuit, if they lose a way of
20 life in terms of their hunting rights or TAH or total
21 allowable harvest that's imposed by governments, that's a
22 total impact on a community. So, you know, we are prepared
23 to work with HTOs and the regional wildlife board, as well,
24 you know, anyone that's willing to assist on impacts that
25 may come.

1 So that's a bit of information I'm providing.

2 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much, Paul.

3 Caleb.

4 MR. SANGOYA: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

5 I think it has to be considered in our
6 processes, and we already know that when there was whales
7 stuck in Pond Inlet -- whales were stuck in Pond Inlet. We
8 know that there was no social ills goes on, there was a lot
9 of Inuit going out to help humanely harvest that group of
10 particular narwhals. There was no criminal activity going
11 on. Nobody was going to the health centre complaining
12 about illnesses throughout the whole process of harvesting
13 those narwhals. So it does have an effect on the human
14 factor.

15 Thank you for your presentation.

16 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Caleb. David.

17 MR. KRITTERDLIK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

18 Board Member for NWMB. We're going to have to
19 be making decisions on the matter sooner or later --
20 hopefully sooner -- but with that information that we've
21 been hearing, we're going to have to come together, come up
22 with something. But we have already heard from Kitikmeot
23 and regional wildlife organizations and local HTOs that
24 they are not supporting the proposal and that they are
25 planning to work together to come up with an alternative,

1 and I'm assuming that KIA will also be supporting their
2 local wildlife organizations looking for solution to this
3 situation. Thank you.

4 THE CHAIR: Thank you, David. I think that
5 was more of a comment unless you want to add to that.
6 Okay, Charlie.

7 MR. INUARAK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

8 Charlie Inuarak, Pond Inlet, NWMB. I don't know
9 if maybe perhaps I should ask this to Kitikmeot Wildlife
10 Management Board, but I thought about this after the fact.
11 Qingnaqtuq already asked about this. They have made some
12 preparation for management systems or plans, and they're
13 not done yet and haven't been submitted.

14 So I would like to see some sort of draft of
15 your proposed management plan on Bathurst caribou at the
16 community level, and I'm sure that you're not aware of this
17 proposed management system as a KIA. Maybe they've been
18 talking about it with the regional wildlife board. But are
19 you aware? Are you going to help them to prepare for these
20 management plans according to the NLCA? Thank you.

21 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Charlie.

22 Geoff.

23 MR. CLARK: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

24 So KIA has been communicating and coordinating
25 with the west Kitikmeot HTOs and the KRWB regarding an

1 HTO-based caribou management plan for the Bathurst herd.
2 As stated earlier, we haven't had a chance to have, for
3 example, the five hours of meetings over three separate
4 occasions that we've had with the Kugluktuk HTO due to
5 logical constraints and time constraints imposed by the
6 Nunavut Wildlife Management Board.

7 There have been discussions, there have be ideas
8 floated, but it would be premature for me to speak to what
9 those management options and alternatives are until we have
10 more discussion with the west Kitikmeot HTOs.

11 I think you mentioned that it would be nice to
12 see a draft plan. Our intent of requesting an adjournment
13 was so that we would have that draft plan available to you,
14 but the Nunavut Wildlife Management Board denied that
15 adjournment.

16 But we are involved in conversation. They did
17 request support, so we are providing support, and the KI
18 board has offered support to develop an alternative plan.

19 And I think that's what I can say to answer your
20 question. Thank you.

21 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Geoff.

22 Any other questions from the Board? Simeonie.

23 MR. KEENAINAK: Qujannamiik, itsivautaaq.

24 Not a question, but I'd like to say something,
25 as well, towards the end of our public hearing. I'm sure

1 we are all aware if we practice our real Inuit tradition,
2 hunters hunting practices, if they're confused about
3 hunting practices we would seek advice from our Elders. I
4 would encourage you to do that. That's our Inuit way:
5 Seek advice from our Elders if we are not sure of
6 something.

7 But this day and age, we've this totally foreign
8 way of dealing with things. It's totally new to us. It's
9 all in the issues and systems, procedural systems that are
10 really foreign and new that we have to learn in the process
11 of trying to decide for Inuit. And I'm sure in the future
12 our next generations will look back on us and say: Why did
13 they agree to this? Why did they make this mistake?
14 Because it's so confusing, because it's not our culture, or
15 it's not our tradition, although that is the case, to the
16 best of our knowledge and our sensibility and wisdom, we
17 should decide as hunters because we have the knowledge.
18 When we need to make decisions for our Inuit, we will make
19 decisions.

20 And we have to keep in mind that traditional
21 hunting practices are different, our equipment are
22 different, our rifles and transportation is different; and
23 that in turn can also contribute to the past way of hunting
24 and decrease in numbers. Although we know we need the
25 basic needs level for food to sustain ourselves, we also

1 have to realize that we have no traditional knowledge on
2 how to use this modern technology, and these are so new,
3 technology and technical thought process that is so new.
4 We have no way of trying to get advice from our Elders
5 because these are foreign techniques and methods. So keep
6 that in mind in the Kitikmeot area.

7 Thank you.

8 THE CHAIR: Thank you for those comments,
9 Simeonie.

10 Paul.

11 MR. EMINGAK: Thank you. Thank you, Simeonie,
12 for the comments.

13 Just a quick overview on what KIA does, in terms
14 of what Simeonie was talking about. We do have a new
15 initiatives fund that the board allocates to each of the
16 communities in the region, whether it be for language,
17 cultural, Elders, youth, sports, whatnot. The monies come
18 from the Inuit benefit agreements that are negotiated with
19 KIA and industry and others. And any beneficiary, any
20 community can access through an application what type of
21 program they want to do in the community, whether it be
22 tool making, sewing, set making, whatnot, or hunting
23 traditional practices, that sort of thing.

24 And it's up to the community to decide, you
25 know, how they want to run the program through an

1 application process, and we have a committee of a board
2 that reviews the applications and provides the funding to
3 communities for such programs. And we are just one entity
4 that can, you know, try and help our beneficiaries. There
5 are others. There's GN, there's the federal government,
6 and our organization tries to access those funding from
7 various governments and agencies to assist also in program
8 delivery.

9 So, you know, we are trying, and we're just one
10 organization that is trying to assist. Thank you.

11 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much, Paul.

12 Okay. No other questions from the Board?
13 Staff? Michael.

14 MR. D'EÇA: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

15 I've got two matters I want to bring up with
16 you, and, really, I guess to start I just want to clarify
17 things. Can you go back to I think it would be your
18 second-last slide. It's the one that refers to -- yes,
19 number 5 there. "GN and NWMB must fund the western
20 Kitikmeot HTOs appropriately to undertake these actions."

21 And I'm not sure if KIA is -- and I'm not
22 speaking for the GN, but for the NWMB. KIA may be basing
23 that upon a section in Article 5 -- I think it's 5.7.13 --
24 which says that adequate funding for the operation of HTOs
25 and RWOs shall be provided by the NWMB.

1 I want to give you a bit more of an explanation.
2 HTOs and RWOs are Inuit organizations. The NWMB is an
3 institution of public government, and all of our funding
4 flows from the Government of Canada and is decided upon for
5 implementation planning periods, so ten-year periods.

6 And the NWMB has been a champion, since the
7 establishment of the Land Claims Agreement, for adequate
8 funding of RWOs and HTOs to be able to carry out their
9 responsibility under 5.7.3 and 5.7.6 of the Land Claims
10 Agreement. But the decision-makers for that funding or the
11 decisions for levels of funding are negotiated by the
12 representatives of Inuit, NTI, and by the federal
13 government, and the Government of Nunavut. NWMB's funding
14 is separate.

15 So when the NWMB provides funding to the RWOs
16 and HTOs, that is what has been worked out by the parties
17 to the Land Claims Agreement. And NWMB's funding is for
18 its own operations and, you know, it's tight, but the Board
19 is a frugal board and carries on.

20 So I'm just concerned that you seem to be
21 indicating that the NWMB must find funding for the HTOs to
22 carry out their responsibilities or projects that flow from
23 their authorities and responsibilities under the Land
24 Claims Agreement; and if that is so, then I do have a
25 disagreement with you. I don't think that that is what the

1 Land Claim requires. I think we would run into all kinds
2 of problems if, in fact, the NWMB did not have certainty
3 about what its funding is and might have to come up with,
4 you know, potentially quite large sums of money because of
5 a project, however worthy, that an HTO or RWO would take
6 on.

7 So I just want to get your take on that and see
8 if we are in some kind of disagreement here.

9 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Michael.

10 Geoff.

11 MR. CLARK: So our reference to that was
12 5.7.13 of the NLCA regarding funding, and so I suppose we
13 do have a disagreement, then. And we state that in order
14 to put some pressure on the Nunavut Wildlife Management
15 Board to assure that the HTOs have the proper capacity to
16 deal with the issues so that when they come before the
17 Board that they're able to meet your needs and that KIA
18 doesn't need to intervene like we have in this
19 circumstance. Thank you.

20 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Geoff.

21 Michael.

22 MR. D'ÉÇA: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

23 I know you sit on the board of NTI, and as far
24 as I am aware -- maybe I'll have more surprises -- because
25 we have talked to NTI, to the Government of Canada, to the

1 Nunavut Implementation Panel many times over all these
2 years regarding these matters and the interpretation of
3 5.7.13 and so on, and as far as I am aware, NTI is in
4 agreement with the NWMB and has supported us in our
5 arguments to the Nunavut Implementation Panel.

6 So I guess we can leave it at that. We are in
7 disagreement, but I invite you to talk to your colleagues
8 at NTI, and we'll see where it goes from there.

9 Mr. Chair, I have one other matter, more of a
10 clarification at this point.

11 I'm not sure where it is in your PowerPoint
12 presentation. It seemed to be around the middle, but it
13 was an indication after you had kind of gone through your
14 consultation analysis you turned to section 5.3.3. And
15 what has to be done prior to the consideration of the
16 establishment of a total allowable harvest, and this is
17 what I understand, looking at that. I couldn't really find
18 it in your longer submission, but again, I was kind of
19 scrambling to look for it so I may have missed it.

20 My impression is that it appeared to indicate
21 that section 5.3.3 requires that the consideration of the
22 establishment of a total allowable harvest by the NWMB is
23 conditional upon first undertaking a section 5.7.3
24 analysis -- or 5.7.6 in the case of the RWO. But that kind
25 of -- there was a step that is really required to be

1 undertaken, and that has to be sort of worked through
2 before the NWMB has the authority to establish a total
3 allowable harvest.

4 And I do want to make it clear that, again, the
5 NWMB is very supportive of 5.7.3 and 5.7.6 rights and the
6 RWOs and HTOs being able to exercise them in a robust way.
7 We support that, but I am concerned that I'm getting the
8 impression that what KIA is saying is: No, it's more than
9 that: There is a legal obligation to take that particular
10 step; otherwise, you are acting contrary to the law in
11 establishing a total allowable harvest.

12 And, again, let's hear back from you, because
13 maybe I've read too much into it or something like that.
14 Or maybe we do have a dispute. Taima.

15 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Michael.

16 Geoff.

17 MR. CLARK: This is clearly a legal question,
18 and we brought a lawyer with us, so I invite John Donihee
19 to answer that. Thank you.

20 THE CHAIR: John, go ahead.

21 MR. DONIHEE: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

22 It's John Donihee.

23 Our reading of 5.3.3 -- and I'll just go back to
24 the language -- we had it in the slides. It just said
25 that, you know, the NWMB should only limit Inuit harvesting

1 to the extent necessary. We're not arguing here about the
2 conservation purpose.

3 I guess what we're saying is, you know, the case
4 law, which is available, that deals with issues like
5 accommodation and reconciliation clearly applies in the
6 context of a proposal to limit Inuit rights through the
7 NLCA. And, so, where is the effort to accommodate or look
8 for another option? I mean, our view is that, in respect
9 of section 5.3.3, that it's incumbent on -- I'm not saying
10 it's legally wrong, I suppose. Although, if I thought
11 about it some more, I might. But for the moment, I'm just
12 suggesting it's incumbent on the Board, when you're being
13 asked to impose a TAH, to ask yourselves whether this is
14 something that is necessary. You know, is there another
15 way that you could achieve the same conservation purpose
16 without the requirement to limit Inuit rights?

17 I think that's the fundamental purpose of 5.3.3,
18 and all I'm suggesting is that, in this case where there's
19 evidence of a desire to try to approach it in a different
20 way, that the Board give recognition to that evidence. And
21 the case that KIA is essentially putting in front of you is
22 to say we believe there's another way that can work and
23 that the TAH is not necessary.

24 So we're not going so far as to say that it's a
25 legal -- we're not raising a legal challenge on that basis.

1 We're simply saying we think there is a question that
2 should be asked before the Board says the only way forward
3 is a TAH. And that question is: Is there an alternative?
4 Have we explored that alternative? Are we satisfied that
5 that alternative will achieve the same conservation
6 objective? And if the answers to those questions are yes,
7 we suggest the Board should then choose the alternative
8 rather than limiting Inuit rights.

9 THE CHAIR: Thank you, John.

10 Michael, briefly.

11 MR. D'EÇA: I won't go too much further,

12 Mr. Chairman.

13 I'm happier with that explanation because you
14 did say "in this case," and in this case you have made your
15 case, and that's perfectly appropriate. It's where in
16 every case there is a legal obligation to explore 5.7.3,
17 5.7.6 that would be a concern. So I don't know if we're on
18 all fours with this, but close enough that I think I'm
19 going to focus on your reference to "in this case,"
20 etcetera.

21 I just want to also point out, you know, the
22 test is -- because the NWMB looks at that test every time.
23 If it's making a decision under 5.3.3(a), it ensures for
24 itself that it has met the test. And the test is that the
25 restriction or the limitation on Inuit harvesting is only

1 to the extent necessary to effect a valid conservation
2 purpose.

3 So I think you're going beyond that, and, I
4 mean, clearly that's a test. I just read out which you
5 have on your slide, which is what's in the Land Claim. And
6 I'm just underlining that those are the words, and they
7 have a particular meaning, and, again, whether we interpret
8 them exactly the same, I'm not sure. But I want us to make
9 sure that we're all relying upon that language in terms of
10 determining whether or not the NWMB has met its
11 responsibilities under section 5.3.3. Taima.

12 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Michael. I think that
13 was more of a comment, but if KIA would like to respond or
14 comment, feel free. John, briefly.

15 MR. DONIHUE: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

16 People didn't come here to hear debate between
17 lawyers. I'll try to end it here.

18 But I accept your point about, you know, the
19 reading of 5.3.3. Obviously, those words are clear. It
20 just seems to me that the purpose of the words you just
21 read is really to see whether there's some way, short of --
22 at least we're suggesting to you in this case -- whether
23 there's some way short of a TAH to effect that conservation
24 purpose, which is to protect the Bathurst caribou herd
25 which is in trouble and which we admit is in trouble.

1 And, really, it's a question of mechanism, I
2 suppose, in a sense. Is it the TAH that's the best way to
3 do this? Or is it sufficient to breathe some life into
4 5.7.3, 5.7.6, and encourage Inuit at the community level to
5 exercise authorities that are also in the Land Claim in
6 order to achieve that same conservation purpose?

7 We're suggesting to the Board there's an
8 alternative here, in this case, based on the evidence
9 that's in front of you, and we're certainly not asking for
10 some kind of a generalized ruling about this for other
11 matters that may be in front of the Board.

12 THE CHAIR: Thank you John.

13 Okay. We're going to move on to questions from
14 the GN. Comments or questions. Mathieu.

15 GOVERNMENT OF NUNAVUT QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

16 MR. DUMOND: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

17 Mathieu Dumond, Government of Nunavut.

18 One thing I wanted to ask the KIA: In your
19 presentation on several occasion and in your written
20 submission, like, you mention that following the Land Claim
21 in establishing a TAH, following a conservation concern
22 that the establishment of a TAH remove all powers from the
23 HTO to transfer them to the government.

24 And my understanding is that it's after the
25 limit is established by the NWMB, and then it's on the

1 contrary because the allocation is delegated to the RWOs
2 and the HTOs that have the power to allocate this harvest
3 as they wish, also establishing bylaws or other regulation
4 in managing that harvest, in terms of zoning, in terms of
5 seasons, in terms of anything they see fit to make it work
6 and efficient.

7 So my question to you is: Why are you keeping
8 bringing that statement that a TAH is necessarily the
9 removal of all powers from the HTO transferred to the
10 government? I don't see it really accurate.

11 Thank you.

12 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mathieu.

13 KIA, John.

14 MR. DONIHÉE: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

15 Thank you for the question.

16 I think at the root of our different points of
17 view about this particular matter that you're asking about
18 is, KIA starts from the position that if the TAH is
19 fundamentally -- it's a limitation on a constitutional
20 right to harvest that's granted to Inuit. And you've heard
21 from numerous other sources. We did ask some questions
22 about it, I asked some questions about it yesterday. But,
23 clearly, once a TAH is in place, the limits, the numbers of
24 animals that can be harvested are dictated by regulation,
25 and potentially, you know, we didn't agree on all points

1 when I asked you questions about it yesterday, but
2 ultimately, you know, there is an enforcement system out
3 there that could be resorted to.

4 So that's, you know, the way we're looking at it
5 from our perspective is that's bringing the machinery of
6 government and its enforcement powers into play. Your
7 preference may be, continue to work with the community, and
8 I commend you for that. And it's true that once the number
9 of tags passes is determined, that either KRWB or the HTO,
10 depending on whether it's a regional or community TAH, will
11 have an allocation role or may have an allocation role in
12 all of this. But I think that, at the end of the day, that
13 doesn't really change the fact that the whole game is
14 changed. You know, we're now working in a system that is
15 simply a different one from the one where Inuit manage
16 entirely on their own among themselves and that, you know,
17 they're making the rules for themselves.

18 Now there's an imposition of a formal framework.
19 It may not be resorted to frequently, but we think it's
20 different once the TAH is in place than it was before, and
21 we think that it would be different; it will feel different
22 for Inuit at the community level in exercising those rights
23 if they can do it on their own based on the rules their own
24 HTO or RWO is making.

25 So, you know, the difference is, really, one of

1 broad perspective, I think, but now I hope you understand
2 why we explained it the way we did.

3 THE CHAIR: Thank you, John.

4 Mathieu, GN?

5 MR. DUMOND: Thank you.

6 No, it's just that I think it's a little bit
7 extreme and a little bit beyond just providing fair
8 information to express it that way because, as you said,
9 it's a framework to manage wildlife. But that has been
10 developed by Inuit in the Land Claim and establish in the
11 Land Claim as one of the tools to manage wildlife, and it's
12 clear in the Land Claim that after the NWMB establish a
13 TAH, the powers are delegated to the RWOs and the HTOs. So
14 I just find the wording that you're using little bit of a
15 scare tactic instead of presenting the facts as they are.

16 And I'll agree to disagree on the establishment
17 of a TAH itself, like, the startup of it. But for that
18 part, I think it's a little bit beyond -- I mean, it's a
19 little bit of a scare tactic, I find, in presenting the
20 facts.

21 Thank you.

22 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mathieu. Drikus?

23 MR. GISSING: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

24 Drikus Gissing, Government of Nunavut,
25 Department of Environment.

1 I have a question or two, and then a comment or
2 two as well. Maybe my first question to KIA is: Do you
3 agree that the current status of the herd, and based on
4 information provided by Lisa and the Northwest Territories
5 biologist that we are currently dealing with a valid
6 conservation concern for the Bathurst caribou herd?

7 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Drikus.

8 Geoff.

9 MR. CLARK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

10 Yes.

11 THE CHAIR: Thank you.

12 Drikus.

13 MR. GISSING: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

14 Then the next one is more of a comment. It's
15 concerning the comments made by KIA concerning lack of
16 consultation, failure to consultation, lack of working with
17 communities on dealing with this conservation issue on the
18 Bathurst herd. I would almost go -- I find it a bit
19 insulting in a way, to be quite frank, but I'll maybe use
20 better words to say that I strongly disagree with those
21 statements.

22 We, as the government, take our responsibility
23 very serious to work with communities. And as director,
24 I've given very clear instructions over the years to the
25 staff in the regions, including Mathieu, who used to be the

1 regional biologist who's worked with the communities over
2 many years to deal with wildlife issues in this region --
3 and then Lisa Marie that came in a few years ago -- and
4 they're very passionate about their work, and they've been
5 very passionate in working with communities and opposing
6 recommendations to establish total allowable harvest
7 limitations on a lot of herds. And we've had a lot of
8 disagreements on issues, but they've worked very well with
9 the communities, and I think they've tried very hard to
10 work with communities to a level where it's been very
11 frustrating. And I think the NWT could maybe comment on
12 that.

13 But, over the years, there's been a lot of
14 pressure from the NWT as to, why is Nunavut not taking
15 action on these conservation issues, specifically on the
16 Bathurst herd, the Bluenose herd, the herds that we are
17 sharing with them.

18 And the reason why we haven't is because we've
19 been working with the communities. There's been a lot of
20 consultations, as we've identified, to communicate these
21 conservation concerns that have been taking place.

22 Our staff have been working with communities to
23 look at alternatives, and nothing prevented the communities
24 from initiating management actions in their communities,
25 and some has. As you know, Kugluktuk have taken actions

1 where they've stopped community hunts. They've diverted
2 harvesting to its muskox. And, again, we encourage that,
3 and we try to work with those HTOs to try and work towards
4 alternatives to a TAH.

5 But we've got to a situation now where we're
6 dealing with shared herds with another jurisdiction, and
7 they are taking action, and the perception is that we are
8 not taking action. And, again, when we consulted with the
9 communities, we identified what we believe was the best
10 available scientific information is the actions to be
11 taken.

12 And that's what we presented during the
13 consultations as a last resort, and, again, it was a
14 proposal that we're bringing forward to the NWMB. That's
15 the main instrument for wildlife management in Nunavut.
16 But our minister is ultimately responsible.

17 Nobody is going to come to KIA and complain
18 about Nunavut or the management, we're not taking action.
19 And as you mentioned, you're very new to this, and you're
20 trying to portray yourselves as the new saviours of the
21 Kitikmeot Region coming in and you're going to help take
22 away from the Government because they failed to work with
23 you.

24 And as I said, I take a little bit of offence to
25 that because we do want to work with communities. We fund

1 the HTOs, and although we're not identified as the main
2 party to fund HTOs, we do put a lot of money into HTOs and
3 RWOs every year. We currently have increased our
4 implementation funding to offer a million dollars this year
5 to work with HTOs to implement issues like management
6 plans, consult with the co-management partners, to develop
7 management plans across Nunavut. And it is challenging.

8 It's challenging for the HTOs, and you will see
9 that. And I don't know where this will go, but it's been
10 very challenging for a lot of HTOs in Nunavut and other
11 regions that have had the same conservation issues that the
12 Kitikmeot is currently encountering where they tried what
13 you're suggesting; community-based management, where before
14 we implemented total allowable harvest -- Coral Harbour is
15 a good example where we told the HTO: You implement
16 management actions. And we try to support them, and they
17 find it very difficult because some of their members were
18 not following the rules and regulations and the bylaws that
19 the HTOs created.

20 And they came back to us and said: No, we want
21 you to manage this harvesting restriction. And where we've
22 taken it over. And there's other regions and examples that
23 I can give as well where, for a number of years we've asked
24 the HTOs that they develop and implement community-based
25 actions, and where they found it very difficult. And it

1 could be a lack of support, and that's possible. But they
2 found it -- it's very challenging in communities to impose
3 restrictions on especially a lot of -- as you know, you
4 live in a small community -- that its member is your
5 family, and it's very difficult to tell your family and
6 other individuals in the community to take action.

7 Even our conservation officers in communities
8 find it very challenging to implement restrictions on HTOs.
9 So it's not as simple as it might sound that we're going to
10 have a community-based plan, and it's going to address the
11 conservation issue. We tried in a lot of instances, and we
12 continue to work about the co-management partners.

13 I tried to work -- and I believe I have
14 developed a very close working relationship with NTI and
15 other co-management partners over the years with the intent
16 that we try and work together as per the intent of the
17 Nunavut Land Claims Agreement. And a lot of comments from
18 KIA try to create the impression that we're doing that, and
19 I strongly disagree. So it's more of a statement in that
20 regard.

21 And as I say, we are very committed to working
22 with all the HTOs in this region. We're committed to put
23 funding into this region to implement a lot of these
24 actions.

25 And as Mathieu said, we are not trying to take

1 away anything from anybody. We realize that the Land
2 Claims Agreement is very important, and our government
3 takes it very serious. The MLAs come from these
4 communities. They are our bosses, and they give us clear
5 direction on expectations. But at the end of the day, we
6 are ultimately responsible for wildlife management; and if
7 there's a serious conservation concern, as you recognize,
8 we have to take action.

9 And we believe we are at the stage now where
10 there's no other alternative but to propose to the NWMB a
11 total allowable harvest. And it's not up to the Board to
12 take all evidence from Elders and from everyone around the
13 table and consider if there's an alternative to what we
14 proposed. Maybe our TAH proposal is too low, maybe there's
15 opportunity to increase that. I'm not sure. But that's up
16 to the Board, and we will respect the Board's decision, and
17 we will present that to our minister.

18 Thank you.

19 I want to give Lisa Marie the opportunity, as
20 well, Mr. Chair, just to maybe very briefly identify to you
21 the intent of the consultations and the nature of some of
22 the consultations that she's conducted with the HTOs and
23 where she's tried to work with them to try and find
24 solutions to some of these problems.

25 Thank you.

1 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Drikus. Lisa.

2 MS. LECLERC: Mr. Chair.

3 Since, you know, restriction was imposed on GNW
4 side in 2010. We did not. We, at that time, start a very
5 heavy meeting and dialogue through a lot of consultation
6 that did not include TAH at that time. We were working for
7 alternative solution. But with the recent decline and the
8 rise of the conservation concern, at what point we have to
9 take the last resort.

10 So the January meeting was to actually update
11 the information so everybody at the table -- which the
12 Cambridge Bay HTO joined the dialogue -- was brought up to
13 the same speed with the status of the herd. They were
14 actually overview of the NLCA process, and they're a
15 co-management partner, so we see them as equal around the
16 table.

17 And we really wanted to make sure that that
18 equality as co-management partner was reflected in this
19 January 2016 meeting. The GN have responsibility and
20 therefore were proposing, not imposing a TAH. Proposing.
21 Recommending.

22 Following this and the justification from the
23 DoE position, there were entire day where alternative
24 predator solution and so on concern, vision, what has been
25 doing -- like, what action was actually currently

1 implemented at the community level. Everything was
2 discussed on the second day.

3 When we reach the last step, it's really hard,
4 and when very strong measure are needed, it's really hard
5 to come to a consensus, and I think that this is why we are
6 consulting again today with NWMB on that issue on the
7 proposal.

8 Thank you -- just a little thing. That was more
9 for comment than needed an answer.

10 However, I would like to know if the minute in
11 the agenda for KIA consultation on the Bathurst situation
12 could be made available. And the second point is, I'm a
13 little bit disappointed that no effort was made to reach or
14 involve the GN at the very early stage of the Bathurst
15 management plan.

16 Thank you.

17 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Government of Nunavut.
18 Geoff. Paul.

19 MR. EMINGAK: Thank you very much for your
20 comments on that.

21 We do take, you know, seriously any concerns of
22 beneficiaries that come to us, including the HTOs. And it
23 is our obligation to represent them fairly, to listen to
24 their views, to work with them. There were concerns raised
25 by the HTOs and also with the Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife

1 Board. So we've collected all the information that
2 happened over the years, I guess, in terms of that we say
3 "consultations."

4 And, therefore, you know, in that sense we want
5 to bring it out to this hearing that, you know, the
6 information provided to the HTOs and, as well, to others
7 were not, I don't think, properly communicated or properly
8 interpreted; and there were some concerns that raised some
9 issues out of that. So that's the reason for, you know,
10 our presentation.

11 And, as well, in terms of our intervention, we
12 tried to be part of the process last year, a couple years,
13 but we were told, you know, we couldn't be part of the
14 round table. You can sit as observers.

15 I mean, that's contrary to our Nunavut Land
16 Claims Agreement. We represent the beneficiaries, we
17 represent the HTOs, in the community. If they have any
18 concerns, then we try to assist them in solving the issue.

19 So I'll leave it at that, and Geoff has other
20 comments.

21 MR. CLARK: So there were a lot of comments
22 made there, and just like to, I guess, respond to you a few
23 matters made in those statements.

24 First of all, if anybody is offended, it's not
25 our purpose. Our purpose is to represent Inuit and to make

1 sure that their rights are protected. We have no issues
2 whatsoever with the professionalism and efforts of the GN
3 staff. We know that they work hard, they have limited
4 capacity, there's pressure from the GNWT on them, as was
5 noted, and that there are multiple projects that they're
6 working on with limited resources. So none of our
7 commentary has anything to do with what we believe -- it
8 has nothing to do with anything about the people. It's
9 about the problem we're trying to solve. We have no issues
10 with the people at the GN.

11 Secondly, we believe there's a fundamental
12 difference between a good co-management partner, which we
13 believe the GN has made a lot of effort and has
14 demonstrated through attempting and -- not attempting --
15 meeting with the HTOs, and there's a fundamental difference
16 between that and consultation when there's a proposal to
17 limit Inuit rights, and that is the scope of our concern.

18 Lastly, we are bringing forward what the HTOs
19 told us. When we met with the HTOs individually or as a
20 group, they consistently told us that they were not
21 consulted about the TAH. Some told us they didn't recall
22 any discussion about a TAH at the meeting, that they
23 couldn't recall.

24 If, in our initial meetings, we had met with the
25 HTOs and they had said, yes, we were consulted on a TAH, we

1 know what the issues are, we've made our suggestions and
2 we've been accommodated, KIA would have left it at that.
3 But when we felt that -- not felt -- we heard that the HTOs
4 believed that they were not consulted, and, I suppose, the
5 word "consulted" has been used a lot at this hearing the
6 last couple of days, but it gets used so much that it
7 becomes a generic term. And KIA has a very specific view
8 of what "consultation" means when Inuit rights are proposed
9 to be limited.

10 When we heard from the HTOs that they were not
11 consulted on this, we felt we had an obligation to get
12 involved. Otherwise, we wouldn't be here. We're not
13 trying to present ourselves as the saviour in this process.
14 We're merely being a voice and assistance to those that
15 felt they hadn't been heard.

16 As far as it goes regarding minutes of any
17 meeting, we have no minutes, we're not required to keep
18 minutes in our conversations with HTO members. There's no
19 bylaw requirement of KIA or anything like that, so we have
20 none, and there's no expectation that we would have to
21 share that.

22 But, once again, I want to make it clear to all
23 the people around the table, this is about the specific
24 issue of a TAH proposal and the problem that we believe
25 that entails that we're trying to solve today. It has

1 nothing to do with the people.

2 Taima. Thank you.

3 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Geoff.

4 GN.

5 MS. LECLERC: Just a brief mention. We have an
6 audio recording of that January '16 meeting, so we could
7 make that available to NWMB. Thank you.

8 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thank you, Lisa.

9 All right. We'll move on, then, to GNWT.

10 GOVERNMENT OF NORTHWEST TERRITORIES QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

11 MS. YONGE: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

12 Lynda Yonge, GNWT. I just have a couple of
13 points of clarification. The first one is with respect to
14 the slide that KIA put up about the consultation and
15 identifying the fact that two of those meetings were led by
16 the GNWT.

17 So consultation -- there's a spectrum of
18 activity that happens with consultation, and the first step
19 is to provide adequate and thorough information on which to
20 make a decision. So those two meetings, while they were
21 not specific to the TAH, they're the beginning of the
22 process to come to that recommendation. They were led by
23 the GNWT because this is a shared herd, and we had a
24 political leaders' meeting where we brought in all the
25 political leaders, and they said, you guys need to get the

1 technical people together, get all the information
2 together, and come up with some options for us as a
3 leaders.

4 The majority of the harvesting groups are in the
5 NWT, and so we did host that meeting, but there was good
6 representation at them. So I would suggest that it is a
7 valid step in the consultation process. Possible ways of
8 dealing with the issue were discussed, and that to me is
9 the first step towards moving towards a proposal for a TAH.
10 So not suggesting it was specific to the TAH, but it is
11 part of the spectrum of consultation.

12 My second point of clarification is just about
13 the Deliné plan. So it was used as an example of an
14 alternative to a TAH, and that's actually not quite
15 correct. There is a TAH process -- and, sorry -- the
16 Deliné plan is for the Bluenose East herd, and I expect we
17 may discuss it some more in the next hearing, but it is a
18 plan that fits in within the context of an overall TAH. So
19 we do have a number of land claims agreements in the
20 Northwest Territories. We have processes just like this to
21 set a total allowable harvest. A total allowable harvest
22 for the Bluenose East has been recently determined by the
23 Wek'èezhìi Renewable Resources Board, and the Sahtu
24 Renewable Resources Board has held a hearing on a total
25 allowable harvest, and we are expecting a recommendation

1 from them next month.

2 The Deliné plan was also considered at the
3 hearing by the Sahtu Renewable Resources Board. It is a
4 way for Deliné to manage the allocation that the Sahtu will
5 get from the total allowable harvest of the Bluenose East
6 herd. So it's a herd-wide total allowable harvest. There
7 is an allocation for each of the regions. One of those
8 regions is the Sahtu Region. Deliné is a community within
9 the Sahtu, and the Deliné plan is how that community is
10 going to use traditional methods, traditional knowledge.
11 They refer to it as "hunting the way our grandfathers
12 hunted" to manage the way they harvest the Bluenose East
13 caribou herd.

14 There are mechanisms for authorizations in that
15 plan, and there is reference to a limit in that plan, and
16 there is a system of encouraging compliance and then
17 ensuring compliance. And the last step in that process is
18 using GNWT officers to enforce, and so we're still working
19 with them to find out what that legal mechanism can be so
20 that it's not -- if we put it in regulation, it's very
21 difficult to allow other steps to happen first, but we're
22 trying to find some way that there will actually be a
23 backup, a legal backup by the GNWT to be able to help
24 enforce that.

25 So I just wanted to make it clear that it's not

1 an alternative, but it's a way of working within an overall
2 context of a total allowable harvest.

3 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much, Lynda, for
4 that information.

5 Okay. We'll move on to Kitikmeot Regional
6 Wildlife Board. Oh, sorry. We'll move on to the Kitikmeot
7 Regional Wildlife Board. Any questions for KIA?

8 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: Qujannamiik, itsivautaaq. Simon
9 Qingnaqtuq. I don't have any questions at the moment.

10 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Simon.

11 Kuglugtuk HTO. Larry, any questions?

12 KUGLUGTUK HTO QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

13 MR. L. ADJUN: I have a few, but I don't think
14 it's appropriate to bring up different issues that pertain
15 to the Bathurst Inlet caribou herd at the moment. I
16 believe it's delicate enough as it is from this afternoon's
17 sessions already, so I'm not going there.

18 THE CHAIR: Okay, Larry. Well, it's totally
19 your choice whether you want to ask questions or not, so is
20 there any other members of your board that would have any
21 questions? Jorgen?

22 MR. BOLT: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

23 So if we don't find a solution to the problem,
24 what's the next step? If we don't -- how would you say?
25 If we don't resolve this issue, where do we go from here?

1 Like, are we just going to keep talking about it until the
2 caribou are gone, or what are we going to do? We need to
3 put some energy into helping these caribou.

4 I guess I'm just trying to get at CITES, I
5 guess, international. Because you talk about circumpolar
6 caribou; right? So at what point do the national, federal
7 government take over? I mean, I know for a fact that they
8 were doing some seismic testing over in Baffin Bay, and the
9 company went to the local, I believe to the local HTOs or
10 something like that, and they got denied for testing in
11 those waters. And then they turned around and went to the
12 federal government. So they got superseded. Is that going
13 to happen here?

14 Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

15 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jorgen.

16 KIA, would you choose to respond to that?
17 Geoff.

18 MR. CLARK: Yeah, the answer would be is if
19 the HTOs cannot show that they can manage the caribou herd
20 themselves, then the Nunavut Wildlife Management Board
21 really will have no choice but to impose a TAH. That would
22 be the next step, if you're saying, What's next?

23 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Geoff.

24 Jorgen.

25 MR. BOLT: I guess, that really wasn't what I

1 was looking for. How would you say it? I don't know.

2 Yeah, I mean, when can we not even put a TAH? When can we
3 not even hunt? When can we not even put a total allowable
4 harvest? When there's one caribou left? What? When?

5 Thank you.

6 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jorgen.

7 MR. CLARK: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

8 I don't have an answer for what that threshold
9 is.

10 THE CHAIR: Would you like to defer that to a
11 biologist, maybe, to give an answer?

12 MR. CLARK: Mr. Chair, I'm not sure if that's
13 fair, but I'll leave it to them if they want to try to
14 handle that.

15 THE CHAIR: No. We'll leave it, then.

16 It didn't sound like you're going to have an
17 answer. Any more questions from Kugluktuk?

18 MR. L. ADJUN: No more, Mr. Chairman.

19 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry.

20 Bathurst Inlet, any questions for KIA.

21 MR. S. KAPOLAK: Thank you. No questions.

22 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Sam.

23 Bay Chimo, Peter.

24 MR. P. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chair. No
25 questions.

1 THE CHAIR: Cambridge Bay HTO, any questions
 2 for KIA?

3 MR. GREENLEY: Thank you, Mr. Chair. No
 4 questions.

5 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Bobby.
 6 Any Elders representatives or Elders present
 7 have any questions for KIA? I don't see any.

8 We'll carry on. NTI, any questions for KIA?

9 MR. DEAN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
 10 No questions.

11 THE CHAIR: North Slave Métis Alliance, Shin,
 12 any questions?

13 MR. SHIGA: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
 14 I have no questions.

15 THE CHAIR: Adventure Northwest Limited, Boyd,
 16 any questions?

17 MR. WARNER: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Just when
 18 is supper? No questions.

19 THE CHAIR: I was getting to that.
 20 Is there any questions from the public at all to
 21 KIA? If not, that ends the session for KIA.

22 Thank you very much for your presentation and
 23 the answers to all the questions around the table.

24 Okay. I think at this point we'll break for
 25 supper, but can we all be back here again at 6:45, and

1 hopefully we're going to finish this hearing tonight.

2 Thank you very much.

3 (Proceedings ended at 5:22 p.m.)

4

5 (Proceedings to recommence at 6:45 p.m.)

6

7 (Proceedings recommenced at 6:45 p.m.)

8 THE CHAIR: Welcome back, everybody. Thank
9 you very much for coming back. We have three more
10 presentations to be done, and I think this shouldn't take
11 too long, so we'll try and finish as soon as we can.

12 So, up now I have North Slave Métis Alliance.
13 Shin, would you like to make your presentation, please.

14 NORTH SLAVE MÉTIS ALLIANCE SUBMISSION

15 MR. SHIGA: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

16 Shin Shiga, North Slave Métis Alliance. I'd
17 like to thank the people of Kitikmeot of the great
18 hospitality. This is my third time visiting your land in
19 two months, and it's been an absolute pleasure every time
20 I'm here, so thank you.

21 So it is with great difficulty that I'm here
22 today in front of you because what I'm going to ask you and
23 ask the Nunavut Wildlife Management Board is perhaps
24 contrary to what you want to see or hear. Although we may
25 disagree on points, please accept that the indigenous Métis

1 people of the Great Slave Lake area who sent me here today
2 do so in good faith and wish to work together and to
3 protect Bathurst caribou for future generations of all
4 Aboriginal people who depend on these animals.

5 However this process unfolds, that is whether
6 the TAH is assigned by the Board or be it resolved to the
7 local HTO-led initiatives, it is NSMA's hope that we build
8 a collaborative working relationship with everyone to
9 wisely manage Bathurst caribou that is so crucial to
10 Aboriginal people we all represent here today.

11 That said, Mr. Chair, members of the Board, and
12 the people of Kitikmeot, the North Slave Métis Alliance
13 does not support establishing the total allowable harvest
14 of 30 Bathurst caribou bulls. We suggest instead a
15 temporary harvest moratorium of Bathurst caribou.

16 I would like to share with you what happened to
17 North Slave Métis Alliance members in the last six years in
18 the way of trying to communicate how difficult it is for
19 the Métis people to not harvest Bathurst caribou and,
20 nonetheless, we had to.

21 In 2010, when Bathurst caribou dramatically
22 reduced in numbers, the GNWT introduced a total allowable
23 harvest of 300 Bathurst caribou and gave 150 tags to Tlicho
24 people and 150 tags to the Yellowknives Dene people.

25 NSMA members got none. NSMA had to take the

1 government to court, and after spending millions of
2 dollars, in February of 2015 we won, as we expected and was
3 again recognized the Aboriginal right to harvest caribou.
4 When we finally won, there were no more caribou to harvest.

5 For six years, NSMA members could not harvest
6 Bathurst caribou. In those six years, Elders passed away,
7 youth grew up to be adults without having the chance to
8 hunt caribou in their traditional harvesting areas. The
9 NSMA still supported moratorium on Bathurst caribou.

10 We raised our concerns with the GNWT that this
11 was impacting Aboriginal rights of NSMA members, that it's
12 disrupting cultural practices, that our members are in dire
13 shortage of fish meat which they grew up with. ENR
14 suggested -- GNWT suggested -- that we could buy reindeer
15 meat, but, of course, it's not just about having similar
16 meat on the table. Harvesting caribou is about culture,
17 teaching, knowing the land, traditions, and aboriginal
18 rights. So we declined respectfully the offer for reindeer
19 meat, and throughout all that, we supported the moratorium
20 on Bathurst caribou harvest.

21 And that's because, given the magnitude of the
22 decline and everything else that is happening on the land,
23 NSMA members think that it is their responsibility to give
24 Bathurst caribou the best chance to recover so that their
25 children will be able to see the caribou come back to their

1 land again.

2 So I'm here today to convey that message to the
3 people of Kitikmeot that the NSMA would like your support
4 in protecting and helping to recover this suffering herd
5 and that NSMA thinks the appropriate action right now is to
6 give Bathurst caribou the space to recover and not hunt
7 them until they start coming back in strength.

8 Thank you very much. That concludes my
9 presentation, Mr. Chair.

10 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much, Shin.

11 Okay. I'll open it up to questions of the
12 Board. Any Board Members have any questions to Shin?
13 David?

14 NUNAVUT WILDLIFE MANAGEMENT BOARD QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

15 MR. KRITTERDLIK: Thank you.

16 David Kritterdlik from the Board.

17 A suggestion that puts in place a temporary
18 closure of harvest activities of the Bathurst caribou herd,
19 it would be nice to get some ideas. What ideas are there
20 out there to put in place in order to get around this total
21 allowable harvest number in the mean time? I am just
22 asking the person who just made that presentation if they
23 did work of this kind before and if they have any ideas.
24 Thank you.

25 THE CHAIR: Thank you, David.

1 Shin.

2 MR. SHIGA: Thank you for the question.

3 Shin Shiga, North Slave Métis Alliance. So the
4 question was how to try to not get to the point of not
5 having a total allowable harvest? I'm not sure.

6 In NWT where I'm involved, we feel that we tried
7 everything we could. There is a range planning process
8 that attempts to regulate the land use. Meanwhile, we
9 intervene in every development project possible to mitigate
10 impacts on caribou. We tried to work with other aboriginal
11 governments and regulatory authorities to try to mitigate
12 the impact of TAH on aboriginal people.

13 So while providing reindeer can be actually
14 insulting, that is one of the suggestions that was made, or
15 perhaps providing support to community members to take
16 other game; moose or other herds. All those things could
17 be done, but at this point, our view is that a moratorium
18 is appropriate.

19 Thank you.

20 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Shin.

21 Charlie.

22 MR. INUARAK: Thank you. Charlie Inuarak, NWMB.

23 My question: You mentioned the caribou decrease
24 in great numbers, and you explained a little bit about the
25 cumulative effects, but I'd like to understand. You said

1 they decreased all of a sudden. In Nunatsiaq, NWT and our
2 government has to stated that there is a decline in the
3 Bathurst caribou. So did you ever find out why they
4 decreased drastically around your area? What were the
5 reasons?

6 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Charlie.

7 Shin.

8 MR. SHIGA: Thank you for the question.

9 Shin Shiga North Slave Métis Alliance. I think
10 there are people in the room who are much better qualified
11 to answer that question, but I'll try to deflect the
12 question.

13 I think, as far as I know, we don't have a clear
14 answer. There are many factors that might be contributing
15 to the decline, and NMSA's approach is to try to mitigate
16 all of them right now. That includes hunting.

17 Thank you.

18 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Shin.

19 Any other questions from the Board? Staff
20 questions.

21 If not, Government of Nunavut.

22 MR. GISSING: No questions.

23 THE CHAIR: Thank you.

24 Government of Northwest Territories.

25 MS. YONGE: Thank you, Mr. Chair. No

1 questions.

2 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lynda.

3 Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife Board.

4 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: Thank you, Mr. Chair. We have no
5 questions.

6 THE CHAIR: Thank you.

7 Kugluktuk HTO?

8 KUGLUKTUK HTO QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

9 MR. L. ADJUN: Quana, itsivautaaq.

10 Always seem to be the one put on the hot seat.

11 But it's not true, to the best of your knowledge with the
12 information given in the last two days, that the
13 Aborigines in the tree line with the ice roads and with
14 use of airplanes depleting one harvest or one population,
15 being the Bluenose and then transferred on over to the
16 Bluenose East, would that have a definite impact on a
17 population that we're talking about?

18 And why does it seem -- like I stated yesterday,
19 why does it seem like Nunavummiut are having to end up
20 sweeping the problems on our doorsteps?

21 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry.

22 Shin.

23 MR. SHIGA: Thank you for that question. It's
24 a tough question to answer.

25 All I can say is that aboriginal groups in

1 NWT -- I can only speak for NSMA -- we haven't hunted
2 Bathurst caribou in six years. The Bluenose East caribou,
3 we got 17 tags last winter, and it's six hours, maybe four
4 hours driving and then twelve hours Ski-Doo riding on the
5 way, so we can't get there. Yeah.

6 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Shin.

7 Larry, any follow-up?

8 MR. L. ADJUN: No, I think I'll be kind to him
9 now.

10 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry. Any other
11 questions from Kugluktuk HTO? Jorgen.

12 MR. BOLT: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

13 Jorgen with HTO, Kugluktuk HTO. Couple
14 questions.

15 This moratorium you have on the caribou from
16 your group, how long is this? And, like you said, you talk
17 about six years. You got Elders that passed away, and then
18 the younger generation grew up with no knowledge of
19 caribou. If you put this moratorium on, so you won't be
20 able to hunt caribou, period; right? So how are you going
21 to teach your younger generation if it's more than, say,
22 until you feel that the caribou is strong enough again or
23 the herd is strong enough again to be able to harvest some
24 of these caribou? How long do you think will that take,
25 and will it impede your ability to educate the younger

1 generation with this moratorium in place? How are you
2 going to teach your younger generation on the ability to
3 prepare caribou and so on?

4 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

5 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jorgen.

6 Shin.

7 MR. SHIGA: Thank you for the question.

8 So I should clarify. We cannot hunt Bathurst
9 caribou. We get a very minimum tags of 17 Bluenose East
10 tags, bull only, and there are no tags -- no limitation to
11 hunt Beverly, Ahiak herd and those eastern herds, but
12 they're very, very far away. Last winter, they didn't even
13 come to the territory, so last winter it was not
14 accessible. If they come closer, we may be able to hunt
15 them.

16 But Bathurst caribou is the main herd that the
17 NSMA members hunt, and they are not hunting them. So for
18 limited educational purposes, we are able to make concerted
19 effort to make group trips to the Bluenose East hunting
20 areas, but that is very costly for 17 tags.

21 Thank you. Oh, and how long it might take to
22 recover. I don't know. I don't know, but we hope that
23 there will be caribou in the future. That is why we are
24 not.

25 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Shin.

1 Jorgen.

2 MR. BOLT: No further questions. Thanks.

3 THE CHAIR: Thank you. No further questions
4 from Kugluktuk.

5

6 A. Okay. Bathurst Inlet, HTO, Sam. Sam, go ahead.

7 MR. S. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

8 Yeah, once again, my question was raised, and
9 the question I had in my mind was already raised and
10 answered, so I have further no questions. Thank you.

11 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Sam.

12 Bay Chimo HTO, Peter.

13 BAY CHIMO HTO QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

14 MR. P. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

15 Just one question. In your submission, can you
16 clarify for me the number of initiatives that are ongoing
17 to address the decline of Bathurst herd?

18 Thank you.

19 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Peter.

20 Shin.

21 MR. SHIGA: Thank you for the question.

22 I will try my best. There are quite a few, so I
23 might miss a couple.

24 So Bathurst Caribou Range Planning Working Group
25 is a group that includes people from Nunavut. There will

1 be a meeting next week, actually. I'll see a number of you
2 there. It's about planning, land use, so trying to decide
3 how many mines can the land sustain or caribou herd
4 sustain, where should we put the road, where should we not
5 put the road, that sort of things, wolf management or
6 predator management, it's in the primary stage of
7 development.

8 Bathurst Caribou Collaborative Management
9 Advisory Committee, we are reviewing the terms of reference
10 for that one. The purpose of that as to develop a
11 long-term management plan. A number of Inuit
12 representatives are there also.

13 So right now, other than that, we try to go to
14 major public hearings for mine development, for example,
15 and try to make the mines as caribou friendly, if you like,
16 as possible.

17 So you raised earlier about the caribou not
18 being able to cross the road. We go to a public hearing
19 and make sure those roads are designed so that the caribou
20 can cross the road. We go to public hearings so that the
21 traffic on the road is minimized, the noise on the road is
22 minimized. They stop blasting when the caribou come there,
23 that sort of thing. We go to public hearing and raise
24 those issues.

25 Thank you.

1 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Shin.
2 Peter.
3 MR. P. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
4 Thanks, Shin.
5 THE CHAIR: Okay. Carry on.
6 Is there any questions from the Elders
7 representation or Elders in the hall tonight? If none,
8 we'll carry on. Oh, I'm sorry, I did, I forgot
9 Cambridge Bay.
10 Cambridge Bay. Sorry about that, Bobby.
11 Cambridge Bay, any questions?
12 MR. GREENLEY: Thank you, Mr. Chair. That's
13 fine. No questions.
14 THE CHAIR: My apologies.
15 NTI, Paul.
16 NUNAVUT TUNNGAVIK INCORPORATED QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS
17 MR. IRNGAUT: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
18 Paul Irngaut from NTI.
19 My first question is: The historical harvest of
20 Bathurst by NSMA, do you have a number before there were
21 restrictions? Was there harvests? And can you give me the
22 historical numbers?
23 Thank you.
24 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Paul.
25 Shin.

1 MR. SHIGA: Thank you for the question.

2 Unfortunately, I do not have that number. I
3 don't think the harvest study was conducted in those times.

4 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Shin.

5 Paul.

6 MR. IRNGAUT: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

7 Thank you, Mr. Shiga. But there was harvest in
8 the past, though, eh? And I'm not sure you don't know, but
9 just to clarify, was there harvest in the past on Bathurst
10 herd?

11 Thank you.

12 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Paul.

13 Shin.

14 MR. SHIGA: Thank you. Yes, there were
15 harvests, yeah, for sure. How many, I really cannot say.

16 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Shin.

17 NTI, no more?

18 KIA, Geoff, any questions?

19 MR. CLARK: Thank you, Mr. Chair. We have no
20 questions.

21 THE CHAIR: Thank you.

22 Adventure Northwest, Boyd, any questions for
23 Shin?

24 ADVENTURE NORTHWEST LIMITED QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

25 MR. WARNER: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

1 Shin, just one quick question. Does North Slave
2 Métis Alliance support the increase in harvest of predators
3 on the Bathurst herd?

4 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Boyd.

5 Shin.

6 MR. SHIGA: Thank you for the question.

7 That's a topic that we engage with, and we are not opposed
8 to that idea, and we participate in those discussions. It
9 is a pretty -- it is a sensitive topic. It is not entirely
10 consistent with the traditional values, but we do recognize
11 that it is at the point where that should be considered.

12 So that's what I can say. Thank you.

13 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Shin.

14 Boyd.

15 MR. WARNER: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

16 Thank you, Shin. No further questions.

17 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much.

18 Is there any questions from the public to the
19 North Slave Métis Alliance?

20 If not, thank you very much, Shin, for your
21 presentation and answering the questions.

22 We'll move on. The next presentation is
23 Adventure Northwest Limited. Boyd, the floor is yours.

24 ADVENTURE NORTHWEST LIMITED SUBMISSION

25 MR. WARNER: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

1 And thank you especially to the Elders and the
2 Board Members and the interveners that are here today.

3 It's good to be back in Cambridge Bay. The
4 first time I was here was 53 years ago. I spent the first
5 four years of my life here and have a lot of friends in
6 Kitikmeot, and it's great to be back.

7 I'm not going to read my whole submission. As
8 was pointed out by the Board, they have the submission, and
9 it's there for the reading for the Board. And for anybody
10 else, I would like to read it. And a lot of the points
11 that were raised in my submission were certainly discussed
12 during the meetings.

13 I do have a few points from the meetings that I
14 would like to bring up and discuss and open for questions,
15 of course.

16 I think it's very important that we understand
17 that the Bathurst harvest in Nunavut, the harvest of
18 Bathurst caribou in Nunavut, since 2010 has been very, very
19 low. It started off at 70 animals, and it's now increased
20 to about 100 animals because, geographically, the Bathurst
21 herd is no longer accessible. And, also, I've spoken to
22 the issue of what I call herd splitting, that the animals
23 now that live on the east side of Bathurst Inlet are no
24 longer counted as Bathurst caribou anymore; they're
25 different herds.

1 So, geographically, the people of Nunavut are
2 really restricted to the Bathurst range. And the harvest
3 happens largely from the use of tags that are issued to two
4 HTOs, Umingmaktok and Bathurst, and they have the right to
5 use those tags as they see fit. So there's been a lot of
6 discussion about management plans, and I would like to
7 bring to the table that this is a very good example of an
8 informal management plan of HTOs because they're issued the
9 tags, and they get to do with what they want, which is
10 their decision, and they have chosen, up to now and
11 hopefully in the future, to allow us to work with them to
12 bring in nonresident hunters.

13 And we've heard from both HTOs that, during the
14 years that they're hunting in the fall time on Contwoyto
15 Lake, that they've seen no sign of the herd in trouble.
16 They recognize that numbers change, they hear all the talk
17 and believe the numbers are fluctuating as caribou do, but
18 not to the point of a crisis on the Bathurst herd. And, in
19 fact, they're still, even if you geographically reduce it
20 down to that small area, there's still 20,000 caribou
21 there. And when we compare that historically to 400,
22 350,000, it seems like the herd has declined by 96 percent.

23 But as I pointed out in questioning to the
24 government is, that's not all the caribou on the range.
25 When the Bathurst range was at its peak or the Bathurst

1 herd was at its peak and at 350,000 plus caribou, it
2 included all the area that's currently used by Bluenose
3 East and Ahiak and now Beverly. So there is still -- and I
4 tried to ask the GN to agree with a number of 200,000,
5 which I still feel is conservative -- that there is still
6 that many animals on the mainland.

7 So back to the Bathurst and the Burnside HTO.
8 They have a management plan in place that, if they saw a
9 decline in the herd and, for sure, if they thought -- Sam
10 and Peter thought that those animals were trouble, they
11 wouldn't issue the tags. They wouldn't allow the tags to
12 be used for sports hunting, or they would voluntarily give
13 that up. Nobody at this table wants to see the caribou
14 disappear. And I'm sure everybody would agree with that.

15 So we've also heard from Elders that bulls are
16 very important, and we've heard from biologists that there
17 is no problem with the bull-to-cow ratio right now with
18 the -- I'm just going to concede the fact of the Bathurst
19 herd being at 20,000 for the sake of this discussion -- so
20 that there is not a problem currently with that ratio, and
21 our experience on the land with the guys that are seeing
22 it.

23 So the caribou are still healthy, and a lot of
24 those skills that have been discussed. The importance of
25 meat going back to communities, Sam mentioned that families

1 get fed from these hunts. The meat has gone to
2 Yellowknife. We make a point, when it gets to Yellowknife,
3 if any extra meat is available for pickup through social
4 services, it's going to single families in need, and that's
5 the first priority who gets it in Yellowknife. And a lot
6 of those people, including the people from Kitikmeot, are
7 in Yellowknife, and they phone and ask for meat, and we
8 give it to them when it's in the freezers.

9 I'd also like to say that I disagree with the
10 statement, you know, that we have to take this step of a
11 total allowable harvest to 30 because that's all we can do,
12 or we have to do it to make it look like we're doing
13 something. It's my opinion that, since 2010, Nunavut has
14 done more to manage and to make sure the Bathurst herd is
15 protected. Through 2010 when the GNWT was still allowing
16 the harvest of up to 300 caribou, Nunavut was allowing --
17 and I mean by "allowing" is because only the HTO -- at that
18 time Burnside -- was harvesting any -- 70 caribou. And in
19 NWT, that harvest was not just limited to bulls; it was
20 also cows.

21 And I've spoken and asked several questions, so
22 I think people understand that we harvest bulls, the same
23 time. So our position would be and has been stated that we
24 actually help the caribou.

25 And it was like Kugluktuk, Larry mentioned

1 families used to live in Contwoyto Lake. Everything around
2 the table will probably recognize, you know, John
3 Franklin's name, Algona's name. When those guys lived at
4 Pellett and Contwoyto, yes, they were killing caribou. But
5 they were killing a lot of wolves, and they're not there
6 anymore in the wintertime. John spends a little bit of
7 time there. Hopefully he'll move back. His kids have
8 graduated now, and that's their goal is to live there, so
9 he will probably singly start helping those caribou because
10 he's there all winter, and I know John loves to hunt
11 wolves.

12 But we're also taking wolves during our fall
13 time, and I've talked about the importance of that, that if
14 we do take 10 or 15 wolves in September, those animals
15 aren't able to eat caribou for the rest of the winter, so
16 they're out of the picture. And it might not seen as
17 significant to some, but I think it shows that those
18 animals would have, if they're left alive, would have taken
19 more caribou than the hunts for the caribou, like the
20 sports hunts would have taken.

21 We've also heard that statistically,
22 biologically, or even scientifically, the harvest of 100
23 caribou out of a herd of 20,000 is inconsequential. It is
24 inconsequential. What we're asking for or what is being
25 asked for with a total allowable harvest of 30 is really

1 only a change in Nunavut of 70 animals being harvested, and
2 it amazes me that actually, you know, that much effort is
3 being given, because that is really all that would be
4 accomplished. And I hope I've pointed out that it would
5 actually be detrimental to the Bathurst herd to remove the
6 hunting, and we would be glad to work with Nunavut and
7 others to increase the wolf harvest around Contwoyto and
8 Pellett Lake through sports hunts or else subsistence hunt
9 if that means helping the caribou.

10 So I would like to say that I've heard that the
11 GN has faced heavy criticism because it's done nothing to
12 help the Bathurst herd. I hope through this meeting that
13 people will see that the Bathurst herd is now such a small
14 geographic range in Nunavut that, actually, Nunavut should
15 be commended for probably doing more earlier than any other
16 management group, because again, I go back to that harvest
17 of only 70 caribou in 2010 and when other jurisdictions
18 were still hunting more.

19 But our position is that no total allowable
20 harvest is needed at this time, that the management through
21 the HTOs, through -- if they want a formalized management
22 plan, we totally support that, that that's where the
23 decision should be made and that the crisis might not be
24 there as sometimes being perceived, that still is a lot of
25 caribou on the mainland. And in my lifetime of going to

1 Bathurst Inlet, which started in 1970 as a seven-year-old
2 boy and spending every summer there with Sam and Peter and
3 others and seeing the caribou on the east side of Bathurst,
4 seeing the caribou on the west side of Bathurst, I can only
5 agree with the concept of the cycle changes and the range
6 changes. And I've studied the maps that show the shift in
7 calving grounds, the Bathurst herd moving around.

8 I don't know why. I wish I could answer why the
9 caribou are spending so much time, like, what they're
10 calling the Ahiak herd and now the Beverly herd is spending
11 so much time not even migrating, maybe even staying the
12 whole winter last winter in Nunavut. But there's nobody
13 down there hunting them. There's nobody even seeing them.

14 I think Sam, two years ago when he was doing
15 refining muskox hunts on the east of Bathurst Inlet, ran
16 into thousands -- I don't think -- I know because talked to
17 Sam -- thousands and thousands of mainland caribou
18 wintering. And I think the satellite collar showed last
19 winter a lot of caribou wintering all winter in Nunavut on
20 the mainland.

21 So I don't know why they shifted. There's been
22 talk of mines and roads, and I don't claim to be an expert
23 on that, so I'm not going to draw any conclusions there. I
24 do know, on the North Slave Region, because I lived there
25 for a good part of my life, that there's been huge forest

1 fires. We heard reference to forest fires. And if you
2 look at maps that show the burns in the North Slave Region,
3 huge, huge, huge tracks of caribou range has been burned.

4 Well, caribou eat lichen and the mosses, and it
5 will be 40 years before those caribou return to that area.
6 Maybe that's why they've gone somewhere else for now. I
7 don't know. I'm just saying that's in the equation.

8 But we have also heard from really good Elders
9 who have talked about cycle changes, Elders that have said
10 there used to be no caribou, and they've come back. There
11 always is an idea, when man is involved, that we want to
12 control everything and put our finger on the problem, but I
13 would support the idea that this is a cycle, and if
14 different areas want to be set up for management reasons,
15 it's fine. But it's important to know, I think for this
16 Board and for the people here, that if we added up the
17 caribou still on the mainland, there's hundreds of
18 thousands of caribou. And they might not all be over by
19 Kugluktuk right now or around Bathurst Inlet, but I'm very
20 thankful that all caribou, you know, aren't dead. And even
21 in the area we're harvesting, we have seen no evidence to
22 suggest that our harvest is being detrimental to the
23 Bathurst herd, and actually helping it.

24 So I will conclude with that. Thank you for
25 your time.

1 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much, Boyd.

2 Okay. With that, I'll open it up to questions
3 to the Board Members. Any questions? If not -- Charlie.

4 NUNAVUT WILDLIFE MANAGEMENT BOARD QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

5 MR. INUARAK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

6 When you see caribou, how often are you in that
7 area? How many days or how many months or how many years?
8 Can you tell me?

9 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Charlie.

10 Boyd.

11 MR. WARNER: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

12 And thank for the question, Charlie.

13 I've been going to Bathurst Inlet since 1970.

14 We operate a lodge, an eco tourism lodge in Bathurst
15 Island, and I go there every summer. In addition, I'm a
16 pilot. I fly airplanes, and I spend a lot of time in the
17 area with my airplane, as well. So every year, mostly in
18 the summertime, I am in Bathurst Inlet.

19 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Boyd.

20 Charlie.

21 MR. INUARAK: Can you show us? Have you taken
22 any pictures, or have you written anything on the caribou
23 that you see? I just wonder if you have anything on paper
24 or photos.

25 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Charlie.

1 Boyd.

2 MR. WARNER: Thank you, Mr. Chair, and Charlie.

3 Yes, I don't have them at this presentation, but
4 I would be happy to send both to the Board, because I have
5 written and we have a lot of pictures. Even last year when
6 we were harvesting caribou with the Burnside HTO, we have a
7 lot of photos, so I'd be happy to send them to the Board,
8 if you would.

9 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Boyd.

10 Any other questions? If not, staff? Michael?
11 Government of Nunavut.

12 MR. GISSING: No questions.

13 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Drikus.
14 Government of Nunavut.

15 GOVERNMENT OF NORTHWEST TERRITORIES QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

16 MS. YONGE: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

17 Lynda Yonge, GNWT. I'm just curious about what
18 proportion of the meat that comes from that harvest
19 actually ends up in Yellowknife and how that's distributed.

20 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lynda.

21 Boyd.

22 MR. WARNER: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

23 And thank you, Lynda. It would be difficult to
24 answer that on a specific caribou level because the hunters
25 sometimes take meat home, so they take some of the meat.

1 Ironically, the meat that the hunters like to take home,
2 the back straps and the roasts, are usually the least
3 preferred from the Elders, so the ribs and the tongues and
4 those things get sent to Yellowknife because the others
5 don't take them.

6 If I had to put a number on it, I would say
7 probably 60 percent of the meat remains and that that would
8 first go, as Sam said -- he outlined kind of that priority
9 how it's split up: That the Inuit guides on site take what
10 they would like first, and they're often packaging -- I've
11 seen boxes of tongues where Sam sent out and certain lucky
12 people have their names on it. So they take food for their
13 families and send it to Yellowknife and other people. And
14 then whatever is left is left as what we call donated meat,
15 and then we disperse that donated meat in Yellowknife, and
16 it actually included several trips to the Dene and N'Dilo
17 last year as well, so I would say, to answer your question,
18 Lynda, about 60 percent of the harvest.

19 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Boyd.

20 Lynda.

21 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Jan Adamczewski with Government
22 of Northwest Territories. This is, I guess, maybe more of
23 a comment and a clarification, but Boyd may want to
24 comment.

25 So just to be clear, since 1996, the Bathurst

1 herd as defined by the caribou that calve on that calving
2 ground have been surveyed several times using the same
3 survey methodology, and the estimate in 1996, when we had
4 the first satellite collars on Bathurst caribou, was
5 350,000 caribou. That did not include any of the caribou
6 in the Queen Maud Gulf; they're on the other side of
7 Bathurst Inlet. It did not include the Bluenose East
8 caribou which calve to the west of Kugluktuk and are still
9 there. So that 350,000 was the Bathurst herd as we define
10 it, and it's the same population that is there now.

11 So I just want to be clear that that population
12 that calves west of Bathurst Inlet since the last 20 years
13 has had a massive decline, even since that time, from
14 350,000 down to about 20,000, and the survey methodology
15 has remained consistent over that time, and the collars
16 have told us it's the same group of caribou the last 20
17 years.

18 So just want everybody to be clear on this;
19 there is a very real and massive decline that has happened
20 in the Bathurst herd. Thank you.

21 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jan.

22 Boyd.

23 MR. WARNER: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

24 And thank you, Jan. I'm not disputing the
25 caribou herds fluctuate. I think I would disagree on a

1 point with you is that, even as the Nunavut Wildlife Act
2 recognizes that the east side of Bathurst Inlet was
3 actually recognized as Bathurst caribou calving grounds.
4 And I believe that all of this started when we put
5 satellite collars on caribou and we watched where they
6 went.

7 But there's still a lot of caribou. My point
8 I'm trying to make is not to dispute herds or numbers, but
9 trying to emphasize that there still is thousands, if not
10 hundreds of thousands, of caribou on the mainland.

11 Thank you.

12 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Boyd.

13 Jan.

14 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Jan Adamczewski with Government
15 of Northwest Territories.

16 I don't want to prolong this. You know, it's
17 late in the day. But I would also like to point out -- I
18 mean, every three years we have been doing population
19 surveys on the herds: Bathurst, Bluenose East, and then
20 three herds to the west. And all of those herds have shown
21 large declines since about 2000 or around that time. So
22 these are very real declines, and real management actions
23 have been taken because of it.

24 If you were to take the estimates for those five
25 herds from, say, around 2000, you would have a much larger

1 number of caribou than we have now. So the declines are
2 quite real, and they have happened in multiple herds, and I
3 think by this point with our collars and our surveys,
4 there's not that many -- there's not that much chance that
5 there's a big bunch of caribou that we've somehow missed
6 out there. I'll leave it at that.

7 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jan.

8 Boyd.

9 MR. WARNER: Okay. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

10 And thanks, Jan. And you showed a map of
11 circumpolar and decline. I'm not disputing caribou are
12 following that cycle, Jan.

13 I guess if I could ask you a direct question,
14 then: If you added the caribou that are being used from
15 Bathurst Inlet to Chantry Inlet, the Ahiak and the Beverly
16 caribou, how many thousands of caribou would that be?

17 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Boyd.

18 Jan.

19 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Jan Adamczewski with Government
20 of Northwest Territories.

21 If I could maybe ask Lisa to comment, because
22 they just completed a survey that calving ground in the
23 Queen Maud Gulf. I'm sure they won't have any precise
24 numbers. The last estimate that we have from a GN survey
25 from 2011, the estimate, I think, was a little over 200,000

1 for the caribou that calve in that area. And I don't know
2 if anyone from GN wants to add any further information on
3 that.

4 THE CHAIR: Lisa.

5 MS. LECLERC: Yeah. GN here, Lisa, regional
6 biologist.

7 So the Beverly, like Jan mentioned, was a little
8 bit over a hundred thousand caribou, and the Ahiak was only
9 surveyed once, and it was around 70,000. There were
10 reconnaissance survey now done last week. At this point,
11 it's too early to comment on the situation. Thank you.

12 THE CHAIR: Thank you.

13 GNWT, are you done?

14 MS. YONGE: No further questions. Thank you.

15 THE CHAIR: Thank you.

16 Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife Board, any questions
17 for Mr. Warner?

18 KITIKMEOT REGIONAL WILDLIFE BOARD QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

19 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: Thank you. Simon Qingnaqtuq,
20 Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife Board chair.

21 Thanks for your presentation, and thanks for
22 giving the information to the public. I trust in your
23 presentation that you mentioned that you go to Bathurst
24 yearly.

25 My question is: Both our governments,

1 government of NWT and Government of Nunavut, and the
2 biologist is saying that the caribou around that area is
3 declining. But you saying that you go to Bathurst Inlet
4 yearly, and I trust the numbers that you're saying on that
5 herd, on the caribou herd. It's healthy.

6 My question is: Have you ever written a letter
7 to either government, federal government or the wildlife
8 federation, saying that the caribou is healthy? If you
9 have written letters to either departments or any wildlife
10 organization, like, if you wrote the letters, have you ever
11 received any response?

12 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Simon.

13 Boyd.

14 MR. WARNER: I've got a long list of letters to
15 the GNWT. We had similar issues in the Northwest
16 Territories about sports hunts, but that's prior to 2010.

17 Since that time, my letters that I have written
18 have been public. They've been published in Nunatsiaq News
19 as well as News North. One was titled Divide and Confuse,
20 and it spoke to the issue which -- I'm not trying to imply
21 that this is intentional, but I'm saying that there's a lot
22 of people in the north, especially Elders in both the
23 Northwest Territories and Nunavut that identify only with
24 the Bathurst caribou herd.

25 Ever since I grew up, as a seven-year-old boy,

1 all the caribou on the mainland were Bathurst caribou, and
2 now for management reasons and we have satellite collars,
3 we're finding there's a difference. They want to call them
4 different herds. I think it's confusing people. When we
5 hear that there's only 20,000 Bathurst caribou left, it's
6 confusing people. And that's my opinion, and we've just
7 heard that there is more caribou in that range area, that
8 the Bathurst herd used to be the only herd in that range,
9 and that's what's causing a lot of the confusion.

10 Thank you. I hope I answered your questions.

11 THE CHAIR: Thank you Boyd.

12 Simon.

13 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

14 Simon Qingaqtuq from Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife
15 Board. Thanks for the answer, and I have no further
16 questions.

17 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Simon.

18 Kugluktuk HTO? Larry, Peter?

19 KUGLUKTUK HTO QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS.

20 MR. L. ADJUN: Quana, itsivautaaq. I believe a
21 couple of our directors have some questions. I myself am
22 tired, so I have none.

23 THE CHAIR: Peter.

24 MR. TAKTOGON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

25 Just one question. I know in your area I was

1 wondering if you guys have any tags for grizzly bears for
2 distribution for selling them or for sports hunts. If you
3 do, how many?

4 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Peter.

5 Boyd.

6 MR. WARNER: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

7 Thank you, Peter. Again, any of the tags that
8 we would get or do get are through the Burnside hunters and
9 trappers, and we get two tags for the Bathurst Inlet area,
10 we get no tags for the Contwoyto Lake area, and we -- or
11 Sam -- has been trying for years and years and years and
12 years to get more tags.

13 So we have not had -- so right now, to answer
14 your question, Peter, there's two tags for grizzly bear,
15 and they're usually hunted in the spring around Bathurst
16 Inlet.

17 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Boyd.

18 Peter.

19 MR. TAKTOGON: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

20 Thanks for your information. That's all I have.

21 THE CHAIR: Thank you. Kevin?

22 MR. KLENGENBERG: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

23 Your outfitting, is it still active on sport
24 hunting caribou in Contwoyto Lake area?

25 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Kevin.

1 Boyd.

2 MR. WARNER: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

3 And thank you, Kevin. Yes, it is. There's two
4 camps, one on Pellett Lake and then recently, as Sam
5 mentioned, it's moved on Contwoyto Lake so it is active as
6 of last year, last fall, and we certainly hope to be active
7 this year, yes.

8 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Boyd.

9 Kevin.

10 MR. KLENGENBERG: Yes, Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

11 How many tags are you getting?

12 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Kevin.

13 Boyd.

14 MR. WARNER: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

15 And thank you, Kevin. Seven -- the Burnside
16 hunters and trappers allocate 70 tags that we use with
17 them, and Umingmaktok issues 30 tags for a total of 100
18 tags.

19 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Boyd.

20 Kevin.

21 MR. KLENGENBERG: Thank you. That's all I got,
22 Mr. Chair.

23 THE CHAIR: Thank you.

24 No other questions from Kugluktuk? Jorgen.

25 MR. BOLT: Just more or less as a statement,

1 I guess.

2 Like, I been fortunate enough to have worked on
3 a project that was a place name project, and I got to talk
4 to a lot of Elders here, Bay Chimo, Kugluktuk; and lot of
5 them had lived on inland, and I had to verify these place
6 names, make sure they were put in the right place, and make
7 sure they were spelled right and so on and such.

8 Just to get to the point, I talked to a few
9 Elders, and they said for, like, long ago they'd see
10 thousands and thousands of caribou in the summertime, or
11 they're just circling and circling and circling due to
12 bugs, and you could see the dust cloud from miles and miles
13 away where the caribou are just circling, circling,
14 circling.

15 And then when they go away, when they finally
16 leave their area and then they go and check out what's
17 going on, they see hundreds of dead caribou that have
18 suffocated in the middle where this wheel of caribou that
19 is going around has created this dust cloud. And like I
20 said, I've been fortunate enough to talk to a lot of
21 Elders. That's where I got a lot of my knowledge from.
22 And so I just wanted to say that they've seen these animals
23 where they're in the thousands and ten thousand circling,
24 going around, going around, going around in the middle of
25 land. We always wonder why there's such a significant drop

1 in numbers. Have this -- I don't know, how would you say?
2 -- been considered or have been looked into it?

3 The Elders would say that, you know, there's
4 caribou scattered all over, and this is just one of the --
5 probably one of the contributing factors, too, within their
6 own self that the bugs have a significant impact on the
7 herd when there's thousands like that. But just to say
8 that they used to watch these caribou go around and around
9 and around and around, just trying to get away from the
10 bugs, trying to create -- I don't know if they've got,
11 like, a bug repellant for them or what, but eventually when
12 they leave, the middle of the wheel was hundreds and
13 hundreds of dead caribou. So I just wanted to kind of
14 bring that up with my knowledge there.

15 And I've talked to a lot of Elders like the
16 people back in the public there. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

17 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jorgen.

18 Larry.

19 MR. L. ADJUN: Yeah, just a closing remark just
20 to give whoever wasn't here or didn't hear my statement
21 yesterday, Kugluktuk, like I stated, has been proactive,
22 and we have stopped sport hunts and commercial caribou
23 harvest or commercial community caribou harvests in the
24 past since 2009. And I just want to make that clear for
25 everyone that's sitting in these panels or the agencies.

1 Quana.

2 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry.

3 Okay. If there's nothing else from Kugluktuk,
4 we'll move on then to Bathurst HTO. Sam, any comments or
5 questions?

6 MR. S. KAPOLAK: No questions.

7 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Sam.

8 Bay Chimo HTO, Peter?

9 MR. P. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

10 No questions.

11 THE CHAIR: Thank you.

12 Cambridge Bay HTO, Bobby.

13 CAMBRIDGE BAY HTO QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

14 MR. GREENLEY: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

15 One of my questions was answered already, which
16 is good.

17 Another question. You stated that you harvest
18 wolves up to ten during your sports hunts. Is that
19 correct? And just to put numbers out there, say I don't
20 know if you've watched a certain pack, even just a small
21 pair, a male and female -- I'm thinking they would
22 harvest -- catch a caribou once a week just to survive, and
23 so just a question if you watched any small packs hunt
24 caribou yourself. Thank you.

25 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Bobby.

1 Boyd.

2 MR. WARNER: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

3 Thank you, Bobby. To speak to the number of
4 wolves we harvest, yeah, it's usually a minimum of 10 up to
5 15. And that includes -- we do it two different times of
6 the year -- that help the Bathurst herd. One is right when
7 the sports hunts are going on, and then we also go north
8 from Yellowknife in the winter with sports hunters up the
9 ice roads. And as was brought up by the GNWT, they're
10 trying to target wolves that are impacting the Bathurst
11 herd. So we take our hunters up, and yeah, we're hunting
12 wolves that are directly impacting the Bathurst herd at
13 that time. So our estimates are 10 to 15 animals a year.

14 To speak to your question of I've seen wolves
15 chase caribou, but I haven't followed them enough to, you
16 know, give an answer, I don't think, to that question. But
17 from the reading I've done, I believe it's estimated that
18 each wolf needs 15 to 20 caribou a year per wolf, so that's
19 where we kind of get the math.

20 In my presentation, I estimate 15 to 25 wolves a
21 year. You know, over six years, 25 caribou, it would
22 amount to 2,250 caribou or so that, you know, would have
23 been alive if we wouldn't have harvested wolves. So that's
24 where I'm getting those numbers from. Thank you.

25 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Boyd.

1 Bobby.

2 MR. GREENLEY: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

3 Thank you, Boyd. You stated also that you are a
4 pilot. Have you ever made a proposal to the government or
5 anybody, like, to even maybe track, get some collars or
6 whatever you can do to follow a pack of wolves just to see
7 while you're up there in the summertime, and maybe you'll
8 have a better idea of how many they actually take or how
9 they move also? Thank you.

10 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Bobby.

11 Boyd.

12 MR. WARNER: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

13 And thank you, Bobby. No, I haven't considered
14 that idea with them. We do follow, because we owned a
15 lodge in Bathurst Inlet, and both my father -- many people
16 would know, in the room -- the Elders especially -- Glen
17 Warner was a pilot, and we had two airplanes there. And we
18 often saw wolf dens and wolf sightings, and we certainly
19 know -- I know a story to back up, I guess, what was said
20 before, about wolves hunting caribou.

21 This is a story of my father when he was flying
22 a Super Cub, and he had a guest with him, and they
23 witnessed wolves killing caribou calves on the calving
24 grounds. And it wasn't just catching a caribou and eating
25 it; it was killing a caribou calf and then chasing the next

1 calf, and I don't know if it was the excitement for the
2 wolves, or whatever. They were in a big herd of caribou
3 crossing airplanes in a migration, and he witnessed -- he
4 came back that night and told us about how many wolves that
5 they had seen. I didn't see that myself, though, but
6 that's a story from my father.

7 Thank you.

8 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Boyd.

9 Bobby.

10 MR. GREENLEY: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

11 Thank you, Boyd. No further questions.

12 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Cambridge Bay.

13 Is there any questions from Elder representation
14 or Elders that are in the room to Mr. Warner?

15 If not, NTI.

16 NUNAVUT TUNNGAVIK INCORPORATED QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

17 MR. IRNGAUT: Thanks, Mr. Chair.

18 And thanks, Boyd, for your presentation. Paul
19 Irngaut from NTI.

20 My question is, you mentioned you harvest, it's
21 along the line with this questioning. You mention you
22 harvest wolves. What's the largest wolf pack that you've
23 ever come across, or have you?

24 Thank you. That's my first question.

25 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Paul.

1 Boyd.

2 MR. WARNER: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

3 And thank you for the question. The largest one
4 personally I've ever seen while in the air with my plane
5 would be 18 wolves. The biggest story I ever heard of a
6 wolf pack was from Bobby Qingnaqtuq, who's now passed away,
7 in Bathurst Inlet. And he told a story of hunting caribou,
8 and he saw a big herd of caribou go over a hill, and he was
9 using a little Elan -- and many of us remember the Elan and
10 bogie wheels -- and he went over the hill to catch a
11 caribou, and it turned out that it was 30 wolves. And he
12 said he broke every bogie wheel on his Ski-Doo trying to
13 get home.

14 So, personally, 18 for me. Thank you.

15 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Boyd.

16 Paul.

17 MR. IRNGAUT: Thank you, Boyd, for that answer.

18 My last question is -- we're talking about
19 predators here: Are you seeing more grizzly bears in
20 Bathurst? Thank you.

21 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Paul.

22 Boyd.

23 MR. WARNER: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

24 Thank you, Paul. Absolutely. Connie testified
25 to that, Sam testified to that.

1 The lodge has been in operation since 1969, and
2 we keep an observation book, and it records animal
3 sightings, bird sighting, and in the early years, we would
4 see maybe two, three bears a year. As Connie testified
5 now, if you come to Bathurst Inlet in the summertime and go
6 out in the evening, you're going to see, I don't know,
7 three, five, seven bears every night. And others have
8 testified about boat trips to Bathurst Inlet.

9 So yes, the bears have -- and Sam even again
10 mentioned, it's not just a few bears. The bears are having
11 three cubs each, which is also, I think, a sign that the
12 population is exploding because there's a lot of grizzlies.

13 Thank you.

14 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Boyd.

15 Paul, NTI? Okay. Thank you.

16 KIA, any questions for Boyd?

17 KITIKMEOT INUIT ASSOCIATION QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

18 MR. DONIHEE: John Donihee, Mr. Chairman.

19 I just have one question of clarification,
20 Mr. Warner yesterday -- and you said it again today -- that
21 the Nunavut Wildlife Act defines the Bathurst calving
22 ground, and I'm a little mystified by that.

23 After you said it yesterday, I went and had a
24 look at the Act, and it's not defined. I'm just wondering
25 whether you're making reference to Critical Areas

1 Regulations that might have been adopted when the Act was
2 transferred over from the Northwest Territories.

3 Anyhow, I wonder if you could just explain what
4 you're referring to when you say that the calving ground is
5 defined by the Act.

6 THE CHAIR: Thank you, John.

7 Boyd.

8 MR. WARNER: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

9 And thank you, John. I'll definitely try and
10 send it to you. What I did was I went online and looked up
11 the Nunavut Wildlife Act. I believe it was off the Nunavut
12 website, and to my knowledge, that's what I was reading,
13 because it all pointed out the Latin long. And it wasn't
14 just the Bathurst herd. It had a number of calving
15 grounds, and I was reading from that.

16 Thank you.

17 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Boyd.

18 John? No? KIA is done?

19 Okay. The North Slave Métis Alliance. Shin,
20 any questions?

21 MR. SHIGA: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

22 Thank you, Boyd, for the presentation. I have
23 no questions.

24 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thank you very much.

25 Is there any questions from the public to

1 Mr. Warner? If not, we'll carry on.

2 Thank you very much. Boyd.

3 Next Wek'èezhìi Renewable Resources Board. Go
4 ahead.

5 WEK'ÈEZHÌI RENEWABLE RESOURCES BOARD SUBMISSION

6 MS. PELLISSEY: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

7 So we're at a distinct disadvantage. Everyone
8 is tired, we're the end of the day, so I hope you'll bear
9 with us. We'll keep it short and sweet.

10 The WRRB wanted to come and present information
11 to you today because we've just recently gone through a
12 similar proposal in the NWT. So with that, I'll turn it
13 over to our board member Jonas Lafferty.

14 MR. LAFFERTY: Thank you, good evening, and my
15 name is Jonas Lafferty, and I'm from the community of
16 Behchokò in the Northwest Territories. I am a board member
17 with the Wek'èezhìi Renewable Resources Board.

18 As you heard her earlier that I have here with
19 me the board's executive director, Pellissey.

20 We would like to thank the community of
21 Cambridge Bay for hosting this public hearing and the
22 Nunavut Wildlife Management Board for granting the WRRB
23 witness status to present information related to its recent
24 Bathurst caribou herd proceeding. Next slide.

25 The WRRB is a co-management BOARD established by

1 the Tlicho agreement in 2005. The board is an institution
2 of the public government, which means that that the board
3 considers the interests of all users in making its
4 decision. Next slide.

5 The WRRB has a jurisdiction, Wek'èezhìi
6 Management Area. The yellow line shows the Wek'èezhìi
7 boundary. The green line is the moshi wa denike (phonetic)
8 which means the traditional area of the Tlicho described by
9 Chief Moshi Duin (phonetic) signing of Treaty 11 in 1921.
10 The red line shows the Tlicho land. The WRRB is
11 responsible for wildlife, plant, and forest management in
12 Wek'èezhìi. Next slide.

13 The WRRB's purpose is to work with the
14 communities and government to manage wildlife and its
15 habitat in the Wek'èezhìi to benefit people today and the
16 future generations. Next slide.

17 The WRRB follows the principle and practice of
18 conservation in fulfilling its duties. The board considers
19 the relations between the wildlife, the land, and the
20 people, and uses the best information available to inform
21 its decision-making. Next slide.

22 The WRRB is then able to make balanced decisions
23 supporting the Tlicho philosophy of "Strong like two
24 people."

25 The Board shares responsibility of managing and

1 monitoring the Bathurst caribou herd. The following
2 information will provide the Nunavut Wildlife Management
3 Board with additional information about involvement of the
4 WRRB in the management of the Bathurst caribou herd in the
5 Northwest Territories and Nunavut.

6 And with that, I'll turn it over to Jody.

7 MS. PELLISSEY: Thank you, Jonas. Jody Pellissey,
8 WRRB.

9 So the board, WRRB, has been invested in
10 managing the Bathurst caribou herd since its inception in
11 2006. The Board has conducted three proceedings to address
12 Bathurst caribou harvest limitations in 2007, 2010, and
13 most recently in 2016 for a herd that has continued to
14 decline since 2003.

15 In December 2015, the Tlicho government and the
16 Government of the Northwest Territories Department of
17 Environment and Natural Resources submitted the joint
18 proposal on caribou management actions for the Bathurst
19 herd, and that proposal is for 2016 to 2019. That proposal
20 included new restrictions on hunter harvest, predator
21 management to reduce wolf populations on the winter range
22 of the Bathurst caribou herd, as well ongoing biological
23 and environmental monitoring. More specifically, Tlicho
24 government and the GNWT propose the closure of all
25 harvesting of the Bathurst caribou herd, including

1 aboriginal harvest.

2 The Board considers any specific restriction of
3 harvest or component of harvest by way of a quota as the
4 establishment of a total allowable harvest. Because of
5 that, the Tlicho agreement sets out that the Board must
6 hold a public hearing when considering a total allowable
7 harvest. The Board held its public hearing in Yellowknife
8 on February 23rd and 24th in 2016.

9 Following extensive deliberations, allowing for
10 consideration of all the information on the record and to
11 meet legislated timelines, the board decided to prepare two
12 separate reports to respond to the proposed management
13 actions.

14 The board's reasons for Decision Report Part A
15 was submitted to the Tlicho government and GNWT on May 26,
16 2016. It primarily deals with the Government's request for
17 a total allowable harvest, as well as some wolf management
18 actions. This report was provided to the Nunavut Wildlife
19 Management Board as supporting documentation to the board's
20 written submission on May 27th. That report is found in
21 your hearing binders. If you try to read it, it's missing
22 a whole bunch of letters --

23 THE CHAIR: Jody --

24 MS. PELLISSEY: Because the Tlicho font's -- I'm
25 going fast, I'm sorry.

1 THE CHAIR: Yes, you are slow down.

2 MS. PELLISSEY: The translators do have the
3 speaking notes, so that's why I'm rushing. I apologize.
4 I'll slow down.

5 The board's reasons for decision report is in
6 your binders. I do hope the digital copies that the Board
7 Members have aren't missing the Tlicho fonts because if you
8 try to read to read the report in your binder it won't make
9 very much sense.

10 The board's Part B report will deal with
11 additional predator management actions, biological and
12 environmental monitoring, and cumulative effects, and will
13 be submitted at the end of August.

14 Per section 12.5.5, of the Tlicho agreement --
15 next slide, please -- the board has sole responsibility for
16 making a final determination with respect to a total
17 allowable harvest for a population of wildlife in
18 Wek'èezhìi.

19 The board determined that a total allowable
20 harvest of zero shall be implemented for all users of the
21 Bathurst caribou herd within Wek'èezhìi for 2016 to 2019.
22 The Board believes that the Bathurst caribou herd is in a
23 crisis, given the continuing decline in the breeding
24 females, poor vital rates, including low pregnancy and low
25 cow survival, impacts of environmental factors such as poor

1 summer feeding conditions and high number of bugs and
2 flies, and extensive exploration and development on the
3 herd's annual range.

4 The board recognizes the hardships that Tlicho
5 and other aboriginal harvesters will endure: Loss of
6 connection to the caribou and the land; however, they felt
7 that a total allowable harvest of zero must be implemented
8 without delay.

9 The board also recommended that the Tlicho
10 government and the Government of Northwest Territories
11 agree on an approach to the harvest zoning in the NWT and
12 conduct aerial and ground-based surveillance throughout the
13 fall and harvest seasons. They also recommended timely
14 implementation of hunter education programs in the Tlicho
15 communities. Next slide.

16 The board also provided recommendations to the
17 two governments regarding wolf management actions. The
18 board supports the community-based wolf harvesting project,
19 a pilot training program, which will train Tlicho
20 harvesters in a culturally appropriate manner to hunt and
21 trap wolves on the Bathurst herd range.

22 As well, the board recommended a collaborative
23 wolf feasibility assessment led by the board with input and
24 support from Tlicho government and the GNWT be conducted to
25 examine all options for wolf management, including costs,

1 practicality and effectiveness. Next slide.

2 The board has also participated in long-term
3 management planning processes with the Tlicho government
4 and the GNWT, as well as with other management authorities
5 and traditional users of the herd, and that includes
6 organizations from Nunavut. Most notably, in recent times,
7 the Bathurst Caribou Long-Term Planning Working Group and
8 the Bathurst Caribou Range Planning Work Group.

9 The board would like to see a management plan
10 and range plan developed and implemented before the herd
11 declines any further. There is a real possibility of
12 extirpation, so loss of the herd, and not having a
13 management plan or range plan in place is a real concern.
14 Next slide.

15 The board's involvement in management processes
16 in Nunavut has been quite limited; however, the board has
17 submitted comments through review processes with the
18 Nunavut Planning Commission and the Nunavut Impact Review
19 Board for the Bathurst caribou herd.

20 While the board believes that all parts of
21 barren ground caribou annual range warrants some level of
22 protection, including water crossings and the wintering
23 grounds, the WRRB believes the calving and post-calving
24 grounds should receive the highest level of protection. In
25 the board's view, these areas should have no exploration or

1 development on them at any time as they are of utmost
2 importance to the health and sustainability of a herd.
3 Next slide.

4 With the Bathurst herd in such a perilous state,
5 the WRRB believes that all peoples who harvest the herd
6 must do their part to ensure the herd's recovery. Users
7 and managers must act now in whatever way is possible to
8 protect the herd so future recovery may be possible. With
9 harvest of the Bathurst caribou herd closed in the
10 Northwest Territories, the WRRB encourages the Nunavut
11 Wildlife Management Board to take a similar approach to the
12 protection of Bathurst caribou in Nunavut. Next slide.

13 So that's it. On behalf of the WRRB, Jonas and
14 I would like to say thank you for listening. Are there any
15 questions? Thank you.

16 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much, Jody and
17 Jonas, for your presentation.

18 Is there any questions from the Board in regards
19 to their presentation? If not, staff legal? No?

20 Government of Nunavut.

21 MR. GISSING: Nothing, Mr. Chair.

22 THE CHAIR: GNWT?

23 MS. YONGE: No questions.

24 THE CHAIR: Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife Board?

25 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: No questions.

1 THE CHAIR: Kugluktuk HTO?

2 KUGLUKTUK HTO QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS.

3 MR. L. ADJUN: Yes, we have a few. About two
4 weeks ago we received a letter from Fred Van Der Wielen --
5 I hope I'm saying that right -- from Tlicho government
6 requesting a four-week study on Contwoyto Lake regarding
7 the Bathurst caribou. Lately, the Kugluktuk HTO, as stated
8 yesterday and today, we are right in the middle of a
9 political ring, as it were. So we are pressured and, like
10 I said, we're trying to be politically proactive, but there
11 comes a time when, like the time of the evening right now,
12 it gets a little overwhelming. As I've stated, we are
13 shorthanded with our turnover.

14 And I believe that might be it for me for now.
15 But I believe our younger director is finally going to
16 voice his opinion.

17 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry. Go ahead.

18 MR. G. ADJUN: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Gustin
19 Adjun from the Kugluktuk HTO.

20 Since the NWT people have a strong belief with
21 the wolves, would you be able to send, like, a group of
22 Inuit people to harvest the wolves in the communities?
23 That's it.

24 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Gustin.

25 Jody.

1 MS. PELLISSEY: Thank you for the question. My
2 understanding at this time is, as the work has just begun
3 with the feasibility assessment, that the Tlicho government
4 would consider having other aboriginal groups possibly in
5 the future come in to harvest wolves in Wek'èezhìi;
6 however, I definitely don't speak on behalf of the Tlicho
7 government, so that's as far as I can say is that it's
8 something they're willing to think about.

9 THE CHAIR: Thank you Jody.
10 Jorgen?

11 MR. BOLT: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
12 Just kind of add to that, I guess. I've hunted
13 around Great Bear Lake area, too, quite a bit, quite
14 extensively. I've been up through there. There's lots of
15 wolves up there. McLaren Lake, County Lake (phonetic), all
16 those areas, I know that area pretty good, Gamèti, Hottah
17 Lake. I've been up through there.

18 So I know that you guys have a strong tie with
19 the wolves. I believe I understand where you guys are
20 coming from. And like I said, I've worked in these mines,
21 and I got to meet a lot of guys from all over the NWT.
22 Métis, Whati, all these places. I got to work with all
23 these difference aboriginal people, and they always talk
24 about, you know, we got so many wolves at home they're
25 going to deplete the wolves. Can somebody come in from

1 Kugluktuk to do some hunting or come down to Great Bear?

2 You know, they've asked me to ask that a few
3 times: Can anybody come down, or, you know, do some wolf
4 hunting down there? Like, we come down, we try and do the
5 best we can, and it's really -- it's not like chasing
6 wolves out in the open land out here.

7 In the tree line it's really tough to chase
8 wolves down and, say, there you got two or three feet of
9 snow. I've been stuck in trees and, you know, chasing
10 wolves and stuff like that in the trees. And it is tough.
11 I mean, it is really rocky, it's really rough, not like out
12 in the open.

13 I told them; Inuit, as long as you get lots of
14 snowmobiles, they want to come down and some do wolf
15 hunting for you. But other than that, you know, we'd like
16 to try and help, but it is really tough. Especially I know
17 that Great Bear Lake area. I've been there, and it is
18 rugged, rugged country and trees and, you know. I've
19 definitely been lucky a few times, I managed to get the
20 wolves out onto the lake, just haze them out onto the lake
21 and managed to get a few, but I don't think I put a dent
22 on, I don't think I put a dent on the population of the
23 wolf.

24 So just kind of wanted to add to that. Thank
25 you, Mr. Chair.

1 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jorgen. Anything else
2 from Kugluktuk?

3 MR. L. ADJUN: Yeah, just to give a little more
4 further statement for Jorgen -- I'm tired -- his statement.
5 It costs Kugluktumiut a lot of money to get down to the
6 tree line area. Like you stated earlier, it costs little
7 under or add about 500 bucks for us to get into the tree
8 line, Fatismo Lake (phonetic) and up into the mountains of
9 Great Bear Lake. So it does cost us a lot of money for the
10 hunters, but yes, we do hunt down in that area. And as
11 Kevin said, it's part of our -- I'm tired -- our own
12 pockets.

13 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thank you, Larry. More of
14 a comment. Okay. Kugluktuk's done.
15 We'll move on, then. Bathurst Inlet HTO, any
16 questions?

17 MR. S. KAPOLAK: No questions.

18 THE CHAIR: Bay Chimo HTO. Any questions,
19 Peter?

20 MR. P. KAPOLAK: No questions.

21 THE CHAIR: Cambridge Bay, HTO. Bobby?

22 MR. GREENLEY: Thank you, Mr. Chair. No
23 questions.

24 THE CHAIR: Is there any questions from Elder
25 representation or Elders in the room?

1 If not, NTI, any questions for you?

2 MR. IRNGAUT: Thank you, Mr. Chair. No
3 questions.

4 THE CHAIR: KIA any questions?

5 KITIKMEOT INUIT ASSOCIATION QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

6 MR. CLARK: I have a few questions.

7 So the WRRB has made a statement about the
8 critical nature of the calving grounds in Nunavut and that
9 it should be absolutely protected. What public statements
10 has the WRRB made about all of the development in the
11 Northwest Territories that occur in the Bathurst winter
12 range and core migration corridors in the Northwest
13 Territories? Thank you.

14 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Geoff.

15 Jody.

16 MS. PELLISSEY: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

17 Thank you for the question. At this time, the
18 board has made statements in its reasons for decision
19 report, and more information related to those specific
20 topics will be made in Part B of its report where it talks
21 about cumulative effects, particularly human disturbance.
22 The board, as I stated in the presentation, is concerned
23 about the whole annual range, about the winter range, water
24 crossings, as well as the calving and post-calving grounds.
25 Thank you.

1 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jody.

2 MR. CLARK: I guess, more specifically I'll
3 ask: Does the board oppose development the same way that
4 it does in the calving grounds as equally in the winter
5 range and the core migration corridors in the Northwest
6 Territories?

7 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Geoff.
8 Jody.

9 MS. PELLISSEY: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
10 At this time, the board has made no formal
11 statements to support that, no.

12 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jody.
13 Geoff.

14 MR. CLARK: What public statements did the
15 board make about the Jay Project proposal in regards to its
16 support or opposition?

17 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Geoff.
18 Jody.

19 MS. PELLISSEY: Thank you, Mr. Chair.
20 The board did not make any statements about the
21 Jay Project hearing. They were not a part of that
22 proceeding.

23 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jody.
24 Geoff.

25 MR. CLARK: So I guess just a final comment.

1 We hear this often, either through the press or,
2 you know, reports back to our region that, in the Northwest
3 Territories, there's vast support for what they consider to
4 be critical habitat outside of the Northwest Territories,
5 but inside their own territory they either have no comment
6 or they don't comment, and I think that's important for the
7 Board to know, for those who aren't familiar with the
8 Kitikmeot Region, that this commonly happens, and it's an
9 obvious inconsistency, in the view of the Kitikmeot Inuit
10 Association.

11 Thank you.

12 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Geoff.

13 Jody.

14 MS. PELLISSEY: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

15 Just to clarify, the board has made the
16 statements through two processes here in Nunavut. I did
17 state that there will be a report coming out. At this
18 time, the board has not made support or nonsupport of any
19 development in the NWT or any further development in the
20 NWT. There will be expectations of statements made in that
21 Part B report.

22 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jody.

23 MR. CLARK: Thank you very much. I have no
24 more questions.

25 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Geoff.

1 Okay. The North Slave Métis Alliance, Shin.

2 MR. SHIGA: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

3 Shin Shiga, North Slave Métis Alliance. I have
4 no questions.

5 THE CHAIR: Thank you.

6 Ventures Northwest Limited, Boyd.

7 MR. WARNER: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

8 And thank you, Jody. No questions.

9 THE CHAIR: Thank you.

10 Is there any questions from the public at all to
11 Jody? Don't think so.

12 Okay. At this point in time there's an
13 opportunity for anybody in the public to make a
14 presentation to the Nunavut Wildlife Management Board in
15 regards to the Bathurst caribou herd that we're talking
16 about today. If there's anybody in the public that would
17 like to make a statement or a comment, feel free to do so
18 now. If not, we will move on.

19 For everyone's information, we would like to
20 advise you that we also received two written submissions
21 from parties that aren't here, and I'll just give an
22 outline of what they are, and one was from the Yellowknife
23 Dene First Nation, and they support the GNWT representation
24 of no harvest; and also from the Tlicho Government of the
25 Northwest Territories, they also have the same support of

1 no harvest. And those letters are sent to us for our Board
2 to consider.

3 Okay. We're getting close. That formally ends
4 the public hearing process of our hearing on the Bathurst
5 caribou herd today. Before we have final remarks, Michael
6 is going to take a few minutes just to summarize the
7 process.

8 Michael, go ahead.

9 NUNAVUT WILDLIFE MANAGEMENT BOARD LEGAL COUNSEL SUMMARY

10 MR. D'EÇA: Qujannamiik, itsivautaaq.

11 I'm taking an easier route than actually
12 summarizing the process. What I've done during the last
13 couple of days is tried to record where I thought the
14 parties generally agreed on points and where they had
15 disagreements, and the Board does regularly try to do this
16 in its hearings. It helps it in preparing to make the
17 decision to see where there might be consensus and where
18 people are farther apart.

19 So I'll walk you through those, and Mr. Chair,
20 if there is time and if people are interested, hopefully
21 there will be opportunity for the parties, if they disagree
22 with any of these points, to let us know. And I've been
23 doing this as I went through it, so I haven't run through
24 it with my Board Members either.

25 So I'll start with the shorter list, which is

1 actually the points of disagreement. So there appears to
2 be disagreement as to whether the consultations carried out
3 by the Government of Nunavut concerning the proposed future
4 management of the Bathurst caribou herd were adequate.

5 There's disagreement whether mining operations
6 have a detrimental effect on caribou migration routes.

7 Third, there's disagreement as to whether a
8 predator control program would be beneficial for the
9 recovery of the Bathurst caribou herd.

10 Fourth, disagreement as to whether switching
11 between herds is a relevant factor in accounting for
12 caribou population declines.

13 And, fifth, there's disagreement, if a level of
14 total allowable harvest is established, as to what the
15 number of that total allowable harvest should be.

16 The points of agreement are more numerous, but
17 there's not too, too many of them. The first one is that
18 the Bathurst caribou herd is in the midst of a severe
19 population decline.

20 Secondly, that this decline is part of a natural
21 cycle in which caribou numbers traditionally rise, reach a
22 peak, decline, and eventually recover.

23 Third, conservation management measures are
24 required to help contribute to the recovery of this herd.

25 Fourth -- and this came from one of the Elders

1 right I think in the first morning, as I understand what he
2 said -- it is essential that Inuit, other aboriginal
3 people, governments, and wildlife management boards find
4 ways to work together for the recovery of this herd.

5 The fifth point is that the collaborative
6 development of an effective management plan would be a
7 positive step forward.

8 Sixth, the number of Nunavut residents
9 harvesting this herd is relatively low.

10 Seventh, should a total allowable harvest be
11 established, it will be a challenge to fairly enforce that
12 total allowable harvest in locations where the Bathurst
13 herd intermingles with one or more other herds.

14 And the final point of agreement that I think I
15 have captured is this: Taking into account the respective
16 numbers of the Baffin Island caribou population and the
17 Bathurst caribou population, a level of total allowable
18 harvest of 250 caribou for Baffin Island and a proposed
19 level of total allowable harvest of 30 caribou for the
20 Bathurst herd are out of balance with one another.

21 So, Mr. Chair, that's the two sets of points of
22 agreement and disagreement, and I leave it with you and
23 with the parties if there's any comments or concerns or
24 questions. Taima.

25 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Michael.

1 I suppose I would just open the floor up to any
2 parties that have a comment on what Michael has outlined.
3 Is there anybody that would like to comment? Boyd.

4 MR. WARNER: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

5 And thank you, Michael. Perhaps I heard wrong,
6 but on the disagreement side, you said that we disagreed on
7 the need for predator control being beneficial. Is that
8 correct?

9 THE CHAIR: Michael.

10 MR. D'EÇA: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

11 Yeah, that's what I understood, that there was
12 not a consensus around this table that the predator control
13 program would be beneficial. One or more parties, if I
14 understood it correctly, were saying that, essentially, in
15 my own words, it would be nice if it were beneficial, but
16 it's much more complicated than that, and, in fact, the
17 costs would not produce the benefit that would be intended.
18 Taima.

19 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Michael.

20 MR. WARNER: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

21 And thank you, Michael. I guess I would
22 disagree with that assessment, Michael, to me, I heard
23 everybody at the table, even the GN, speak that they might
24 not be able to do anything about predator control, but that
25 it should be looked at, and quickly, either by increasing

1 tags or harvest of wolves and grizzly bears. I don't know
2 if we'd want to take a vote around the board, but I clearly
3 heard from this meeting that predator harvest control is
4 very important and that there was consensus on that.

5 THE CHAIR: Michael.

6 MR. D'EÇA: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

7 Generally, I'm not so happy if I'm wrong about
8 something, but anything on that points of disagreement list
9 I've got wrong, I'm very pleased to change that, for sure.
10 So maybe we should check. Does anybody think that --

11 THE CHAIR: GNWT, Mathieu.

12 MR. D'EÇA: -- points of disagreement?

13 MR. DUMOND: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

14 I'm just a little bit worried that the
15 interpretation on the agreement and disagreement of those
16 two days by one person, and the summary of it is a little
17 bit dangerous at this time. I mean, we all express -- I
18 don't think there was black and white during the meeting.
19 It was a lot of gray for people that exchanged ideas and
20 exchange views. And to put it as a black-and-white list
21 summarized by one person for the Board's benefit, I'm not
22 sure that's going to help really the process here. And we
23 may go back into arguing over every point like we did for
24 the last two days.

25 So I just would be careful, a little bit, with

1 this.

2 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Mathieu.

3 Michael.

4 MR. D'EÇA: Qujannamiik, itsivautaaq.

5 Yeah, I guess all I can say is generally the
6 NWMB has followed this process, and it's worked out quite
7 well. You know, I'll leave it at that. Again, it's just
8 something I'm doing for the Board, but if it's unacceptable
9 or controversial or just not working, well, then, that's
10 fine. Taima.

11 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thank you.

12 NWT government. Go ahead.

13 MR. ADAMCZEWSKI: Thank you. Jan Adamczewski with
14 Government of Northwest Territories.

15 I don't know whether I can say that everybody
16 will agree on this, but on the issue that you raised,
17 Michael, about the size of the herd and the size of the
18 harvest, we would certainly argue, from our standpoint in
19 Northwest Territories, that the extent of the decline from
20 highest numbers also needs to be considered, and not just
21 the current herd size. And beyond that, that population
22 trend is probably almost as important as population size,
23 in terms of what scale of harvest might be appropriate.

24 And both of those, certainly within the
25 Northwest Territories and as you heard from the Wek'èezhii

1 board, the other aboriginal groups, it's the summation of
2 where the herd is now, the extent of that decline and the
3 fact that the recent decline is still quite rapid. So I
4 would suggest that looking at the harvest should also
5 include those factors and not just the population size
6 itself. Thank you.

7 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jan. Noted.

8 Okay. Moving on, Michael, I think you want to
9 talk about the transcripts from the hearing?

10 MR. D'EÇA: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

11 I was speaking with John Donihee, counsel for
12 KIA, yesterday, and John suggested that the NWMB might want
13 to propose to the parties that we file the transcript of
14 this hearing as a hearing document in tomorrow's two-day
15 Bluenose East caribou hearing, and the reason why is that
16 there is considerable overlap in submissions and,
17 undoubtedly, in resulting questions and answers between the
18 two hearings. Not complete overlap, but a number of points
19 raised would be the same or almost the same. And by
20 placing this transcript on the record for the Bluenose East
21 caribou hearing, parties won't need to repeat what they've
22 already said during this hearing -- unless, of course, you
23 want to. So it's not in any way saying, don't raise it or
24 don't provide your submission again, even if it's the same,
25 but you wouldn't have to because it's on the record there.

1 And it would allow the parties to concentrate
2 only on providing additional or supplementary submissions,
3 questions, and answers specific to the Bluenose East
4 caribou. So the expectation is that that could save
5 significant time in conducting the Bluenose East caribou
6 hearing but with no loss of the points raised, the
7 submissions made, the questions and answers going back and
8 forth.

9 So, again, the Board is wondering how the
10 parties feel about that. Would you have any objection to
11 that? We don't see a downside in that you're still
12 completely free to repeat everything you said here, if you
13 wish, but you have that other option of knowing, I've
14 already said that; I'm just going to concentrate on these
15 particular points. Taima.

16 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Michael. Thank you,
17 Michael, for that suggestion.

18 I think, with that, we can leave that with the
19 hearing parties tonight, and you can think about if that's
20 how you prefer to move forward on this, and we'll revisit
21 this in the morning when we start our new hearing and see
22 how people feel about that.

23 Lynda.

24 MS. YONGE: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

25 Lynda Yonge, GNWT. I'm just wondering if the

1 parties are identical for the two hearings.

2 THE CHAIR: Yes.

3 MS. YONGE: Thank you.

4 THE CHAIR: Everything is the same, except

5 Mr. Warner will not be here. Thank you.

6 So we'll leave that suggestion with you.

7 John, go ahead -- oh, Boyd.

8 MR. WARNER: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

9 And just for the record, I have no objection to
10 that for tomorrow.

11 THE CHAIR: Thank you.

12 Larry.

13 MR. L. ADJUN: With this information still fresh
14 in our minds, before we sign off for tonight, would it be
15 safe to say that we either all agree tonight now while it's
16 still fresh in our memory? I'm getting tired. Would we
17 put it to a consensus vote or show of hands to have the
18 information that we did today not be repetitive again
19 tomorrow? Quana.

20 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry. Yes, we can do
21 that. So what I can do is go around the table by
22 jurisdiction or interveners and ask for your support of
23 this. Is that okay with everybody?

24 Okay. I'm going to start off with Government of
25 Nunavut. Do you support this suggestion by Michael?

1 MR. GISSING: Drikus Gissing from the Department
2 of Environment. Yes, we do.

3 THE CHAIR: Government of Northwest
4 Territories.

5 MS. YONGE: Lynda Yonge, GNWT. Yes, we're
6 good with it.

7 THE CHAIR: Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife Board.

8 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: Yes, we agree.

9 THE CHAIR: Kugluktuk HTO?

10 MR. L. ADJUN: Yes, we do.

11 THE CHAIR: Bathurst Inlet HTO?

12 MR. S. KAPOLAK: We support.

13 THE CHAIR: Bay Chimo HTO.

14 MR. P. KAPOLAK: Yes, we do.

15 THE CHAIR: Cambridge Bay HTO.

16 MR. GREENLEY: Yes, we do.

17 THE CHAIR: NTI?

18 MR. IRNGAUT: Bert says no way, but I agree.

19 THE CHAIR: That's right. You're supposed to
20 be gone today.

21 KIA, do you agree with this?

22 MR. CLARK: I think we should vote to have
23 Bert put on the plane. We support keeping the record open.

24 THE CHAIR: North Slave Métis Alliance, Shin?

25 MR. SHIGA: We support it. Thank you.

1 THE CHAIR: Wek'èezhii?

2 MS. PELLISSEY: We support that.

3 THE CHAIR: Okay. Thank you very much. So we
4 will do that tomorrow, and I think it will help our hearing
5 in the process of it. Yes, it will.

6 Just before we go, we're going to close this,
7 but I'm going to give everybody a quick opportunity to make
8 their final comments, okay, and I'll start off with the
9 Government of Nunavut.

10 CLOSING REMARKS

11 MR. GISSING: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

12 Drikus Gissing, Department of Environment,
13 Government of Nunavut.

14 Thank you very much to you and the Board for
15 your time and listening to us, and I just want to reaffirm
16 our commitment, irrelevant of what the outcome of the Board
17 decision is, our commitment to work with the HTOs in the
18 Kitikmeot Region on the management of this herd and our
19 commitment of the staff to work with them.

20 THE CHAIR: Thank you. Drikus.

21 Government of Northwest Territories.

22 MS. YONGE: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Lynda
23 Yonge, GNWT. We'd also like to thank the Board, and we
24 very much appreciate this opportunity to present our
25 information and, again, to reinforce the idea that this is

1 a shared herd; and a collaborative approach and sharing
2 information is very important to us.

3 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lynda.

4 Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife Board, Simon.

5 MR. QINGNAQTUQ: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

6 Simon Qingnaqtuq, Kitikmeot Regional Wildlife
7 Board.

8 I'd like to thank all the presenters and all the
9 information that we gathered here, and hope for the best
10 for the Kitikmeot Region, as we acknowledge to the Board
11 and the panel that we are not fully in support with the
12 total allowable harvest.

13 Saying that is that, you know, once it's
14 approved, we're afraid of losing the management from the
15 HTO board. Down the road, if we see the Bathurst caribou
16 go back to health, like, to healthy population, our HTO has
17 no control of that harvesting of the caribou herd. That's
18 why we're not in support with the total allowable harvest.

19 But I'd like to thank everybody for their
20 presentation and, on behalf of the Kitikmeot Regional
21 Wildlife Board, I'm very happy that we put in our
22 submission with the NWMB. Thank you.

23 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Simon.

24 Larry, Kuglugtuk.

25 MR. L. ADJUN: Thank you. Larry Adjun, Kugluktuk

1 Angoniatit Association chairman. I'd like to thank the
2 Board for giving us the opportunity to express our opinions
3 on the Bathurst caribou herd, and because I have a
4 contingent of my HTO board, I will let them speak on their
5 own behalf. If they'd do so, please. And I'll leave the
6 floor to the board.

7 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Larry.

8 Peter.

9 MR. TAKTOGON: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

10 I would like to thank everybody here for giving
11 us a chance to give our voice. I just want to say one
12 thing while everybody's here: Nunavut government, Nunavut
13 Wildlife Management Board, GNWT, Kitikmeot Regional Board
14 plus all the affected areas for the Bathurst, Bluenose, and
15 Dolphin Union.

16 From now on in the future, as we're affected in
17 Kitikmeot for those three herds, before any decisions are
18 made in the near future, please work together with us
19 first. Any one of you jumping into Nunavut Wildlife
20 Management Board or Nunavut government, we Inuit peoples
21 are really affected for those three herds. We have to work
22 together in the future and don't ever forget us. Thank
23 you.

24 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Peter.

25 MR. L. ADJUN: That's it for my board's comments.

1 THE CHAIR: Thank you.

2 MR. L. ADJUN: And like I said, thanks for
3 letting the HTO board from Kugluktuk attend here for this
4 hearing.

5 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much, Larry.

6 Sam?

7 MR. S. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

8 I'd also like to thank the board for taking the
9 time to listen to all of our questions and comments and
10 presentations. And like I stated earlier, caribou is a big
11 issue on the table right now, and it's going to be a big
12 issue for a while and has been in the past; but there's a
13 lot of interesting questions brought up, and good answers
14 put forth, and I'd just like to thank everybody for all the
15 information put out on the table. There's different
16 information and new information to me. So I'd like to say
17 thank you again.

18 Unless our chairperson wants to add more, that's
19 all from us. Thank you.

20 THE CHAIR: Bay Chimo, Peter.

21 MR. P. KAPOLAK: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

22 On behalf of Umingmaktok HTO, I'd like to thank
23 the Nunavut Wildlife Management Board for inviting us, and
24 I'd like to thank all interveners for all their input.
25 Might have other ups and downs. And I'd like to thank all

1 the interpreters for all the hard work for this two days.

2 Thank you.

3 THE CHAIR: Hear, hear. Thank you.

4 Thank you very much, Peter.

5 Cambridge Bay.

6 MR. GREENLEY: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

7 I'd just like to thank everybody for giving

8 Cambridge Bay HTO the opportunity to sit in on the hearing.

9 It was very interesting. I myself, this is my first

10 hearing that I've sat in, so I've learned a lot the last

11 couple of days, and I get to see different perspective from

12 every group involved. So it's a big thank-you to

13 everybody.

14 But also, like I said the other day about our

15 Dolphin and Union, on our plans with that also, we're

16 working with Lisa and the GN on our herd also, so it gives

17 us different perspectives to look at and what to do and

18 what we should start doing. So I'd just like to thank

19 everybody.

20 THE CHAIR: Thank you Bobby. George? George.

21 MR. G. ANGOHIATOK: Yes, thank you, Mr. Chair. I,

22 too, would like to take the opportunity to thank everyone

23 involved. Of course, we all have our differences, and it's

24 great to see that we can work it out as a group, a big

25 group, together and hash things out through all our

1 differences and disagreements. But the overall thing that
2 we want to achieve is to ensure our caribou remain for our
3 future generations. And thank you all. Quana.

4 THE CHAIR: Thank you.

5 NTI.

6 MR. IRNGAUT: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

7 First of all, I appreciate the Board for holding
8 their hearing here in Cambridge; you are exercising your
9 rights under the Claim, and that's good to see.

10 Having said that, we always like to see the
11 Board go to the communities that are most affected, and
12 even though the logistics might play a role, maybe in the
13 future we should try and go to communities like Kugluktuk.

14 Having said that, we will work with the
15 governments, we will work with the RWOs and HTOs to make
16 sure that they are properly prepared, and also with the
17 RIAs. This is too big an important issue not to work
18 together, because our caribou depends on it. Thank you.

19 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Paul.

20 KIA.

21 MR. CLARK: Geoff Clark on behalf of KIA. I'd
22 like to thank the Board and all the interveners and the
23 information shared over the last two days, and we look
24 forward to the continuation of the hearing.

25 Thank you.

1 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Geoff.

2 Attima.

3 MR. HADLARI: Attima. Thank you very much for
4 having the hearing here, for NWMB and the ones that are a
5 party to the hearing. And the people from Northwest
6 Territories, thank you for coming.

7 And, also, I would like to hear something that
8 would be very positive for Kitikmeot. Thank you.

9 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Attima.

10 Shin.

11 MR. SHIGA: Thank you. I'd like to thank the
12 board and the people of Kitikmeot again, and I'm looking
13 forward to working with you tomorrow.

14 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Shin.

15 Boyd.

16 MR. WARNER: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

17 And, again, yeah, thanks, especially from our
18 company. I think we're the only private company at the
19 table, and I do appreciate that Nunavut Wildlife Board
20 recognized our importance and allowed us to be a full
21 participant, and I enjoyed the dialogue with all the
22 interveners. I actually don't think we're that far apart,
23 and we all want to work for the caribou. So thank you.

24 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Boyd.

25 And last is Jonas and Jody.

1 MS. PELLISSEY: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

2 Jonas is going to give the thanks, but I need to
3 give my apologies to the translators. I know better than
4 to rush through a presentation. My board member also
5 happens to be a Tlicho translator, so I will get my butt
6 kicked later for rushing through that. So I just wanted to
7 give my apologies and thanks to the translators.

8 MR. LAFFERTY: With my left or right foot, I
9 don't know. (Translation not available)

10 I'd just like to say thank you to each and every
11 one of you, especially the Elders. By listening you get a
12 lot of knowledge. You don't realize that you're teaching
13 us young people, but I'd just like to say this has been
14 very educational, and I'd like to say thank you very much.
15 I spent over 30 years in the booth, so therefore, I'd like
16 to thank the translators and each and every one of you
17 around the table.

18 But I want to ask Boyd Warner for his card so
19 next time you go hunting I want a caribou tongue.

20 Thank you very much.

21 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Jonas.

22 Well, that wraps up all our interveners, but I'm
23 going to give a chance to all our Board Members to say a
24 word, if you would. Charlie.

25 MR. INUARAK: I'd like to thank the people of

1 Cambridge Bay. I was here once as a mayor, but now I'm
2 here again as a wildlife management member. They're always
3 welcoming. And, also, I'd like to thank the people -- I
4 don't see the people from Kugluktuk too often, and also
5 seeing the people from Northwest Territories, and I'd like
6 to say thank-you.

7 Now our hard work is coming in trying to make a
8 decision, and I know that the Board will have a difficult
9 time, difficult time. Yes, they've been working hard to
10 make a proper decision. Thank you.

11 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Charlie. David.

12 MR. KRITTERDLIK: Thank you to everyone that was
13 here, the GNWT and Nunavut and GN and the people and the
14 presenters. We learn from that. I've been a Board Member
15 for not too long, and this is my first involvement with a
16 hearing. But I look forward with my fellow Board Members
17 and the wildlife managers, we will be working together.
18 We'll be able to manage the wildlife properly as we work
19 together, and different organizations, especially Elders
20 and younger people. And we cannot settle anything. We can
21 work together to make it better. Thank you.

22 THE CHAIR: Thank you, David. Caleb.

23 MR. SANGOYA: Thank you very much.

24 My fellow Inuit and the government, we can speak
25 together this much before regarding the caribou -- and

1 since the Nunavut Land Claims Agreement was ratified, we
2 are more involved in the discussions of wildlife
3 management. I know they're not going to be beneficial.
4 I'm not saying that it's going to be bad, but I don't want
5 anybody to give up. Our fathers and our ancestors, keep
6 them in your heart because they are our strength. And
7 thank you very much, and especially my fellow Board
8 Members. We'll have a difficult task ahead of us, and
9 we'll keep you in our hearts. Thank you.

10 THE CHAIR: Thank you Caleb. David.

11 MR. IGUTSAQ: Thank you very much, Mr. Chairman.

12 And I'm thankful because there are people from
13 other communities to meet with the NWMB Board. When we
14 have a meeting like this, as NWMB, as it was already
15 mentioned, we're going to have a difficult task ahead of us
16 when we have to make a decision in the fall.

17 We did that with the Baffin Island caribou when
18 we had to make a decision on Baffin Island caribou, and it
19 will be as difficult. But once we start working on it and
20 once we make a decision, whether it is good or not, yeah,
21 we'll make a decision on this even, though it's been
22 difficult, yeah, we have to share our thoughts. Yeah,
23 we'll be dealing with it because we have to go through it.

24 And we will remember that our kids won't have to
25 keep going to the store and just buy sardines. Back in

1 1990 -- I think it was 1990s -- 1996, yeah, we met with
2 aboriginal people and Inuit, and it was difficult. And
3 we're able to listen to the Elders, and I know that we're
4 able to work together now. Even though, yes, we'll still
5 be living. Thank you that we were able to meet here.
6 Thank you.

7 THE CHAIR: Thank you, David.

8 Simeonie.

9 MR. KEENAINAK: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

10 I'd also like to say thank-you. And when the
11 Baffin Island caribou, there was a moratorium, we didn't
12 know what to do when there was a moratorium put on the
13 caribou harvesting on Baffin Island. And you were probably
14 thinking, as we did before. But I know they make decisions
15 for us, even though we don't all agree with it, but we can
16 cannot do anything about it, but we have to try and make a
17 decision.

18 And before we had anything to say to it, when
19 there was a moratorium put on the Baffin Island caribou, we
20 couldn't do anything about it, but we had to follow it.

21 I'd like to thank everyone that have come to this
22 community, GN and the GNWT and other people, other Inuit,
23 that have come to this hearing. Thank you.

24 And our Chairperson. Let's applaud our
25 Chairperson. Thank you.

1 THE CHAIR: Qujannamiik. "Your Worship" gets
2 the last word here.

3 First of all, I'd like to say it is an honour, a
4 privilege to belong to this Board and also to be Acting
5 Chairperson. I think we have a great amount of experience,
6 as you can see and you've witnessed, I believe, that we're
7 going to take this valuable information that you all
8 provided us and make the best decision for Nunavut. And I
9 hope you have trust and faith in us that we're going to do
10 that, and that is what our endeavour is, to make the best
11 decision.

12 So thank you very much, and it's getting late,
13 but we're going to see each other all again tomorrow
14 morning. So thank you very much. Good night.

15 9:00 a.m. tomorrow.

16

17 (Proceedings ended at 9:01 p.m.)

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1 Certificate of Transcript

2

3 I, the undersigned, hereby certify that the foregoing pages
4 280 to 588 are a complete and accurate transcript of the
5 proceedings taken down by me in shorthand and transcribed
6 from my shorthand notes to the best of my skill and ability.

7

8 Dated at the City of Calgary, Province of Alberta, on the day
9 24th of July, A.D. 2016.

10

11 "Adele Jones"

12 Adele Jones

13 Official Court Reporter, CSR(A)

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25