

Dunavunmi Anngutighatigut Aulapkaijitkut Katimajiat Nunavut Wildlife Management Board

ለጋፈናርΔሮሮ% >PLጚናው ፈጭፈበՐጋЈ ፈጋናበርÞውኖና ΔውΔና ጭPትLውጋጭኖና ፈካLጋ ጭPትኒናበካLሲና ጭPትLውኖና Tammaqtailinahuarniriit anngutighat atuqhugit Inuit qaujimajatuqangillu ilihimaniillu ilitquhiannin Conserving wildlife through the application of Inuit Qaujimajatuqangit and scientific knowledge

May 26th 2010

Honourable Jim Prentice Minister of Environment Government of Canada

Jayko Alooloo Vice-Chairperson of the Qikiqtaaluk Wildlife Board Honourable Gail Shea Minister of Fisheries and Oceans Government of Canada

Peterosie Qappik
Chairperson of the Pangnirtung
Hunters & Trappers Organization

Paul Kaludjak
President of Nunavut
Tunngavik Inc.

Re: Late filing Response Submission by Nunavut Tunngavik Incorporated for the Nunavut Wildlife Management Board's Public Hearing to Consider the Proposed Species at Risk Act (SARA) Listing of Cumberland Sound Beluga as a Threatened Species

Dear Colleagues,

The Nunavut Wildlife Management Board (NWMB or Board) wrote to you all on March 19th 2010 that it would be holding a public hearing on June 22nd and 23rd 2010 in Pangnirtung, Nunavut, to consider the proposed legal listing of the Cumberland Sound beluga population as a threatened species under the federal *Species at Risk Act* (SARA). That correspondence went on to indicate that Environment Canada (EC) had earlier filed with the Board a *Proposal for NWMB Decision*, as well as a number of additional documents which comprised the best available information to date. The NWMB invited written, translated response submissions to the *Proposal for NWMB Decision*, to be filed by no later than 5:00 p.m. Eastern Time (ET) on May 18th 2010.

On May 25th 2010, Nunavut Tunngavik Incorporated (NTI) filed a response submission to the EC *Proposal for NWMB Decision.* The NWMB had indicated in its March 19th correspondence that, "unless persuasive written and translated reasons are provided to the Board for late filing, the NWMB will not consider materials for this hearing that are not filed on time." The response submission was accompanied by written reasons for the late filing, which is an attachment to this letter.

The delivery of all written materials to a public hearing within a particular time frame is an important requirement of the NWMB hearing process. Although it is clearly necessary from an administrative perspective - facilitating as it does the Board's efforts at running a timely and efficient hearing - the primary value of meeting filing deadlines is to ensure fairness to all parties.

In order to meet the highest standards of procedural and substantive fairness in its hearings, the NWMB is of the view that other parties require an opportunity to consider whether the late filing of the response submission is unfair to them, to be able to raise any objections and – if there

are objections - to set out recommended measures to fairly address any resulting prejudice to them.

In an effort to maintain efficiency, timeliness and – most importantly - fairness, the NWMB has decided to proceed as follows:

- Accompanying this letter is a translated copy of the response submission. If a party has objections to the late NTI filing, the Board is providing until no later than 5:00 p.m. ET on June 9th 2010 to deliver –English and Inuktitut –the written objection, supporting reasons and recommended measures to fairly address the resulting prejudice to that party.
- Once the deadline for delivery of objections has passed and if any objection has been filed - the NWMB will decide how to fairly proceed, and will promptly notify all of the hearing parties of its decision.

Written objections may be filed with the Board in person, by courier or by mail. They should be clearly marked as pertaining to the late submission by NTI for the NWMB's Hearing on the proposed SARA listing of Cumberland Sound beluga. Delivery may also be made through fax or electronic transmission, but only if you or your organization confirms by phone with the NWMB — by no later than 5:00 p.m. ET on the date the objection submission is due — that a complete and legible copy of the transmission has been received by the Board. Materials are deemed to have been filed on the actual day of receipt by the NWMB. The Board recommends that a copy of any written objection filed with the NWMB be delivered, at the same time, to all of the other parties.

If you require further information, please do not hesitate to contact the NWMB.

Yours sincerely,

Willie Nakoolak,

Acting Chairperson of the

Nunavut Wildlife Management Board

win th

Attachments (2)

c.c. Richard Connelly, Executive Director of the Nunavut Inuit Wildlife Secretariat, for distribution to the Chairpersons of Nunavut's Hunters and Trappers Organizations and Regional Wildlife Organizations;

Gabriel Nirlungayuk, Director of Wildlife, Nunavut Tunngavik Inc.;

Paul Irngaut, Wildlife Advisor, Nunavut Tunngavik Inc.;

Virginia Poter, Director General, Environment Canada, Canadian Wildlife Service; Eric Kan, Area Director - Eastern Arctic Region, Department of Fisheries and Oceans



ው ድራር እንዲየየት ሀኒሪ ህብ የተያ ህብ የተያ መመንር XOV 0H0 P ማር

Nunavut Tunngavik Timingat Titiqqilvia 638 Iqaluit NU X0A 0H0 Canada Nunavut Tunngavik Incorporated P.O. Box 638 Iqaluit NU X0A 0H0 Canada

(867) 975-4900 1-888-646-0006 (867) 975-4949

ەخەpp، Qikiqtaaluk

Arctic Bay

SPPSECSYON

Oikiqtarjuaq

P™L∆¢ Cape Dorset

Grise Fiord

Hall Beach

Igloolik △۵د۵ Igaluit

PLT2C Kimmirut

<°σ°656 Pangnirtung Γ°∩LC←°

Pond Inlet もとさなった Resolute Bay

5σΡ⊃Φ% Sanikiluaq

Per-ch Kivalliq

مائلام Arviat الالحريم Baker Lake الاعراد

Chesterfield Inlet المحادثة Coral Harbour المحادثة Bankin Inlet

Repulse Bay

OPS' 20%

Whale Cove

SPOSTOS

Kitikmeot

∆الی-۱۵۰۵ Cambridge Bay اطاعی الله کاله Kugluktuk کاله کاله کاله

> Gjoa Haven dじな Kugaaruk Cユゲイヤ

> > Taloyoak

May 20, 2010

Willie Nakoolak Acting Chairperson Nunavut Wildlife Management Board

RE: Late submission on Cumberland Sound Belugas

Dear: sir

I have been working on two submissions for the upcoming SARA public hearing in Pangnirtung on Cumberland Sound beluga and Eastern High Arctic- Baffin Bay beluga. Due to the workload, I had mixed up the dates for the deadline for the Cumberland Sound submission. I was also waiting for the Inuktitut translations to be done.

I apologize for the late CS submission. I hope you can accept the late Cumberland Sound beluga submission.

Sincerely;

Paul Irngaut Nunavut Tunngavik Inc.



NTI Submission to the SARA listing of beluga

Issue: The Committee on the Status of Endangered Wildlife in Canada (COSEWIC) has assessed the Cumberland Sound population of beluga whales as "Threatened".

Background:

Under the Nunavut Land Claims Agreement (NLCA), governments must seek community input before bringing any issues to the Nunavut Wildlife Management Board (NWMB) for decision. The process for *SARA* listing consultations in Nunavut is detailed in a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) between the federal government and the NWMB which harmonizes the listing process under *SARA* with the NLCA. The *SARA*-NLCA Harmonization MOU outlines a process in which the federal government conducts public consultations with affected communities before seeking NWMB approval for species listings.

Cumberland Sound belugas: Under the COSEWIC Assessment and Update Status Report on the Beluga Whale, *Delphinapterus leucas* dated 2004, the Southeast Baffin Island-Cumberland Sound population was designated as "Endangered" in April 1990. The reason for designation is that numbers declined by about 1500 animals between the 1920s and the present. This decline is due to harvesting by the Hudson Bay Company until the 1940s and harvesting by the Inuit until 1979. Hunting has been regulated since 1979.

Following this status designation, a hunting quota of 35 belugas was set for the community of Pangnirtung in 1991.

Since 1998, DFO and the Pangnirtung HTO have conducted research to update the population estimate for Cumberland Sound belugas. Information about movements and dive times along with cliff counts and aerial surveys has updated the population estimates. Aerial surveys flown in 1999 have shown that there are most likely about 1,960 belugas in Cumberland Sound and they likely remain in or near Cumberland Sound year-round. (The actual population size, with 90% confidence limits, lies between 1594 and 2409 belugas; DFO unpublished data).

In 2003 the quota was increased from 35 to 41 and has remained to present.

In May 2004, the structure of the population was redefined and named "Cumberland Sound population". After aerial survey review, the status of the population was re-examined and down listed to "Threatened" in May 2004

At that time, NTI supported the decision made by COSEWIC to change the designation of the Cumberland Sound beluga population from Endangered to the less at-risk category of Threatened because both the 1999 survey (population estimate: 1547) and local Inuit knowledge suggest the

population is increasing. NTI also noted that the community of Pangnirtung has worked cooperatively with DFO over several years to develop a beluga recovery strategy and management plan, and that work should be recognized as a positive relationship.

A working group had been established with DFO taking the lead. The group consisted of Pangnirtung HTO, Qikitalluk Wildlife Board, Nunavut Tunngavik and Fisheries and Oceans.

Aerial surveys were also flown in 2005 to update the abundance estimate, but due to poor weather and equipment malfunction the results were not considered reliable.

Since 2004, the community of Pangnirtung has been participating with DFO to develop a Cumberland Sound recovery and management plan in preparation of a listing under the Species at Risk Act.

In August 2005, DFO did a recovery assessment report on the Cumberland Sound Beluga population. The report summarized that:

- * In Cumberland Sound, reconstruction of the historical population using the available catch information provides an estimated historical (pre-commercial whaling) population size of 8,465 (S.E. = 426). A Bayesian model estimated the 2002 population size to number 2,018 (95% C.L.: 1,553-2,623), or 24% of its estimated historical population size. The population is estimated to be on an increasing trend even with the quota- regulated local subsistence hunt.
- A recovery target at 70% of historical population size would correspond to 5,926 individuals.
 This target could be reached in 40, 55 and 90 years for harvest scenarios of 0, 20 and 41
 (actual quota), respectively. The population would likely decline under a harvest scenario of 60.
- Subsistence hunting might be considered as a threat to the Cumberland Sound beluga population. Nevertheless, the actual carefully managed subsistence hunt, that inflicts a low mortality rate, does not seem to be an impediment to recovery over the long term.
- In June 2008 during a second consultation process, DFO letters were sent to all parties indicating that there was new information and that there was a delay in the listing process and asked if the parties supported listing of the Cumberland sound belugas.
- Pangnirtung HTO indicated that they do not support the listing of Cumberland sound belugas as threatened. Twenty-two local hunters signed a petition indicating their opposition to the listing.
- The QWB also does not support listing for several reasons: the current harvest of 41 is sustainable; local hunters report seeing more belugas since beluga management measures were undertaken in the 1980s; recent surveys indicate beluga numbers have increased since the early 1990s.
- In the DFO Social-economic analysis regarding Cumberland Sound belugas, historic over exploitation by commercial whaling caused major decline in CS belugas. This decline was not

caused by the Inuit of Pangnirtung and this has been a sticking point with the community when it comes to setting quotas and proposed listing of the CS belugas under SARA.

Inuit have been very co-operative with the management of the CS belugas. Again to emphasize;

- Hunting has been regulated since 1979.
- The community has been involved in the recovery strategy and management plan since 2004.
- Beluga meat and muktaq is essential to Inuit diet and offset the high cost of store bought foods.
- Aside from the odd beluga caught by fishing nets, the community has been under a quota of 41 for the last 7 years.
- Pangnirtung is the only community in Nunavut that is under a quota system for beluga.

Recommendations and concerns raised by NTI:

NTI does not have the responsibility to make a decision on whether or not to list beluga. NTI however would like to make a recommendation to the NWMB and that it should consider the following;

- Pangnirtung HTO and QWB do not support the listing?
- The record of consultation provided by DFO on the proposed listing clearly indicated that there is no support from the community of Pangnirtung to the listing.
- The listing of species as "threatened" will impact the community and the potential harvesting of this species. Therefore adequate understanding through consultation is essential.
- The NWMB should fully acknowledge the opinions and concerns expressed by Inuit during the consultation process. In the event that the NWMB does not feel adequate consultation took place, it should consider returning the process back for consultation.
- The NWMB should fully consider the intent and purpose of the Species at Risk Act, and the definition of a listing of "threatened" and whether it applies to this population at this time.
- The Pangnirtung HTO and the community have been very co-operative and respectful over the last 7 years with their current quota of 41. Therefore NTI recommends that the quota of 41 be increased by 10 to meet the needs of the growing community and to recognize the effort this community has done to help the ongoing recovery and management of the Cumberland Sound belugas.

NTI's main concern is that RWOs, HTOs and community opinions and concerns and needs are taken into account as you make your decision on the listing of Cumberland Sound beluga as "threatened" under the Species At Risk Act.

Prepared by: Paul Irngaut Nunavut Tunngavik Inc.



」。 Nunavunmi Anngutighatigut Aulapkaijitkut Katimajiat Nunavut Wildlife Management Board

ለጋላርረልሮች >PLላናው ላናፅሰቦጋህ ላጋናበርኮው የር ልጋልና የኦንትር ላይ illimaniillu ilitquhiannin
Conserving wildlife through the application of Inuit Qaujimajatuqangit and scientific knowledge

144 mg 200

Jealar ULarc

LΔ 26, 2010

ንጥሮብ ሳጋ፡፡ ንጥሮብ-የሌላሪው የኤርንትር praces Pursace አዋባ ሳጋ፡፡ ላንትላ _የየላ የአፍራርብር 〈ፌዲንዶL የብጣት የተመጠቀላቸው የህር ሀርብር

ለ``ጔ\: P`ህ<'`)¯'`) > ¬ተራ ነገ' > ¬ተራ

Acashnoba.

Δαδ'Γ \dot{D} LdCach'dV \dot{D} LdCach'dV \dot{D} V \dot{D} Cach' \dot{D} V \dot{D} Cach' \dot{D} Cach'

Рペσ LΔ 25, 2010, $_{\Delta}$ $_{$

 Λ^{\prime} $\Lambda^$

- Δ ር Δ Δ C Δ Δ C Δ Δ C Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C
 Δ C

 $\Lambda^b b^a - \Lambda^b \partial^b C \lambda^b C b^a - C^b C b^a C b^b C b^$

۵-دام ک کرد کاله

DDCade

ωσ»(Γ ÞΓ<<ν>/
Λίζς)(Σρργως)» δς »Δς σης»,

DCPCDYLX (2)

Λቴርና: ሊናለና ¡¡¡ (Δ<</p>
ለቴርና: ሊናለና ¡¡
ልጋላ Δና/ «ኦርና) «ኦር «አር «አር » «አር » «አር «አር » «አር »



ለንፈበና: b∩L}ናረና Ldውኄ Δ፫∿ᲡԺ∿Րዮውና ସናርሷጭጋ፫ናጋና ÞL4Δና bሷርΓ ቴኦኦትርኦጭጋና ርኦዊታ ርናጋንበኦና ΔĽ∿Րዮታ ସΓቭታጐՐዮውና የየሷጋሁልና ΔĽዮሷ ር∆৮ኦዮጋቦኑ "ቴኦናለፈሷጭጋ፫ዮታጐቦዮታና".

Δ C%U\sigmaD%UC:

CΔL^ħυσ^c 1998, Λελ^{*}«Δ^c ΔL^cΓραλ^b» «^c Δ^c Δρ^c Δρ^c

L Δ 2004, Δ ር~ሁታጐቦና Δ d Δ Γ $\dot{\sigma}$ ጐቦናር $\dot{\Delta}$ ጐቦናሪ $\dot{\Delta}$ ጐቦሪው Δ ሁ። Δ L $\dot{\sigma}$ " $\dot{\sigma}$ ጐቦና $\dot{\Delta}$ ር~ሁታጐቦና". $\dot{\sigma}$ ህ $\dot{\sigma}$ ላሁ $\dot{\sigma}$ \dot

CΔ′γLσ, Δαδς Ͻ΅Ϳϭͼ ΠΓʹʹͿς Δρίκολος διουνος Δίτορος ἀιριουνος Ακτορος ἀιριουνος Ακτορος Ακτορος Ακτορος Ακτορος διανός δι

4 ላ ነው ነገና 4 ነው ነገር ነው ነ

CΔ⁶ULσ⁶ 2004-Γ⁶, Δασ⁶ <⁶σ⁶)⁶ Δαρλικ⁶ Δαρ⁶ Διτροσπλεσ⁶ Ασπλεσ⁶ Διτροσπλεσ⁶ Διτροσπλεσ⁶ Διτροσπλεσ⁶ Διτροσπλεσ⁶ Διτροσπλεσ⁶ Δαρροσπλεσ⁶ Δαρροσπλεσ⁶

ΔΡΊ 2005-Γ, ΔΕΊΓΡΟς ΛΕΛΙΘΑ ΛΕΡΊΟς ΊΒΡΡΥΡΠΑς ΡΟΘΌΘΟς ΟΡΘΌ Ο ΔΕΊΡΟ ΤΡΩΙΙΔΟ ΔΑΓΑΊΘΑ ΤΟ ΕΡΘΌΘΟ ΑΔΙΘΑ ΑΔΙΘΑ ΡΟΘΌΡΙΑς ΑΔΙΘΑ ΡΟΘΌΡΙΑς:

* C'→PNP' ΔL%ቦው. ሷ፟ጐየቦላጐCP/Lው%ቦ CΔ/Looco ΔΔቦላጐውሎው ላΓ/ታ ጥቦር ላጋጐታ ላጋΔው Proc DP/JN ምር ላጋΔው PN የNP' ወር P'ርጐCP/L የተመር ለው ለም ነው ልር ው ምርም የመደመው የተመደመው የተመደ

- Δόαλασίι αθανσι Δλεργασιο Νουλασισασι Ειγινι Είρο Αργασιο Α
- $<^*\sigma$ ") T Dac" σ DL4CLAdic bNL2% σ Palua 4°Ca") σ Co" σ Co"
- POD ΛΕΛΙΘΟΝΑΝ ΔΕΙΓΡΟΝΑΝ ΔΑΙΓΡΟΝΑΝ ΑΙΓΡΟΝΑΝ ΑΙΓΡΟΝ ΑΙΓΡ

 $\Delta \Delta \Delta^c$ ዕር ት/Lላ-L Λ ት/ Λ^c Δ^c $\Delta^$

- Φυαλωσίμε Lcuc > "C>να CΔLωσ 1979-Γε.

- $<^{\circ}\sigma^{\circ}\dot{)}^{\circ}$ DOCOMED $\Delta C^{\circ}\cup\sigma^{\circ}\dot{)}^{\circ}$ $\Delta C^{\circ}\cup\sigma^{\circ}\dot{)}^{\circ}$

<u>אטריאלאילחי שידי שלך יטה ליים אולאילטה שה שה שהישרישהי</u>

ውወቅና ጋግሁል፥ በ୮৬៤ና ለአ፥ኣናቴጐቦናጋነ፥ ለርጢላጋና Δ ևትል ኣልታናፑና Δ ረዜሮኦንበታና ኦዕላ የቦፌህሪና Δ ይላይነት የተመለይነት እርስ አልት በ୮৬៤ና የተላማ Δ ይላይነት ለመቀ የተመለይነት ለመቀን ነው ላጋር ነው አንተለው የተመለከት አለው የተመለከት አለው

- Φdd ΔαΦΓ ÞLdchhidde bnlhidden ΔΔΔΟΓς Δλιωθωπλασς λσασσασς λρας λίθης με βdd Þldας αςς ωνοϊνως νόθησης, αιια αραδιασία λρα βdd αραδρωλιας βdωθυ "βςλασωρίωσης" αιια ρίξραθη δdα αραδρωλιας βαθυ αγάσωνος ίναι βλασωρία αιιας και με βίρα βλογια.

۵۵۶٬ ۵۳۰۵٬ ۱۳۵۰٬ ۱۳۵۰٬ ۱۳۵۰٬ ۱۳۵۰ ۱۳۵۰ ۱۳۵۰٬ ۱۳

Διωροντο Οπηθο UL,ης: Κιστο Συμβο UL,ης: Συμβο Συμβο UL,ης:



Nunavut Tunngavik Timingat Titiqqilvia 638 Iqaluit NU X0A 0H0 Canada Nunavut Tunngavik Incorporated P.O. Box 638 Iqaluit NU X0A 0H0 Canada

(867) 975-4900 1-888-646-0006 (867) 975-4949

φρφ≟ε Qikiqtaaluk Δε∧Φί√ε

Arctic Bay

P % L \(\sigma \)

Qikiqtarjuaq

P % L \(\sigma \)

Cape Dorset もゃいゅうじへゅ Clyde River

Dr∆cos Grise Fiord Socsb

Hall Beach ムレート Igloolik

PrL>c و اdajnit ک⇔

Kimmirut <°o~%% Pangnirtung

Pond Inlet

Resolute Bay トテトコ 4% Sanikiluaq

Pecció Kivalliq diado Arviat

SbLσウΔ%
Baker Lake
Δレコーレイや
Chesterfield Inlet

Whale Cove

SPOSTOS

Kitikmeot

Kitikmeot

∆°b⇒°c∩√°b
Cambridge Bay

'd'≤¬°b>°b
Kugluktuk

▷°b'b'b'b
Gjoa Haven

d'L' ←b

Kugaaruk Cュヤイ5 Taloyoak LA 20, 2010

Φοδς <u>ΣΓ4</u>ς νοης ρ Φοδο ΣΕ Φοδο ΣΕ

 Λ^{1} ረበርቱ: የህペ%ጋውና ጋውረሃረበና Δ ወል Δ ርጎጋበ>ና Δ ርሲው%ቦዬውና የ Δ ጋሀ Δ ና

 $\Delta\Delta$;

 $L\Gamma ext{d'}$ ጋጐ $L ext{PdG} ext{C'} ext{DPV} ext{CLP} ext{C'} ext{C'} ext{DF} ext{DF} ext{DF$

לכלר:

Paul <' Δ⁵*υρ^c Δαρ^c Ͻ**υδ⁶ Λ*υ^c